THE WORSHIP MUSIC OF DUBLIN'S CHURCH OF IRELAND PARISHES AND OTHER PROTESTANT DENOMINATIONS IN THE LONG EIGHTEENTH CENTURY: SOURCES, REPERTOIRE AND CULTURAL CONTEXT

Submitted for the degree of Doctor in Philosophy

University of Dublin

March 2022

by

Eleanor Jones-McAuley

Complete in Two Volumes

Volume 1

DECLARATION

I declare that this thesis has not been submitted as an exercise for a degree at this or any other university and it is entirely my own work.

I agree to deposit this thesis in the University's open access institutional repository or allow the Library to do so on my behalf, subject to Irish Copyright Legislation and Trinity College Library conditions of use and acknowledgement.

I consent to the examiner retaining a copy of the thesis beyond the examining period, should they so wish (EU GDPR May 2018).

Eleanor Jones-McAuley

Chonting

SUMMARY

This thesis examines the worship music of Protestant churches and meeting houses in Dublin during the period 1691–1800. Its specific objectives are: firstly, to reconstruct the tune repertory and performance practice of the city's parish churches and meeting houses through an examination of primary sources; secondly, to contextualise these musical traditions both in relation to one another and to the physical and ideological surroundings in which they emerged; and thirdly, to investigate the relationship between worship music and the "inner world" of eighteenth-century Dublin Protestants: how they thought about, and situated themselves within, the world around them. To these ends I employ a methodology best described as a combination of "urban musicology" and "cultural history", which prioritises the contextualisation of musical repertories and traditions within the physical and figurative landscapes in which they were produced as a means of understanding the way in which the people who listened to, spoke about, and participated in them thought about their world.

Chapter one examines the music of the city's parish churches, and how it was affected by contemporary ideologies and attitudes, particularly the eighteenth-century drive for "improvement". Taking the parish church of St Michan's as a case study, it situates the world of parish music-making within the wider context of the parish, and of the city more generally. Chapter two addresses the music (or lack thereof) of the "Old Dissenters"—the Presbyterians, Baptists and Quakers—in the context of the social position of Nonconformists within eighteenth-century Dublin society, while chapter three examines the evangelical movements of the mid- to late-eighteenth century, and how the character of public worship music changed alongside the changing character of the city

during this period. Chapter four discusses the Huguenot and Lutheran communities, and the significance of their particular musical traditions in the maintenance of a distinct corporate identity which remained distinguished from, but shared many elements with, that of the city's other Protestant communities during the eighteenth century. Finally, chapter five collects together the tunes identified in the surviving Dublin tunebooks from this period to create a "Dublin church tune repertory", revealing that a broadly similar tune repertory was in use across the general Protestant community during the eighteenth century despite their denominational and cultural differences. Through these successive studies of different Protestant groups, I conclude that worship music was responsive to, and expressed, extra-musical forces such as social position, historical identity, anti-Catholicism, the drive for progress and improvement, and politico-cultural allegiances, and that through the study of this somewhat neglected area of eighteenth-century worship music practice it is possible to gain a deeper understanding of the mental world of eighteenth-century Dublin.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Volume 1

Abbreviations and Library Sigla	viii
List of Music Examples, Tables and Illustrations	X
Acknowledgements	xii
Introduction	1
1. PARISH MUSIC AND PARISH MINDSETS	23
1.1 The Dublin Parish	25
1.1.1 Internal administrative structure of the parish: the	
"middling sort"	25
1.1.2 Dublin's parishes: a picture of expansion and improvement	29
1.1.3 The other parish system: Catholics in Dublin	33
1.1.4 The parish church as venue	39
1.2 Parish Church Music	43
1.2.1 Protestant theology of worship music	43
1.2.2 Anglican music: two traditions	45
1.2.3 Metrical psalmody: Sternhold and Hopkins	47
1.2.4 Metrical psalms in performance	50
1.2.5 Tate & Brady's New Version (1696)	54
1.3 Organs and Organists	61
1.3.1 Organs as instruments of improvement	61
1.3.2 Organists (male and female)	71
1.3.3 Organ music and the organist's duties	75

1.4 Charity Schools	79
1.4.1 The charity school movement	79
1.4.2 Case study: St Michan's charity schools	84
1.4.3 Music at the charity schools	87
1.5 Printed Music and Music Printers	91
1.5.1 Select Psalms (1752) and A Collection of Psalms (1777)	91
1.5.2 Powell and Bonham: a case study of music printers	95
1.6 Conclusions	102
2. DISSENT AND ESTABLISHMENT 1691–1740	104
2.1 The "Old Dissenters" in Dublin	106
2.2 Dublin Presbyterians and their Music	110
2.2.1 Dublin's Presbyterian community	110
2.2.2 Presbyterian worship music	113
2.2.3 The Dublin Presbyterian position: Joseph Boyse versus	
William King	116
2.3 Early Eighteenth-Century Tune Sources	122
2.3.1 The tunebooks of Thomas Smith	122
2.3.2 Joseph Boyse's Sacramental Hymns (1693) and Family	
Hymns (1701)	130
2.3.3 Bradley's Psalms of David in Metre (1740)	139
2.4 The Dublin Baptists	145
2.5 Protestant Unity and its Limits: The Quakers	151

2.6 Conclusions	157
3. HYMNODY AND EVANGELICALISM 1740–1800	159
3.1 The Rise of the Hymn: Isaac Watts	163
3.2 The Moravians	167
3.2.1 Origins of Moravianism	167
3.2.2 Moravianism in Dublin	169
3.2.3 The Moravian church on Big Butter Lane	177
3.2.4 Moravian music	180
3.2.5 Sources of Dublin Moravian hymns	184
3.2.6 Cennick's Collection of Sacred Hymns (1752)	189
3.2.7 The Moravian tune repertory	192
3.2.8 Instrumental music and the organ	195
3.3 The Methodists	201
3.3.1 Origins and practices of Methodism in Ireland	201
3.3.2 Methodist music	205
3.4 Later Eighteenth-Century Tune Sources	209
3.4.1 A Collection of Hymns and Sacred Poems (1749)	209
3.4.2 A Collection of Hymns and Sacred Poems (1779)	215
3.4.3 Select Tunes for Sacred Use (1780)	219
3.4.4 McVity's Select Psalm and Hymn Tunes (1787)	225
3.5 Dissent within the Establishment: Extra-Parochial Chapels	228
3.6 Conclusions	233

4. THE PROTESTANT STRANGERS	235
4.1 "Protestant Strangers": Background and Legislation	236
4.1.1 The first "Protestant Strangers"	236
4.1.2 Foreign Protestants in Ireland: The "Protestant Strangers Acts"	238
4.2 The Huguenots	243
4.2.1 Huguenot immigration to Ireland, 1662–1760	243
4.2.2 The Dublin Huguenot community	248
4.2.3 Non-established conformity: the French conforming churches	250
4.2.4 The non-conforming Huguenot congregations	255
4.2.5 Music in Huguenot worship: the Genevan Psalter	259
4.2.6 Huguenot music books	265
4.2.7 The Genevan Psalter and Huguenot identity	276
4.3 The Lutherans: A Musical Enigma	285
4.3.1 Lutherans in Dublin	285
4.3.2 Lutherans and music	292
4.4 Conclusions	299
5: THE DUBLIN CHURCH TUNE REPERTORY	301
5.1 Observations on the Dublin tune repertory	302
5.2 Comparisons with other tune sources	306
5.2.1 Cochran's Selection of Psalm and Hymn Tunes (1804)	306
5.2.2 Weyman's Melodia Sacra (1816)	308
5.2.3 Supplement to the New Version (1708)	312

	vii
5.3 Conclusions	314
CONCLUSION	315
BIBLIOGRAPHY	320
Volume 2	
MUSIC EXAMPLES	343
ILLUSTRATIONS	355
TABLES	356
APPENDIX 1: THE DUBLIN TUNE REPERTORY	360
APPENDIX 2: A COLLECTION OF HYMNS AND SACRED POEMS (DUBLIN: S. POWELL, 1749)	367

APPENDIX 3: CANTIQUES SACREZ (DUBLIN: CHEZ SAMUEL

377

POWELL, 1748)

ABBREVIATIONS AND LIBRARY SIGLA

General

bap. baptised

c. circa; "approximately"

d. died

ed., eds edited by, editors

edn edition

et al. et alii; "and others"

Ex., Exx. Example, Examples

ff. following

MS manuscript

Ps., Pss. Psalm, Psalms

trans. translated by

vol., vols volume, volumes

Bibliographical

BCP Book of Common Prayer

DIB Dictionary of Irish Biography

ECCO Eighteenth-Century Collections Online

EEBO Early English Books Online

ESTC English Short Title Catalogue

GMO Grove Music Online

HTI Hymn Tune Index

KJV King James Version (Bible)

ODNB Oxford Dictionary of National Biography

Wing Short-title catalogue of books printed in England, Scotland, Ireland,

Wales, and British America, and of English books printed in other

countries, 1641–1700

Library Sigla

F-Pn Bibliotheque nationale de France

GB-Cu Cambridge University Library

GB-En National Library of Scotland

GB-Lbl British Library

GB-Ob Oxford Bodleian Library

IRL-Dcla Dublin City Library and Archive

IRL-Dn National Library of Ireland

IRL-Dtc Trinity College Dublin

US-Ps Pittsburgh Theological Seminary Clifford E. Barbour Library

US-CHH University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill

US-SM Huntingdon Library, San Marino, CA

US-U University of Illinois, Urbana

US-WOa American Antiquarian Society Library, Worcester, MA

US-WS Washington Folger Shakespeare Library

LIST OF MUSIC EXAMPLES, ILLUSTRATIONS AND TABLES

Music Examples

Ex. 1: "Ps. 137 Old" tune [109c] from <i>Select Psalms</i> (1752)	343
Ex. 2: "Ps. 119" tune [120c] from <i>Select Psalms</i> (1752)	343
Ex. 3: "St Luke's" [667a] and "St Martin's" [668a] from <i>Select Psalms</i> (1752)	344
Ex. 4: "Hanover" tune [657d] from A Collection of Psalms (1777)	344
Ex. 5: "Bristol" tune [583] from Smith, Psalms of David (1699)	345
Ex. 6: "Ely" tune [584] from Smith, Psalms of David (1699)	345
Ex. 7: "Oxford" tune [585] from Smith, Psalms of David (1699)	346
Ex. 8: "Lord's Prayer" [130a] from Supplement to the New Version (1700)	346
Ex. 9: "Southwell" tune [269j] from Smith, Psalms of David (1699)	346
Ex. 10: "Dublin" tune [271c] from Smith, Psalms of David (1699)	347
Ex. 11: "St Mary's" tune [542a] from Smith, Psalms of David (1699)	347
Ex. 12: "London" tune [497b] from Smith, Psalms of David (1699)	347
Ex. 13: "Stanford" tune [591] from Smith, Psalms of David (1699)	348
Ex. 14: "St David's" tune [379f] from Smith, Psalms of David (1699)	348
Ex. 15: "Dursley" tune [1545] from Psalms of David (1740)	349
Ex. 16: "London" [497b] and "Shuston" [750b] from <i>Psalms of David</i> (1740)	349
Ex. 17: "Andrew's" tune [663b] from <i>Psalms of David</i> (1740)	350
Ex. 18: "Elgin" tune [400] from <i>Psalms of David</i> (1740)	350
Ex. 19: "How bright appears the morning star" from LaTrobe,	
<i>Hymn-tunes</i> (1790)	350
Ex. 20: "O head so full of bruises" from LaTrobe, Hymn-tunes (1790)	351
Ex. 21: "Cork" tune [10157] from <i>Select Tunes</i> (1780)	351
Ex. 22: "Mystic" tune [14742] from <i>Select Tunes</i> (1780)	352
Ex. 23: "Helmsley" tune [2973d] from McVity, Select Psalm and	
Hymn Tunes (1787)	352

Ex. 24: "Head of the Church triumphant" from Lampe, <i>Hymns on the Great Festivals</i> (1746)	353	
Ex. 25: "St Ann's" [664a] from Select Tunes (1780)	353	
Ex. 26: "Old Hundredth" [143a] from Select Tunes (1780)		
Ex. 27: "Ps. 119" [120c] from A Collection of Hymns and Sacred Poems (1749)	354	
Illustrations		
Illus. 1: The Powell family music type	355	
Illus. 2: George Bonham's music type	355	
Tables		
Table 1: Tunes from Select Psalms (1752) compared with the Supplement to		
the New Version (1708) and to the pre-existing Dublin sources		
Table 2: Comparison of tune contents of sources Smith1, Smith2 and Boyse2	357	
Table 3: Tunes occurring most frequently across the Dublin tune sources	358	
Table 4: Dublin repertory tunes that do not appear in the 1708 Supplement to		
The New Version	359	

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First and foremost, I wish to thank my endlessly patient supervisor, Dr Andrew Johnstone, for his unwavering support even during my rockiest research periods. This thesis would not exist without his encouragement and expertise. I would also like to extend my gratitude to everyone at the Trinity Music department for supporting me in my research for many years.

A great many people were instrumental in the completion of this research project—far too many to name here. I am extremely grateful to everyone who has offered advice and support along the way. I particularly wish to thank the staff at the RCB Library, the TCD Early Printed Books department, the Public Records Office in Belfast, the British Library, and the National Library of Ireland, and, individually, Mark C. Russell, Anne-Marie McInerney, David O'Shea, Steven C. Smyrl and Roy Stanley, for their invaluable assistance.

To my friends, for being a constant source of support and comfort, particularly during the last two years, when coronavirus restrictions have meant that we have been more often apart than together: I cannot thank you enough. I must particularly thank Dr Eimear Maguire, who has been commendably patient with my increasingly inane ramblings at strange hours of the day and night. Your reward will be great in Heaven, etc.

Finally, my most sincere and heartfelt thanks to my family, for putting up with all the highs and (frequent) lows of the research process, and for supporting me all my life.

INTRODUCTION

Musicological research on eighteenth-century Dublin has, to date, largely been concerned with the musical culture of the city's upper class—the fashionable gentry who patronised the Rotunda Gardens and promenaded in Stephen's Green—upon whose extravagant lifestyle the economy of the city depended. Additionally, the majority of this research has been concerned with secular music; that which has ventured into the realm of the sacred has focussed almost entirely on the city cathedrals, themselves strongly associated with social and political elites. The humbler musical world of the parish church, the chapel and the meeting house, by contrast, have received very little attention; yet it is in these more prosaic surroundings that the majority of Protestant Dubliners encountered and participated in a distinctly different culture of worship music than that associated with the cathedral tradition. This musical culture, centred on the congregational singing of psalms, has almost totally faded from existence in modern times, and is unknown in today's Dublin, but it formed a central part of the everyday experience of life in the eighteenth-century city.

The central aim of this thesis is to reconstruct the worship music of Dublin's Protestant churches and meeting houses during the long eighteenth century. Within this I have three more specific objectives: first, to establish the tune repertory and performance practice of the city's Church of Ireland parishes and Nonconforming meeting houses through an examination of primary sources; second, to contextualise this music within the broader landscapes of the eighteenth-century city, both physical (situating music within the space of the church or meeting house) and figurative (social, political and

¹ David Dickson, ed. *The Gorgeous Mask: Dublin 1700–1850*, Trinity History Workshop 2 (Dublin: Trinity History Workshop, 1987), vii–viii.

cultural landscapes); and third, in so doing, to investigate what these musical traditions can reveal about the eighteenth-century Dublin "Protestant mindset": in other words, the way in which eighteenth-century Protestants in Dublin perceived, conceptualised, and situated themselves and their own culture in relation to the world around them.

The study of Protestant music at the parochial level has much to contribute to our understanding of the social and cultural world of eighteenth-century Dublin. Firstly, it represents a "history from below" approach to what has often been a period dominated by studies of the upper classes.² By focussing on parish churches, meeting houses and chapels, it reveals a musical culture very different from that of the cathedral tradition more familiar to us in the present day. Secondly, it facilitates comparison between Irish musical practices and those of contemporary Britain, which contributes to an understanding of Ireland's (and Dublin's) cultural position within the wider context of the British Isles—for example, the fact that Dublin parish church music closely followed the London model, or that much of the content of Dublin tunebooks was derived from English sources. Thirdly, by considering each of the city's distinct Protestant communities in turn, it is possible to discern both commonalities and differences between musical practices across denominational boundaries. These observations in turn have significant implications for our understanding of the relationships between these different communities, at a time when worship practices and cultural heritage were important elements in the construction of community identity (see, in particular, chapter 4 below).

Finally, I believe that the reconstruction of this little-known repertory is a worthy objective in itself. I suspect that one reason for the musicological neglect of the psalm

² The concept of "history from below" was popularised in English historiography by the work of E. P. Thompson, whose 1963 book, *The Making of the English Working Class*, devoted considerable space to the importance of Methodism, including Methodist hymnody, to working-class culture. Antoinette Burton, "Radical Book History: E. P. Thompson and 'The Making of the English Working Class'", *Historical Reflections / Réflexions historiques* 41, no. 1 (Spring 2015), 3. See also Peter Burke, *What is Cultural History?*, 3rd edn (Cambridge: Polity Press, 2019), 19–20.

and hymn tradition, similar to its neglect by literary scholars, is a perception that the material is of a low aesthetic or artistic value. Although these attitudes are undoubtedly influenced by the longstanding disdain of more "educated" musicians and scholars towards popular psalmody in particular, which itself was not purely aesthetically motivated but influenced by political and theological concerns (see 1.2.5 below), I make no attempt to argue for the artistic merit of the musical repertory under examination. Many of the traditional psalm tunes are rather dull for modern tastes, and the often chaotic manner in which they were performed would be unlikely to appeal to modern audiences. Paradoxically, however, it is precisely for this reason that I believe this repertory to be a worthy object of study. The eighteenth century pre-dates the idea of the autonomous musical work of art as an expression of the artistic vision of its composer, a concept which developed in the Romantic era and continues to dominate musical culture to the present day. Confronting a musical practice that was created and enacted within an entirely different cultural framework helps to expand our definition of what music is and does, and hence to develop a more holistic musicology.

The temporal and denominational scope of the study is intentionally broad, in order to identify long-term trends and changes in musical practice and to facilitate the drawing of comparisons between the worship music traditions of Dublin's many different Protestant communities. The timeframe of the study, initially intended to cover the eighteenth century as traditionally chronologically delineated (i.e. 1701–1800), was expanded to include the closing decade of the seventeenth century on the grounds that the ending of the Williamite War marked a watershed point in the cultural history of the city

.

³ Lydia Goehr, *The Imaginary Museum of Musical Works: An Essay in the Philosophy of Music* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1994).

of Dublin in a way that the arbitrary date of 1701 did not.⁴ The concluding date of 1800 was retained, as its correspondence with the passing of the Acts of Union makes it a similar watershed year. Although two nineteenth-century tunebooks are briefly considered in the closing stages of the study for comparative purposes (see chapter 5 below), the research proper does not extend into the very different social and cultural environment of the post-Union era. The resulting timeframe of c. 1691–1800 has been described throughout as the "long eighteenth century", following now-common usage for this kind of "extended" timeframe.⁵

The first chapter of the thesis discusses the music of the parish church in Dublin, taking as a particular case study the parish of St Michan's. Dublin's parish churches followed the London model of parish music-making, centring on the singing of psalms in metre, led either by the parish clerk or by an organ, accompanied by children from the local charity school. This examination of parish church music is embedded within the context of the wider world of the parish church, a significant centre of local authority and a focal point around which a great many different ideologies and attitudes coalesced.

The second and third chapters of the thesis investigate the relationship between the Established and Dissenting Protestant communities through an analysis of their worship music. This analysis is divided into two parts: chapter two discusses the Presbyterians, Baptists and Quakers, collectively known as the "Old Dissenters", and examines the tunebooks printed between 1690 and 1740; arising from this analysis, it points to the existence of a "common repertory" of tunes that provided a point of commonality between

⁴ The consideration of the years 1691–1699 as part of a temporal "era" that also includes parts of the eighteenth century is not a novel one in Irish historiography. See T. W. Moody and F. X. Martin, eds, *The Course of Irish History*, revised edn (Cork: Mercier Press, 2011), and David Dickson, *Dublin: The Making of a Capital City* (London: Profile Books, 2015).

⁵ See, for example, Frank O'Gorman, *The Long Eighteenth Century: British Political and Social History* 1688–1832, 2nd edn (London: Bloomsbury, 2016), which begins the "long eighteenth century" with the "Glorious Revolution" and ends it with the 1832 Reform Act, both watershed events in English history.

disparate Protestant groups. Chapter three takes in the developments of the later eighteenth century, in particular the rise of hymnody and the evangelical turn in the established church, and looks more closely at the two main evangelical groups present in Dublin during this period, the Moravians and the Methodists. Hymnody and evangelicalism, along with the continuing drive towards the "improvement" of worship music observed in chapter one, significantly impacted the style of worship music in the latter part of the century, and these developments can be clearly seen in the tunebooks analysed in this chapter.

Chapter four discusses the non-English-speaking Protestant communities collectively known as the "Protestant Strangers". The larger of these communities, that of the Huguenots, is the subject of the majority of the chapter, which places the two surviving Huguenot tunebooks printed in Dublin in the broader context of the Dublin Huguenot community's history and identity. This chapter also discusses the city's small Lutheran community, and what little can be established about their musical traditions. Finally, chapter five collates all of the tune data gathered in the preceding chapters into a general "Dublin tune repertory", which can then be analysed in its totality as well as compared to external and later sources.

The musicologist Reinhard Strohm, in his study of the music of medieval Bruges, wrote of the sense that the vibrant world of the medieval town existed "just beyond" the silent relics of that era that survive to the present day. "Late medieval Bruges," he wrote, "is known to us through the stillness of pictures":

we are aware that the townscape of Bruges is just beyond ... there were the people, the houses and the activities of a city whose hectic business, disorders and violence cry out from page after page in the archives ... The noises of the marketplace, the inns, the workshops, the stock-exchange, the public baths—they have all died, and so have the music and the song of the nightingale in the orchard. And yet, these sounds have shaped the

townscape, contributing to its order and to its disorder. The sound of music is still frozen in the shapes of Bruges.⁶

The scale of urban development in Dublin during the eighteenth century was such that much of the modern urban fabric dates from this period; to walk through today's Dublin is to be surrounded by the "shapes" of the eighteenth-century, the same buildings that have been preserved in the majestic and sanitized Malton engravings which at once represent and somehow conceal the reality of the Georgian city. There is a sense, as Strohm observed in Bruges, that "just beyond" the stillness of the engraving and the silent facades of the still-impressive Georgian buildings lies the hectic, noisy, chaotic world of a bustling European metropolis, where tens of thousands of inhabitants—increasing to almost two hundred thousand by the century's end—lived crammed into a "claustrophobically small urban site" just one twentieth the size of today's Greater Dublin. By reconstructing the worship music traditions that formed an integral part of the everyday experience of life in that now-vanished world, this study hopes to bring a small part of the eighteenth-century city back to life.

i. Methodology

The methodology employed in this thesis is best described as a form of "urban musicology", within a broader "cultural history" framework. "Urban musicology" here refers not merely to the study of music produced in an urban context, though Dublin's public worship music undoubtedly represents an "urban" genre, reflecting the sacred music culture of contemporary London and stylistically distinct from "rural" genres.⁹

⁶ Reinhard Strohm, *Music in Late Medieval Bruges* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1990), 2.

⁷ James Malton's prints have recently been reproduced in Trevor White, *The Golden Age of Dublin* (Dublin: The Little Museum, 2020).

⁸ Dickson, ed., *The Gorgeous Mask*, ix.

⁹ See Nicholas Temperley, *The Music of the English Parish Church* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1979), chapter 5: "Urban parish church music".

Instead, following Strohm's study, urban musicology is construed as the study of the music of a city as part of the city itself—as expressed through its institutions, its public spaces, buildings, and as it relates to the city's history, as well as the greater social and political forces that surround its production, transmission and reception. Music, in Strohm's example, is shown to be interwoven with the daily life of the city and its inhabitants, inseparable from other facts of city life in Bruges, such as the church, the court, the guild system and even the measurement and marking of time and civic space.¹⁰

It attempting to thus situate the music of eighteenth-century Dublin in its contexts, geographical, historical, theological, sociopolitical and cultural, the aim is not to "prove" that any one of these external forces—or even the combination of all of them—was responsible for producing the music under discussion. In the first place, it is worth bearing in mind Richard Taruskin's caution that "no historical event or change can be meaningfully asserted unless its agents can be specified; and agents can only be people". While external conditions and social forces may affect the experience of writing a psalm tune or listening to an organ voluntary, my argument is not that human agency is lost entirely in this process. Neither is any implication intended that music is epiphenomenal or superstructural to deeper societal forces, such as economic production, as in the traditional Marxist model. Rather, to quote Adam Krims's Music and Urban Geography—itself a valuable piece of urban musicological writing which incorporates a Marxist approach—this thesis examines the history of the city and the history of the music of that city as two concurrent processes which "participate in each other as different moments in a larger unity".

