

Public Health Framework Approach in providing advice to Government in relation to reducing social distancing measures introduced in response to COVID-19

National Public Health Emergency Team

1st May 2020

Purpose of this Document

This document is the Public Health Framework Approach developed by the National Public Health Emergency Team (NPHET) to assist Government in informing its decisions in responding to the emergency, in providing advice to the Minister for Health and to the Government regarding changes to public health social distancing and other measures in response to the progression of the COVID-19 disease in Ireland.

This is a living, flexible document and will be subject to regular review in the context of: the progression or suppression of COVID-19 in Ireland at different points in time; new guidance and evidence which emanate from the research, experience and findings of international bodies, and of other countries, and consideration of the utility and outcomes of taking certain measures.

The purpose of this public health framework approach is to inform a slow, gradual, step-wise and incremental reduction of the current public health social distancing measures, in a risk-based, fair and proportionate way, with a view to effectively supressing the spread of COVID-19 disease while enabling the gradual return of social and economic activity.

This framework also acknowledges that there are other important considerations regarding the reduction of measures that Government will have, such as social and economic considerations, adherence, public sentiment, acceptability, feasibility, overall population health & wellbeing and others.

The lifting of measures carries uncertainty and risk, and the easing of social distancing restrictions must be accompanied by a high level of adherence to the fundamental individual and collective behaviours needed to guard against transmission of the virus, and to avoid the need to re-impose restriction measures.

Structure of this Document

The document is divided into three sections:

- 1. Introduction Section
- 2. Diagrammatic representation of NPHET's public health framework approach to advising Government regarding the reduction of measures
- 3. Guide to the NPHET public health framework approach to reducing public health social distancing measures

Appendix 1 contains the public health framework approach to advising on reducing social distancing measures.

1. Section 1: Introduction

2020 has brought with it the most serious global pandemic in a century – something that was unimaginable a few short months ago. Since COVID-19 emerged first in China in December last, it has spread widely and rapidly around the globe, disregarding borders, time zones, and race. As of 29 April, it is reported that there have been over 3m cases worldwide, with 20,253 of these in Ireland.

As well as being more infectious than first thought, it is impossible to predict with certainty what its effects will be on any one person infected; some experience no symptoms at all, or are very mildly ill, and for others it is fatal. Nearly 208,000 COVID-19 related deaths have been reported worldwide. Since the first case in Ireland was notified on 29 February 2020, sadly over 1,190 lives have been lost to this disease in this country. The loss of our loved ones in such circumstances and the ongoing threat of the pandemic continue to exact a heavy toll on our society.

The uniqueness of the COVID-19 disease has posed an immense challenge for health services and countries across the globe, as well as for Ireland. The demands posed on our health and other services by COVID-19, and people working within those services, cannot be underestimated. People have displayed extraordinary and inspiring individual and collective responsibility and commitment to the common good and responded to national, regional, local and community calls for assistance to deal with this crisis.

However, a mere four months after we first became aware of COVID-19, and we mobilised to deal with the immediate challenges, it is clear that what we hoped might be a sprint is in fact a marathon. COVID-19 will continue to provide a threat to the world for the foreseeable future, though it is hoped that a vaccine or new treatments may emerge. There is no magic unwinding of the clock to a pre-COVID-19 time. There is no roadmap or precedent for dealing with a pandemic such as this and, adopting a public health led approach, we must proceed with caution and care in seeking to tread a path to a new way of life.

How have we been responding to COVID-19 in Ireland?

Not for generations has Ireland been faced with a health threat as serious as COVID-19 and the daily life of every single person has been changed. In the early weeks of 2020, as this pandemic was emerging, Government and our health and social care service monitored the evolving global situation, deployed our plans and started to prepare for the disease's likely impact in Ireland. At the same time, businesses, organisations, communities, families and each of us individually were becoming informed, changing our individual and collective behaviours so that we would know what to do, and do the right things as COVID-19 found its way closer.

Within a very short few weeks after the first cases of COVID-19 were reported in Ireland at the end of February 2020, as with other EU countries, it became necessary to take unprecedented steps to control the disease. A tiered approach of public health social distancing measures was first advised by An Taoiseach on 13 March, and these measures were further strengthened on 24 March and again on 27 March, extended to 5 May to continue to suppress transmission of the virus.

The call for extraordinary **solidarity and community spirit**, as well as personal and collective behavioural change, inventiveness and resilience required of each and every one of us at each step to delay the transmission of COVID-19 was heeded; we complied with the restrictions and have succeeded in reducing the spread of infection. Coupled with the ability of our health and social care

services to respond to the needs of persons affected by COVID-19, these measures have saved countless lives. We are grateful and indebted to our healthcare workers, carers, and workers who provide essential services on minimising the impact on our society.

In reality, we have seen Irish society at its very best over the past couple of months, at a time when the risk to the health and wellbeing of everyone in Ireland has been at its greatest.

National Action Plan in response to COVID-19

During January, as COVID-19 became more serious in Europe, the health service and the Government stepped up national public health and emergency responses. The National Public Health Emergency Team (NPHET) and HSE National Crisis Management Teams for COVID-19 were convened and commenced their work at the end of January, as part of the wider whole-of-Government co-ordinated approach.

As this disease progressed, it emerged globally that people living in long-term residential care facilities were at particularly high risk of being susceptible to infection and subsequent adverse outcomes. Responding to these risks, on 12th March, the Irish health service published specific public health and clinical guidance in relation to infection prevention and outbreak control in residential healthcare settings, including nursing homes. One of the subgroups established under the NPHET has been particularly focussed on measures to protect vulnerable groups and individuals in society. A concerted focus has continued on enhancing measures to protect residents and staff in residential healthcare settings.

A National Action Plan was published on 16 March, setting out a whole-of-society response and the mobilisation of resources across Government and society to fight the spread of this virus. The core goals of the National Action Plan, for the health service and across Government, in continuing our response to COVID-19 are to minimise-

- the risk of becoming unwell for all people in Ireland;
- the health, wellbeing and social impact for people, in particular, those who may be at greater risk from COVID-19 through minimising the risk of illness for them while working to maintain their quality of life; and
- the social and economic disruption associated with the COVID-19 outbreak.

Put simply, under the National Action Plan, over the last couple of months, the priorities of the health and social care service have been, and continue to be, to-

- a) implement a coherent **disease control strategy** to suppress the virus so that we can minimise the impact on Irish society through:
 - *public health-led measures* to interrupt person-to-person transmission in the community (such as social distancing measures),
 - protecting *vulnerable people and healthcare and other staff* particularly *in residential settings,* by implementing a comprehensive range of enhanced measures to prevent outbreaks and, where outbreaks occur, controlling those outbreaks and minimising further transmission,
 - expanding sampling, testing and contact tracing capacity to quickly detect cases, to test close contacts and to put in place active surveillance of contacts in order to prevent further spread, and to utilise data, modelling, IT systems and continuous monitoring to enable a real-time

understanding of the evolving impact of the infection on the Irish population so as to guide how we respond, adapt and make decisions,

- b) provide **care** to those people who have become infected with COVID-19 and who need treatment,
- c) ensure that there is **sufficient capacity in our health service** to respond to the demands of COVID-19, including healthcare workers, hospital and ICU beds, as well as essential products and equipment, (e.g. personal protective equipment, ventilators, testing kits etc.),
- d) continuing to **communicate openly and transparently** with the public and healthcare workers.

What has been the effect of the response?

Our combined efforts across society have been having a clear impact. Through our collective action, particularly through the **public health social distancing measures** (staying at home, working from home etc over the last few weeks) and **changing our personal and collective behaviours** (not shaking hands, maintaining our distance etc) we have saved lives and protected countless people from becoming infected. Recognising that COVID-19 will remain a public health threat for some time, the simple changes in personal behaviours must be maintained to interrupt person-to-person transmission and to protect us all.

The NPHET, on behalf of the health service, has been gathering information about the numbers of people infected and using mathematical modelling and evidence from other countries, to predict the likely impact of the disease on the Irish population. This modelling has predicted that, if Ireland had not implemented mitigation measures (such as widespread social distancing), we could have had a peak of up to 120,000 new cases of COVID-19 per day¹. Instead, we have only ever slightly exceeded 1,000 cases reported in a day, our total cases are just over 20,000 and undoubtedly unnecessary hospitalisations and deaths have been prevented. We have also made progress over the last number of weeks in controlling the spread of the virus; the reproduction number of the virus (R) (i.e. the average number of infections generated by an infectious person) has now fallen below 1, with indications being that it is now between 0.5 and 0.8. It has since been estimated that in the initial stages of the unmitigated pandemic the R_0 could have been as high as 4^2 .

Indirect effects

While we have done well in Ireland over the last number of weeks in controlling the spread of infection, the economic consequences and social disruption have been dramatic; for example, many people have lost their jobs, businesses have had to close their doors, children have not gone to school, people have had to forego their social interactions and children have not been able to visit their grandparents. Across the globe it is recognised, as well as in Ireland, that the socio-economic consequences of the public health social distancing measures are likely to be severe.

These measures have also had indirect health and societal effects. The COVID-19 outbreak affects all segments of the population, and the emotional and mental health impact of the outbreak is not limited to patients, healthcare workers, or to families bereaved at this time. From social distancing to cocooning for those over 70 years of age, those extremely medically vulnerable to COVID-19, those with a disability, mental health issues, those living in poverty or marginalised groups using our social inclusion services, their usual social interactions and exercise patterns have altered significantly.

¹ https://www.gov.ie/en/publication/a950be-covid-19-modelling-data-thursday-23-april-2020/

² https://www.ecdc.europa.eu/en/publications-data/rapid-risk-assessment-coronavirus-disease-2019-covid-19-pandemic-ninth-update

It is likely that the health and other impacts of the disease are being borne more by certain sections of society: the young; older people; those who are disadvantaged; people with disabilities; those who are alone and others.

While many are adapting through use of social media or innovative technology, there are reports of increases in loneliness, sense of poorer wellbeing, social isolation, domestic abuse, anxiety and self-harm including attempting suicide among the population, particularly amongst those vulnerable groups. In addition, access to traditional supports including care and treatment has been interrupted. While recognising the adaptation and indeed evolving delivery of all support and health services, there is little doubt of the negative impacts on individuals and society. Many will cope very well through strengthened family, friends, neighbourhood and health and social care services - however for others, we need to continue to build and adapt our society, economic, health and social care supports.

A wide range of mental health and wellbeing initiatives aimed at supporting the diverse mental health needs of the public during the COVID-19 pandemic, including online, are underway to provide supports to the public at large, as well as specific interventions for those in vulnerable groups such as individuals who lose their jobs, healthcare and essential workers, older adults, people with disabilities, and priority groups such as students, traveller and Roma communities and LGBTQ+. Longer terms strategies will be needed to address anxiety, stress, financial pressure, grief, and general uncertainty of living with COVID-19 in our society.