¹⁰ Strohm, Music in Late Medieval Bruges.

¹¹ Richard Taruskin, *Music from the Earliest Notations to the Sixteenth Century*, Oxford History of Western Music vol 1 (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010), xviii. Emphasis Taruskin's.

¹² See Burke, What Is Cultural History?, on the interaction between Marxist viewpoints and cultural history.

¹³ Adam Krims, *Music and Urban Geography* (London: Routledge, 2007), xix.

In historiographical terms, this thesis is a work of "cultural history", seeking to understand, in the words of the influential cultural historian Robert Darnton, "ways of thinking"; it is distinguished from the broader "history of ideas" by its focus on "ordinary people ... how they organized reality in their minds and expressed it in their behaviour". ¹⁴ In particular, the cultural historian seeks the expression of these "ways of thinking"—often called mindsets, or *mentalités*, reflecting the strong French influence on the modern discipline—by the "reading" of aspects of the past. Darnton writes,

one can read a ritual or a city just as one can read a folktale or a philosophic text. The mode of exegesis may vary, but in each case one reads for meaning—the meaning inscribed by contemporaries in whatever survives of their vision of the world.¹⁵

This thesis, then, "reads" the worship music of eighteenth-century Dublin, in all of its aspects, as a source of meaning about the thoughts and mindsets of the people who created it, listened to it, wrote about it and participated in it. It is not quite a "microhistory"—the scope is a little too broad for that—but has been inspired by the microhistorical approach of scholars like Carlos Ginzburg, whose study of a single sixteenth-century heresy trial demonstrated that "complex" concepts were not the exclusive preserve of the upper classes or the educated elites but manifested at a local, popular level, often in quite idiosyncratic ways. ¹⁶ Another concept derived from cultural history that has strongly influenced this research is that of cultural "frontiers", the places—physical and figurative—where different cultures meet; these frontiers can serve both as barriers or zones of resistance, or as permeable "contact zones" where cultures interact and influence

-

¹⁴ Robert Darnton, *The Great Cat Massacre and Other Episodes in French Cultural History* (New York: Basic Books, 1984), 3. An excellent general introduction to cultural history, including criticisms of this approach and the history of the discipline itself, can be found in Burke, *What Is Cultural History?*.

¹⁵ Darnton, The Great Cat Massacre, 5.

¹⁶ Carlo Ginzburg, *The Cheese and the Worms: The Cosmos of a Sixteenth-Century Miller*, trans. John and Anne Tedeschi (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1980).

one another.¹⁷ Both of these processes of resistance and influence can be clearly identified in the worship music of eighteenth-century Dublin.

Cultural history in the style of Darnton owes much to the ethnographic and anthropological traditions, and as a result shares much of its methodological apparatus with ethnomusicology, a discipline which is defined in the Grove Encyclopedia as "the study of social and cultural aspects of music and dance in local and global contexts". 18 Although this thesis is not explicitly a work of ethnomusicology, it shares in many of the priorities of ethnomusicological research, particularly its focus on a primarily oral tradition and its location within wider contemporary culture.

Keith Jenkins has asserted that today's historians, living as they do in a postmodern society, must necessarily consciously position themselves in relation to the modernist and postmodernist views of historiography. 19 Although I share the postmodern historian Francis Lyotard's disdain for "metanarratives" which seek to explain the overall trends of history in terms of "progress" towards a teleological end point, in other respects the position taken by this thesis is a modernist one, relying on the empirical study of contemporary sources, largely documents, to reconstruct a part of the past (assumed to be in some sense "real", and so recoverable by these methods). ²⁰ I also believe, contrary to Jenkins, that empathy with the people of the past is possible if some attempt is made to understand how those people thought and felt about their own world and their own culture.²¹ Where this approach perhaps diverges from, or perhaps just builds upon, the

¹⁷ Burke, What Is Cultural History?, 120–122.

¹⁸ Carole Pegg, Philip V. Bohlman, Helen Myers and Martin Stokes, "Ethnomusicology", GMO (20 January 2001). Burke, What is Cultural History?, 32ff. Darnton, The Great Cat Massacre, 3–7.

¹⁹ Keith Jenkins, ed., *The Postmodern History Reader* (London: Routledge, 1997), 1–2.

²⁰ See Jenkins's summary of the modernist, empiricist position in Jenkins, ed., *The Postmodern History* Reader, 9-17. Francis Lyotard's famous definition of postmodernism as "incredulity toward metanarratives" is taken from the essay The Postmodern Condition, first published in 1979, an excerpt from which is presented in Jenkins, ed., The Postmodern History Reader, 36-38.

²¹ Keith Jenkins, *Re-thinking History*, 2nd edn (London: Routledge, 2003), 47–57.

modernist position is in the treatment of intangible elements, including the historical metanarratives just described, as of equal importance to our understanding of the past as more tangible historical "realities" such as events, objects and documents.²²

As this study concerns Ireland, or at least a small part of it, it seems prudent also to situate it also with regard to specifically Irish historiographical discourse. The dominant trend in Irish historiography since the 1970s has been a revisionist one, forming a reaction against the nationalist interpretations common in the post-independence period. Irish revisionist historians, following a modernist approach, have sought to dismantle nationalist narratives by contextualising Irish history in a wider European context, as well as by questioning received wisdom on matters such as the severity of the penal laws.²³ This revisionist turn has not been without its share of criticism, however, particularly in the context of issues of identity in Northern Ireland.²⁴ My position relative to this debate is broadly similar to that adopted towards postmodernism: while the empirical approach taken in this thesis is undoubtedly a largely modernist one, I believe that revisionist history, like the modernist approach more generally, risks presenting an incomplete picture of the past it seeks to recover if it does not acknowledge the importance of intangible elements such as ideologies, prejudices and historical narratives. It is here, I believe, that a cultural history approach can add greatly to our understanding of the past.

ii. Literature Review

Although eighteenth century Dublin has been a rich field of study for Irish musicology,

-

²² An excellent example of ideology taken seriously as a societal force can be found in Edward Said, *Culture and Imperialism* (London: Vintage Books, 1994), which argues that ideologies of empire not only infused nineteenth century culture within colonizer nations but also played a highly significant role in the perpetuation of empire.

²³ Patrick O'Mahony and Gerard Delanty, *Rethinking Irish History: Nationalism, Identity and Ideology* (Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2001).

²⁴ See Mary E. Daly, "Recent Writings on Modern Irish History: The Interaction between Past and Present", *The Journal of Modern History* 69, no. 3 (September 1997).

the vast majority of this work is concerned only with secular music, or with the peculiarly Dublin phenomenon of the philanthropic oratorio, as popularised by Handel's *Messiah*. This imbalance is epitomised in the *Dublin Musical Calendar* by Brian Boydell, an exhaustive and detailed treatment of Dublin's "secular" music scene between 1700 and 1760 dotted with sparse references to events in the cathedrals and city churches. 25 While much of the information in the Calendar, and in the related Dublin Music Trade database that has been created from Boydell's index card collection, is useful in the study of figures such as organ builders and music printers, the study as a whole is primarily concerned with the upper-class musical culture with which eighteenth-century Dublin is principally associated.²⁶ Those works which do focus on public worship music have tended to focus on the cathedral tradition (for example, Barra Boydell's study of music at Christ Church Cathedral, W. S. Grindle's Irish Cathedral Music, and the work of Kerry Houston in relation to St Patrick's Cathedral).²⁷ The general neglect of this area is evidenced by the sparsity of information on the worship music of eighteenth-century parishes and meeting houses in the 1,100-page Encyclopedia of Music in Ireland, which amounts to a total of perhaps a page or two of material, spread over several entries.²⁸

Very little scholarship has attempted to date to approach questions of Irish musicology using a cultural history framework. The one significant exception to this is the work of

²⁵ Brian Boydell, A Dublin Musical Calendar 1700–1760 (Dublin: Irish Academic Press, 1988).

²⁶ Dublin Music Trade database accessible online at https://www.dublinmusictrade.ie/.

²⁷ Barra Boydell, ed., *Music at Christ Church before 1800: Documents and Selected Anthems* (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 1999). W. H. Grindle, *Irish Cathedral Music: A History of Music at the Cathedrals of the Church of Ireland* (Belfast: Queen's University Belfast, 1989). Kerry Houston, "Reformation to the Roseingraves: Music, 1550–1750", "Music before the Guinness Restoration, 1750–1860" and "Restoration and Consolidation: Music, 1865–1977", in John Crawford and Raymond Gillespie, eds, *St Patrick's Cathedral Dublin: A History* (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2009). Kerry Houston, "The Eighteenth-Century Music Manuscripts at St Patrick's Cathedral, Dublin: Sources, Lineage, and Relationship to Other Collections" (PhD diss., Trinity College Dublin, 2002).

²⁸ See, for example, Michael Thompson, "Church of Ireland", Donald Davison, "Hymns and Hymnology", and Martin Adams, "Methodist Church Music", "Presbyterian Church Music" and "Tate, Nahum", in Harry White and Barra Boydell, eds, *The Encyclopedia of Music in Ireland*, 2 vols (Dublin: University College Dublin Press, 2013).

Harry White, which situates music firmly within Irish cultural and intellectual history and discourses.²⁹ In-depth contextualisations of eighteenth-century music within the broader social and cultural life of the city also remain surprisingly rare, though Jonathan Bardon's recent work on Handel's *Messiah*, and particularly its first chapter, which situates the genesis of the work within a sociohistorical study of the eighteenth-century city, is a promising indication of rising interest in this area.³⁰

In an English context, the authoritative work on parish church music remains *The Music of the English Parish Church* by the late Nicholas Temperley. ³¹ Despite its age, it remains unsurpassed in its field; a new edition, as the original is currently out of print, is most emphatically called for. To this already monumental contribution Temperley subsequently added an even more ambitious project: an index of all the hymn and psalm tunes printed in English-language sources between 1535 and 1820. The *Hymn Tune Index* is available in a print edition, but even more usefully for the modern digital age, it has been translated into a fully searchable online database, which provides information on every tune, source, and text catalogued by Temperley and his colleagues. ³² The idea of cataloguing psalm- and hymn-tunes is not new—the Hymn Tune Index builds upon earlier work by Pidoux, Frost, and others—but for the Anglophone repertory its scope is unsurpassed. Both *Music of the English Parish Church* and the Hymn Tune Index were major sources of inspiration and information for this study.

²⁹ Harry White, *The Keeper's Recital: Music and Cultural History in Ireland, 1770–1970*, Critical Conditions: Field Day Essays 6 (Cork: Cork University Press, 1998).

³⁰ Jonathan Bardon, *Hallelujah: The Story of a Musical Genius and the City that Brought his Masterpiece to Life* (Dublin: Gill & Macmillan, 2015).

³¹ Temperley, *Music of the English Parish Church*.

³² The Hymn Tune Index is hosted by the University of Illinois at https://hymntune.library.uiuc.edu/. It is also available in a print edition as Nicholas Temperley, *The Hymn Tune Index: A Census of English-Language Hymn Tunes in Printed Sources from 1535 to 1820*, 4 vols (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998).

Beyond these and other works by Temperley, the field of parish church musicology is somewhat sparser. Sally Drage's recent doctoral thesis on the performance practice of English provincial psalmody is a very welcome addition to this area.³³ Beth Quitslund's *The Reformation in Rhyme* is an excellent study of the early history of metrical psalms in England, although it is primarily concerned with texts rather than music; particularly notable is Quitslund's relating of the psalm texts she discusses to the political and theological contexts in which they were written.³⁴ Similarly J. R. Watson's *The English Hymn*, in taking a serious approach to the study of hymns as literary texts, demonstrates clearly the interrelationship between this musicopoetic tradition and its various changing historical contexts.³⁵

No study comparable to Temperley's work on the English parish church has yet been produced in Ireland. The most significant recent work has been done by Denise Neary, exemplified in two articles published in the Irish Musical Studies series in the 1990s and 2000s, which give a general overview of the parish music-making tradition in Dublin in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. Barra Boydell's article on the organ at St Michan's church is an excellent case study and a tour de force in empirical historiography, but sadly has not been replicated in any subsequent study of other parishes. Raymond Gillespie's article on seventeenth-century Irish music and its cultural context makes perceptive comments about worship music at the end of the seventeenth century, many

³³ Sally Drage, "The Performance of English Provincial Psalmody c. 1690–c.1840" (PhD diss., University of Leeds, November 2009).

³⁴ Beth Quitslund, *The Reformation in Rhyme: Sternhold, Hopkins and the English Metrical Psalter, 1547–1603* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2008).

³⁵ J. R. Watson, *The English Hymn: A Critical and Historical Study* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1999).

³⁶ Denise Neary, "Music in Late Seventeenth- and Eighteenth-Century Dublin Churches", in Patrick F. Devine and Harry White, eds, *The Maynooth International Musicological Conference 1995 Selected Proceedings: Part One*, Irish Musical Studies 4 (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 1996). Denise Neary, "Seventeenth-Century Irish Parish Church Music", in Barra Boydell and Kerry Houston, eds, *Music, Ireland and the Seventeenth Century*, Irish Musical Studies 10 (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2009).

³⁷ Barra Boydell, "St. Michan's Church Dublin: The Installation of the Organ in 1725 and the Duties of the Organist", *Dublin Historical Record* 46, no. 2 (Autumn 1993).

of which also apply to the period of this study, but the scope and focus of the article do not allow for an in-depth treatment.³⁸ It is an unfortunate indicator of the neglect of this particular area by Irish musicologists that the work of William H. Grattan Flood, now more than a century old and notoriously unreliable, is still the only relevant scholarship available on many of the tunebooks discussed in this thesis.³⁹ The music of the city's Nonconforming communities has, to my knowledge, received no specific attention, and is discussed (when it is discussed at all) only in passing as part of more general histories of those communities.

Outside of music, there is slightly more information to be found on the history of Dublin parish churches and meeting houses, though perhaps not as much as might be expected. Much of the scholarship, particularly of Nonconforming groups, is the result of the efforts of individuals or of dedicated groups of researchers, often with a personal connection to the places or communities involved; see, for example, Dudley Cooney's studies of Irish Methodism, the extensive research undertaken by John and Edna Cooper on the Dublin Moravians, and A. S. Godfrey Brown's studies of Dublin Presbyterian ministers.⁴⁰ One exception to this is the study of the Irish Huguenots, a thriving area of

-

Street Church, Dublin, 1638–1728 (Belfast: Presbyterian Historical Society of Ireland, 1988). Brown, "Boyse, Joseph (1660–1728), Presbyterian Minister and Religious Writer", and "Iredell, Francis (d. 1739), Minister of the Presbyterian General Synod of Ulster and Author", ODNB (23 September 2004). The research of the Coopers remains unpublished, but was drawn upon extensively by Steven Smyrl in his work on Nonconformist meeting houses. Steven C. Smyrl, *Dictionary of Dublin Dissent: Dublin's Protestant Dissenting Meeting Houses 1660–1920* (Dublin: A. & A. Farmar, 2009).

³⁸ Raymond Gillespie, "Seventeenth-Century Irish Music and its Cultural Contexts", in Boydell and Houston, eds, *Music, Ireland and the Seventeenth Century*.

³⁹ See, for example, W. H. Grattan Flood, "Barton's Psalms (1698): The Earliest Known Dublin-Printed Music-Book, *The Journal of the Royal Society of Antiquaries of Ireland*, sixth series 2, no. 3 (30 September 1912), and W. H. Grattan Flood, "Music-Printing in Dublin from 1700 to 1750", *The Journal of the Royal Society of Antiquaries of Ireland*, fifth series 38, no. 3 (30 September 1908). The issue of Flood's reliability is discussed in Barra Boydell and Kerry Houston, "Introduction: The Seventeenth Century and the History of Music in Ireland", in Boydell and Houston, eds, *Music, Ireland and the Seventeenth Century*, 19–20. ⁴⁰ Dudley Levistone Cooney, *The Methodists in Ireland: A Short History* (Dublin: Columba Press, 2001). A. W. Godfrey Brown, *The Great Mr Boyse: A Study of The Reverend Joseph Boyse Minister of Wood Street Church, Dublin, 1638–1728* (Belfast: Presbyterian Historical Society of Ireland, 1988). Brown, "Boyse, Joseph (1660–1728), Presbyterian Minister and Religious Writer", and "Iredell, Francis (d. 1739),

scholarship since the nineteenth century.⁴¹ The present vitality of this field was amply demonstrated by the great diversity of research presented at a recent conference at Marsh's Library by both Irish and international scholars.⁴²

It was of critical importance to this study to situate the history of public worship music within and alongside the history of the city, and to consider each individual Protestant community as part of the bigger picture of eighteenth-century Dublin life. To this end, David Dickson's *Dublin: The Making of a Capital City*, which gives a comprehensive history of the city from its origins to the present day and highlights the complexities and contradictions inherent in that history, proved an extremely useful resource. Addifferent perspective, but an equally enlightening one, can be found in architectural works such as those of Christine Casey and Niall McCullough, which are excellent sources of information on surviving structures such as churches and meeting houses, and on the development of the city's built environment more generally. On the subject of meeting houses, Steven C. Smyrl's *Dictionary of Dublin Dissent* provides a comprehensive survey of Dublin's non-conforming communities and the various buildings associated with them, both surviving and no longer extant. Kenneth Ferguson's study of meeting houses shown on John Rocque's map of 1756 provides a similarly detailed account, though less ambitious in its scope.

⁴¹ Contents pages of the *Huguenot Society Journal*, formerly *Proceedings of the Huguenot Society*, from 1885–2012 can be downloaded at https://www.huguenotsociety.org.uk/publications/proceedings.html. Many of the earlier volumes of these *Proceedings* are available on the Internet Archive.

⁴² "Élie Bouhéreau & the World of the Huguenots", conference at Marsh's Library, Dublin, 15–17 November 2019. At the time of writing, the conference programme was available to view here: https://www.marshlibrary.ie/bouhereauconference/.

⁴³ David Dickson, *Dublin: The Making of a Capital City* (London: Profile Books, 2015).

⁴⁴ Christine Casey, *Dublin: The City Within the Grand and Royal Canals and the Circular Road with the Phoenix Park* (London: Yale University Press, 2005). Niall McCullough, *Dublin, An Urban History: the Plan of the City*, 2nd edn (Dublin: Anne Street Press, 2007).

⁴⁵ Smyrl, *Dictionary of Dublin Dissent*.

⁴⁶ Kenneth Ferguson, "Rocque's Map and the History of Nonconformity in Dublin: A Search for Meeting Houses", *Dublin Historical Record* 58, no. 2 (Autumn 2005).

As with every research project, much of the work that influenced this research was not directly relevant to the field in question but provided a useful methodological template. Vincent Morley's *The Popular Mind in Eighteenth-Century Ireland* represents a rare and impressive example of the history of *mentalités* in an Irish context, though restricted to the "Gaelic" mind, and the medium of (mostly Irish-language) poetry. Another laudable essay into the study of the construction of historical identity, focussed on the formation of "British" identity during the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, is Linda Colley's *Britons: Forging the Nation 1707–1837*; many of the social and cultural forces which Colley describes as impacting the formation of British identity, such as Protestantism, mercantilism and monarchism, apply also in the Irish Protestant context. The art historian Andrew McClellan's article on Bouchardon's statue of Louis XV, a masterful study of the potential of art to embody complex political and social realities within urban space, was also highly influential in its serious treatment of the many layers of meaning which a "work of art"—whether a statue of a disfavoured King or a royally-authorised set of psalm tunes—may occupy within the popular mind. The protestant context is a statue of a disfavoured King or a royally-authorised set of psalm tunes—may occupy within the popular mind.

iii. Sources

The principal primary sources examined in this study are tunebooks printed in Dublin during the long eighteenth century. "Tunebooks" here designates any printed source which contains psalm- or hymn-tunes presented in musical notation (rather than simply referred to by name). A total of eleven sources fit these criteria, all except one of which was accessible, either in person or digitally. The one source which unfortunately could

-

⁴⁷ Vincent Morley, *The Popular Mind in Eighteenth-Century Ireland* (Cork: Cork University Press, 2017). ⁴⁸ Linda Colley, *Britons: Forging the Nation 1707–1837*, revised edn (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2019).

⁴⁹ Andrew McClellan, "The Life and Death of a Royal Monument: Bouchardon's Louis XV", *Oxford Art Journal* 23, no. 2 (2000).

not be accessed within the timeframe of my research is held at the British Library (no digital copy is available). The travel restrictions imposed by the ongoing coronavirus pandemic, coupled with the British Library's temporary suspension of its scan-to-order service due to high demand, made it impossible to obtain access to this rare source in any form, and I have instead relied upon existing analysis in my discussion of it in chapter two. Similarly, the tunebook *Select Tunes for Sacred Use*, which survives as a single copy, became accessible only a few weeks before the thesis submission date, and so only a general overview of its contents was possible in the time available (see 3.4.3 below).

Although somewhat mitigated by access to online resources to an extent unthinkable even ten years ago, the ongoing pandemic nevertheless presented significant challenges to accessing primary sources in person. Travel restrictions, archival and library closures and limits imposed on consultation of material over the last two years have unavoidably impacted the research process. Fortunately, access to digitised copies of library and archival material through repositories such as Eighteenth-Century Collections Online, Early English Books Online, the Internet Archive, and Google Books have facilitated the continuation of research even when physical access to materials was curtailed. Identification and location of relevant sources was greatly facilitated by the English Short Title Catalogue, a fully searchable version of which is hosted by the British Library website. This catalogue gives full holdings details for all known copies of each indexed work, along with links to digital copies where available. For the convenience of readers, and mindful of continuing travel and access restrictions, ESTC catalogue numbers and URLs for access to digital copies have been appended wherever possible to primary sources in the bibliography of this thesis.

⁵⁰ The online ESTC is accessible at estc.bl.uk.

Beyond the core set of Dublin tunebooks, a wide variety of contemporary sources have been consulted in the course of this study, ranging from psalm and hymn collections lacking printed tunes, to commentaries and debates on worship music, to tune sources of international origins which nonetheless strongly influenced Irish practice (for example, the 1708 Supplement to the *New Version* discussed in chapter one). Moving beyond the purely musical, a vital resource has been the records of the parish churches, the majority of which are now stored at the Representative Church Body Library in Dublin. The RCB Library maintains a comprehensive online guide to available parish resources for the whole of Ireland, which is regularly updated.⁵¹ It also houses the Irish Huguenot Archive, which collects much material related to Dublin's Huguenot community. ⁵² Another extremely useful collection of congregational records is that of the Dublin Moravians, who took meticulous accounts of the daily business of their church, including information about their worship music; these records are accessible on microfilm at the Public Records Office of Northern Ireland in Belfast.⁵³

A vital reference document for any study of eighteenth-century Dublin is the map of the city produced by the surveyor John Rocque in 1756, which, in Ferguson's words, remained unmatched until the advent of the Ordnance Survey in the 1830s.⁵⁴ Rocque's meticulous record of the cityscape as it was in the mid-eighteenth century, and his careful marking thereon of every church, meeting house and Catholic chapel, make it an invaluable resource for any scholar of the period. In 1757, Rocque produced a "reduced"

 $^{^{51}}$ The list of parish registers is available for download from the RCB Library website at $\underline{www.ireland.anglican.org/about/rcb-library}.$

⁵² An index of the contents of the Irish Huguenot Archive, as well as an article about the archive by Dr Raymond Refaussé, can be found at https://www.ireland.anglican.org/news/7722/the-irish-huguenot-archive (accessed 26 March 2022).

⁵³ PRONI MIC14/F; see bibliography for further details.

⁵⁴ John Roque, An Exact Survey of the City and Suburbs of Dublin in Which is Express'd the Ground Plot of all Publick Buildings Dwelling Houses, Ware Houses, Stables, Court Yards, &c (1756), F-Pn GE DD-2987 (2657 B). Ferguson, "Rocque's Map", 131.

map of the city which is, if anything, even more useful for locating churches and meeting houses, as all of these buildings are even more clearly marked on the reduced plan, and it also shows the boundaries of the Established parishes. ⁵⁵ Both maps are publicly available on the website of the Bibliothèque nationale de France (Gallica), along with many more of Rocque's works including other maps of Dublin and its surrounding countryside. The 1756 *Exact Survey* is also included in the Dublin volume of the Irish Historic Towns Atlas, another extremely useful resource, along with several other historic maps, plans and prints. ⁵⁶

iv. Notes on Terminology, Spelling, etc.