The impact of COVID-19 on the health services has reached beyond infected persons and their families. Over the last number of weeks there has been an obvious reduction in patients presenting at Emergency Departments and for other hospital services, including cancer services due to reduced GP attendances and referrals. This is giving rise to concerns that people may be delaying seeking assistance for illnesses and injuries that require treatment and care. The health service quickly adapted to put in place the necessary capacity and care pathways to respond to COVID-19, however, the new challenge over the coming months will be to deliver all of the other health and social care services in a 'COVID-19-safe' way and restore the confidence of members of the public to avail of those necessary services. It is also essential to continue to protect the future health and wellbeing of our society by putting in place safe ways to provide health protection services for example, such as screening, childhood immunisation services, as well as ensuring a comprehensive seasonal flu vaccination programme this winter, which is of particular importance in light of COVID-19.

Let us also not forget our healthcare workers who are living with the challenge of working on the frontline, and concern about coming home from COVID-19 environments to family members, some of whom may be medically vulnerable or in 'at risk' groups. Infection rates amongst healthcare workers have been a particular challenge, and there continues to be a concerted focus on measures to care for our workers who are at the coalface of caring for infected patients. As we move forward with COVID-19, healthcare workers and their families must continue to be a priority.

Public health approach to lifting COVID-19 restrictive measures - the path to a new way of life

Planning in relation to the lifting of restrictive measures

The risks to human health and life caused by COVID-19 warranted public health measures that have had to be imposed by countries across the globe. These extraordinary measures cannot be continued indefinitely as they come at a significant cost in terms of the quality and meaning of people's lives. Nevertheless, it must be understood that their lifting carries great uncertainty and risk.

The threat posed by COVID-19 to public health and wellbeing and its economic impact are deeply concerning. In considering which restrictions should be lifted in the coming weeks and months, it is important to avoid a false dichotomy between saving lives or livelihoods. This fails to recognise the interdependency between the two. Lifting restrictions too quickly would not only endanger people's health but would also undermine sustainable economic recovery. Ensuring the pandemic is brought and kept under control will facilitate the resumption and maintenance of economic activity.

Based on current evidence, the World Health Organization advises that *the most plausible future scenario in the dynamic of COVID-19 may involve recurring epidemic waves interspersed with periods of low-level transmission*. This means that when Ireland and other countries ease the social distancing restrictions, we are likely to have periods of time when the numbers of people infected increases (waves) and periods when the number of people infected decreases. We remain susceptible to infection and the risk of a large surge of infection will be ever-present; we cannot become complacent. Easing social distancing restrictions must be accompanied by a high level of adherence to the fundamental individual and collective behaviours needed to guard against transmission of the virus; otherwise re-imposition of restrictions will be unavoidable.

We need to start on the path to a new way of life, where we can work together towards adapting and engaging safely in economic and social activities. A whole-of-population approach is central to protecting the health and wellbeing of everybody in our society.

But we should not be afraid. In Ireland, we have faced other infectious diseases in the past, at times when we knew a lot less, and while they were not on the same scale nor did they spread at the speed of COVID-19, we know we can adapt and prevail.

Approach in relation to the easing of measures

Easing the current restrictive social distancing measures is going to be a slow and incremental process. This approach is essential as easing measures too quickly is likely to result in a sudden surge in infections. Any phased reduction of public health social distancing measures may not necessarily follow the same sequence as when the measures were first introduced.

Consequently, **public health advice** should always be clearly and transparently provided as part of decision-making process to inform Government on the slow unwinding of the restrictions. This public health advice will be **grounded in guidance** of international expert bodies such as the World Health Organization, and the European Centre for Disease Prevention and Control as well as experience and learning from other countries, particularly those countries with a similar outbreak profile, and evidence, where available. In addition, NPHET will be guided by the **precautionary principle** which can inform decisions under the significant uncertainty that prevails, while allowing for proportionate and timely decision-making.

This follows a **risk-based approach**, considering risk both from the perspective of protecting those most vulnerable to infection as well as protecting against causes, situations, circumstances, and behaviours that may lead to risk of spread of disease. The approach must also **proportionate** and practical, **balancing overall risk with a hierarchy of benefits** in terms of population health and wellbeing, understanding, feasibility, acceptance and adherence to support ongoing restrictions, economic and social factors, human rights, ethical principles and other considerations.

The WHO and ECDC are warning that the measures have to be lifted in a **very slow, gradual and stepwise manner** in phases separated by **sufficient intervening time** (every 3 weeks) in order to

avoid a rapid upsurge in infections. Measures will be assessed on a regular basis, individually and in combination to consider their impact. There will be close and continuous monitoring across Government as measures are eased, to understand their impact on the disease and as far as possible to avoid a surge. If that happens, certain measures may have to be re-imposed. The approach to reducing measures will evolve as more information becomes available and in line with international learning and experience, in particular from countries ahead of Ireland in terms of their outbreak, to assess closely the effectiveness of their approaches to easing restrictions.

From a public health perspective, key indicators have been developed to identify when to consider the slow and gradual easing of current restrictive measures. As with other countries, in Ireland these include: downward trajectories in the incidence of disease, the numbers of deaths, the numbers of cases and clusters in residential healthcare settings; hospitalisation and ICU capacity; and the delivery of sampling, testing and contact tracing.

We have seen over the last few months that small **changes in our personal behaviours** can have a big impact in saving our own lives and the lives of those around us. Maintaining regular handwashing and good respiratory hygiene, keeping 2metres distance from people, being very vigilant about flu-like symptoms, isolating if we have symptoms, and reducing the number of our close contacts are essential things we all must continue do, and get even better at, over the coming months if we are to successfully ease the current restrictions.

Solidarity and acting together are key to any approach to lifting restrictive measures and will be even more important now than when the measures were introduced and extended. There will be hard choices over the next few months, which may impact upon some of us at different times. We will have to accept that we cannot all get back to our normal lives at the same time, we have to move slowly. Solidarity is not only a national concern, we must be good global citizens and act with care towards those who live in other countries.

Good and continuous **communication** has been critical throughout this pandemic. Government, the Department of Health, HSE and international health organisations have endeavoured to communicate as effectively and openly as possible with the public, in providing clear, consistent and sustained information, as well as adapting information to meet the needs of key groups in society, such as vulnerable groups, healthcare workers and others.

Communication efforts will be redoubled by the health services and across Government in the context of lifting the current measures, including explaining the rationale behind decisions made to adjust measures, as we tread the path towards a new life.

Section 2: Public Health Framework Approach to advising Government regarding reduction of measures

Approach: public health evidence-led and risk-based

- public health-led and grounded in evidence, guidance & advice of ECDC, WHO and EU, as well as experience and learning from similar countries
- risk-based to protect those most vulnerable to infection and to minimise the risk of spread of disease
- proportionate, practical, feasible and acceptable, balancing public health risk with hierarchy of benefits in terms of overall population health & wellbeing, adherence, public sentiment, social & economic considerations.

Key principles: communicating openly and acting together

- Clear consistent sustained accessible communication with public from trusted sources outlining benefits associated with all stages of phased reductions
- Support desired behavioural change through communication and education
- Maintain solidarity, mental wellbeing and resilience
- Continue to maintain openness, transparency and confidence in public health advice
- **Update**, **tailor** and adapt advice, based on data & evolving disease situation
- Tailor key messages for **target groups**, such as, vulnerable groups & health workers
- Reinforce underpinning ethical approach of solidarity and caring for community, minimising harm, fairness, privacy, duty to provide care, proportionality

Core concepts for us all:

What we can each do:

- Maintain handwashing & respiratory hygiene
- Keep 2m distance from other people
- Be hyper-alert to, and isolate if we have symptoms, including flu-like symptoms
- Reduce close contacts and duration of contact with people outside our households (have a micro-community)
- Access advice and supports for mental wellbeing and resilience

What we can do together:

- · Follow public health advice
- · Keep informed about disease in Ireland
- Support vulnerable people and maintain solidarity in our community
- . Support healthcare workers and health service
- Accept that measures can only be lifted in slow stepwise manner and may need to be reintroduced if rate of infection increases

Principles of Approach to reducing measures

- No assurance that it is safe to reduce social distancing measures and stricter measures will have to be reintroduced if there is strong upsurge of infection
- Measures will be reduced in a slow, gradual, stepwise manner over 5 broad phases with 3 weeks between each phase
- Reduction of measures will be robustly and continuously monitored in terms of adherence and effect
- Ideally a 'whole-of-country approach, but potentially a differentiated geographical approach depending on circumstances, e.g. urban/rural
- Approaches to reducing measures will evolve as information becomes available and in line with international learning and experience, especially countries ahead in terms of their outbreak
- Reducing measures **critically dependent** on health service's ability to:
- find new cases by consistently testing and contact tracing, and utilise robust information on disease, system capacity and performance,
- implement mechanisms to protect 'at risk' groups particularly, from outbreaks.

Disease indicators

- 1. Trajectory in incidence of disease
- Trajectory in number of cases & clusters in residential healthcare settings
- 3. Trajectory in number of deaths
- 4. Hospitalisation and ICU occupancy
- $5.\,Programme\ to\ consistently\ sample,\ test\ and\ contact\ trace.$
- * and other criteria as may arise in the future.

Monitoring the Disease & reduction of measures

- Essential Health data sources: epidemiological data & modelling; incidence of outbreaks in residential settings; testing and contact tracing; health service capacity & performance (incl. ICU beds, hospital, access to essential products, PPE, masks)
- Non-health information sources: transportation data; data and information on mobility and congregation; other sources

Alternative and evolving regulatory approach

- Travel and distance restrictions currently in place will change over time
- New requirements will be developed in relation to premises, transport, and business compliance
- Existing regulatory approaches will be examined and structures put in place to support organisations in meeting new requirements

WHO predicts that the most plausible scenario is recurring epidemic waves interspersed with periods of low-level transmission

Gradual reduction of public health social distancing measures over time

(with potential reintroduction of measures if an upsurge in disease occurs)

Phases 1-3 Phase 4 Phase 5

Section 3: Guide to the NPHET public health framework approach to advising Government in relation to reducing public health social distancing measures (contained in Appendix 1)