The choice of how to refer to the islands of Ireland and Great Britain together is notoriously weighed down with political baggage, occasioning the invention of somewhat awkward terms such as "the Atlantic Isles". ⁵⁷ I have chosen to use the more traditional term "British Isles" throughout this work. This is not intended as a political statement, but merely a geographical one, adopted for convenience and readability. In general, the terms "British" and "Britain" have been avoided as both potentially controversial, where identities are being discussed. Where they have been used, it is geographically: to refer to the landmass of Great Britain, as opposed to the island of Ireland.

For the conflict which took place in Ireland between the years 1689 and 1691 between the armies of James II and William III, I have used the term "Williamite Wars" throughout. The period following the English Civil War and preceding the Restoration of 1660 is referred to as the "Cromwellian era" or "Commonwealth", rather than the "Interregnum".

⁵⁵ John Rocque, *Survey of the city and suburbs of Dublin, with the division of the parishes reduc'd from the large plan in four sheets* (1757), F-Pn GE C-4370.

⁵⁶ Colm Lennon, *Dublin Part II: 1610 to 1756*, Irish Historic Towns Atlas 19 (Dublin: Royal Irish Academy, 2008).

⁵⁷ See, for example, Diarmuid MacCulloch, *Reformation: Europe's House Divided 1490–1700* (London: Penguin Books, 2004), which uses "Atlantic Isles" throughout.

The state church of England, Wales and Ireland, established by law in the time of Queen Elizabeth, is nowadays commonly known as the "Anglican church". While this term has occasionally been used for clarity in this thesis, particularly when comparing several different Protestant denominations, it has generally been avoided, as the use is anachronistic to this period. Instead, this church has been referred to as the "established church", or the "Church of Ireland", wherever possible. The terms "conformed" or "conforming" have also been used in some cases, where the relevant distinction being drawn in the text is between conforming and non-conforming groups.

In discussing those Protestants who did not conform to the established church, the terms "Dissenters" and "Nonconformists" have been used reasonably interchangeably, the former being the contemporary term and the latter a more modern one. For the problematic cases of the "foreign" churches, and of the non-Dissenting subgroups within the established church which nevertheless represented an alternate strain of belief and practice, no truly satisfactory terminology exists. The flexibility of both contemporary and modern terminology in this area is indicative of the permeability of categories of conformity and Dissent, the boundaries of which were not always as rigidly defined as might be expected.

References to "parish churches" throughout the thesis refer to established church (Anglican) parishes rather than Catholic parishes (which had no legal validity during the period under discussion), primarily because this thesis is concerned with the world of Protestant Dublin as it was seen by Protestants. Dublin Catholics continued to recognise the Catholic parishes and to maintain the system of parish priests, bishops and archbishops despite their lack of legal recognition. Nonconforming places of worship, including Catholic ones, have been variously referred to throughout the text as chapels or meeting houses, following (as far as possible) contemporary practice: thus Catholics and

Methodists tended to worship in chapels, whereas Presbyterians and Baptists assembled at meeting houses. The Moravian place of worship, by convention, is referred to as a church.

Where quotations are taken directly from primary sources, original capitalisation, spelling and punctuation have been retained. The exception to this is in the texts of hymns, where spellings have been modernized to facilitate the use of search functions in databases such as Hymnary.org. All dates are given in new style.

HTI tune codes have been used throughout the text to match each tune under discussion with the relevant entry in the Hymn Tune Index. These tune codes are enclosed in square brackets; the tune for the "Old Hundredth", for example, corresponds to the HTI tune code [143a].

v. Notes on the Footnotes and Bibliography

In accordance with the Chicago Manual of Style (17th edn), URLs have been provided for all content consulted online. In order to maintain clarity in the footnotes, however, these have been included in the bibliography only, except for references to material available exclusively on websites. For the same reason, ESTC numbers have been included in the bibliography but omitted from the footnotes. HTI source codes and library shelfmarks/Wing numbers, however, have been included in the footnotes, to facilitate cross-referencing with the HTI while reading, and to make it clear at all points which copy of a given source is being referred to.

Entries from Grove Music Online, the Oxford Dictionary of National Biography, and the Dictionary of Irish Biography have been cited individually in the bibliography. Shorter entries, such as those in the Dublin Music Trade database, the Hymn Tune Index, or Hymnary.org, are cited on a case-by-case basis in the footnotes, with the database as a

whole included in the "Online Resources" section of the bibliography. Websites that have been cited only once or twice are included in the footnotes only, with URLs provided. Access dates for online material, in line with the Chicago style, have been included only where the website was felt to be potentially subject to change. Also following the newest edition of the Chicago manual of style, "Ibid." has not been used.

Portions of the research included in this thesis were published in my article "The Psalm Tune Repertory of Eighteenth-Century Dublin: Sources, Concordances, and Cultural Significance", *The Musicology Review* 10 (November 2021): 1–28.

CHAPTER 1: PARISH MUSIC AND PARISH MINDSETS

The parish church was a highly significant place, institution and social force in eighteenth-century society. As well as serving as a social centre where the (Anglican) community gathered each week, and a religious space in which the business of the Church was carried out, it was also, in effect, a branch of local government. Its considerable secular authority over the administrative affairs of the local area was theoretically open to all who cared to involve themselves in the business of the vestry, but in practice parish administration was generally dominated by small numbers of dedicated members of the middle class. The parish church also had a symbolic existence: for the Protestant community, it embodied their financial success, piety, and aesthetic taste, while the internal space of the church mirrored social hierarchies, serving as a microcosm of the community. To the Catholics, the parish church symbolised continuing Protestant oppression, particularly as it was a highly politicised space which advertised its affiliation with the state and Crown at every turn. It was in these surroundings, among all of these conflicting and converging functions, meanings and symbolisms, that parish church music making took place.

Nicholas Temperley has argued, in his survey of English parish church music, that although local churches are "sensitive to social and economic changes and to movements of popular opinion", they are simultaneously "remote from the influence of theological,

¹ Rowena Dudley, "The Dublin Parish, 1660–1730," in Elizabeth Fitzpatrick and Raymond Gillespie, eds, *The Parish in Medieval and Modern Ireland: Community, Territory and Building* (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2006), 277.

² Dudley, "The Dublin Parish", 280.

³ Toby Barnard, "The Eighteenth-Century Parish", in Fitzpatrick and Gillespie, eds, *The Parish in Medieval and Early Modern Ireland*.

⁴ Barnard, "The Eighteenth-Century Parish".

aesthetic or political ideas that thrive in seats of government, learning, fashion, and commerce".⁵ In combination with the relatively weak legal control exerted over worship practices at the parish level, and the freedom which music has historically enjoyed within the Anglican service structure, Temperley argues that this has made parish church music a barometer of popular opinion, and a reflection of local attitudes to issues like the place of music in worship.⁶

This chapter approaches the music of the Dublin parish church in the same spirit as Temperley approached that of the English church, evaluating the ways in which it reflected and expressed the attitudes and opinions of those who took part in it. In one significant departure from Temperley, however, it is not assumed from the outset that these attitudes were "remote" from the worlds of politics, aesthetics, fashion, or otherwise; rather, all levels of ideological and extra-musical influence on the world of the parish church are considered. The chapter reconstructs the musical repertory and performance practices of the Dublin parish church, from the texts and tunes sung by the congregations during services to the organ music and charity school choirs which often accompanied them. At the same time, it situates this musical tradition within its wider historical and cultural context by examining the relationship between developments and attitudes in parish music and the wider social, cultural and political forces of eighteenth-century life. These include socio-political and economic forces, the rise of the middle class, the ubiquity of the Enlightenment ideals of "progress" and "improvement", and the lingering fear of Catholicism that pervaded post-Restoration society. All these factors influenced the music of Dublin parish churches during the eighteenth century, and were at the same time embodied within it. The music which filled the spiritually, socially and politically

-

⁵ The Music of the English Parish Church (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1979), 1.

⁶ Temperley, *Music of the English Parish Church*, 1–4.

significant spaces is therefore inextricable from these extra-musical forces, and can open a window into the world of the eighteenth-century Dublin parish church.

Because the quantity of surviving primary source material from this period varies widely between Dublin parishes, and for reasons of practicality, this chapter takes as a case study the church of St Michan's, for which a considerable quantity of material has survived, particularly relating to the parish music. Wherever possible, this has been supplemented by information pertaining to the music of other city parishes. To generalise from a specific case is always risky, and what was true for St Michan's of course may not have been true in all parishes; nevertheless, in the absence of detailed information about the musical life of every parish church, the (relatively) complete picture that can be established of the St Michan's parish music is a useful place to begin.

1.1. The Dublin Parish

1.1.1 Internal administrative structure of the parish: the "middling sort"

It is impossible to evaluate the cultural significance of the parish church without an appreciation of the multiple roles it played in eighteenth-century life. One of the most important of these was administrative and governmental: the parish was the main unit of local civil administration in the British Isles during the eighteenth century. It effectively functioned as a form of local government, combining its spiritual functions and responsibilities with an array of secular ones including the collection of both parish and

⁷ The records of St Michan's parish church are held at the RCB Library in Churchtown and cover the period 1711–1996; earlier records were destroyed in the Public Records Office fire in 1922. Transcripts are available of some lost records. RCB P.0276.

civil taxes, the maintenance of roads, lighting the streets, policing, and looking after the local poor. The civil responsibilities of the parish gradually increased during the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, gathering pace after the Restoration.⁸ The parish church, therefore, should be correctly viewed not merely as a site of religious and social importance but as a physical manifestation of temporal authority—the place, in the Irish historian Toby Barnard's words, where the average person could come into close contact with a small part of the "increasingly complicated state machine of Britain, Ireland and its expanding empire", and even form part of that machinery on the local level.⁹

The increase in civic responsibilities delegated to the parish church after the Restoration was spurred partly by expanding urban populations. Another significant factor, however, was a "growing awareness" that urban living required more structured regulation. Towards the eighteenth century, this awareness would finally be manifested in state-led initiatives such as the establishment of a centralised police force, and the pressure of civil responsibility would begin to lift slightly. For most of the period under consideration, however, it was the parish system that had to bear most of the burden of local administration. Although this placed a strain on parish finances, and was resented by overworked parish officials, it also concentrated significant local power in the hands of the parish officers and vestry.

The internal administrative structure of the parish was hierarchical, and consisted of both a spiritual "branch" and a lay contingent, both answerable to the incumbent minister. ¹² The "spiritual staff" of the church usually consisted of a minister, an assistant

⁸ Dudley, "The Dublin Parish", 277.

⁹ Toby Barnard, "The Eighteenth-Century Parish", 298.

¹⁰ Dudley, "The Dublin Parish", 278.

¹¹ Dudley, "The Dublin Parish", 294–6.

¹² All information about parish offices in this paragraph taken from Dudley, "The Dublin Parish", 279–283.

and a reader; additional salaried helpers were sometimes employed to carry out specific duties, such as reading prayers or preaching on Sundays, but these became less common as the eighteenth century went on. The secular staff of the parish was divided into remunerated and unremunerated positions; the former consisted of people like the parish clerk, the sexton and the beadle, whose responsibilities included the recording of births, marriages and deaths, seating people and maintaining order during services, digging graves and generally keeping the church in good order. ¹³ The standard unpaid positions were those of the churchwardens, who were answerable to the minister, and the sidesmen, answerable to the churchwardens. Although the numbers of wardens and sidesmen varied, churches generally appointed at least two people to each role. Some parishes also appointed officers to take charge of the poor. All of the unpaid parish offices were filled for a year at a time, and elected from among the generality of parish residents (though a select few, including peers, attorneys and MPs, were considered exempt from consideration).¹⁴ Refusal to take up the position resulted in a hefty fine—five pounds for turning down a warden position, three pounds for that of sidesman—but conversely this meant that those who wished to avoid the task could easily pay their way out of it. 15 The late seventeenth-century records of St Catherine's church in Dublin list high numbers of elected officials opting to pay the fine rather than accept the role, suggesting that this practice was not uncommon.¹⁶

The most significant decision-making force within the parish was the vestry. In theory, all parish inhabitants were eligible to attend vestry meetings and get involved in the proceedings; although some parishes in Britain replaced the general vestry with a "select

¹³ The parish clerk also frequently had the additional responsibility of organising the church music; see 1.2.4 below.

¹⁴ Dudley, "The Dublin Parish", 279–80.

¹⁵ Dudley, "The Dublin Parish", 281.

¹⁶ RCB P.0117.05/1a: St Catherine's Vestry minute book 1679–95 (typescript copy).

vestry" made up of a small number of powerful parish residents, there is no direct evidence that any Dublin parishes had select vestries. In practice, however, only a small number of the most involved and invested parish residents tended to take part in vestry meetings. It is possible that the majority of people were either uninterested in parish administrative matters or were put off by the heavy workload and lack of pay.¹⁷ The day-to-day governance of the parish therefore generally fell to a small number of invested citizens, with greater numbers becoming involved only when an issue impacted them directly.¹⁸

The end result of the processes of selection for parish offices, combined with the general disengagement from the parish vestry, was the concentration of parish-level authority in the hands of a small number of enthusiastic residents of the "middling sort", as the middle classes were generally known before the late eighteenth century. The "middling sort" were positioned between, on one hand, the gentry and aristocracy, and, on the other hand, the working labourers "who depend upon their hands". The majority were commercial or industrial capitalists, who were principally distinguished from labourers by their ability to accumulate wealth and to employ others, rather than merely to survive from week to week. This class of people included shopkeepers and tradesmen, as well as, at the upper end, urban professionals such as clergy, lawyers and doctors, who despite being similar in many ways to the lower ranks of the gentry were closer to the middle class "in terms of income and life-style". In attitude, the middle class was

¹⁷ Dudley, "The Dublin Parish", 284.

¹⁸ Barnard, "The Eighteenth-Century Parish", 305.

¹⁹ Dudley, "The Dublin Parish", 280. Peter Earle, *The Making of the English Middle Class: Business, Society and Family Life in London, 1660–1730* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1989), 3.

²⁰ Earle, *The Making of the English Middle Class*, 4–5.

²¹ Earle, *The Making of the English Middle Class*, 5. The *cultural* distinction between classes was, however, becoming increasingly blurred during the eighteenth century, particularly by the adoption of similar manners of dress by people of very different social stations, and by those in the country as well as in town. See Paul Langford, *Eighteenth-Century Britain: A Very Short Introduction* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), 50–52 & 65–66.

resolutely capitalist, characterised by pragmatic and commercial attitudes that prioritised utility and practicality.²² They were also possessed of a great desire for self-education and self-improvement.²³

The significance of this for parish church music is that it was primarily the attitudes of this class, and even more specifically of the members of this class predisposed to take an active interest in parish affairs, which influenced the developments which took place in parish church music during this period. If it is possible to speak of a "parish mindset", or set of attitudes and ideologies which shaped developments at the parish level, then it is largely the mindset of this class of Dublin resident.

1.1.2 Dublin's parishes: a picture of expansion and improvement

The area of land encompassed by a parish was variable, dependent not only on historical factors but also on practical concerns such as congregation size and access to the parish church. A sparsely populated parish meant not only low attendance at services but also low income from tithes and other sources; many ministers in rural parishes during this period were forced to combine parishes together in order to obtain a decent living.²⁴ Equally, a parish which was too large or overpopulated was unwieldy, and might result in a larger congregation than could be accommodated at the parish church. Parish boundaries therefore were not static, but changed in response to demographic factors, and the parish boundaries of Dublin in the eighteenth century not only mapped the historical growth of the city but also reflected the continuing expansion of Dublin during the early modern period. Beginning in the seventeenth century, Dublin began a period of

²³ Earle, *The Making of the English Middle Class*, 10.

²² Langford, Eighteenth-Century Britain, 56.

²⁴ Barnard, "The Eighteenth-Century Parish", 299.

exponential growth which transformed it from the relatively humble post-Medieval colonial outpost that was depicted on Speed's map of 1610 to the thriving metropolis of the later Georgian era. ²⁵ In 1600, the city's population was around 10,000. ²⁶ By 1695 this had risen to around 47,000, and by 1798 there were approximately 180,000 people living in the city. ²⁷ The city itself grew from approximately 11.8 hectares in 1610 to 35.7 hectares in 1756. ²⁸ This placed the parish system under great strain, and required the creation of several new parishes, as well as the reconfiguration of existing parish boundaries. In 1695 there were twelve parishes in Dublin, several of which included rural areas; by 1800 there were twenty. ²⁹

Newly created parishes tended to correspond with areas of urban development. This was particularly evident on the north side of the city, which began the century much more sparsely populated than the south side; only around twenty per cent of the city's population lived north of the river in 1695. The rom 1675, a major development by Humphrey Jervis at the estuary of the Pill river resulted in the creation of a new suburb surrounding Ormond Quay; around the same time, Jervis also extensively developed the area around today's Jervis Street, which quickly attracted a new population of gentry and wealthy merchants. In 1697, St Michan's parish, at the time the only parish on the north side of the city, was divided into three, creating the new parishes of St Paul's, "New" St Michan's, and St Mary's. In 1749, reflecting the general drift of urban activity eastward

-

²⁵ Christine Casey, *Dublin: The City within the Grand and Royal Canals and the Circular Road with the Phoenix Park.* Buildings of Ireland series ed. Nikolaus Pevsner and Alistair Rowan (London: Yale University Press, 2005), 22ff. John Speed's Map of 1610 is reproduced in Colm Lennon, *Dublin Part II:* 1610 to 1756, Irish Historic Towns Atlas 19 (Dublin: Royal Irish Academy, 2008).

²⁶ Dudley, "The Dublin Parish", 278.

²⁷ Patrick Fagan, "The Population of Dublin in the Eighteenth Century with Particular Reference to the Proportions of Protestants and Catholics", *Eighteenth-Century Ireland / Iris an dá chultúr* 6 (1991): 148.

²⁸ Lennon, *Dublin Part II*, IHTA, 1.

²⁹ Fagan, "Population of Dublin", 125.

³⁰ Fagan, "Population of Dublin", 127.

³¹ Casey, *Dublin*, 111. Lennon, *Dublin Part II*, IHTA, 4.

³² 9 Will. 3 c. 16. Fagan, "Population of Dublin", 125.

from the old Viking centre towards newer developments in the area of Sackville Mall (now O'Connell Street), St Thomas's parish was created in the east; Luke Gardiner, the developer of Sackville Mall, encouraged the creation of the new parish because this gave the new residents greater control over local affairs such as taxes, parish utilities, and policing.³³ Finally, St George's parish was established in 1793, in the far north-east, though its church was not built until 1802.³⁴ Four new parishes were also created south of the Liffey in the course of the eighteenth century: St James's, St Ann's, St Luke's, and St Mark's.³⁵ The last of these was newly created in more ways than one, for it comprised land reclaimed from the river under the direction of Sir John Rogerson.³⁶ St Ann's parish, established in 1707, contained the new fashionable urban estate development of Joshua Dawson, who, like Gardiner, encouraged the creation of the parish for the benefit of his new residents.³⁷

Not all of the city's parishes were equally wealthy. The parishes of St Catherine's, St John's, St Michan's, St Mark's, and St Luke's had the highest number of people per household of all the parishes, generally an indicator of poverty. Whitelaw's 1798 census of the city estimated that eighty per cent of the population of St Mark's were lower class. The richest parishes appear to have been St Michael's, St Werburgh's and St Nicholas Within; in these parishes over sixty per cent of the houses had more than five hearths and an average of two servants. In contrast, St Nicholas Without, which was right on the edge of the city at the time, was made up mostly of small houses, with only one or two hearths

-

³³ Eamon Walsh, "Sackville Mall: The First One Hundred Years", in David Dickson, ed., *The Gorgeous Mask: Dublin 1700–1850*, Trinity History Workshop 2 (Dublin: Trinity History Workshop, 1987), 32–33. ³⁴ 33 Geo. 3 c. 53. There was previously a chapel of ease dedicated to St George in Hill Street, of which the tower survives, standing in a playground. Casey, *Dublin*, 120–122.

³⁵ Fagan, "Population of Dublin", 125.

³⁶ Lennon, *Dublin Part II*, IHTA, 6.

³⁷ 6 Ann. c.21. Walsh, "Sackville Mall", 33.

³⁸ Ruth Le Velle & Paul Huggard, "The Parish Poor of St Mark's", in Dickson, ed., *The Gorgeous Mask*, 86–87.

and an average of one servant for every two houses.³⁹ In general, the parishes of the inner city, which were confined within the city walls and so resisted extensive development and expansion, were richer, while those closer to the periphery were poorer (though St John's, an extremely central but not particularly wealthy parish, was an exception). There was also an increasingly apparent "social gradient" observable between the western reaches of the city and the more fashionable eastern side.⁴⁰

Another factor which differed between parishes was the percentage of the population which actually belonged to the established church. In general, the parishes of the inner city had a higher concentration of conforming inhabitants; in 1718 a report for the Archbishop of Dublin, William King, estimated that St Bride's, St John's and St Nicholas Within all had a three-to-one established church majority. In contrast, in St Michan's parish, King was told, albeit vaguely, that "the papists are 8 or 10 times more than both protestants, Conformists & dissenters". In 1731, a report on the "State of Popery" in the Kingdom of Ireland, which detailed the numbers of priests, chapels and Catholic schools operating in each parish, stated that the parishes with the highest number of Catholic inhabitants were St Catherine's, St Nicholas Without, St Michael's, St Audoen's, and St Mark's. St Michan's was listed as having four mass houses, one of which had been opened after 1714, as well as a nunnery "built within these three or four years", two Latin schools and nine English schools. It should be noted that the proportion of Catholics did not correlate directly with the wealth of the parish, as St Michael's was one of the richer parishes in the city; nor were Catholics totally confined to the newer developments at the

³⁹ Fagan, "Population of Dublin", 128.

⁴⁰ Lennon, Dublin Part II, IHTA, 5.

⁴¹ Dudley, "The Dublin Parish", 284.

⁴² Quoted in Dudley, "The Dublin Parish", 284.

⁴³ Fagan, "Population of Dublin", 135–6. A transcript of the full report is accessible on JSTOR: "Report on the State of Popery in Ireland, 1731: Diocese of Dublin", *Archivium Hibernicum* 4 (1915).

^{44 &}quot;Report on the State of Popery in Ireland", 141.

periphery of the city, for both St Audoen's and St Michael's were among the most central and oldest parishes, while St Mark's was at that time one of the newest. Contemporary surveys of religious affiliation do, however, reveal a slightly greater concentration of Catholics in western parishes, and Protestants in eastern ones.⁴⁵

1.1.3: The other parish system: Catholics in Dublin

The Dublin parish system was distinguished from its London counterpart by the fact that, in practice, a large part of the population which it served and oversaw were not members of the church. At the beginning of the eighteenth century, approximately a third of the population of Dublin were Catholic. By the end of the century, this had risen to around two thirds—approximately 110,000 people. ⁴⁶ (Protestant Nonconformists, who also made up a sizeable percentage of the population, are discussed in chapter 2 below.) Although obliged to pay the established parish cess and minister's money, Dublin's Catholics maintained their own independent parish structure; the boundaries of the Catholic parishes corresponded roughly, though not entirely, with those of the established church. ⁴⁷

The social position of Irish Catholics during the eighteenth century is a hotly contested issue among scholars of Irish history. It is indubitable, however, that Catholics were subject during this period to a succession of oppressive legal restrictions known as the "penal laws". These laws greatly restricted the activities of Catholic clergy, particularly the regular clergy (monks and nuns), as well as discriminating against Catholics in matters of land ownership, marriage, and voting rights. Penal legislation

⁴⁶ Fagan, "Population of Dublin", 156.

⁴⁵ Fagan, "Population of Dublin", 141.

⁴⁷ Fagan, "Population of Dublin", 136.

deprived Catholics of the right to vote, excluded them from positions in parliament, forbade them to bear arms or to send their children to Continental European schools, and made it illegal to purchase or inherit land from Protestants, as well as many other sweeping prohibitions designed to maintain power in the hands of the Protestant elite.⁴⁸ The majority of these laws did not originate in Britain, but were introduced by the Irish Parliament in Dublin, which was made up exclusively of members of the upper-class "Protestant Ascendancy".⁴⁹

The traditional nationalist historiography of the penal laws asserts that their primary purpose was to effect the complete suppression of Catholicism in Ireland. This has been greatly disputed by more recent revisionist historiography, which has suggested that in fact the majority of the penal laws were very weakly, if ever, enforced, and that the Irish authorities generally took little interest in stamping out Catholicism. The historian Maureen Wall commented that if the penal laws had ever been enforced (or enforceable), they would have eliminated Catholicism in Ireland within a generation, and that in fact the Protestant Ascendancy had no strong interest in the total suppression of Catholicism. This perspective is supported by the surprising, yet undeniable fact that the Irish Catholic church actually grew considerably in strength during the period of the penal laws. In 1697, only eight bishops remained in Ireland and thirteen sees lay vacant; by 1750, all of them were filled, and competition for places was acute. The penal laws were

⁴⁸ Of the laws directed against the clergy, the most serious were the 1697 Banishment Act (9 Will. 3 c.1), the act of 1704 (2 Ann. c.7), and the act of 1709 (8 Ann. c.3); these respectively ordered the expulsion of bishops and regular clergy, required all priests to register with the authorities, and compelled registered priests to swear an Oath of Abjuration denying the Stuart claim to the throne. Alongside these were laws that discriminated more generally against Catholics, including the 1704 Popery Act (2 Ann. c.6), a 1727 Act depriving Catholics of voting rights (1 Geo. 2 c.9), and multiple Acts dealing with marriage between Protestants and Catholics; see William Burke, *The Irish Priests in Penal Times*, 1660–1760 (Shannon: Irish University Press, 1914; this edn 1968), 187.