- 1. The World Health Organization predicts that the most plausible scenario is recurring epidemic waves interspersed with periods of low-level transmission.
- 2. This document is the National Public Health Emergency Team (NPHET) public health framework approach to a planned phased reduction of social distancing measures. Its purpose is to assist Government in informing its decisions in responding to the emergency, and is to be used in advising the Minister for Health and Government in relation to adjusting the public health social distancing measures in response to the progression of the disease.
- 3. It is a **living, flexible document** and will be subject to regular review in the context of the progression or suppression of the disease in Ireland at different points in time; new guidance and evidence which emanate from the research, experience and findings of international bodies and of other countries; and consideration of the utility and outcomes of taking certain measures.
- 4. This framework approach contains a range of indicative measures set out under a number of different headings (categories) and across a number of potential phases. The measures are not to be interpreted as definitive decisions, instead the measures described are intended to be illustrative of possible measures. The measures cannot all begin at once, for to do so would result in too many people being on the move, increasing opportunities for disease transmission. Over the coming period, as NPHET monitors the progress of the disease, these are intended to provide the NPHET with a **flexible menu of possible options** to consider, in providing public health advice to Government regarding the adjustment of social distancing measures.
 - a. Under each heading, a number of phases are set out. These phases are broadly considered to be sequential under each heading. However, the categories can be read independently of each other (for example a Phase 3 Education measure might be started before a Phase 3 Social / Recreational measure, depending on the circumstances at the time).
 - b. Recommendations to action a measure under one phase under a given heading does not mean that all other measures in the same phase under that heading will necessarily be recommended for activation. The framework is intended to be applied flexibly, so that it would be open to the NPHET, at any point in time, to recommend measures from later phases depending on the prevailing circumstances.
- 5. Ongoing two-way communication with the public will be essential to ensure that
 - a. the public are informed of the changes in restrictions as approved by Government, and the social distancing and other measures that are in place at each phase;
 - b. there is clear and coherent information about the public health rationale and an explanation of changes made by Government, with a view to encouraging adherence with measures;
 - c. feedback mechanisms are in place to better understand the measures which work most effectively, areas of challenge, opportunities to innovate in protecting the safety of people while progressing towards a return to economic and social life.

- 6. The purpose of this public health framework approach is to inform a slow, gradual, step-wise and incremental reduction of the current public health social distancing measures, in a risk-based, fair and proportionate way with a view to effectively supressing the spread of COVID-19 disease while enabling the gradual return of social and economic activity.
- 7. This framework also acknowledges that there are other important considerations regarding the reduction of measures that Government will have, such as social and economic considerations, adherence, public sentiment, acceptability, feasibility, overall population health & wellbeing and others.

Appendix 1 – Public health framework approach to advising on reducing social distancing measures (measures listed are illustrative)

		1. Co	ommunity Health Measures		
Measure Category	Phase 1	Phase 2	Phase 3	Phase 4	Phase 5
Wearing of face coverings in community	Develop guidance for wearing of face coverings in community and has regard to the need for medical grade masks by healthcare workers (and other specified categories of persons)	Roll out guidance for wearing of face coverings in community			
'Stay at home' restriction	Continue to avoid unnecessary journeys	Extend restriction to within 20km of your home Continue to avoid unnecessary journeys	Maintain restriction to within 20km of your home Continue to avoid unnecessary journeys	Extend travel to outside your region	
Cocooning	• Up to 4 persons not of	 Consider designating specific retail hours coordinated across all retailers for over 70s and medically vulnerable, with strict social distancing; provision of gloves, ideally wearing face coverings Visits to homes of over 70s and medically vulnerable by no more than a small number of persons for a short period of time wearing gloves, face coverings, maintaining strict 2m social distancing 			Continue cocooning of over 70s and extremely medically vulnerable until later phases due to higher risk
groups outdoors	same household to meet outdoors while maintaining strict social distancing				
Social visits	Continue to avoid non- essential social visiting Develop guidance in relation to micro- communities (very small group of specific close contacts)	Small number of persons may visit another household for a short period of time while maintaining strict social distancing		Slightly larger number of people may visit another household for a short period of time while maintaining social distancing	
Family-type social gatherings	Continue current restrictions on attendance at funerals to a maximum of ten people and only members of the household, close family or close friends if the deceased has no household or family members	Slightly larger number of people in attendance at funerals but still restricted to immediate family and close friends and limited to a maximum number of mourners for a limited period of time where social distancing can be maintained		Small social gatherings by family and close friends limited to a maximum number of attendees for a limited period of time where social distancing can be maintained (e.g. small weddings, baptisms)	Large social gatherings (e.g. large weddings to be restricted to later phases due to risk)
Other (non- commercial) social events				Small social (non-family) gatherings limited to a maximum number of participants for a limited period of time where social distancing can be maintained	 Large social (non- family) gatherings restricted to later phases due to risk
Household contacts of suspect cases					Continue to restrict all household contact of suspect cases (awaiting test results or 14 days isolation) 12 L P a g e

		1. Cq	ommunity Health Measures		
Measure Category	Phase 1	Phase 2	Phase 3	Phase 4	Phase 5
Public health r	of contacts is As the strings with whom the rates of trans be conducted. The effectiver contact ⁴ . The continues WHO, ECDC and International groups with a those in at rise ECDC and Whomas with the string	important in any measure received physical distancing menter come into contact; consistentials of and for social interaction to process of containment and mitigated protection of people aged or and EU Commission which all reand national evidence shows in elevated risk for COVID-19. It groups be continued ^{5,6} . HO, on basis of increasing evented the contained of	d in reducing the transmission duction. Deasures is reduced, members stently meeting with the same diverse and changing group. The promote wellbeing, while still liveration depends on limiting the liver 70 and those with underlying the importance of promote the importance of promotes and promotes are coverings may reduce spreaments.	of the public should be encore colleagues and small group the promotion of 'micro-comm miting the spread of infection number of social contacts, but sing health conditions is in line totecting the vulnerable populate of the property with specific underlying and that the cocooning measures with mild or no symptoms	ouraged to carefully consider of friends will lead to lower unities' will allow for work to 3. talso the duration of each with recommendations of lations. health conditions are es for the over 70s and for

³ ECDC Rapid Risk Assessment Coronavirus disease 2019 (Covid-19) in the EU/EEA and the UK – Ninth update 23 April 2020 ⁴ OECD: Flattening the covid-19 peak: Containment and mitigation policies, Updated 24 March 2020