⁴⁹ William Edward Hartpole Lecky, *A History of Ireland in the Eighteenth Century*, vol. 1 (London: Longmans, Green & Co, 1913), 145.

⁵⁰ The Penal Laws 1691–1760, 2nd edn, Irish History series 1 (Dundalk: Dundalgan Press, 1967), 10.

⁵¹ Wall, *Penal Laws*, 3–4 & 32–34.

established throughout the country, and while they were generally situated away from the main road so as not to attract attention, they suffered very little harassment or defacement and were almost always permitted to remain open. Church schools also proliferated. The 1731 *Report on the State of Popery in Ireland* stated that in Dublin alone there were "sixteen Mass houses, four whereof have been built since the reign of King George I; one hundred and two popish priests; three private popish chapels; two nunneries, but the number of nuns is uncertain; and there are forty-five popish schools".⁵² In 1745, the (Protestant) Archbishop of Tuam wrote that Catholics "resort publicly in great numbers to their Mass-houses, without the least molestation, as the Protestants do to their churches"; that "the priest in every parish" was "well known to the Protestant gentlemen"; and that "so long as he behaves himself orderly and decently", he was generally not disturbed.⁵³

Rather than viewing the penal laws as an example of religious oppression, revisionist historiography suggests that they were largely motivated by economic and political factors, and by the Protestant Ascendancy's desire to protect their own interest. Restrictions on Catholic land ownership at a time when land formed the basis of political power, along with bans on Catholics entering public office, guilds or professions, preserved money and power in the hands of a small elite: as analysed by the leading Victorian historian W. E. H. Lecky, "the penal code, as it was actually carried out, was inspired much less by fanaticism than by rapacity, and was directed less against the Catholic religion than against the property and industry of its professors. It was intended to make them poor and to keep them poor". 54 In this respect, the penal legislation was

⁵² Ouoted in Wall, *Penal Laws*, 45.

⁵³ Quoted in Wall, *Penal Laws*, 64.

⁵⁴ History of Ireland in the Eighteenth Century, vol. 1, 152. Patrick J. Corish, *The Catholic Community in the Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries* (Dublin: Helicon, 1981), 73. Wall, *Penal Laws*, 7.

barely different from similar attempts by wealthy political elites across contemporary Europe to conserve power in their hands at the expense of the generality of the population: to quote the Irish historian S. J. Connolly,

It was of course the case that Ireland in the late seventeenth and eighteenth centuries was an unequal and exploitative society, in which power and wealth were monopolised by a small group. But the same was true of contemporary England, and indeed the whole of western Europe, regardless of the religious composition of the population. ... If the penal laws had been removed or if the whole population had been transformed overnight into Protestants ... there is no reason to assume that land would have ceased to be the key to political power, that men would have become really equal before the law, ... or that wealth would have been divided more equitably. ⁵⁵

In practice, the average Catholic inhabitant of Dublin may have suffered little from the penal laws, which were sporadically enforced and often concerned matters (such as admittance to the professions or restrictions on land ownership) which were of little relevance to the average person. ⁵⁶ Significantly, the penal laws placed almost no restrictions on Catholic engagement in trade, and in fact the fortunes of the Catholic merchant classes improved dramatically during this period. ⁵⁷ Nevertheless, the legal subordination of Catholics reflected, and perpetuated, a very real socio-cultural divide that existed between the kingdom's Protestant and Catholic populations. It is telling, for example, that enforcement of the penal laws became much more stringent during periods when the Protestant population felt themselves to be under threat of Catholic rebellion or insurgency, such as during periods of increased Jacobite activity. ⁵⁸ Fear, therefore, was a major motivating factor behind both the passing and the enforcement of the penal laws.

-

⁵⁵ S. J. Connolly, *Religion, Law and Power: The Making of Protestant Ireland, 1660–1760* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1995), 312.

⁵⁶ Connolly, *Religion, Law and Power*, 310.

⁵⁷ Maureen Wall, "The Rise of a Catholic Middle Class in Eighteenth-Century Ireland", *Irish Historical Studies* 11, no. 42 (September 1958).

⁵⁸ Wall, Penal Laws, 20.

Dublin's Protestants, particularly at the beginning of the eighteenth-century, perceived themselves as a minority population surrounded on all sides by a menacing Jacobite threat—a perspective that was not entirely without grounding in reality, as pro-Jacobite sentiment was high among the Irish clergy. The issue of Catholic allegiance to the secular monarchy, which had been an issue since the Reformation, was genuinely complicated by the Pope's recognition of the exiled Stuarts as the rightful kings of England, and with England's continuing war with Catholic France.⁵⁹

Even more significant than fear, however, was the general position occupied by Catholicism in the eighteenth-century Protestant mind. Catholicism was the great "other" against which Anglican society defined itself: a cruel and superstitious culture associated with social chaos. This contributed to the general image among Protestants of both kingdoms that the "native Irish" were an ignorant and primitive people, whose poverty was attributable to their own inadequacies, for example, their failure to master "modern" agricultural techniques (see 4.1.2 below) and their need for "civilising" via the reordering of society along an English model. ⁶⁰ These views were part of what the British historian Linda Colley has called "a vast superstructure of prejudice" against Catholics in the contemporary British Protestant mindset, sustained by ongoing wars against Catholic France, which equated Catholicism with economic wastefulness, laziness and corruption. ⁶¹ The parish church, as an embodiment of rationality, order and civility, contrasted starkly with this image of Catholic backwardness, and as a centre of civil administration was a direct agent in the (perceived) imposition of the "civility" of the former upon the "barbarity" of the latter: a dramatic example of this was the brief

⁵⁹ Wall, *Penal Laws*, 17–19.

⁶⁰ Keith Thomas, *In Pursuit of Civility: Manners and Civilization in Early Modern England* (London: Yale University Press, 2018), 152–3, 222.

⁶¹ Britons: Forging the Nation, 1707–1837, revised edn (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2019), 33–35.

enthusiasm for the idea of cultivating orchards of fruit trees in the Irish countryside, to which purpose parish school children were put to work in rural areas in the mid-eighteenth century.⁶²

The minority situation of Protestantism on the island of Ireland also heightened the political tensions inherent in the parish church space. Though in earlier times the parish church had functioned as a unifying element of sorts in the community, uniting different confessional groups at a local level, by the end of the seventeenth century it had become a more overtly polarised space. From the Catholic perspective, Barnard has argued, the parish church in the eighteenth century symbolised continued Protestant oppression and control: of significant public space, of important rites of passage such as marriages and burials, which could not legally take place at the Catholic chapels, and of the apparatus of local government. Parish churches were in no way politically neutral spaces but advertised their affiliation at all turns, from the legal requirement to display the Royal Arms inside every church to the ritual commemoration, via church services, of events such as the deliverance of the nation from the Catholic uprising of 1641. These events were generally marked by sermons that stoked popular distrust of Catholicism, as well as by public festivities such as feasts and illuminations. Church bells were rung not only for religious reasons or to mark the passage of time but also on political occasions such

⁶² M. G. Jones, *The Charity School Movement: A Study of Eighteenth-Century Puritanism in Action* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1938), 240. This recalled an earlier, similar enthusiasm for the "improving project" of tree-planting, for which the government made parishes responsible in 1698 but which was quickly abandoned. Barnard, "The Eighteenth-Century Parish", 304.

⁶³ The role of the parish as a locally unifying institution is discussed in Raymond Gillespie, "Urban Parishes in Early Seventeenth-Century Ireland: the Case of Dublin", in Fitzpatrick and Gillespie, eds, *The Parish in Medieval and Early Modern Ireland*, 228.

⁶⁴ Barnard, "The Eighteenth-Century Parish", 297.

⁶⁵ Dell Upton, "Anglican Parish Churches in Eighteenth-Century Virginia", *Perspectives in Vernacular Architecture* 2 (1986): 93. Barnard, "The Eighteenth-Century Parish", 320.

⁶⁶ T. C. Barnard, "The Uses of 23 October 1641 and Irish Protestant Celebrations", *The English Historical Review* 106, no. 421 (October 1991): 892–895.

as the monarch's birthday and accession day.⁶⁷ At St Catherine's in 1691, payments were made for bell-ringing on ten exceptional occasions. Two of these were religious (Christmas and Easter), and the remaining eight were political or associated with occasions of state: the bells were rung "at the surrender of Limerick", on King William's birthday, for the "Victory at Sea" in May, for the coming to town of the Lord Lieutenant, the Lords Justices and "the General", and on 23 October (anniversary of the 1641 Rebellion) and 5 November (Gunpowder Treason Day).⁶⁸ Through practices such as these, the parish church embodied the "confessional fragmentation" of the wider parish community.⁶⁹ All activities which took place there, including music, did so in this politically charged atmosphere.

1.1.4 The parish church as venue

The religious, administrative, social and cultural heart of the parish was the parish church itself. With just a few exceptions, the parish churches of eighteenth-century Dublin displayed a striking conformity of architectural style that belied the disparate ages of their respective parishes; almost all were simple rectangular buildings with internal galleries, built in a style which the architectural historian Christine Casey describes as "sturdy and distinctly provincial". This was an internationally-recognised model, which was also followed in contemporary Episcopalian churches in America. To this basic plan some churches added more ambitious architectural features: St Mary's incorporated "convex quadrants linking the nave to the chancel", similar to those of St Clement Danes in

-

⁶⁷ Gillespie, "Urban Parishes", 229.

⁶⁸ RCB P.0117.05/1: St Catherine's Vestry book 1657–1692, 290.

⁶⁹ Barnard, "The Eighteenth-Century Parish", 319.

⁷⁰ Casey, *Dublin*, 450.

⁷¹ Upton, "Anglican Parish Churches in Eighteenth-Century Virginia", 93.

London, for example, while the elaborate frontage of St Thomas's was modelled on Palladio's Redentore in Venice.⁷² The only two churches which departed significantly from this "shoebox" pattern were St Audoen's, which retained much of its medieval fabric, and St Andrew's, the famous "round church", which had a distinctive oval shape.⁷³ The parish of St Nicholas Without, idiosyncratically, worshipped in the north transept of St Patrick's cathedral, and later in the Lady Chapel (see 4.2.3 below).

This conformity of style was the result of the early modern craze for rebuilding and improvement which gripped the city's parishes throughout the period: parish churches were constantly being rebuilt, refurbished and altered, despite the considerable expense to the parish coffers. Surviving parish records detail near constant expenditure on upkeep, expansion and beautification of the churches. Sometimes these rebuildings were essential, for example when St Werburgh's church burned almost to the ground in a fire of 1754. Often, however, we have only the parishioners' testimonies that the churches were falling into disrepair to the point that extensive rebuilding was needed. It has been suggested that many of these rebuilding projects were in fact exploited by unscrupulous churchwardens as money-laundering schemes, with contracts for jobs like roofing and glazing awarded to the wardens' own firms, or ones in which they had a personal interest.⁷⁴

For whatever reason, this craze for improvement had a very visible effect upon the city's churches: in addition to the eight brand new churches built during the long eighteenth century, at least seven of the pre-existing churches were substantially or

⁷² Casey, *Dublin*, 89–90.

⁷³ John Crawford, "An Archaeological Survey of St. Audoen's Church, Cornmarket", *Dublin Historical Record* 49, no. 2 (Autumn 1996). John T. Gilbert, *A History of the City of Dublin*, vol 3 (Dublin: James McGlashan, 1854), 308. An early nineteenth-century account of the 1793 rebuilding of St Andrew's, which preserved its distinctive shape, noted that although the interior was aesthetically very pleasing, the acoustics were so bad that it was very difficult to be heard inside. George Newenham Wright, *An Historical Guide to the City of Dublin*, 2nd edn (London: Printed for Baldwin, Cradock, and Joy, 1825), 83.

⁷⁴ Temperley, *Music of the English Parish Church*, 117. Temperley notes that "It is not unlikely that organ builders profited from the same system, though no case has come to light".

completely rebuilt. Many of the structures which were replaced were themselves reasonably new: the 1763 church of St John's replaced a building originally from the 1680s, and St Michan's church, the contemporary structure of which dated also from the 1680s, underwent extensive renovations as early as 1713, and subsequently in 1724 and 1767. Even the partly medieval St Audoen's was modified on several occasions around this time; these modifications included the addition of an organ gallery to the twelfth-century nave in 1680, which necessitated a new window, and the replacement of the medieval roof in the 1770s. It was common for parish churches to exist in a half-constructed, unfinished state for many years: St Mark's took over twenty years to build, and the western front of St Ann's—which would eventually be superseded by the present Victorian design—still had "neither cupola nor steeple ... an exceedingly unfinished appearance" in 1825. The eighteenth-century parish church, therefore, was not a static, venerable building of a timeless character but a constantly changing, modern construction—often with something of the atmosphere of a building site.

The parish churches' collective enthusiasm for improvement and enlargement often far outpaced the money available for such grand schemes. One regular casualty of the disparity between the parish authorities' figurative eyes and stomachs was the church spire: although many of the parishes planned to crown their buildings with a tower and spire, almost none of these was ever built. An early nineteenth-century source states that the spire of St Werburgh's, which was a particularly impressive construction, was, with

https://www.archiseek.com/2010/1702-st-marys-church-mary-street-dublin/).

⁷⁵ Gilbert, *History of Dublin* vol 1, 51–52. Casey, *Dublin*, 239.

⁷⁶ Crawford, "An Archaeological Survey of St. Audoen's Church, Cornmarket".

⁷⁷ Wright, *Historical Guide*, 71. Casey, *Dublin*, 450.

⁷⁸ At St Catherine's, the tower was never finished, and the upper part of the belfry and spire "never materialised"; the tower of St Mark's was planned, but not built (Casey, *Dublin*, 451 & 623). Wright noted in 1825 that "it was the intention" of the parishioners at St Thomas's to erect "a very beautiful steeple", but that it had not yet been realised (*Historical Guide*, 76). The tower of the new St Andrew's church of 1793 was "only partially built" and St Mary's never received its spire, having instead just a stumpy tower. (https://www.archiseek.com/2014/round-st-andrews-church-dublin/;

that of St Patrick's, one of only two church spires in the city before it was removed in 1810.⁷⁹ More reprehensible than an unrealised project was one realised without being paid for: the building of St Mary's church, begun in 1701, still had not been fully paid for by 1711, and legal charges were brought against the parish authorities by the builders for non-payment. In 1721, the parish finally admitted they could not afford the arrears and suffered further legal charges.⁸⁰

As well as expressing theological and political affiliations, the interior of the parish church was ordered according to strict social hierarchies. Generally, richer congregants sat in pews, while the poorer sat on benches, or stood. But Upwardly mobile parishioners could pay for exclusive rights to use a particular pew; these pew rents were a significant source of income for the parish. The spatial organisation of the church, which strictly separated rich from poor, thus mirrored the social stratification which characterised the eighteenth-century world outside. One of the duties of the sexton at St Michan's was to seat parishioners "according to their Properties, Ranks, Orders and Degrees". Monuments on the church walls to deceased members of the parish, still today a common trait of Anglican and Episcopalian worship spaces, also served as reminders of the hierarchical preoccupations of the secular world: at St Mary's, a monument to Mrs Chenevix, wife of the Bishop of Waterford and Lismore, who died in 1752, proclaims that she was "loved and esteemed ... particularly by her royal mistress the Princess of Orange and her friend the Countess of Chesterfield".

--

⁷⁹ Wright, *Historical Guide*, 69.

⁸⁰ Dudley, "The Dublin Parish", 287.

⁸¹ Barnard, "The Eighteenth-Century Parish", 318–19.

⁸² At St Catherine's in 1679 some parishioners were paying as much to rent a pew for a year as others were paying to rent a house. RCB P.117.5/1: St Catherine's Vestry book 1657–1692, 200.

⁸³ RCB P.0276.28/3: St Michan's Memorial book 1724–89, 19.

⁸⁴ Casey, Dublin, 90.

1.2 Parish Church Music

1.2.1 Protestant theology of worship music

The question of what kind of music was acceptable in public worship is age-old and complex, and following the sixteenth-century Reformation Protestant communities took various positions on what kind of music should be permitted. This variety was part of a wider disagreement on worship practices and how they should relate to scripture. In general terms, Lutherans and Anglicans subscribed to what was known as the "normative principle" of worship, which stated that whatever was not expressly forbidden by scripture, and which contributed to the general edification of the faithful, was appropriate for use in worship. In contrast, Calvinists and Presbyterians held to the "regulative principle", believing that only what was expressly commanded by scripture was permitted. Related to this was the concept of *adiaphora*, central to the English church's view on music. This doctrine stated that it was possible for legitimate church practices to exist which were *neither* expressly forbidden *nor* specifically mandated by the scriptures, and it was partly the classification of music as a form of *adiaphora* that allowed it to escape extinction under the Elizabethan Settlement.⁸⁵

The key to determining whether music was mandated by scripture, prohibited by scripture, or adiaphorous was, of course, the interpretation of scripture itself. Unfortunately, in the matter of music the scriptures have remained notoriously vague. The Bible contains no clear commands relating to church music—Jesus did not authorise a particular style of music to his disciples in the way that he authorised the communion

⁸⁵ Jonathan Willis, Church Music and Protestantism in Post-Reformation England: Discourses, Sites and Identities (Farnham: Ashgate, 2019), 62ff.

rite and the Lord's Prayer, for example—and while the Old Testament in particular contains numerous references to music's being played in a spiritual context, opinions have been divided as to whether Christians are bound to follow the practices of the Hebrews. Psalm 150, for example, makes clear references to worshipping with the assistance of musical instruments:

³ Praise him with the sound of the trumpet:

praise him with the psaltery and harp.

⁴ Praise him with the timbrel and dance:

praise him with stringed instruments and organs.

⁵ Praise him upon the loud cymbals:

praise him upon the high sounding cymbals. 86

While some took this as explicit support for the use of instruments in church services, others argued that it was merely an account of a Jewish practice and therefore not a mandate for modern Christians to follow. ⁸⁷ Theologians' arguments for and against church music were generally founded on a small number of specific Biblical passages that were felt to give the clearest indications one way or another, but even those could be open to interpretation.

In addition to the uncertain scriptural validity of music, Protestant theologians had an uneasy relationship with the inherent power they believed it to possess. Music was seen as supremely capable of uplifting and edifying the faithful and could be used as a worthy tool for praising God, but it also had a dark side: it was associated with "wantonness, judgement and excess", and had the potential if handled incorrectly to act as a temptation away from spiritual matters and towards sensual fulfilment. ⁸⁸ This central dilemma with respect to music did not newly emerge at the Protestant Reformation: the

⁸⁶ Psalm 150 (KJV).

⁸⁷ Willis, Church Music and Protestantism, 40–41.

⁸⁸ Willis, Church Music and Protestantism, 41.

same concerns had been clearly expressed by St Augustine in his *Confessions* around 400

AD, when he wrote that in listening to music,

I vacillate between dangerous pleasure and healthful exercise. I am inclined—though I pronounce no irrevocable opinion on the subject—to approve of the use of singing in the church, so that by the delights of the ear the weaker minds may be stimulated to a devotional mood. Yet when it happens that I am more moved by the singing than by what is sung, I confess myself to have sinned wickedly, and then I would rather not have

heard the singing.⁸⁹

For some Protestant communities, the solution to these questions around music was

simply to forbid music in a worship context altogether (the Quakers, for example, had no

worship music during this period; see 2.5 below). For others, such as the Calvinists, music

was permitted but highly restricted in its form and content (see 2.2.2 below). At the other

end of the scale, Lutheran worship and the Anglican choral tradition retained much from

pre-Reformation musical practice (see 4.3 below). The Anglican parish charted a middle

course between these two extremes.

1.2.2 Anglican music: two traditions

The attitude of the English church towards worship music was strongly influenced by the

particular circumstances of the English Reformation. Too well known to require detailed

discussion here are the stern Protestant reforms pushed through during the reign of

Henry's sickly young son Edward VI, the vernacular prayer books of 1549 and 1552

bearing his name (the first leaning towards Lutheranism, the second Calvinism), and his

Catholic half-sister Mary's attempt to reverse his and their father's religious reforms. In

⁸⁹ Quoted in Philip Schaff, ed., A Select Library of the Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers of the Christian Church, volume 1 (Edinburgh: T & T Clark, 1994), 156.

any case, the future course of English church music was to be decisively set by the third and last of Henry's children to take the Tudor throne, the young Protestant Queen Elizabeth, whose so-called "settlement of religion", though in many respects a precarious compromise, was to prove permanent.

Elizabeth attended to the matter of church music in a set of fifty-two detailed injunctions on ecclesiastical reform, governance and practice she promulgated on 16 July 1559, eight months after her accession, and three months after her first parliament passed the Act of Uniformity reinstating a vernacular prayer book. In contrast to the Act, the injunctions were a royal proclamation issued without reference to parliament. For centuries to come, injunction 49, on the "continuance of singing in the church", would exert the queen's lasting personal influence on both the choral and the parish traditions:

And that there be a modest distinct song, so used in all parts of the common prayers in church, that the same may be as plainly understood, as if it were read without singing, and yet nevertheless, for the comforting of such that delight in music, it may be permitted that in the beginning, or in the end of common prayers, either at morning or evening, there may be sung an hymn, or such like song, to the praise of Almighty God, in the best sort of melody and music that may be conveniently devised, having respect that the sentence of the hymn may be understood and perceived. ⁹⁰

Provided that the clarity of the text and the structure of the liturgy were not disturbed, this provision permitted almost any form of music in the context of worship, from complex cathedral anthems accompanied by instruments to the congregational singing of simple psalms. The form that worship music took was therefore not standardised but differed widely between different worship contexts, influenced by the venue in which it was performed, the resources available, and the ideologies of the relevant authorities. The

⁹⁰ Quoted in Temperley, Music of the English Parish Church, 39.

result was a lasting divergence in musical style between choral foundations and parish churches. Edward Wetenhall, an English clergyman based in Ireland in the late seventeenth century, wrote in 1678 that:

there is at present practiced in our Church a double usage in singing: And I must ingenuously acknowledge, no two things which have the same name, and in any degree the same nature, common to them, can be more unlike on the other, than are our Choral and Parochial singing.⁹¹

In the cathedrals, choral services were sung by choirs with organ accompaniment, while in the parish churches, where the Puritan (Calvinistic) influence was stronger, the predominant form of musical worship was the congregational singing of metrical psalms. ⁹² Because this latter form of worship was closer to the Calvinistic ideal, it was not only undisturbed but actively encouraged during the Cromwellian era of the midseventeenth century, and remained the norm following the Restoration. ⁹³

1.2.3 Metrical psalmody: Sternhold and Hopkins

Congregational metrical psalmody, or the singing of psalms in metre rather than in prose, originated in the German Reformation, with Martin Luther's creation of a kind of vernacular hymn in which the whole congregation could participate together. While Luther equally embraced scriptural texts and newly composed verse, as long as it expressed Lutheran ideas, Calvin, following Martin Bucer in Strasbourg, restricted congregational singing to texts drawn directly from the Bible—principally, the psalms of

⁹¹ Edward Wetenhall, *Of gifts and offices in the public worship of God: a treatise in three parts* (Dublin: Printed by Benjamin Tooke, and are to be sold by Mary Crook), 327. Wing / W1506. Patrick A. Walsh and John Cronin, "Wetenhall, Edward", DIB (October 2009).

⁹² Temperley, Music of the English Parish Church, 41–42.

⁹³ Nicholas Temperley, "Anglican and Episcopalian Church Music", section 6: "English parochial music, 1549–1830", GMO (20 January 2001).

David. ⁹⁴ Although there are some limited examples of English-language metrical psalmody from the pre-Reformation, Henrician and Edwardian periods, mostly in the form of private devotional material or court poetry, ironically it was during the Marian period that metrical psalms entered the English repertory in force. ⁹⁵ At that time, many English Protestants fled to the Continent to escape persecution, and there came under the influence of the Reformed psalm tradition in Frankfurt, Geneva and Strasbourg. The English exile congregations developed their own tradition of English-language metrical psalmody, and following Elizabeth's accession metrical psalm singing quickly became a central part of worship in parish churches. ⁹⁶

The version of the psalms which dominated popular practice was *The Whole Booke of Psalmes*, published in its complete form by John Day in 1562. This book collected together texts by several different authors to create a complete metrical psalter; subsequent editions also included a small number of hymns, metrical canticles and prayers. Thirty-seven of the psalm texts were by Thomas Sternhold, a courtier who had been close to both Henry VIII and Edward VI.⁹⁷ The bulk of the remainder were by John Hopkins. William Whittingham, Calvin's brother-in-law, contributed seven psalms and a metrical version of the Ten Commandments. The predominance of texts by two of the contributors led to the psalter generally becoming known as the "Sternhold and Hopkins" version; in later centuries, following the publication of a *New Version* of the psalter (see 1.2.4 below), it would be referred to also as the "Old Version". The vast majority of the psalm texts—131, out of a total of 156 (six psalms were given in two alternative

⁹⁴ Beth Quitslund, *The Reformation in Rhyme: Sternhold, Hopkins and the English Metrical Psalter, 1547–1603* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2008), 9–10.

⁹⁵ Quitslund, *The Reformation in Rhyme*, 11–18.

⁹⁶ Nicholas Temperley, Howard Slenk, Jan R. Luth, Margaret Munck, John M. Barkley and R. Tosh, "Psalms, Metrical", GMO (16 October 2013).

⁹⁷ For an in-depth examination of Sternhold's psalm texts and their contextualisation within the genre of early modern "advice" literature, see Quitslund, *The Reformation in Rhyme*, chapter one.

versions)—were in "common metre", four-line stanzas of alternating eight- and six-syllable lines (8.6.8.6). Six were in "short metre" (6.6.8.6), three in "long metre" (8.8.8.8) and sixteen in other metres.⁹⁸

The *Whole Booke of Psalmes* was extremely popular, and dominated the metrical psalm tradition in the British Isles for over a hundred years. At least 452 editions with music were published, first by John Day and his descendants, and latterly (from 1603) by the Stationer's Company, who used it to maintain a monopoly over the printing of psalters in general. Despite never being authorised by any ruling body, the Sternhold and Hopkins psalms were felt in some way to be "authoritative", and although other versions were produced during this period, none was able to unseat the "Old Version", which by the end of the seventeenth century was entrenched in the popular imagination. ⁹⁹ At least six editions of the Sternhold and Hopkins psalter were printed in Dublin in the late seventeenth and early eighteenth century, indicating that there was still a considerable demand for this version in the city at that time. ¹⁰⁰ Three editions were produced between 1661 and 1700 by successive members of the Crooke family; the last, published in 1700 by Andrew Crooke, was probably bundled with the BCP also printed by him in the same year. Between 1711 and 1715 five copies were printed by Aaron Rhames, and a final edition was released in 1720 by George Grierson.

Although the earliest editions of the Sternhold and Hopkins psalter contained a large number of printed tunes—forty-eight psalm tunes and eighteen hymn tunes—none of those printed in Dublin contains any music. The *Grove* encyclopedia states that editions of the *Whole Booke of Psalmes* containing printed tunes were rare after 1620, and that no

-

⁹⁸ Temperley et al., "Psalms, Metrical", GMO.

⁹⁹ Temperley et al., "Psalms, Metrical", GMO.

¹⁰⁰ Data derived from the ESTC.

editions had any tunes after 1687.¹⁰¹ The original selection of tunes was largely derived from those used by the English congregations in Geneva, modelled on the French tunes of the Genevan Psalter (see 4.2.5 below). Some tunes were drawn directly from the French tradition and proved among the most enduring in the repertory. The English tunes, in comparison, seem to have faded from use surprisingly quickly. By 1594, Thomas East wrote that in most of the churches in England, only four tunes were used. These were "Oxford" [201a], "Canterbury" or "Low Dutch" [250], "Cambridge" [249a] and "Psalm 25" [269b]; none of them was printed in the psalm books at that time. ¹⁰² Of these tunes, only "Cambridge" [249a] is found in eighteenth-century Irish sources in the same form. The others are found in variant forms: [201a] in the variant "e" form, [269b] in the "h" and "j" forms, and [250] in the "h" form (see Appendix 1).

1.2.4 Metrical psalms in performance

The standard established church services during the long eighteenth century were the services of Morning and Evening Prayer, retained from the Edwardian BCP. Both of these services included a sermon, and metrical psalms were generally sung before and after the sermon. ¹⁰³ In churches that maintained them, organs and singing groups served chiefly to support congregational singing; if no organ or choir were available, as was most often the case, the congregation would sing unaccompanied. Because the metrical psalms were not technically part of the liturgy, unlike the prose psalms, they did not need to follow

¹⁰¹ Temperley et al., "Psalms Metrical", GMO.

¹⁰² Nicholas Temperley, "The Old Way of Singing: Its Origins and Development", *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 34, no. 3 (Autumn 1981): 520. The Frost numbers given in that article, which are taken from Maurice Frost, *English and Scottish Psalm and Hymn Tunes c.* 1543–1677 (London, 1953), have been converted here into HTI codes using the conversion table in HTI itself (https://hymntune.library.uiuc.edu/hti1/frostnos.asp). The "Oxford" tune of HTI code [201a] should not be confused with tune [585], also known as "Oxford".

¹⁰³ Temperley et al., "Psalms, Metrical", GMO.

any prescribed pattern or system; any psalm text could be used, sung to any tune which fit its metre.

Although the incumbent minister theoretically had full control over choosing the music for the service, in practice this responsibility usually fell to the parish clerk. ¹⁰⁴ The greater part of the responsibilities of the parish clerk concerned the maintaining of parish records of baptisms, marriages and burials, and acting as a kind of secretary to the minister. ¹⁰⁵ The parish clerk was also the *de facto* head of music in the average eighteenth-century parish, and not only chose the psalms but also took responsibility for leading the singing during services. As the majority of churchgoers at this time were not musically literate—indeed, were potentially not literate in any sense—they could not be expected to read either the tunes or the texts of psalms from books. ¹⁰⁶ Their participation in the music therefore relied either on their knowing the tunes by heart or on the parish clerk's effectiveness in leading the singing. This was by no means guaranteed, for parish clerks were usually appointed on the basis of their poverty rather than their musical qualifications, the job being given to someone who needed the salary, as an act of local charity. ¹⁰⁷

The burden of responsibility which leading the singing placed on the shoulders of parish clerks can be seen in the variety of measures taken to provide them with support.

The London Company of Parish Clerks organised regular meetings at which members could practice singing together, and some of Playford's multi-part settings of the psalms

¹⁰⁴ Temperley et al., "Psalms, Metrical", GMO.

¹⁰⁵ RCB P.0276.28/3: St Michan's Memorial book 1724–89, 18.

¹⁰⁶ Literacy at this time was influenced greatly by class and gender divides. "By 1750 almost all upper-class [European] men and women could read, but still only a small minority of male or female peasants could ... the majority of male artisans could both read and write, but their wives and sisters could not." Merry E. Wiesner-Hanks, *Early Modern Europe*, 1450–1789, 2nd edn, *Cambridge History of Europe* series 2 (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013), 131.

¹⁰⁷ Temperley, Music of the English Parish Church, 90.

were designed for use at those meetings.¹⁰⁸ Handbooks such as Benjamin Payne's *The Parish-clerk's Guide*, first printed in 1698 and re-issued in 1709 and 1731, dispensed advice on how to choose psalms of the appropriate character ("Sing cheerful sprightly Psalms and Tunes on Solemn Feast-Days, and more grave, as suitable to those of Fasting-days") and provided lists of psalms organised by topics ("Hail, Frost and Snow", for example, was dealt with in the fifth part of Psalm 78, the second part of Psalm 147, and the "fourth stave" of Psalm 148).¹⁰⁹

One of the practices described in detail in the *Parish-clerk's Guide* is that known as "lining out" the psalm. This was a method of leading the psalm-singing designed for churches where there was no organ, and where the congregation was illiterate, whereby the parish clerk alone would sing one line of the psalm "in a Singing Tone, and after the manner of Chanting", after which the congregation would sing the same line back. 110 The clerk would then move on to the next line, and so on. Payne held that in chanting these lines, the clerk should allow the space of a crotchet for each syllable, and that a crotchet rest should be left after the first four syllables. "This way of Reading the Psalm", he assured his readers, "was constantly practis'd and commendably perform'd by the ingenious Mr John Playford". 111 The practice of lining out had been first introduced in the British Isles during the Cromwellian Era, and embodied the Calvinistic belief that it was important for the whole congregation to take part in the singing, and to do so "with

¹⁰⁸ Nicholas Temperley, "John Playford and the Metrical Psalms", *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 25, no. 3 (Autumn 1972): 357.

¹⁰⁹ Benjamin Payne, *The Parish-clerk's Guide: or, the singing Psalms used in the parish-churches suited to the feasts and fasts of the Church of England, and most other special occasions* (London: re-printed by John March, for the company of Parish-Clerks, 1731), 23, 40. GB-Lbl 1412.c.17. The book was published under the initials "B. P."; the identity of the author, per ESTC, was established by the Company of Parish Clerks. Information on previous editions from ESTC.

¹¹⁰ Payne, The Parish-clerk's Guide, 30.

¹¹¹ Payne, The Parish-clerk's Guide, 31.

understanding". ¹¹² While established church congregations often resorted to it for practical reasons, for them it was far from an ideal solution. Payne writes that

It were to be wish'd, for the sake of Harmony, that all People could read the Psalms themselves; and I wish also, that all that can, would bring their Psalm-Books to Church, and deliver the Clerk from this Inconvenience of reading the Psalm Line by Line, which spoils the Harmony ... However ... by the Ignorance or Remissness of People, it is become inevitably necessary.¹¹³

One problem with unaccompanied singing, and with lining out, was that there was no way to keep the congregation, or the parish clerk, singing in time. As a result of this, psalm tunes gradually lost what little rhythmic variety they had in the first place, and slowed down considerably. The preface to one Restoration-period London psalter noted that parish clerks "do generally observe but one Time [note value], as indeed is most easie ... and that is (usually) about a Minim and a half, or three pulses". 114 Some descriptions from eighteenth-century Scotland and New England describe congregants singing at different speeds, so that some were finished singing long before others. 115 This caused the psalm tunes to settle into a standardised rhythmic pattern with the first note of each phrase becoming elongated as a way of "gathering" all of the congregation together on the correct pitch; each line similarly ended with a double-length note. This rhythmic pattern became the norm for psalm tunes during the seventeenth-century, and new tunes were still being written in it in the eighteenth. 116

¹¹² Directory for the Publique Worship of God (1644), quoted in Temperley et al., "Psalms, Metrical", GMO.

¹¹³ Payne, The Parish-clerk's Guide, 30.

¹¹⁴ Thomas Mathew, *The Whole Booke of Psalmes, As They Are Now Sung in the Churches* (London, 1688), preface, quoted in Temperley, "The Old Way of Singing", 524.

¹¹⁵ Temperley, "The Old Way of Singing", 524–5.

¹¹⁶ Walter Truron, "The Rhythm of Metrical Psalm-Tunes", Music & Letters 9, no. 1 (January 1928): 31.

Temperley has argued, based on contemporary tune transcriptions, that a further consequence of this slowing and loss of rhythmic variety was an emerging tendency for congregations to ornament the tune, adding passing notes, portamento and even a form of faburden (improvised parallel harmonisation).¹¹⁷ It is possible that similar practices of ornamentation evolved in Dublin (see 5.2.2 below).

1.2.5 Tate and Brady's New Version (1696)

From the middle of the seventeenth century, the Sternhold and Hopkins version began to be heavily and roundly criticised. In typical examples of such criticism, the clergyman Thomas Fuller described the "bald rhymes" of the *Whole Booke of Psalms* as so bad that "two hammers on a Smith's anvil would make better music", while Milton's nephew John Phillips described the book as "Tom Sternhold's wretched Prick song", and "a Common Nuisance to the Service of the Church, a Translation … that hath revil'd David worse than Shimei". ¹¹⁸ This attitude persisted among educated writers into the eighteenth century: John Wesley memorably described the *Whole Booke of Psalmes* as "wretched, scandalous doggerel". ¹¹⁹

Much of this criticism was politically and confessionally motivated. The harshest criticism of the "Old Version" came from royalist, high-church figures for whom the texts of the *Whole Booke of Psalmes* were too Calvinistic for comfort; one writer in 1684 even accused metrical psalmody of fomenting social disruption and rebellion, not only in England during the Civil War but in France and Holland as well. 120 Other criticisms of

¹¹⁷ Temperley, "The Old Way of Singing", 528–29.

¹¹⁸ Quitslund, *The Reformation in Rhyme*, 1–2.

¹¹⁹ John Telford, ed., *The Letters of John Wesley, A.M.* (London, 1931), iii, 27. Quoted in J. R. Watson, *The English Hymn: A Critical and Historical Study* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1999), 47. ¹²⁰ Quitslund, *The Reformation in Rhyme*, 2–4.

the Whole Booke of Psalmes were based on aesthetics, and reflected changing tastes in matters of literature and poetry over time. The hymnologist J. R. Watson has noted, for example, that poets of the Elizabethan era placed very little importance on stress patterns, instead prioritising rhyme; this practice led to prosody that sounds ungainly to more modern ears, as with the final syllable of the line "Approach with joy his courts unto" (from Psalm 100). 121 More generally, it has been observed that the style of written English poetry changed considerably towards the end of the seventeenth century, favouring concision, directness and simplicity. 122

These criticisms were not mutually exclusive, but were in fact intertwined: aesthetic criticism was a form of theological criticism in the context of eighteenth-century established church attitudes towards worship, which privileged the aesthetic quality of worship elements like music and poetry. 123 This was a move away from the Calvinistic emphasis on the ability of all congregants to participate wholly. A newer, more elegant version of the psalm texts was required to fit the aesthetic (and theological) sensibilities of a more high-church form of Anglicanism.

The answer came in 1696 with the publication of A New Version of the Psalms of David by Nahum Tate and Nathaniel Brady. Both authors were of a literary cast: Tate was England's poet laureate, and is now best known for his libretto for Purcell's Dido and Aeneas (1681) and his adaptation of Shakespeare's King Lear (1681), in which most of the characters end the play happily. 124 Brady was a clergyman and sometime poet, and supplied (anonymously) the words for Purcell's 1692 ode "Hail, bright Cecilia". 125

¹²¹ Watson, The English Hymn, 47–48.

¹²² Watson, The English Hymn, 98–99.

¹²³ Temperley, Music of the English Parish Church, 100.

¹²⁴ David Hopkins, "Tate, Nahum (c. 1652–1715), Poet, Playwright, and Translator", ODNB (3 January

¹²⁵ James Sambrook, "Brady, Nicholas (1659–1726), Poet and Church of England Clergyman", ODNB (23 September 2004).

Unlike the "Old Version", the *New Version* at first contained only psalms, though by 1700 a *Supplement* had appeared containing metrical prayers and canticles, alternative versions of some of the psalms, and some hymns. Almost all of the texts in the *New Version* were in "the three commonest metres" (common, long and short). ¹²⁶ In December of 1696, the *New Version* was "allowed and permitted" by William III for use in public worship; although this "authorisation" carried no legal weight, metrical psalms not being part of the prayerbook, the king's seal of approval lent the volume an aura of authority rivalling that which had accrued to the "Old Version".

Although the *New Version* was never printed with tunes, from 1698 a series of supplements were produced that contained tunes to which the new texts could be sung. The early supplements provided no new tunes, reproducing tunes from the "Old Version", but in 1708 a greatly expanded supplement was issued which combined old and new tunes. Many of the new tunes became stalwarts of the English repertory and are still popular, for example, "St Ann's" [664a] and "Hanover" [657a], both of which were likely composed by William Croft. 127 The tunes in the supplement were printed in two-part settings, treble and bass, presumably to allow the widest application possible in both accompanied and unaccompanied settings.

In total there are 87 tunes in the 1708 *Supplement*. ¹²⁸ Given East's comments that the vast majority of congregations in England used none of the tunes printed in the early copies of the "Old Version", it should not be assumed that inclusion in the *Supplement* was indicative of a tune's contemporary popularity. Instructively, however, an earlier edition of *New Version* had contained a short set of "Directions about the Tunes and

¹²⁶ Temperley et al., "Psalms, Metrical", GMO.

¹²⁷ Temperley, Music of the English Parish Church, 124.

¹²⁸ HTI entry for Source: *TS TatB 6a.

Measures", which indicated how texts and tunes could be paired, and which also included a list of "the most usual tunes" in common metre. ¹²⁹ The tunes named were "York-Tune, Windsor-Tune, St. David's, Litchfield, Canterbury, Martyrs, Southwell, St. Mary's, alias Hackney-Tune, &c." Seven old Genevan tunes were also named, including the "Old 100 Psalm". All of these tunes were included in the 1708 *Supplement*.

The "Directions" also include a brief consideration of the musical and emotional character of tunes, which appears in the guidelines for matching tunes to long-metre texts:

The Psalms [in long metre] (if Psalms of Praise or Chearfulness) may properly be sung as the Old 100th Psalm. Or to the Tune of the Old 125 Psal[m] Second Metre. The Penitential or mournful Psalm in the same Measure, may be sung as the Old 51 Psalm. 130

By later standards this consideration of affects appears unsophisticated: both the "Old 100th" [143a] and the "Old 125th" [111a] are in the major mode, while the "Old 51st" [93a] is minor. Nevertheless, it implies that while the primary consideration for choosing a tune to fit a text remained one of metre, in cases where several suitable tunes presented themselves, the perceived character of the tunes could serve as a deciding factor.

The first Dublin printing of the *New Version* recorded in the ESTC is a 1718 edition by Rhames.¹³¹ After this date, only one further edition of the "Old Version" is known to have been published in Dublin (Grierson's of 1720). The *New Version* dominated from then on, going through at least twenty-four editions in Dublin between 1718 and 1800, as

¹²⁹ Nahum Tate and Nicholas Brady, *A new version of the Psalms of David, Fitted to the Tunes Used in Churches* (London: printed by J. R. for the Company of Stationers, 1703). GB-Lbl 1220.g.4(1). Although Brady was in fact listed first on the title page of many editions of the *New Version*, I have reversed their names for the convenience of the reader, as they are now almost invariably referred to as "Tate and Brady" rather than "Brady and Tate".

¹³⁰ Nahum Tate and Nicholas Brady, *A New version of the Psalms of David, fitted to the tunes used in churches* (Dublin: Printed by A. Rhames, for E. Dobson, J. Pepyat, and E. Dobson, Jun, Booksellers, 1718), 207. GB-Ob Ps. Verse 1718.f.2.

¹³¹ As previous footnote. All publication information in this paragraph derived from ESTC records.

well as three further editions whose place of publication is uncertain but believed also to be Dublin. At least one edition of the *New Version* was published in every decade of the century except the 1700s and 1760s. After five early editions by Rhames, the last of which was printed in 1723, almost all of the remaining editions were published by Grierson and his descendants. All printers of the *New Version* were holders of the title of "King's Printer"; this theoretically gave them a monopoly on printing in the city, but in practice this monopoly usually extended only to "government business" and other material of an official character (see 1.5.2 below). 133

Several Dublin editions of the *New Version* reproduce the "Directions" discussed above almost word-for-word, though given that this passage is not of Dublin origin the list of tunes given assumes less relevance as an indication of which tunes were the most popular. That said, the printers of the Dublin editions clearly paid some attention to the text of the "Directions", for they cut out all of the references to the 1708 Supplement, which is not known ever to have been printed in Dublin.

In England, adoption of the *New Version* was gradual, and at first it attracted many opponents. Despite its royal "authorisation", it failed to oust the Sternhold and Hopkins psalter until well into the nineteenth century in many parts of England. ¹³⁴ In Dublin, by contrast, the *New Version* appears to have become dominant quite rapidly. Not only were no editions of the "Old Version" produced after 1720, but *New Version* texts also predominate in the tunebooks (see 2.3 and 3.4 below). While the continued use in churches of old copies of *The Whole Booke of Psalmes* of course cannot be ruled out, the

¹³² For details of the extended Grierson family, see section 1.5.2 below.

¹³⁴ Temperley et al., "Psalms, metrical", GMO.

¹³³ M. Pollard, A Dictionary of the Dublin Book Trade, 1550–1800: based on the Records of the Guild of St Luke the Evangelist Dublin (London: Bibliographical Society, 2000), xv.

absence of "Old Version" texts from all except one of the Dublin sources seems to imply that Dublin took more readily to the *New Version* than was usual in England.

One reason for this early adoption might be that the writers of the *New Version* were both Irish, and hailed from upper-class Protestant families. Nahum Tate's birthplace is unknown (and may have been the Suffolk town of Sudbury), but his family were Irish and he certainly attended university in Dublin, graduating from Trinity College in 1672. 135 By 1676, Tate had moved to London, where he lived for the rest of his life. Tate's father and grandfather had both been puritan clergymen who had also studied at Trinity College Dublin, and his grandfather had suffered considerably during the 1641 rebellion, having "his valuable property destroyed". 136 Nicholas Brady was born in Cork. His greatgrandfather Hugh Brady (d. 1585) was the first Church of Ireland bishop of Meath to be consecrated after the Elizabethan settlement, his father was an army officer, and his father-in-law a Munster provincial judge. Brady was educated at Finbarre's School in Cork, and later (after being sent down from Oxford) at Trinity College Dublin, whence he graduated B.A. in 1685 and M.A. in 1686. After his ordination in 1687 he served for several years as domestic chaplain to Wetenhall, then Bishop of Cork and Ross, whose writings on church music were referred to above (see 1.2.2). 137

In addition to their local connections, Tate and Brady were politically well-positioned for acceptance within the highly charged politics of the Irish parish church. Both were committed Williamite supporters, although they had also both started out more sympathetic to the Jacobite cause. Although Tate had initially supported Charles II and James II after the Restoration, he became "rapidly disenchanted" with James's highly

¹³⁵ Margaret Laurie and Curtis Price, "Tate [Teate], Nahum", GMO (20 January 2001). Hopkins, "Tate, Nahum", ODNB.

¹³⁶ Hopkins, "Tate, Nahum", ODNB.

¹³⁷ Sambrook, "Brady, Nicholas", ODNB.

pro-Catholic policies, and transferred his support to William, "whom he hailed as a pious peacemaker and defender of English liberty". ¹³⁸ In his role as poet laureate he was responsible for the composition of pindaric odes celebrating the achievements and anniversaries of the monarchy, commemorating military victories, and applauding public figures. ¹³⁹ Brady had served as a clergyman in Cork during the Williamite Wars, when his preaching of the divine right of kings had won him popularity with the Jacobites. In 1689 he saved the town of Bandon from being burned to the ground by negotiating with the Jacobite general Justin McCarthy. Brady's experiences of the war seem to have affected his politics, for by 1690 he was "an outspoken and zealous Williamite". ¹⁴⁰ He was appointed chaplain to the Duke of Ormonde and moved to London; in 1694 he was appointed chaplain to Colonel Sir Richard Atkins's foot regiment, and soon afterwards became chaplain to William and Mary themselves. ¹⁴¹

Aside from these political considerations, it may simply be the case that the more "modern" theology and aesthetic of the *New Version* appealed to the sensibilities of the Dublin churchgoer. In the psalms as rendered by Tate and Brady can be found the same cocktail of high-church, aesthetically-minded theology, the desire for improvement and modernisation, and political undercurrents that also characterised the parish church itself, and indeed encapsulated the spirit of the age. The texts themselves reflect the worldly preoccupations of an age of prosperity, mercantilism and burgeoning capitalism, for example in Psalm 101, which declares that the man who "stands in aw of God" [sic] shall see his house become "the Seat of Wealth ... an inexhausted Treasury", and that he shall see "the Shipwreck of his Enemies" as he extends "lib'ral Favours" while remaining

¹³⁸ Hopkins, "Tate, Nahum", ODNB.

¹³⁹ Hopkins, "Tate, Nahum", ODNB.

¹⁴⁰ Sambrook, "Brady, Nicholas", ODNB.