⁵ WHO Considerations in adjusting public health and social measures in the context of COVID-19: interim guidance, 16 April 2020 ⁶ ECDC Rapid Risk Assessment Coronavirus disease 2019 (Covid-19) in the EU/EEA and the UK – Ninth Update 23 April 2020

			2. Educ	cation & Childcare Meas	ures	
Measure category	Pha	se 1	Phase 2	Phase 3	Phase 4	Phase 5
Education & Childcare	service whe childcare we support in a	orted in-reach re registered orkers provide n essential worker's home		Opening of crèches, childminders and pre- schools for children of essential workers in phased manner with social distancing and other requirements applying	 Opening of crèches, childminders and pre- schools for children of all other workers on a gradually increasing phased basis (e.g. one day per week) and slowly increasing thereafter 	
	Opening of school and college buildings for access by teachers for organisation and distribution of remote learning					Commence opening on a phased basis at the beginning of the academic year 2020/21: Primary and secondary schools Universities, 3 rd level education centres and adult education centres
population of transmiss It appears th uncommon ⁸		population de of transmission lt appears that uncommon ⁸ . The effectives	ensity onsite in childcare/pre- on of the disease. It COVID-19 infections are less	sed and stepwise basis allows school and education facilities is frequently observed in children ation depends on limiting the n	at junior levels to facilitate soc	ial distancing and reduce risk mission appears to be

 $^{^{7}}$ ECDC Rapid Risk Assessment Coronavirus disease 2019 (Covid-19) in the EU/EEA and the UK - ninth update 23 April 2020

⁸ ECDC Rapid Risk Assessment Coronavirus disease 2019 (Covid-19) in the EU/EEA and the UK – ninth update 23 April 2020 ⁹ OECD: Flattening the covid-19 peak: Containment and mitigation policies, Updated 24 March 2020

Appendix 1 – Public health framework approach to advising on reducing social distancing measures (measures listed are illustrative)

		3. Health & Socia	al Care Services Measur	es	
Measure	Phase 1	Phase 2	Phase 3	Phase 4	Phase 5
Measure category a) Increasing delivery of "non-COVID-19" care and services alongside COVID-19-care	During Phases 1 and 2, inc care and services alongside demand through: Capacity planning for on non-COVID-19 care an modelling capability to primary, acute (includi mental health, disabili continuum of care. Implement measures to 19 and non-COVID-19 Continue to deliver cathrough telephone, on models of care to mee concerns of patients, so workers. Communication camporate encourage people need it, advise of health and to reduce risk of communication camporates. Implement activities to care and services (in a measures) such as the protective equipment, may emerge over time. Continue to support the initiatives directed to the health and resilience in times. Continue to maintain in the capacity of the continue to maintain in the capacity of the capacity	rease delivery of non-COVID-19 e COVID-19 care to meet ongoing delivery of COVID-19 and d services side by side, utilising of assist in predicting demand for: ng ICU), community, social care, ties and other services along the consure safe delivery of COVID-care and services side by side. The analysis of the services are and services in new ways (e.g., line, virtual clinics etc) and new to demand and to alleviate ervice users and healthcare are services in the service with public to: to present for care when they and social care services initiatives ontracting COVID-19, and regard to non-COVID-19 care of mitigate risk in the provision of didition to social distancing. The services in the service of masks, personal testing and other measures that the mental health and wellbeing meeting the diverse mental seeds of the public during these mechanisms to provide	Phase 3	Phase 4	Phase 5
b) Visiting	community support to	those in vulnerable groups.	Commence a phased approach to visiting at hospital / residential healthcare centre / other residential settings / prisons etc., bearing in mind the particular features of types of settings and each individual centre, also considering personal protective equipment availability and other protections.		Return to normal visiting for hospital / residential healthcare centre / other residential settings / prisons
Public health ration	nale:	The full resumption of the Health 19. The WHO recently highlighted health service recovery. Maintaining population trust in the infection risk in health facilities is advice. Continuation of primary if such as telemedicine to monitor patients. Countries will need to make the simultaneously engaging in delivery, mitigating the risk of systargeted referral of COVID-19 and	n Services is contingent on the ed the importance of taking a continuous of the education of the health system is key to ensuring appropriate contents and remote consultationate difficult decisions to bala in strategic planning and coordistem collapse Establishing e	dual approach i.e. balancing C em to safely meet essential ne are-seeking behavior and adf I. Where possible, the use of t ions should be considered, to nce the demands of respondir inated action to maintain esse ffective patient flow (through	eds and to control nerence to public health echnological solutions minimize risk to ag directly to COVID-19, ential health service