¹⁴¹ Sambrook, "Brady, Nicholas", ODNB.

prudent in his business.¹⁴² "In technique and style", Watson notes, Tate and Brady were "as representative of the later seventeenth century as Sternhold and Hopkins had been of the sixteenth".¹⁴³

1.3 Organs and Organists

1.3.1 Organs as instruments of improvement

Just as rational, high-church Anglicanism objected to the outdated poetry of *The Whole Booke of Psalmes*, it also found fault with the quality of the musical elements of public worship. In 1678, Wetenhall described parish church music as "obnoxious":

all is pitiful and mean; and especially the singing oftentimes full of ungrateful jarres, discords, squeaks, screeches, roaring, &c. which severally I wish brought to a more regular, comely and orderly course ... the present disorderly practice, is no constitution of our Churches ... it has been onely permitted, out of a kind of necessity, to the will of the people, because it yet could be no better. 144

The quality of church music, which ought to serve as an ornament to worship, was in serious need of improvement to keep pace with the more worldly aesthetic sensibilities of an increasingly wealthy congregation, for whom decorum was an essential quality of an acceptable worship service. One popular method for achieving this ideal of decorum was to install an organ in the church. This intervention had two effects on the music: it helped to mitigate some of the chaos of wholly unaccompanied singing by setting the

¹⁴⁴ Wetenhall, Of gifts and offices, 249.

¹⁴² Quoted and discussed in Watson, *The English Hymn*, 101.

¹⁴³ Watson, *The English Hymn*, 101.

tempo and providing guidance in the matter of pitch, and it also, if played loudly enough, could subsume the less skilled voices of the congregation.¹⁴⁵ These dual benefits (as they were perceived) were explained by Richard Banner of University College Oxford in a sermon of 1737:

... the grave and melodious instrumental music ... tends to regulate the time, and rectify the tune, checks and prevents the over eagerness of some, drowns and mollifies the clamorous harshness and untunableness of others ... [and makes] our parochial music in some sort resemble that of the *cathedral* or *mother* church.¹⁴⁶

Temperley has perceptively described the function of the organ in these cases as a kind of "musical whitewash", likening it to the eighteenth-century taste for whitewashing the inside of churches to create a light and airy space that reflected rationalist concepts of the light of reason and order banishing the darkness of barbarity and superstition. ¹⁴⁷ Introducing an organ to church music at once helped to impose order and structure on a seemingly chaotic oral tradition, and served to cover up unseemly irregularities.

Organs were rare in parish churches in the seventeenth century, and during the Commonwealth period had even been banned by official decree. From the late seventeenth century, however, Dublin churches began investing in organs, beginning—as far as can be verified—with St Werburgh's, which at a cost of fifty pounds purchased a second-hand instrument from the organist of Christ Church, John Hawkshaw, in 1676. St Werburgh's was followed by St Catherine's (1678), St John's (1684), St Peter's (1686), St Bride's (c. 1686), St Mary's (1713) and finally St Michan's. 148 Several of these early

¹⁴⁵ Temperley, Music of the English Parish Church, 101.

¹⁴⁶ Quoted in Temperley, Music of the English Parish Church, 101.

¹⁴⁷ Temperley, Music of the English Parish Church, 101.

¹⁴⁸ Denise Neary, "Music in Late Seventeenth- and Eighteenth-Century Dublin Churches", in Patrick F. Devine and Harry White, eds, *The Maynooth International Musicological Conference 1995 Selected Proceedings: Part One*, Irish Musical Studies 4 (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 1996), 106.

instruments were replaced during the long eighteenth century: Cuvillie built a new organ for St Peter's in 1713, while St Werburgh's replaced its organ twice: once in 1719 (built by Thomas Hollister) and again in 1767 (built by "Millar, of College Street"), after the fire of 1754 destroyed Hollister's instrument. St Catherine's appears to have had three different organs during this period: one, possibly a second-hand instrument, procured in 1678, another in 1696 (built by Renatus Harris) and yet another in 1769, acquired from Ferdinand Weber following a complete rebuilding of the church. Around the same time Weber also built an organ for the newly-erected St Thomas's church, which closely resembled St Catherine's in design. 150

The main obstacle to acquiring an organ was the prohibitive cost. The organ at St Michan's cost £470 pounds, not including further expenses for the rebuilding of the gallery or adding the bellows. ¹⁵¹ This seems to have been on the expensive side for the time, though not unreasonable; Cuvillie's organ for Cloyne Cathedral in 1713 cost £220, while Renatus Harris's 1697 instrument at St Patrick's Cathedral in Dublin cost £505. The organ installed at St Werburgh's in 1767 cost a similar £400. ¹⁵² Less costly instruments, such as that built by Lancelot Pease for St Audoen's for £110 in 1681, were still considerable investments. ¹⁵³ While some lucky parishes might have their organs paid for by a wealthy benefactor, as was the case at St Werburgh's in 1766, it was more common to raise money for organs through subscriptions, essentially donations solicited

¹⁴⁹ Neary, "Music in Dublin Churches", 106. Gilbert, History of the City of Dublin, vol 1, 34.

¹⁵⁰ Neary, "Music in Dublin Churches", 108–109. Denise Neary, "Seventeenth-Century Irish Parish Church Music", in Barra Boydell and Kerry Houston, eds, *Music, Ireland and the Seventeenth Century*, Irish Musical Studies 10 (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2009), 168. Casey, *Dublin*, 623–4. The Dublin Music Trade database gives a date of 1767 rather than 1769 for the installation of the Weber organs. "Weber, Ferdinand", *Dublin Music Trade* (https://www.dublinmusictrade.ie/node/492).

¹⁵¹ RCB P.0276.28/3: St Michan's Memorial book 1724–89, 50.

¹⁵² Neary, "Music in Dublin Churches", 106.

¹⁵³ Barra Boydell, "St Michan's Church Dublin: The Installation of the Organ in 1725 and the Duties of the Organist". *Dublin Historical Record* 46 no. 2 (Autumn 1993): 117.

from parishioners. ¹⁵⁴ This was an accepted method of parish fundraising, and was frequently used to pay for exceptional expenses such as charity schools (see 1.4 below). At St Michan's, the organ was paid for by a combination of subscriptions, burial fees and pew rents. Although the number of people who donated towards the cost of the organ was considerable—the subscription list records 181 names—the majority contributed only small amounts; the most common donation was a pistole, or 18s 6d. The largest contribution, apart from the £146 contributed by the churchwardens along with the minister and his family, came from the Lord Chief Justice, who contributed 23 guineas (£26 9s). ¹⁵⁵

Often the organ was installed as part of wider projects to improve and beautify the church that were so beloved of the eighteenth-century public. At St Michan's, the installation of the organ was part of a general remodelling of the church interior, including the purchase of a new, moveable pulpit and font (which could be positioned to the side when not in use, making "the prospect of the Altar ... more Obvious"), and a complete redesign and rebuilding of the west gallery. The new gallery incorporated two canopied seats on either side of the organ, reserved for the church wardens, and an elaborately carved "Trophy of Musick" on the front; this carving of a collection of musical instruments is still visible in the church today. The renovations surrounding the organ installation were in fact so thorough that they delayed Cuvillie from working on the instrument "for a few Weeks while the Windows of ye Church were Glazing, the Walls and Ceiling White Washing, and the Gallery Seats Painting ... and other Incidental

¹⁵⁴ Neary, "Music in Dublin Churches", 106.

¹⁵⁵ RCB P.0276.28/3: St Michan's Memorial book 1724–89, 50 & 75–83. The Memorial book lists 1 guinea as equal to £1 3s, from which this parenthetical figure has been calculated.

¹⁵⁶ RCB P.0276.28/3: St Michan's Memorial book 1724–89, 10–13, 52.

¹⁵⁷ RCB P.0276.28/3: St Michan's Memorial book 1724–89, 10–13.

Work". ¹⁵⁸ At St Catherine's, payments are recorded for erecting a gallery in 1678, around the same time that the organ was brought to the church. ¹⁵⁹ Almost a century later, the purchase of the new organ formed part of a total reconstruction of the church building. ¹⁶⁰ In this context, the organ itself was seen as not only an ornament to worship in the musical sense but as a literal ornament decorating the church interior. These attitudes can be seen in the rhetoric which surrounded the St Michan's organ: as well as the vestry's noting the general benefits of instrumental music in worship, and of the efficacy of music in "actuat[ing] the devotion of good men", the vicar's son argued that the organ would honour God by "adorning the place of his public worship". ¹⁶¹ The church records comment that the organ was purchased "not only to Adorn the ... Church, but also to promote the decency and solemnity of the Divine service". The two functions were equally important, and both here and in a succeeding passage on the purpose of the organ ("to adorn his [God's] House and to promote the decency of his Worship"), it is the function of "adornment" that is listed first. ¹⁶²

Installing an organ combined the contemporary enthusiasm for improvement of the physical environment of the church, through modifications and upgrades of the physical fabric, with that of the improvement of the quality of the church music. As a significant, visible luxury expense, it also added to the church's social status, and reflected favourably on the wealth and good taste of the parishioners. In this respect, the high cost of the organ was an attraction rather than a deterrent. The organ served as a point around which these many different ideas and attitudes could focus. The large number of subscribers was hailed by the church authorities not only as a clear indication of public support for the use

¹⁵⁸ RCB P.0276.28/3: St Michan's Memorial book 1724–89, 101.

¹⁵⁹ P.0017.05/1a: St Catherine's Vestry minute book 1679–95 (typescript copy), 189.

¹⁶⁰ Neary, "Music in Dublin Churches", 108–109. Casey, *Dublin*, 623–4.

¹⁶¹ Boydell, "St Michan's Church", 103–104.

¹⁶² RCB P.0276.28/3: St Michan's Memorial book 1724–89, 103–104.

of organs in services but also a testament to the piety and charitable nature of the parish community.¹⁶³

The social dimensions of such projects could be complex. At St Michan's, the project organisers used the subscription list as a means for encouraging larger donations: the appeal for donations was made as part of a "lively Pathetick Discourse from the Pulpit ... with a Purse in One hand, and a Book in the other; The Purse speaking its Call for Money by shewing the Sumes it received; and the Book Recording not Subscriptions to be afterwards paid, but present Benefactions actually bestowed". 164 Other social and cultural forces were at play here, as well: among those who donated were "Weld Nathanl. Dissenting Teacher", who contributed a generous guinea, and "Nairey Dr Regisd Priest of ye Parish", who gave a pistole (18s 6d). Nathaniel Weld (1660–1730) was the minister at the Presbyterian meeting house in New Row. 165 Although New Row was across the river, Weld was resident in St Michan's parish, living on King Street. 166 Cornelius Nary (d. 1738) was the priest of the Catholic parish of St Michan's, and "arguably the most significant Catholic figure in Ireland in the first half of the eighteenth century". 167 He lived locally, on Bull Lane (close to today's Arran Street East), and regularly wrote in support of the Irish Catholic cause; on his arrival in Dublin around 1698 the rector of St Michan's (established) parish was "spoiling ... for a face-to-face disputation with him on religious topics". 168 The musicologist Barra Boydell notes that the presence of people of different religions on the list perhaps "reflects the degree of social pressure which could

1.

¹⁶³ Boydell, "St Michan's Church", 104.

¹⁶⁴ RCB P.0276.28/3: St Michan's Memorial book 1724–89, 75.

¹⁶⁵ Bridget Hourican, "Weld, Isaac", DIB (October 2009). New Row was on the south side, just across the Old Bridge from St Michan's; a journey of about 5 minutes on foot. John Rocque, An Exact Survey of the City and Suburbs of Dublin in Which is Express'd the Ground Plot of all Publick Buildings Dwelling Houses, Ware Houses, Stables, Court Yards, &c (1756). F-Pn GE DD-2987 (2657 B).

¹⁶⁶ RCB P.0276.28/1: St Michan's Commonplace book 1722–33, 205.

¹⁶⁷ Patrick Fagan, "Nary, Cornelius", DIB (October 2009).

¹⁶⁸ Fagan, "Nary, Cornelius", DIB.

be exerted when it came to seeking nominally 'voluntary' contributions". ¹⁶⁹ While general social pressure was undoubtedly at play, it is surely significant that the two identifiable donors of different religions were the leaders of Catholic and Dissenting congregations: these may have been symbolic as well as personal donations, made as representatives of those communities, and intended as amicable gestures of goodwill.

Compared to the weight of sociopolitical and cultural significance which rested upon them, the actual instruments at the centre of these debates were rather unassuming. They were generally one- or two-manual instruments, without pedals, which were practically unknown on British organs before the mid-nineteenth century. 170 The organ at St Michan's was a two-manual one with great and chair divisions, built by John Baptiste Cuvillie, the leading organ-builder in Ireland during this period (see below). The great organ contained ten stops and space for three more; the chair was intended to have five stops, but Cuvillie installed only one, the stopped diapason. There were also originally plans to add a small "Echo" with "half a set of keys proper to itself", but these never materialised. 171 This stoplist is very similar to that of the Renatus Harris organ erected in Doncaster parish church in 1738, which Temperley describes as a typical instrument of the period. 172 In 1728, a Principal stop was added to the chair and a Trumpet stop to the great, paid for by mortgaging of pews and vault burials. This work was carried out by John Byfield, an English organ-builder active in Dublin during this period, Cuvillie having died earlier that year. In 1787, a swell organ was added by Cornmell, and the compass extended into a three-manual one of fifty-four keys. ¹⁷³ The subsequent additions

¹⁶⁹ Boydell, "St Michan's Church", 104.

¹⁷⁰ Temperley, Music of the English Parish Church, 110.

¹⁷¹ Boydell, "St Michan's Church", 106-7.

Temperley, *Music of the English Parish Church*, 110. The Doncaster organ had two manuals: a great with 12 stops, and a chair/echo with four and six stops respectively; the echo, interestingly, had a swell box, a relatively recent introduction to English organs.

¹⁷³ Boydell, "St Michan's Church", 101–2, 106–7.

and revisions to the St Michan's organ mirror the constant repairs and improvements that characterised the physical parish church during the eighteenth century. Cuvillie's instrument of 1725 was not a finished project but represented a starting point, with space for future improvement; like the many grand church spires which were never built, some of these planned improvements remained aspirations. Nevertheless, both organs and churches became ongoing projects that embodied the contemporary enthusiasm for improvement and the optimistic character of the age.

The needs of cathedrals, churches and private organisations and individuals sustained a thriving organ-building industry in the city during this period. Many of the best organbuilders in the city were of English or Continental origin. John Byfield settled in Dublin when profitable contracts were available; his work at St Michan's was done while he was employed by both Dublin cathedrals to maintain their organs, and he later built a new organ for Christ Church in 1751. Other prominent organ-builders from overseas at work in the city were Harris, who from his base in London built the organs at St Mary's (1706) and St Bride's (1730) as well as the 1697 Christ Church organ, and Ferdinand Weber, a native of Saxony who settled permanently in Dublin in 1739 and built organs for St Thomas's and St Catherine's around 1767. Cuvillie was another immigrant to the city, settling in Dublin some time before 1698. There were also Irish-born organ-builders active in the industry, particularly the Hollister family (see below). 174

As well as building organs, these professionals could be called upon whenever tuning, repairs and maintenance were necessary. In St Catherine's, a "Mr Ayres Organist" (not the man employed to play the organ, who at that time was John Gayton) was paid 10 shillings fur "tuneing ye Organs ag[ains]t Christmasse" in 1679. Phillip Hollister was

¹⁷⁴ Brian Boydell, A Dublin Musical Calendar, 1700–1760 (Dublin: Irish Academic Press, 1988), 260.

¹⁷⁵ RCB P.0117.05/1: Catherine's Vestry minute book 1657–92, 201.

paid £11 for two years' salary for "cleaning" the St Michan's organ in 1751–2, a task requiring the instrument to be dismantled and reassembled by a qualified organ-builder. Contracts could be long-standing, as at St Catherine's, where regular annual payments of five pounds are recorded in the early eighteenth century to John Baptiste Cuvillie in the capacity of "organ maker". As the same amount of money was paid each time, this regular payment must have covered all necessary repairs and tuning, and was a way of keeping an organ builder "on the books" if any maintenance issues arose.

Like the majority of artisanal trades in this period, organ-building was often a family concern. Byfield's father, "Mr Byfield Senior", was paid for repairs to the organ of St Michan's in 1732, and "Mr Byfield Junior" for the same service in 1733. 178 Philip Hollister was one of a family of organists and keyboard instrument makers: his father built the organ at St Werburgh's in 1719 (though it was later judged "unsatisfactory"); his son, or perhaps nephew, William Castles Hollister, was also an organ and harpsichord maker; and his grandson (or grandnephew) Frederick was a piano maker and tuner. William Castles Hollister was also known for opening the Ranelagh Gardens in 1768, and so had a foot in both the secular and sacred music spheres of the city. 179

The familial nature of the trade also meant that many women were involved in organ-building and repair. It was common for women in the eighteenth century to be actively involved in their husband's business, not only to provide support on a day-to-day basis but also to be able to take over in the event of the husband's absence or death. These women remain generally invisible in the historical record; those who do appear are

¹⁷⁶ RCB P.0276.07/2: St Michan's Churchwarden's account book 1723–61, March 1752.

¹⁷⁷ RCB P.0117.05/2: St Catherine's Vestry minute book 1693–1730.

¹⁷⁸ Boydell, "St Michan's Church", 112.

¹⁷⁹ Boydell, A Dublin Musical Calendar, 281.

¹⁸⁰ Earle, The Making of the English Middle Class, 161.

recorded only after taking over from their dead husbands (see also 1.5.2). One prominent example of this was Rachel Weber, who in 1784 succeeded in the organ-building business of her deceased husband, the German-born Ferdinand Weber, in partnership with their son Thomas. The Trinity College accounts show "Weber" and "Mrs Weber" working in partnership as organ tuners in 1786 and 1787. Payments for organ maintenance appear to both Webers, mother and son, in the St Michan's accounts around this time. Similarly, Sarah Green, the widow of the London organ-builder Samuel Green, oversaw the installation of the organ at Trinity College in 1797, when her husband died before the project was finished. In order to have gained the expertise necessary to administer these businesses after their husbands' deaths, it is likely that these women were actively involved while their husbands were still alive. It is therefore likely also that greater numbers of women were involved in the organ-building trade whose names have not been preserved in the historical record.

As well as the cost of maintaining and tuning the organ, a further expense was the need to employ someone to operate the bellows while the organ was being played. At St Michan's, the bellows-blower (in 1751 a man named Robert Wilson) was paid five pounds a year. Oil for the bellows also cost money: 1s 8d in 1757. The sum of all these varied expenses meant that an organ was not just a one-time luxury expense but a regular and recurring drain on the parish coffers, which were seldom overflowing to begin with.

¹⁸¹ "Weber, Rachel", *Dublin Music Trade* (http://dublinmusictrade.ie/node/501).

¹⁸² Boydell, "St Michan's Church", 113.

^{183 &}quot;Green, Samuel", Dublin Music Trade (http://dublinmusictrade.ie/node/178).

¹⁸⁴ Imelda Brophy, "Women in the Workforce", in Dickson, ed., *The Gorgeous Mask*, 52–3.

¹⁸⁵ RCB P.0276.07/2: St Michan's Churchwarden's account book 1723–61, 1751 & 1757. E. G. Barton notes that Wilson worked as the bellows-blower at St Michans for thirty-three years, from 1725 to 1758. Barton, "The Parish Church of St Michan Dublin: The Organ, 1724–1952". Pamphlet held at the RCB Library (274.183BOUND), 3.

That so many parish churches nonetheless chose to invest in one is an indication of how highly, for whatever reason, these instruments were valued.

1.3.2 Organists (male and female)

The first organist at St Michan's was John Woffington, who took up the appointment on the installation of the organ in 1725. Woffington's personal history is a little difficult to trace—to quote Brian Boydell, "there appears to have been at least six John Woffingtons in Dublin in the eighteenth century"—but it appears that the Woffington of St Michan's had previously been employed at St Werburgh's (from 1720 to 1723) and St John's (from 1723 to 1725). 186 The Memorial Book of St Michan's gives a lengthy account of Woffington's appointment along with the details of the contract signed between him and the minister and churchwardens. Included in this is the comment that before applying for the position at St Michan's, Woffington had left his position at Werburgh's (there is no mention here of his ever working at St John's) and travelled to London, where he studied for a year "under several masters of musick playing on the organ, particularly the famous Dr. Crofts organist ... of His Majesty's Royal Chappel". 187 This was of course William Croft (1678–1727), who—according to Woffington—had testified that Woffington was "a Skillful and good Organist". 188 Later in life, Woffington described himself as having beens "bred under the late famous doctor Crofts". 189 The identities of the "several masters" of organ-playing with whom Woffington claimed also to have studied are harder to identify. One possibility is Maurice Greene (1696–1755), who was organist of St Paul's

¹⁸⁶ Boydell, Dublin Musical Calendar, 239.

¹⁸⁷ RCB P.0276.28/3: St Michan's Memorial book 1724–89, 104.

¹⁸⁸ RCB P.0276.28/3: St Michan's Memorial book 1724–89, 105.

¹⁸⁹ Advertisement in the *Belfast Newsletter*, 1 May 1758, from St Patrick's Cathedral website, "Past Organists" section (https://www.stpatricks-cathedral.org/music/past-organists/; accessed 23 March 2022).

and taking organ pupils in the early 1720s.¹⁹⁰ At the very least it would have been highly risky for Woffington to falsify his credentials with regard to Croft: a 1718 declaration of the competency of an organist who had been accused of being a "bungler" was signed by several organists then active in the City of London, including Greene, and demonstrates the extent to which British organists of the early eighteenth century formed a close-knit profession.¹⁹¹

It is possible that John Woffington was a relative of one or both of the men named Robert Woffington also active as organists and organ-builders in Dublin during the eighteenth century. The first Robert Woffington was organist at St Mary's in 1735. The second was a builder of organs, harpsichords and pianos based in Dublin from 1775 to 1819, who was probably born around 1750, based on the dates of his apprenticeship. This latter Woffington went on to build an organ for St Andrew's church in 1807. Another Woffington, whose first name is unknown, had served as the organist at St Catherine's church in the early eighteenth century. As with organ-builders, the organist trade was often a familial one, and resulted in the formation of small-scale musical dynasties.

John Woffington was appointed organist at Armagh cathedral in 1752, but until 1757 he continued to draw his salary at St Michan's, where his duties may have been performed by a deputy in his pay. Other circumstances suggest, however, that Woffington's move to Armagh may have been delayed until 1758. In that year, the St Michan's salary was

_

¹⁹³ RCB P.0117.05/1: St Catherine's Vestry minute book 1657–92, 294, 250.

¹⁹⁰ H. Diack Johnstone, "Greene, Maurice", GMO (20 January 2001).

¹⁹¹ This declaration is held at the British Library and reproduced in Donovan Dawe, *Organists of the City of London, 1666–1850: A Record of One Thousand Organists with an Annotated Index* (Padstow: Published by the Author, 1983).

Margaret Debenham, "Robert Woffington: Organ-Builder, Harpsichord and Pianoforte-Maker, Dublin: A Biographical Timeline 1774–1819" (https://www.debenham.org.uk/william/Robert%20Woffingontimeline.php; accessed 23 March 2022).

divided between him and his successor, Sampson Osborn. ¹⁹⁴ Additionally, the *Belfast Newsletter* announced that "Mr. John Woffington, late organist of St. Michan's church, Dublin ... is now come to reside at Armagh", and advertised his services as a teacher of harpsichord, spinnet, thorough-bass, composition (presumably for keyboard, as it is grouped as a "branch" of keyboard studies), and singing. ¹⁹⁵ Woffington died later in 1758, soon after moving north, while Osborn seems not to have remained long at St Michan's, for by 1760 the position had passed to James Finlay. ¹⁹⁶ Finlay remained at St Michan's until 1787, at which point he was succeeded by Helen Finlay, probably a relative. ¹⁹⁷

One aspect of the eighteenth-century organist profession that has been significantly under-researched is the contribution of women organists. In general, eighteenth-century society frowned upon women who involved themselves in any kind of professional music-making. Although a rudimentary music education was considered appropriate for upper- or middle-class women, this was focussed on instruments such as the harpsichord, which could be played without any physical distortion of the body or the facial features, and on the learning of technically unchallenging short works for domestic performance. Female music-making thus largely functioned as an ornament to the households of their male relatives or husbands; a career as a professional musician, already somewhat disreputable even for men, was out of the question for most women. ¹⁹⁸ Even if a woman might achieve tolerable technical command of the organ, it was thought that a certain element would still be lacking in her performances. The music historian and gazetteer

¹⁹⁴ RCB P.0276.07/2: St Michan's Churchwarden's account book 1723–61, 319, 371, 383, 391. Boydell has suggested that Woffingon retained his St Michan's position as an absentee between 1752 and 1757, but based on the evidence of the church records and the date of the advertisement it is more likely that the Armagh position was the absentee one. Boydell, *Dublin Musical Calendar*, 239.

¹⁹⁵ Advertisement in the *Belfast Newsletter*, 1 May 1758.

¹⁹⁶ RCB P.0276.07/2: St Michan's Churchwarden's account book 1723–61, 417.

¹⁹⁷ Barton, "The Parish Church of St Michan Dublin: The Organ, 1724–1952".

¹⁹⁸ Judith Barger, *Elizabeth Stirling and the Musical Life of Female Organists in Nineteenth-Century England* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2007), 1, 6–7.

writer Charles Burney (1726–1814), describing performances by female organists he heard in Italy in the mid-eighteenth century, commented that "some of the girls... as well as the nuns ... play with rapidity and neatness in their several churches; but there is almost always a want of force, of learning, and of courage in female performances, occasioned, perhaps, by that feminine softness, with which, in other situations, we are so enchanted". ¹⁹⁹

Identifying female organists in the historical record is challenging, as for the most part these women left little trace of their presence. What records have survived, however, suggest that despite the social biases noted above, the holding of organist positions by women was more common than might be expected. Donovan Dawe's survey of organists in the City of London records no fewer than seventy-five women working as organists between 1753 and 1850, the first being Mary Worgan, who was appointed to St Dunstan in the East, succeeding her brother; by 1850, one church, St Olave Hart Street, had employed women organists exclusively since 1781.²⁰⁰ The musicologist Judith Barger claims that more than forty female organists held positions in England during the eighteenth century.²⁰¹ In Dublin, several women seem to have been active as organists in the late eighteenth century and the early nineteenth, although almost no information exists about them other than their names. As well as Helen Finlay at St Michan's, David Weyman's collection of psalms and hymns published in Dublin in 1816, Melodia Sacra (see 5.2.2), lists an additional three female organists in the list of subscribers: a "Mrs. Dempsey" at St Catherine's, a "Miss Alma" in Monkstown parish church, and a "Miss Holden" at St Andrew's. 202 Miss Holden may have come from a musical family: a "Mr.

¹⁹⁹ Charles Burney, The Present State of Music in France and Italy (London, 1773), 300.

²⁰⁰ Donovan Dawe, *Organists of the City of London*, 3–4.

²⁰¹ Barger, *Elizabeth Stirling*, 33.

²⁰² David Weyman, *Melodia Sacra*, or The Psalms of David, the Music Composed by the most celebrated Authors Ancient and Modern (Dublin: Printed and Published by Geo. Allen, 1816), preface. US-CHH.

Francis Holden" appears on the subscription list as the organist of St Werburgh's, and a "Mrs. Holden" as a "Music-seller".

1.3.3 Organ music and the organist's duties

The contract signed by Woffington at St Michan's in 1725 provides a wealth of insight into the general responsibilities of the organist in an eighteenth-century parish church, including considerable information on when, and what, the organist was expected to play. The principal duty of the organist was accompanying the congregational singing of psalms "after the Third Collect and Morning & Evening Prayer", as well as "before the Sermon",

With Modest Graces and Short Transitions from Line to Line, and upon such Stops as shall be well suited to the Number of the Congregation, so as the Sound of the Organ, and the Voice of the People may be duly proportioned, & equally mingled.²⁰³

The playing of improvised interludes between lines of the psalm was common in contemporary practice; it was also usual to play one verse of the tune before the singing began, a practice known as "giving out". Accompaniments to psalms were generally improvised, either from the tunes alone (printed or from memory) or from two-part copies in which just the tunes and bass parts were printed (see, for example, 1.5.1 and 2.3 below).²⁰⁴

In addition, Woffington was required to play a voluntary before the first lesson, "to hold four Minutes on Week Days and Eight Minutes on Sundays and Holy-Days, rarely exceeding or falling short", as well as an "Introit or Doxology" about two minutes long

-

²⁰³ RCB P.0276.28/3: St Michan's Memorial book 1724–89, 107.

²⁰⁴ Temperley, Music of the English Parish Church, 129–130.

after the prayer from 2 Corinthians 13:14, and a "Dismiss after the whole Service is ended".²⁰⁵ He was further required to spend an hour each week teaching music to the children of the charity school (see 1.4.3 below).²⁰⁶ Failure to discharge these various duties adequately would be punished by fines: leaving during the service or failing to teach the charity children incurred a fine of one shilling, and "neglect", or too-frequent employment of a deputy to play in his place, a fine of 2s 6d. Failure to employ any deputy at all in times of absence was punishable by a steep fine of ten shillings.²⁰⁷

The style in which the organist would play was a matter of some concern to the church authorities at St Michan's, judging from the specific guidelines provided in the organist's contract. The voluntary Woffington and his successors played before the First Lesson was to be "a grave solemn composition"; the introit and doxology were similarly to be "solemn", and the dismissal was to be "in no way savouring of, or tending to excite airiness or levity, but ... very solemn, and suited to the season or service of the day."208 These repeated admonitions that the music be "solemn" and "grave" reflect widespread concerns in the contemporary church that sacred music was becoming frivolous, imitating the fashionable, modern, "Italianate" style associated with theatre music. The "Italian" sound was "treble-dominated and airy", imitating the texture of a violin sonata, or an operatic aria or duet. 209 Organ music of the period also tended towards this style: organ voluntaries were generally "bright and easily melodious" and incorporated a few technically challenging passages as displays of virtuosic skill. 210 The prevalence of this

²⁰⁵ RCB P.0276.28/3: St Michan's Memorial book 1724–89, 106–7. The prayer in question is "The grace of the Lord Jesus Christ, and the love of God, and the communion of the Holy Ghost, be with you all. Amen" (KIV)

²⁰⁶ RCB P.0276.28/3: St Michan's Memorial book 1724–89, 107–8.

²⁰⁷ RCB P.0276.28/3: St Michan's Memorial book 1724–89, 108.

²⁰⁸ RCB P.0276.28/3: St Michan's Memorial book 1724–89, 106–7.

²⁰⁹ Temperley, *Music of the English Parish Church*, 102.

²¹⁰ Temperley, *Music of the English Parish Church*, 102.

more "theatrical" style, particularly in organ music, had many critics in the eighteenth-century. One writer in 1711 accused organists of the "corruption of our music" through the introduction of "profane" influences; this was elaborated by William Mason, the precentor of York cathedral, later in the century, when he recommended that organists should avoid music that imitated "common and trivial melodies", and should instead seek to induce "tranquility ... preparative to devotion" in the congregation.²¹¹

Behind these objections to the shallowness of the "modern" style lay a more troubling association between musical levity and "Popery", a mistrust that had existed since the sixteenth century among Puritans and those of Calvinistic inclination within the established church. This was heightened by the perceived "Italian" quality of this music at a time when societal fear of Catholicism often manifested itself in a deep-seated insecurity towards the foreign in music. At one point in the eighteenth century, rumours even circulated that opera singers were secretly replacing the words of arias with Latin prayers, thus exposing the unsuspecting audience to Catholic propaganda without their knowledge. The associations between instrumental music, the Italian operatic style, and dangerous, destabilising Catholicism were succinctly encapsulated by Jonathan Swift in a poem complaining about the instrumental music at St Patrick's cathedral on St Cecilia's day:

To act such an opera once in a year

Is offensive to every true protestant ear

With trumpets and fiddles and organs and singing

Will sure the Pretender and Popery bring in. 214

-

²¹¹ Quoted in Temperley, Music of the English Parish Church, 137.

²¹² Temperley, *Music of the English Parish Church*, 71.

²¹³ Vanessa Alayrac-Fielding and Claire Dubois, eds., *The Foreignness of Foreigners: Cultural Representations of the Other in the British Isles* (Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2015), 21. ²¹⁴ Jonathan Swift, "The Dean to himself on St Cecilia's Day", in Derek Mahon, ed., *Jonathan Swift: Poems* (London: Faber and Faber, 2001), 63.

As with all of Swift's writings, this may have been more tongue-in-cheek than serious. Nevertheless, it reflects a common contemporary belief that modern, elaborate instrumental music in church was in some way "un-Protestant", and had some connection to Catholicism.²¹⁵ Those who wished to "improve" and innovate in the area of church music, therefore, had at the same time to be wary of inadvertently opening the door to "the pretender and Popery"—or at least to accusations of the same.

Reconstructing the style of the music that organists like Woffington actually played during services is a far from certain task, for perhaps the majority of organ music played during this period was improvised. From those voluntaries which did appear in manuscript and print during the eighteenth century, it is possible to establish that most were made up of two movements: the first slow and preludial, the second faster and of a fugal or soloistic character. The style of printed voluntaries typically exhibits a strong Italian influence. If Woffington's accounts of studying in London are to be trusted, then perhaps the most reliable clues to the style of his playing are to be found in the dozen or so of Croft's voluntaries that survive in manuscript. Some of these pieces are on the typical two-movement plan (including solos for the newly fashionable Trumpet and Cremona stops), while others are single movements based on simple fugal designs. Yet in all these pieces, the level of contrapuntal sophistication never exceeds the capacity of an adept keyboard improvisor. The fugues, for example, are characterised not by such artifices as stretto and augmentation, but by a tendency for entries to be confined to the outer voices, and to the highest voice especially. All this suggests Croft intended these

²¹⁵ The musicologist Harry White has noted that this resistance to European classical music on ideological grounds was a strong contributing factor in the failure of secular European music to establish itself on the Irish musical scene. See Harry White, *The Keeper's Recital: Music and Cultural History in Ireland, 1770–1970* (Cork: Cork University Press, 1998), 8.

²¹⁶ Temperley, *Music of the English Parish Church*, 136.

²¹⁷ William Croft, *Complete Organ Works*, ed. Richard Platt (London: Oxford University Press, 1978).

voluntaries not so much as finished, autonomous compositions than as models of improvisation to be emulated by his pupils, Woffington perhaps among them.

1.4 Charity Schools

1.4.1 The charity school movement

Once an organ had been installed, another possible solution to the problem of parish church music was to put together a choir of children from the local charity school who could be taught to sing the psalms and then lead the congregational singing. This alleviated some of the pressure on both the parish clerk and the congregation, and, like the organs which invariably accompanied the charity children, helped to guide and structure the congregational singing so as to regulate the pitch and tempo. Such charity school choirs were a distinctly urban phenomenon, and during the eighteenth century the sight of children singing from the organ gallery became a common one in British cities and towns. It was also a phenomenon entirely in keeping with the spirit of the age, which combined the enthusiasm for moral instruction as embodied in the charity schools with the desire for improvement and "professionalisation" that made its mark everywhere in parish music-making.²¹⁸

The term "charity school" generally referred to a parish school for the education and training of poor children. The charity school movement began in earnest in Britain in the early eighteenth century, fuelled by the contemporary culture of charity and philanthropy, a practical utilitarianism, and concern for a perceived decline in moral and spiritual

²¹⁸ Temperley, *Music of the English Parish Church*, 104.

standards.²¹⁹ Just as middle-class worries about disruptions to the social order found their outlet in the societies for the reformation of manners which flourished during this period, so similar concerns about the ungodliness of the poor manifested themselves in a general enthusiasm for the establishment of schools.²²⁰ The primary purpose of these schools was religious as well as social: it was thought that if children were removed from the negative influences which surrounded them at home, and exposed at an early age to "true religion", they might have a chance of escaping the life of poverty which otherwise awaited them.²²¹ Children were usually admitted between the ages of eight and twelve, studied the (Anglican) catechism extensively, were regularly examined by the parish minister, and were expected to attend services at the parish church several times per week. The remainder of the school curriculum was made up of a mixture of reading, writing and arithmetic, and manual labour such as weaving. School leavers were apprenticed out to trades or engaged as servants.²²² The emphasis on the study of "useful" skills at the charity school was a reflection on contemporary utilitarian attitudes to charity, which sought to "promote the glory of God by promoting the usefulness of man".²²³

After taking England by storm in the early years of the eighteenth century, enthusiasm for the establishment of charity schools quickly spread to Ireland. The Irish "Society for the Promotion of Christian Knowledge" was established by Henry Maule (later the Bishop of Meath and Dromore) in 1717, modelled on the London society of the same name, with the aim of furthering the cause of the charity schools and encouraging the

²²³ Jones, *The Charity School Movement*, 12.

²¹⁹ Jones, *The Charity School Movement*, 4–7.

²²⁰ Jones, *The Charity School Movement*, 36.

²²¹ Jones, *The Charity School Movement*, 14.

²²² Edward Synge, *Methods of Erecting, Supporting & Governing Charity-Schools: with An Account of the Charity-Schools in Ireland; And some Observations thereon. The Second Edition, with Additions* (Dublin: Printed for J. Hyde, Bookseller in Dame-Street, 1719), 8–11. GB-Ob G.Pamph.1466(1).

clergy and public to support them.²²⁴ The number of schools appears to have grown quickly in the early part of the century, then more slowly for the remainder: A 1706 report listed only three charity schools in Dublin; by 1717 there were fifteen, and by 1719 twenty-two. Between then and 1796, the number seems to have risen only to twenty-six.²²⁵ This pattern of growth mirrors that of London, where there were 132 schools in 1729 and 179 in 1799. The ratio of charity schools to the general population was also approximately equivalent in the two cities: London, which had about eight times the population of Dublin in 1800, had seven times the number of charity schools.²²⁶

A report on Ireland's charity schools from 1719, written by the Archbishop of Tuam Edward Synge, gives more detail on the twenty-two schools then in operation in Dublin, which between them taught around five hundred children. The majority of these were boys' schools, with just six catering to girls. The smallest school at that time was the parish charity school of St Werburgh's, which taught just nine boys, while the largest were St Bride's and St Catherine's, which taught forty boys each. The report noted that the school in the Liberties of St Patrick had formerly supported forty or fifty boys—unusually, largely Catholic—through subscription by several wealthy private individuals, but since several of those individuals had since left the area, the school had "dwindled". Most of the schools listed in the report had between twelve and twenty-five students. Almost all of the parishes had at least one school, only three parishes—St Mark's, St Luke's, and St Ann's—not being mentioned in the report. There were also four schools

-

²²⁴ Jones, The Charity School Movement, 227.

²²⁵ Mary Hayden, "Charity Children in 18th-Century Dublin", *Dublin Historical Record* 5, no. 3 (March–May 1943): 92–93. Synge, *Methods*, 34.

²²⁶ The population of London (c. 1.4 million) taken from Temperley, *Music of the English Parish Church*, 112. The population of Dublin (c. 180,000) taken from Fagan, "The Population of Dublin", 36.

²²⁷ Information in this paragraph taken from Synge, *Methods*, 22–25, 34. Synge was "a major proponent of improvement movements and charity schooling", particularly as a means of stamping out Catholicism, as he believed Catholic priests preyed upon the ignorance of the people and that educated people would naturally turn to the established church. Karen Sonnelitter, *Charity Movements in Eighteenth-Century Ireland: Philanthropy and Improvement* (Woodbridge: The Boydell Press, 2016), 45, 51.

in the city Liberties. The records of St Luke's make reference to charity sermons in the later eighteenth century, but not to charity children, other than those being sent to the workhouse. ²²⁸ By 1825, St Luke's had a "poor school", and St Thomas's, which had not yet been built at the time of Synge's report, had a gallery for the "parish children". ²²⁹

Although some charity schools were maintained by individual benefactors, who kept the school going at their own expense or by means of bequests, most were founded and administered on the initiative either of parish officials, including ministers, or of wellmeaning middle-class citizens. These schools were funded by a variety of methods, the most common being subscriptions from interested parties, donations or bequests from wealthy philanthropists, or collections made at the church. Some churches had dedicated collection boxes for the charity school funds, while others used a portion of their general collection income. Other sources of funds included fines imposed for breaking the "penal laws" on cursing and swearing, the rental of funeral palls, and other minor streams of income. 230 For many schools, the principal source of funds was the annual "charity sermon": this was a special sermon, often given by a well-known preacher hired for the occasion, at which the benefits of charity were extolled, and the congregation were encouraged to give liberally for the support of the school.²³¹ The charity children were obliged to attend the service, where they provided visual stimulus for the congregation's charitable impulses; they were usually also expected to sing on these occasions (see 1.4.3 below).

²²⁸ RCB P.0155.07/1: St Luke's Churchwarden's account book 1716–1777.

²²⁹ Wright, *Historical Guide*, 76, 84. Sonnelitter claims that only one Dublin parish lacked a charity school in the eighteenth century, but does not name which parish it was. Sonnelitter, *Charity Movements in Eighteenth-Century Ireland*, 50.

²³⁰ Synge, Methods, 4–6.

²³¹ For an example of one of these sermons, see Peter Browne, A sermon, preach'd at the parish church of St. Andrew's Dublin, on Sunday the 15th of April, 1716. For the Benefit of The Charity-School for Boys in that Parish. By Peter Lord Bishop of Cork and Rosse (Printed by E. Waters in Essex-Street; and are to be sold by J. Hyde Book-Seller in Dame-Street, [1716]). GB-Lbl 1508/509.

From the beginning, the charity schools were lauded as a method of strengthening the Protestant church in the British Isles against the threats of nonconformity and Catholicism. The charity school at St Margaret Westminster, founded just after the defeat of James II, was described as "the first institution of this kind against Popery". 232 Children who had been thoroughly drilled in the catechism would form, in the words of the Archdeacon of Huntingdon in 1706, "little garrisons against Popery", and would be saved from the "ignorance" that awaited them should they grow up to be Catholics. 233 In *Methods of Erecting Charity Schools in Ireland* Edward Synge expanded on this idea in the Irish context, lamenting that, as "by the laws of this Realm, no Papist can teach School ... the Children of Papists must be abandoned to the grossest Ignorance ... unless some care be taken to breed them up in the Knowledge of them". 234 The charity schools, in this optimistic view, offered a solution not only to the general social problems of the age but to the specific sectarian conflicts that pertained in Ireland:

Children of the Popish Natives, being Instructed, Clothed and taken Care of, along with our own, may be so won by our affectionate Endeavours, that the whole Nation may become *Protestant* and *English*, and all such Rebellions as have heretofore arisen from the Difference between Us in Religion, Language and Interest, for the future be prevented.²³⁵

Despite this, however, it was relatively uncommon for charity schools to admit Catholic children as students—something which Synge admits later in the same treatise, noting that priority was generally given to the children of Protestants over those of "Papists or Dissenters".²³⁶ The records of the St Michan's school, where, as we have seen (1.1.3), the

-

²³² Quoted in Temperley, Music of the English Parish Church, 104.

²³³ Jones, The Charity School Movement, 14.

²³⁴ Synge, *Methods*, 3. In reality, Catholic schools were extremely common, despite being prohibited: the *Report into the State of Popery* listed forty-five "Popish schools" operating in Dublin in 1731—far more than there were established church charity schools (see 1.1.3 above).

²³⁵ Synge, *Methods*, 3.

²³⁶ Synge, Methods, 7.

Catholic population of the parish supposedly outnumbered the Protestant population by eight to one, show a clear preference expressed for admitting the children of Protestant parents.²³⁷ This was in line with general parish policy towards the administration of poor relief, which prioritised giving aid to the Protestant poor. ²³⁸ In this they were fundamentally distinguished from the government-supported "charter schools", which were founded from the 1730s onward specifically to address the poor success of charity schools in rural, predominantly Catholic areas. The charter schools were expressly aimed at the education of Catholic children—from 1756 enrolment was restricted to Catholics only—and were more directed towards manual labour, particularly agricultural work, than the urban charity schools. Only two of these "charter schools" were set up in Dublin, on the North Strand and in Ranelagh. ²³⁹

1.4.2 Case study: St Michan's charity schools

The records of St Michan's parish provide a useful case study on the inner workings of a Dublin charity school. St Michan's parish had two charity schools in the early eighteenth century, one for boys and one for girls, founded, according to Synge, in 1716. At the time Synge's report was written, there were thirty students in each school, and each group had its own dedicated schoolhouse—possibly a rarity, as few of the other parishes are mentioned as having had even one.²⁴⁰ One of these schoolhouses stood on Bow Street, to the west of the churchyard.²⁴¹ The surviving records of the charity schools date only as

_

²⁴⁰ Synge, *Methods*, 24.

²³⁷ RCB P.0276.13/1–2: St Michan's school minute books, 1751–1825

²³⁸ Barnard, "The Eighteenth-Century Parish", 313–14.

²³⁹ Hayden, "Charity Children", 104–106. The historian W. E. H. Lecky memorably described the charter schools as producing in the Catholic population of Ireland "an intensity of bitterness hardly equalled by any portion of the penal code." *History of Ireland in the Eighteenth Century* vol 1, 234.

²⁴¹ RCB P.0276.13/2: St Michan's school minute book 1777–1825, 111.

far back as the 1750s, and the earliest entries make no mention of girls.²⁴² It is possible that the girls' school had closed by this time, or, equally, that the records of the girls' school were kept separately and have not survived. In the late eighteenth century, the girls once again start to appear in the records. By this time, a new schoolhouse had been built to accommodate both girls and boys.²⁴³ At the beginning of the nineteenth century, the boys seem to have been phased out in favour of an all-girls' school.²⁴⁴

The number of children attending the schools seems to have varied over time. In 1719, Synge claimed there were thirty children in each school, though this may have referred to the number of available places rather than the exact current enrolment. The school records from the mid-eighteenth century do not give exact enrolment figures, but suggest that from twenty to twenty-five boys were in regular attendance at the school, of which around six were boarders. Have boarders boarding, while a further ten or so attended as day schoolers. Places were equally divided between girls and boys. In general, boarders attended for two to six years, while day schoolers seem to have attended for just one or two. The children were dressed in blue bonnets, and their shirts stamped with "St Michan's parish" in "lamp-black and oyl". Have been girls and boys.

An unusual aspect of the St Michan's boys' school in the mid-eighteenth century was its internal division into a "Writing School" and a "Working School". The lists of "praemiums" or prizes awarded each month to the boy who showed the most improvement in each discipline reveal that the boys at the "writing school" were taught

²⁴² RCB P.0276.13/1: St Michan's school minute book 1751–77.

²⁴³ RCB P.0276.13/2: St Michan's school minute book 1777–1825, 96.

²⁴⁴ RCB P.0276.13/2: St Michan's school minute book 1777–1825, 503.

²⁴⁵ Synge, *Methods*, 24.

²⁴⁶ RCB P.0276.13/1: St Michan's school minute book 1751–77.

²⁴⁷ RCB P.0276.13/2: St Michan's school minute book 1777–1825.

²⁴⁸ RCB P.0276.13/1: St Michan's school minute book 1751–77, 14, 16.

catechism, reading, writing and arithmetic, and awarded for their proficiency in those subjects and for their general neatness and cleanliness, while the "working school" boys were awarded for their competency with the "chequer loom", the amount of linen and cotton they could produce per day, making the best quills, and for their "conduct and moral character". 249 The lack of any crossover between the names of boys awarded "writing" prizes and those awarded "working" prizes suggests that, rather than integrate "writing" and "working" into one holistic curriculum, as was the general charity school practice, the St Michan's school "streamed" its pupils into one area of study or the other on admittance. As the school records only go back as far as the 1750s, it is not clear whether this unusual situation pertained from the school's establishment, or if it was a later adoption; it is possible that the influence of the ideology of the charter schools, which were prevalent and widely lauded in the period 1730–1750, encouraged the establishment of a more "labour-intensive" working school for those judged unable to meet the standards of the "writing school". In any case, references to the "writing" and "working" schools stop appearing in the school records later in the century (the praemiums, also, were either no longer awarded or just not recorded after a certain point), and it is possible the division was only a short-lived one.

Apart from this curiosity, the daily schedule, curriculum and religious ethos of the St Michan's school(s) departed little from the general standard as described by Synge.²⁵⁰ The school records of 1783 outline a rigorous daily routine: the children were to rise at 6am, breakfast was at 8, and play time until 9, when classes began; dinner was at 2pm, and at 3pm the students were sent to work; supper was provided at 7, and bed time was enforced at 9. In winter, students breakfasted and began lessons an hour later. Church

²⁴⁹ RCB P.0276.13/1: St Michan's school minute book 1751–77, 16, 18.

²⁵⁰ Synge, Methods, 9–10.

attendance was mandatory at both morning and evening services every Sunday, as well as on Wednesday and Friday mornings and on the mornings of holidays.²⁵¹

1.4.3 Music at the charity schools

The close association between charity schools and parish churches meant that it was very common for charity children to be taught to sing psalms as part of their religious instruction, particularly in London. This part of the curriculum had clear practical application, for the charity children, who were required to attend services in any case, could be pressed into service as a rudimentary choir. A group of charity children accompanied by an organ became the "typical resources for music in a prosperous town church of this period". Synge's *Methods of Erecting Charity Schools* contains a list of rules to be hung up in the school, and these included an instruction that the children should sing a psalm at the school every day along with their prayers, and that when in church they should "observe the Time and Tune in Singing Psalms" (along with the additional instruction that they should sing in a "humble or low Voice ... so that neither the Minister nor the Congregation may be drowned or disturbed by them"). 254

At St Michan's, the musical training of the charity children was the responsibility of the organist, who was obliged to spend an hour a week—either on Friday after evening service, "or on such other day of the week as shall be appointed"—teaching "such of the Children educated in the Charity Schools ... as the said Minister and Church-Wardens ... shall Nominate to him for that purpose, so much of the Grounds & Practice of Musick as

²⁵¹ RCB P.0276.13/2: St Michan's school minute book 1777–1825, 39.