		4. E	conomic Activity (Work)				
Measure	Phase 1	Phase 2	Phase 3	Phase 4	Phase 5		
category							
Economic	Applying a risk-based	Applying a risk-based	Applying a risk-based	Applying a risk-based return	Applying a risk-based return		
Activity	approach:	approach:	approach:	to onsite working:	to onsite working applicable		
(Work)	 Permit phased return of 	Permit phased return of	 Organisations where 	 Organisations where 	fairly across all sectors:		
	outdoor workers (e.g.	workers, such as solitary	employees have low	employees cannot	Phased "return to onsite		
(applying	construction workers,	and other workers that,	levels of daily interaction	remote work to be	working" arrangement		
over and	gardeners etc). Social	due to nature of work,	with people and where	considered first for return			
above	distancing requirements	can maintain 2m distance	social distancing can be	to onsite working	'Higher risk'		
currently	continue to apply.	constantly. Social	maintained.	arrangements.	organisations which by		
permitted	continue to appry.	distancing requirements	aea.	urrangements.	their nature cannot		
work	Continue to maintain	continue to apply.	Continue to maintain	 Depending on business, 	easily maintain social		
arrange-	remote working for all	continue to apply.	remote working for all	shift work, staggered	distancing implement		
ments)	•	Continue to maintain	workers / businesses that		• '		
mentaj	can do so.		can do so.		plans for how they can		
	can do so.	remote working for all		operated to increase % of	, , ,		
		workers / businesses that		workforce available for	towards onsite return		
		can do so.		work in any 24-hour	of full staff		
				period, as long as they	complement.		
		Organisations to develop		can limit the number of			
		plans for return to onsite		workers interacting with			
		working by employees in		each other.			
		light of COVID-19					
		considering:		 Continue to maintain 			
		 Social distancing 		remote working for all			
		compliance		workers / businesses that			
		 Hygiene and cleaning 		can do so.			
		Compliance in higher risk					
		situations					
		 plans for medically 					
		vulnerable / pregnant etc					
		 extended opening hours 					
		to enable social					
		distancing.					
		distancing.					
		State to develop mechanism					
		for supporting, advising on,					
		assessing, regulating					
		planning for return to onsite					
Dudalia la a ale	h makin malan	working by organisations.			and another in and and a		
Public nealt		•		ents are made to limit population	on density in order to		
	Tacilita	te social distancing and limit po	erson to person contact and th	e time spent in contact.			
		atom of the case of the case	handel handres to the	in that with air			
				ing that authorities and busine			
		to increasing activities in safe way recognising the interdependency between public health and wellbeing and economic activity. There are several models (jobs suitable for teleworking, economic importance, shifts of workers etc.) but not all the population					
		_	=				
		•	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	cus on less endangered groups	ana sectors that are		
	essent	ial to facilitate economic activit	ty (e.g. transport) ¹¹ .				
		•	mitigation depends on limiting	the number of social contacts,	but also the duration of		
	each c	ontact ¹² .					

 $^{^{11}}$ EU Commission – European Roadmap towards lifting COVID-19 containment measures 14 April 2020 12 OECD: Flattening the covid-19 peak: Containment and mitigation policies, Updated 24 March 2020

	5. Retail, Personal Services and Commercial Activities							
Measure category	Phase	e 1	Phase 2	Phase 3	Phase 4	Phase 5		
Commercial Activity (Retail) (applying over and above currently permitted retail arrange- ments)	Applying a risk-based approach: Open retail outlets that are primarily outdoor (e.g. garden centres, hardware stores etc) Open retail outlets that were open in Tier 2 (e.g. homeware, opticians, motor, bicycle & repair, office products, electrical, IT, phone sales & repair etc.) Retailers to develop plan for safe operation and protection of staff and customers considering: Social distancing compliance Hygiene and cleaning Compliance in higher risk situations Extended opening hours		social distancing can be maintained	Applying a risk-based approach: • Phase in opening of all other non-essential retail outlets on basis of restriction on the number of staff and customers per square metre so that social distancing can be maintained. To be limited to retail outlets with street-level entrance and exit i.e. which are not in enclosed shopping centres due to higher risk.	Applying a risk-based approach: • Commence loosening restrictions on higher risk services involving direct physical contact for periods of time between people and for which there is a population-wide demand (e.g. hairdressers, barbers).	Opening of enclosed shopping centres where social distancing can be maintained. Further loosening of restrictions on services involving direct physical contact for periods of time between people for which there is not a population-wide demand (e.g. tattoo, piercing) for later phases due to risk.		
staff, thereby disease. Retail outlets their staff int There is a hybeauticians of Control of the centres / may A review of the Control of th		I limiting the transmission is that are small in size with eracts with on a daily basic igher risk associated with tc. e population density is mould list hereby facilitating persiche progression of the dise the progression of the dise the set of containment and makes could be lifted first where set out the transmission of the dise the set of containment and makes could be lifted first where sets of containment and makes of containment and mak	the spread of the infection a predifficult in outlets which are conto person transmission. as within and between each stantification depends on limiting the propulation density or individuals.	of the health system to cope all placed to limit and control associated with person to per designed for the congregation age is required. The number of social contacts, but all density is lower or where an all the contacts are the contacts and the contacts are the contacts.	with the inevitable increase in the number of customers that son contact e.g. hairdressers, of people e.g. indoor shopping at also the duration of each			

 $^{^{13}}$ OECD: Flattening the covid-19 peak: Containment and mitigation policies: Updated 24 March 2020

WHO Considerations in adjusting public health and social measures in the context of COVID-19: 16 April 2020
 EU Commission – European Roadmap towards lifting COVID-19 containment measures: 14 April 2020

		6.	Cultural & Social Measu	res	
Measure	Phase 1	Phase 2	Phase 3	Phase 4	Phase 5
category					
a) Culture & religious	Open outdoor public amenities and tourism sites (e.g. carparks, beaches, mountain walks etc) where people are non-stationary and where social distancing can be maintained	Open public libraries with numbers limited, social distancing observed and strict hand hygiene on entry	Open playgrounds where social distancing and hygiene can be maintained	Open museums, galleries, and other cultural outlets where people are non- stationary, social distancing can be maintained and strict hand hygiene on entry Open religious and places of worship where social distancing can be maintained	Open theatres and cinemas where social distancing can be maintained
b) Sport	Open outdoor public sports amenities (e.g. pitches, tennis courts, golf courses etc) where social distancing can be maintained Permit people to engage in outdoor sporting and fitness activities, either individually or in very small groups (maximum 4 people), where social distancing can be maintained and where there is no contact	Permit people to engage in outdoor sporting and fitness activities, involving small group team sports training (but not matches) where social distancing can be maintained and where there is no contact	Permit "behind closed doors" sporting activities events where arrangements are in place to enable participants to maintain social distancing	Permit sports team leagues but only where limitations are placed on the numbers of spectators and where social distancing can be maintained Open public swimming pools where effective cleaning can be carried out and social distancing can be maintained	Permit close physical contact sports (rugby, boxing, wrestling) Open gyms, exercise, dance studios and sports clubs, only where regular and effective cleaning can be carried out and social distancing can be maintained Permit sports spectatorship which involve mass gatherings only in accordance with both indoor and outdoor numbers restrictions and where social distancing can be complied with
c) Social / Recreational			Open cafés and restaurants providing on- premises food & beverages where they can comply with social distancing measures and strict cleaning in operation	Opening of hotels, hostels, caravan parks, holiday parks for social and tourist activities initially on a limited occupancy basis (or number of people per square metre) and then increasing over time (and where social distancing is complied with). Hotel bars remain closed	Indoor recreational venues (roller skating, bowling alley, bingo halls where numbers can be limited, cleaning can be maintained, restrictions where social distancing can be complied with. Open pubs, bars, nightclubs, casinos, where social distancing and strict cleaning can be complied with Festivals, events and other social and cultural mass gatherings only in accordance with both indoor and outdoor numbers and where social distancing can be complied with.
Public health r	wellbeing. The prerequisite, th disease. This w cultural sites to and early phase	public health rationale is to ereby limiting the transmis ill be done where the visiti be relaxed on phased basi s, and social aspects in the	to lift restrictions in such a way a ssion rate and protect the capacing population density can be mind s linked to ability to maintain social later phases.	cial needs, to support mental and is to protect the ability to maintai ty of the health system to cope with mised. Restrictions on sporting, cial distance, with emphasis on spurports of social contacts, but also under the social contacts, but also contacts, but also contacts.	in social distancing vith the inevitable increase in entertainment, culinary and port and exercise in the initial
	Social activity m allowed, etc.) ¹⁷	neasures (restaurants, cafe	s, etc.), with possible gradation (restricted opening hours, maximu	um number of people

 $^{^{16}}$ OECD: Flattening the covid-19 peak: Containment and mitigation policies, Updated 24 March 2020:

¹⁷ EU Commission – European Roadmap towards lifting COVID-19 containment measures, 14 April 2020

			7. Transpoi	t & Travel Measures				
Measure		Phase 1	Phase 2	Phase 3	Phase 4	Phase 5		
category	 Public health risks connected with travel include- collective and time-bound nature of public transport, numbers of vehicles (including private cars) travelling to specific destinations resulting in significant crowding at those locations (e.g. url areas, popular public sites and amenities etc.) – which will require continued focus on social distancing and other hygiene requirements both while travelling and at destination, travel from areas of higher infection rate to areas of lower infection rate potentially increasing spread, an ongoing requirement that people travelling in private transportation maintain social distancing, hygiene and compliance with other 							
a) Transport and travel (national)	 Public t Local A detailed numbe monito part of 	ransport providers & uthorities to provide d data on traveller rs to enable ring of movement as data feed on ng impact of lifting of	pand on arrival at destination. Public transport providers- actively restrict & monitor nos. travelling to ensure SD compliance cleaning and timetables to be enhanced to ensure SD can be complied with	Consider implement travel restrictions on nos. travelling to and in major urban centres on weekdays and weekend days: • public transport providers to actively restrict & monitor nos. travelling to ensure SD compliance • restrictions to be implemented on numbers of private cars	Progressively decrease restrictions on numbers travelling in major urban centres- on public transport and in private cars	Resume tourist travel to offshore islands by non-residents		
b) Travel to and from overseas	approa enterii service days si manda Testini • Avoid in rela	ach from public health ng from overseas other es should provide detail elf-isolation. In the abs atory quarantine 14-day g on entry to be conside non-essential overseas tion to travel from the	travel - consistent message					
c) Non- national Leisure cruise vessels	non-na	in restrictions on tional non-essential cruise vessels						
d) International engagement	Northern public he	d engagement with Ireland regarding alth approaches to ntain the infection n island.	Support coordinated engagement on de-escalation measures at EU & international level, including with UK.					
Public health ra	tionale:	Increasing the number people have with each disease. The continued distancing in conjunct. The gradual reintroder particular types of acceptivate cars) should be health-oriented mease equipment to transpounds and in vehicles,	sential travel. ers of the population using pubth other and limits the amount ed cleaning, modification of timition with individual responsibility action of transport services shoutivities while taking account of the allowed as soon as possible, sures (e.g. reducing the density ort personnel and/or passenger etc.)18	lic transport must be done in a of time spent in each other's cleatables and the restriction of ity for hand hygiene, cough eticuld be adapted to the phasing the level of risk in the areas cowhile collective means of trans of passengers in vehicles, high s, using protective barriers, more	the virus can be complemented way which continues to limit the ompany in order to reduce transumbers will go some way to farquette and physical distancing. Out of travel restrictions and the incerned. Lower-risk, individualist sport should be gradually phased or service frequency, issuing per taking sanitizing/disinfecting geling social contacts, but also the distance of the social contacts, but also the social contacts, but also the social contacts of the social contacts of the social contacts of the social contacts.	ne amount of contact smission of the cilitating social e phasing in of sed transport (e.g. d in with necessary sonal protective available at transport		

 $^{^{18}}$ EU Commission – European Roadmap towards lifting COVID-19 containment measures 14 April 2020 19 OECD: Flattening the covid-19 peak: Containment and mitigation policies, Updated 24 March 2020