²⁵² Jones, The Charity School Movement, 80.

²⁵³ Temperley, *Music of the Parish Church*, 129.

²⁵⁴ Synge, *Methods*, 10.

may enable them to sing the Common and usual Psalm-Tunes in perfect time and Tune with the Organ". ²⁵⁵ Not all of the children necessarily took part in the singing lessons; in 1769 it was resolved that the organist should not teach more than four boys at a time, with the implication that this was to allow the chosen boys to reach a higher standard. ²⁵⁶ In addition, the organist does not always appear to have performed this duty sufficiently, or with good grace. In October 1769 a group of Visitors carrying out an examination on the school noted that "the Organist has neither attended nor called upon the Boys upwards of a Month past to instruct them in Singing the Psalms in which they are very imperfect and ignorant". This troubled the trustees, "the Charity Sermon so nearly at hand there will not be a Sufficient number to raise the Psalms unless the Organist give double attendance". 257 The visitors recommended the emergency measure of tasking the schoolmaster with assigning the boys "to raise and Sing a Psalm every day either on their coming in or before they go out of the School ... to help to perfect them the more."²⁵⁸ Other issues were more disciplinary than musical. In 1770 a committee had to be appointed to look into "the Organist Beating the Parish Boys ... for not Singing as well as they Could have Done". The decision of the committee was that this kind of punishment lay outside the organist's remit, and that the schoolmaster should attend "at the Time the Organist is instructing the Charity Boys in Singing" and report any boys who would not "exert Himself and take the Organist's Instruction" to the school's Visitors on their next inspection. ²⁵⁹

Since the charity children were taught the psalm tunes in advance, they would not have necessarily required their own books. The description of charity children on their

-

²⁵⁵ RCB P.0376.28/3: St Michan's Memorial Book, 107–108.

²⁵⁶ RCB P.0276.13/2: St Michan's school minute book 1777–1825, October 1769.

²⁵⁷ RCB P.0276.13/2: St Michan's school minute book 1777–1825, October 1769.

²⁵⁸ RCB P.0276.13/2: St Michan's school minute book 1777–1825, October 1769. That this was an emergency measure suggests that the "rule" described in Synge's *Methods* requiring the students to sing a psalm at school every day was not generally observed.

²⁵⁹ RCB P.0276.13/2: St Michan's school minute book 1777–1825, 13 June 1770.

way to church in *Methods of Erecting Charity Schools* mentions them "carrying their Bibles and Common-Prayer-Books with them", but does not specifically mention tunebooks. 260 The list of recommended school books at the back of the *Methods* includes a book called "Singing-Psalms"; since this book appears to have been sold as a set with "The Common-Prayer" (4½d for both), it was very likely the *New Version*. A similar recommendation, for the "common prayer book with the singing psalms", was included in an English SPCK report in 1713. At St Michan's, however, the charity boys were provided with their own tunebooks: the school records note the purchase of twenty psalm books "for the use of the Boys" in 1753. These were almost certainly copies of *Select Psalms for the use of St Michan's*, published the previous year (see 1.5.1 below). The school records additionally suggest that the boys had been issued their own personal psalm books prior to this point: in 1752 three of the boys were excluded from consideration for praemiums in June "on account of having lost their psalm books". 264 No further information on these psalm books was recorded, however.

As well as singing at regular services, charity school children were generally called upon to perform as part of the annual charity sermon. This performance served mainly to present the boys to the congregation, showing congregants the objects of their charity in the hope that they would be persuaded to donate further. It was likely a desire to make the boys more visible to the congregation that motivated the resolution, in October 1752, that the St Michan's boys "be brought into the Middle Isle of the Church to Sing the Psalms at the Charity Sermon" (also suggesting they usually sang from a different

²⁶⁰ Synge, Methods, 10.

²⁶¹ Synge, *Methods*, 47.

²⁶² Temperley, Music of the English Parish Church, 104.

²⁶³ RCB P.0276.13/1: St Michan's school minute book 1751–77, 34.

²⁶⁴ RCB P.0276.13/1: St Michan's school minute book 1751–77, 23.

location, probably the organ gallery).²⁶⁵ The aspect of the boys' musical education which most interested the school board of St Michan's was their ability to perform adequately at the charity sermon, because this directly affected the school's finances for the following year. Most of the references to singing in the school records refer to the charity sermon, and whether or not the boys would be sufficiently prepared.

Three printings of hymns have survived from eighteenth-century Dublin charity sermons: all are derived from the *New Version*, and all are without printed music.²⁶⁶ At the St Andrew's charity sermon in 1726, when the visiting preacher was the Bishop of Clonfert, the charity children sang a "hymn" made up of sections from several different Tate and Brady psalms (41, 90 and 35, with a Gloria appended and a "Hallelujah" between each verse), with the pronouns altered throughout to change the singular "I" of the psalmist into the plural "we" of the charity singers.²⁶⁷ Two more Tate and Brady psalms were sung by the children at the St Werburgh's charity sermon in 1756: "That Man is blest who stands in Awe" (Ps. 112, which extols the virtues of charity) and "The Lord does them support that fall" (the second part of Ps. 144, which discusses the generosity of God in giving to the needy).²⁶⁸ At the St Mary's charity sermon of 1764, the hymn was "How shall the Young preserve their Ways", another composite made up of verses from several different *New Version* psalms.²⁶⁹ All of the hymns and psalms in these music sheets were in common metre. Despite Temperley's assertion that anthems were often

-

²⁶⁵ RCB P.0276.13/1: St Michan's school minute book 1751–77, 28.

²⁶⁶ The authorship of the psalm texts mentioned in this paragraph was identified using the Hymnary.org database.

²⁶⁷ An Hymn to be sung by the charity-children, of St. Andrew's parish, on Sunday the 24th of this instant, April 1726 (Dublin, 1726). IRL-Dtc Press A.7.4 no.44.

²⁶⁸ Hymns, to be sung by the children of the Charity-School of St. Werburgh's Parish, on Sunday the 12th of December, 1756. At which time a sermon will be preached by the Reverend Sir. Philip Hoby, bart. (Printed for Samuel Price, bookseller opposite Crane-lane, in Dame-street, 1756). Cambridge University Library Hib.0.756.4.

²⁶⁹ An hymn to be sung by the charity children of St. Mary's, Dublin, on Sunday, the 19th of February, 1764. (Dublin, 1764). Cambridge University Library Hib.0.764.1.

performed at charity sermons in England, there is no evidence that on such occasions in Dublin the charity children ever attempted anything more complex than a hymn.²⁷⁰

1.5 Printed Music and Music Printers

1.5.1 Select Psalms (1752) and A Collection of Psalms (1777)

A significant obstacle to the study of metrical psalmody is the difficulty of establishing positive links between printed music and the tunes actually sung by a given congregation. Metrical psalmody was a primarily oral tradition, and while collections of printed tunes regularly made claims that the tunes they contained were in common use, those claims can be impossible to verify. Similarly, just because a collection of tunes sold well did not necessarily mean the tunes were ever used widely in worship. Given the difficulty in bridging this gap between oral practice and printed sources, the existence of sources with demonstrable close ties to particular churches or institutions is of considerable value, for they inspire much greater confidence that the tunes they contain were those actually used.

One such source is a collection entitled *Select Psalms for the use of New St. Michan's*, *in Dublin*, published by Samuel Powell in 1752.²⁷¹ It is not a full psalter, but contains sixty-one psalm texts set to an impressive thirty-three different tunes. The texts are drawn from the *New Version* of the psalms by Tate and Brady. The metrical variety on offer is limited; the vast majority of the texts are in common or double common metre, with a few in long or short metre and just one, Psalm 148, with a more unusual metre

-

²⁷⁰ Temperley, *Music of the English Parish Church*, 133–134.

²⁷¹ Select Psalms, for the use of the Parish-Church of New St. Michan's, in Dublin (Dublin: Printed by S. Powell, in Crane-Lane, 1752). HTI: #SPNSM a. IRL-Dtc Starkey 129.

(6.6.6.8.8). "Double" and "triple" long metre are surprisingly well-represented, however, appearing in thirteen and four texts respectively. In addition to the title, which clearly identifies the book's connection with St Michan's parish, the records of the parish charity school, as we have seen, confirm that "psalm books" were purchased for the use of the boys in 1753, just a year after *Select Psalms* was published (1.4.3).²⁷² It is almost certain, therefore, that at least some of the tunes in *Select Psalms* were sung by the charity boys at St Michan's in the mid-eighteenth century.

Supplement to the New Version, and owes very little to earlier sources printed in Ireland (see 2.3 below, and Appendix 1). Thirty of the thirty-three tunes appear here in exactly the same forms as they appeared in the Supplement; furthermore, they are rhythmically identical, appear in the same keys and time signatures, and are set to the same psalm texts as in the 1708 book. One tune, the "Penitent's Tune" [655], appears in no sources other than the Supplement, Select Psalms and its 1777 reissue (see below). Three further tunes from the Supplement appear in variant forms in Select Psalms. By contrast, just thirteen of the tunes in Select Psalms appear in previous Irish sources: twelve being exact matches and one a variant (see Table 1). It is beyond doubt that the 1708 Supplement served as the principal source for the unknown compiler of Select Psalms. Unlike the Supplement, however, Select Tunes gives just one part rather than two; perhaps the editor felt that two-part singing was beyond the abilities of the charity children.

The three tunes which do not exactly correspond to tunes from the *Supplement*, but appear in slightly unusual variant forms, are all of Genevan origin. The first of these, "Ps.

²⁷² RCB P.0276.13/1: St Michan's school minute book 1751–77, 34.

²⁷³ Tune content comparison and tune analysis in this and succeeding paragraphs is derived from the HTI in combination with the primary sources.

51 Old" [93b] is a rare variant of a sixteenth-century tune which first appeared in the Anglo-Genevan Psalter. While the original tune [93a] has 177 citations in the Hymn Tune Index, the present variant [93b] has only twelve, only five of which appeared prior to the publication of *Select Psalms*, and only in English sources. The variant is distinct enough from the original to make it unlikely that the compiler of *Select Psalms* arrived at it independently. The second variant tune, "Ps. 137 Old" [109c], is unique to this book and its 1777 second edition (see Ex. 1). The editor's source for these variant tunes remains unclear.

The third variant tune, here entitled "Ps. 119" [120c], is notable for its specific connections to Dublin (see Ex. 2). The original tune [120a] is a sixteenth-century one, and appears in the 1708 Supplement, but the earliest verifiable citation of the "c" variant is an Irish source from c. 1699 (see 2.3.1 below). The "c" variant appears in every known Irish source prior to the publication of Select Psalms. The version of the tune in Select Psalms is not actually completely identical to the standard "c" variant, but since the difference amounts to only one note it may simply be a typographical error. The inclusion of this tune in Select Psalms connects what is otherwise a highly derivative collection with what, as we shall see in the next chapter, is a distinct repertory of tunes in the Dublin sources. Given that the tunes in Select Psalms can be asserted with an unusually high confidence to represent an actual record of music performed in a Dublin church, the inclusion of "Ps. 119" [120c] in the volume is a positive indicator that the "c" variant of this tune was indeed the dominant one among Dublin congregations, and therefore indicates a local preference which diverged slightly from the norm.

In a similar vein, it is curious that the tunes which appear most frequently in *Select Psalms* are relatively obscure in the wider international repertory. The tunes entitled "St

Luke's" [667a] and "St Martin's" [668a], which have only eighty-eight and twenty-four citations in total in the HTI respectively, both appear here six times (see Ex. 3). In comparison, "Cambridge" [249a] has over 400 citations in the HTI, but is used in *Select Psalms* only once. Both "St Luke's" and "St Martin's" had originated in the 1708 *Supplement* and appear in no other Irish sources apart from those associated with St Michan's. The editor of *Select Psalms* may simply have been fond of them; equally, however, this may be an indication of a local preference for these tunes at St Michan's.

Apart from the frequency with which it appears elsewhere, the other distinguishing feature of the "St Luke's" tune [667a] is that it is the only tune in *Select Psalms* with a performance direction: the single word "slow".²⁷⁴ This appears in five of the six instances where "St Luke's" tune is used, and as there seems to be no reason for its omission in the sixth case (for Psalm 47), this may be a mistake. Marking this particular tune as "slow" was not an innovation by the editor of the book, however, but another derivative from the 1708 *Supplement*, where "St Luke's" is similarly marked "slow" every time it appears.²⁷⁵

In 1777 George Bonham, who had recently taken over the Powell family press, reissued the *Select Psalms* of 1752 under the title *A Collection of Select Psalms for the Use of Parish-Churches in General, but Particularly Intended for that of New St. Michan's*. ²⁷⁶ The new title suggests that while the original book was conceived and produced specifically for St Michan's, Bonham hoped that the re-release would reach a wider readership. There are no mentions of the 1777 edition in the St Michan's school

²⁷⁴ See, for example, Psalm 95 (*Select Psalms*, 65–66).

²⁷⁵ For example, Psalm 95, A Supplement to the New Version of Psalms by Dr. Brady and Mr. Tate ... the sixth edition, corrected; and much enlargd: with the addition of ... near 30 new Tunes (London: In the Savoy: printed by John Nutt; and sold by James Holland, at the Bible and Ball, at the West-End of St. Paul's, 1708), 46. HTI: *TS TatB 6a. GB-Lbl 3091.de.6(1).

²⁷⁶ A Collection of select Psalms for the use of parish-churches in general, but particularly intended for that of New St. Michan's, Dublin (Dublin: Printed by G. Bonham, No. 42, Dame-street: for Thomas Stewart, 1777). IRL-Dn Ir.2232.p6.

records, and so if the school did purchase any copies for the use of the charity children, they were not recorded as the purchase of the first edition had been.

The most conspicuous difference between *A Collection of Select Psalms* and its 1752 predecessor is a dramatic change in the typeface (see 1.5.2 below). Apart from this surface-level change, the two books are almost identical, the only difference between their contents being the inclusion in *A Collection of Select Psalms* of one additional psalm, number 149, accompanied by the tune commonly known as "Hanover" [657d]. The reason for this single addition is unclear. The "Hanover" tune [657] first appeared in the Tate and Brady Supplement in 1708, where it was also paired with the text of Psalm 149. The variant which appears in the *Collection of Select Psalms*, which has a more florid melody, is unique, however (see Ex. 4). The tune is today ascribed to William Croft, who may have been linked, through his professed pupil Woffington, with the musical establishment at St Michan's (see 1.3.2 above), though it would be rash to explain the tune's inclusion simply on these grounds.²⁷⁷ Rather, this may simply be a reflection of late eighteenth-century popular taste, as "Hanover" also appears in John McVity's *Select Psalm and Hymn Tunes*, published by Bonham in 1787 (see 3.4.4 below), and in several Irish publications of the early nineteenth century (see 5.2 below).

1.5.2 Powell and Bonham: a case study of music printers

An examination of the printers associated with the two St Michan's psalm books offers a window onto the new but thriving industry of music printing in Dublin. This was a specialised subsection of the more general printing and publishing sector, the rapid

²⁷⁷ Temperley *et al.*, "Psalms, Metrical", GMO. The Grove article notes that "Hanover" was formerly attributed to Handel, and comments that today's attribution of the tune to Croft is made "with little better evidence".

expansion of which during the eighteenth century was characteristic of the Enlightenment era and the growth of the "public sphere". While Irish literacy rates during the eighteenth century lagged behind English and Scottish ones, nevertheless it has been estimated that by the later part of the century, sixty-five per cent of men and forty-five per cent of women in Leinster were literate. The ability to read was no longer exclusive to the elite classes of society: a distinctly "lower class" literature of romance and adventure stories was noted by contemporary commentators. Neither did it vary much along confessional lines, for the proliferation of Catholic schools allowed literacy rates among Catholics to approach those of Protestants. 279

Although Ireland still imported much of its reading material from Britain, an increasing quantity of material was printed at home.²⁸⁰ The Irish print trade was also encouraged by a legal loophole regarding copyright law. The Statute of Anne of 1710, which granted authors of new books a copyright of fourteen years from publication, did not apply in Ireland, and so Irish printers were able to reprint and sell British books without any obligation to pay the copyright holders. Some of these reprints were produced with the collaboration of the British publishers; many were not.²⁸¹ By the mid-1780s there were eighty printers working in Dublin alone.²⁸²

The attempts made to control and regulate the printing business in Ireland, and to restrict Catholic access to the industry, had mixed success. From 1670, the printing and bookselling businesses were theoretically regulated by the Guild of St Luke, which was

²⁷⁸ Literacy rates in Ulster were slightly higher, while those of Munster and Connacht were considerably lower. Ian McBride, *Eighteenth Century Ireland: The Isle of Slaves* (Dublin: Gill Books, 2009), 56–7.

²⁷⁹ McBride, *Eighteenth-Century Ireland*, 57–58. ²⁸⁰ McBride, *Eighteenth-Century Ireland*, 59.

²⁸¹ 8 Ann. c. 19. H. Tomás Gómez-Arostegui, "The Untold Story of the First Copyright Suit under the Statute of Anne in 1710", *Berkeley Technology Law Journal* 25, no. 3, Symposium: Copyright @ 300 (2010): 1248, 1277–8.

²⁸² McBride, Eighteenth Century Ireland, 59.

also the guild of the cutlers and painters (in the sense of decorators, rather than artists). After 1690, full membership of the Guild was restricted to Protestants; Catholics could only join as "quarter brothers", which conferred no benefits but allowed them to carry on their business in peace on payment of a fine. This was essentially a protection tax, and in 1725 Cornelius Nary complained that Catholic businessmen were being intimidated into paying by being threatened with having to say the Oath of Abjuration if they refused.²⁸³ In the first half of the eighteenth century, this resulted in an effective Protestant monopoly on printing (Nary was, in fact, the only significant Catholic to break the monopoly). By the second half of the century, however, the position of Catholics in Dublin society had considerably changed (see chapter 3 below), and Catholic printers established themselves in Dublin and produced large quantities of devotional and educational material despite their continued exclusion from the printers' Guild.²⁸⁴

In general, the Guild of St Luke was far less organised and effective than the Stationer's Guild which was its equivalent in London. ²⁸⁵ Indicative of the Guild's impotence was the clash between its own charter, which supposedly granted a printing monopoly to its members, and the existence of the King's Printer's patent, which was supposed to grant the printing monopoly to its holder. Eventually, a compromise was settled whereby the King's Printer generally printed government business and official documents, while the other printers continued to print whatever they liked. ²⁸⁶ Although not generally music printers, King's Printers did often print books of common prayer, Bibles and psalters; as we have seen, it was the King's Printers (the Crooke family, Aaron Rhames and the Griersons) who were responsible for publishing the Irish editions of *The*

²⁸³ Pollard, *Dictionary of the Dublin Book Trade*, ix–xi, xxii, xxv–xxviii.

²⁸⁴ McBride, Eighteenth-Century Ireland, 58.

²⁸⁵ Pollard, *Dictionary of the Dublin Book Trade*, xi–xiii.

²⁸⁶ Pollard, *Dictionary of the Dublin Book Trade*, xv.

Whole Booke of Psalmes and the New Version (see 1.2 above). When George Grierson, a Scottish immigrant and husband of the poet Constantia Grierson (née Crawley), assumed the role of King's Printer he produced the only edition of the Scottish Psalter published in Dublin during this period (see 2.2.2 below).²⁸⁷ It was rare, however, for any of the King's Printers to involve themselves in music printing directly. According to the historian W. H. Grattan Flood, none of George Grierson's works contains any printed music; his son, who became King's Printer in 1758, produced only "a few musical works".²⁸⁸

In the specific area of sacred music printing, by far the most dominant presence was that of Samuel Powell and his family. The Powell printing business originated with Samuel's father, Stephen Powell, who first appears working in partnership with Brent in the late seventeenth century.²⁸⁹ Brent and Powell's issue of William Barton's *Psalms*, printed at Dick's Coffee House, was one of the first Irish publications to include printed music (see 2.3.1 below).²⁹⁰ Powell struck out on his own in 1703. Conflicting accounts exist of Stephen Powell's character: contemporaries described him as a "wit", "quaint, apposite and genteel, neither scurrilous nor profane".²⁹¹ He was less than kindly to his apprentice Thomas Gent, however, who ran away in 1715 on account of the beatings he

²⁸⁷ C. J. Woods, "Grierson, George", DIB (October 2009; rev September 2010). Sylvie Kleinman and Frances Clarke, "Grierson (Crawley), Constantia", DIB (October 2009).

²⁸⁸ W. H. Grattan Flood, "Music-Printing in Dublin from 1700 to 1750". *The Journal of the Royal Society of Antiquaries of Ireland*, fifth series, 38, no. 3 (September 1908): 238. Flood, quoted in "Grierson, Hugh Boulter Primrose", *Dublin Music Trade* (http://dublinmusictrade.ie/node/180).

²⁸⁹ Although Brent's religious affiliation is not known, Brent's wife (first name unknown) was a Presbyterian and worked all her life as Jonathan Swift's housekeeper, moving into the Deanery of St Patrick's after Brent died, and being succeeded in her post there by her daughter Ann Ridgeway. Pollard, *Dictionary of the Dublin Book Trade*, 51.

²⁹⁰ "Brent, John", *Dublin Music Trade* (http://dublinmusictrade.ie/node/33).

²⁹¹ Quoted in Pollard, *Dictionary of the Dublin Book Trade*, 469.

was receiving from his master, whom he described as generally violent and "by drink made worse". 292

Stephen Powell died of dropsy in 1722, and on his death he left his business to his widow, Deborah, because his son, Samuel, was only a child. 293 Eight years later, Deborah signed the business over to her son-in-law, who then handed it back to Samuel Powell, Stephen and Deborah's son. Between 1722 and 1730, it appears Deborah ran the press herself, publishing under the name "S. Powell" because Samuel was still a minor. Pollard notes that this was a busy period for the press.²⁹⁴ As we have seen in the case of organists and organ builders (1.3), widows' assuming management of their late husbands' businesses was relatively common during this period. Deborah Powell was by no means the only woman involved in the post-Restoration Dublin printing industry: probably the most high-profile example was Mary Crooke, who held the title of King's Printer during the 1670s and "defended the privilege against all comers". ²⁹⁵ Elizabeth Pue continued to run both her late husband Richard's printing business, which produced the newsletter Pue's Occurrences, and his coffee house (Dick's Coffee House) after he died in 1722, until her son took over from her in 1731. Elizabeth and her son, Richard Pue II, also seem to have run a side-business together selling "eye water". ²⁹⁶ George Grierson's son, George Abraham Grierson, "left the running of the business to his step-mother and a manager" after his father's death and left the country for London. 297 When his halfbrother, who was the next to inherit the business, died in 1771, his wife Mary Wilkinson

²⁹² Ouoted in Pollard, *Dictionary of the Dublin Book Trade*, 470.

²⁹³ Pollard, *Dictionary of the Dublin Book Trade*, 470.

²⁹⁴ Pollard, *Dictionary of the Dublin Book Trade*, 465.

²⁹⁵ Pollard, Dictionary of the Dublin Book Trade, xi.

²⁹⁶ Pollard, *Dictionary of the Dublin Book Trade*, 472-474. Richard ("Dick") Pue was described in a 1698 source (quoted in Pollard, *Dictionary of the Dublin Book Trade*, 473) as "a Witty and Ingenious Man, makes the best Coffee in Dublin".

²⁹⁷ Woods, "Grierson, George", DIB.

married her late husband's assignee; after he in turn died within a year, Mary remained in charge of the business for twelve years until her son, another George Grierson, came of age.²⁹⁸

Samuel Powell took over the family business in 1731 and ran it for the next forty-four years, until his death in 1775. During this period the business was extremely successful. As with George Grierson, Samuel Powell's output was influenced by his denominational allegiance: though formerly an "Anabaptist", according to Wesley, in the 1740s both Samuel Powell and his wife Hannah converted to Methodism. After this date, Powell was responsible for the printing of a huge quantity of Wesleyan material (see 3.4.1 below). This did not, however, prevent him from continuing to produce books for the Church of Ireland, or for the French Huguenots, for whom he published a book of sacred songs in 1748 (see 4.2.6 below). The same spirit of ecumenism—within the wider sphere of Protestantism, at least—was visible in his private life, for he remained an active participant in local affairs through his home parish of St Werburgh's, and even served as a church warden there in 1754.²⁹⁹

At the time of his death in 1775, Samuel Powell had no surviving sons; the son who had briefly worked in partnership with him in the mid-1760s, also named Samuel, had died soon afterward aged just twenty-three. His daughter Sarah Allen therefore inherited the business. She does not seem to have been interested in continuing it, however, and she quickly sold it to Bonham. Along with the press, Bonham inherited Powell's interest in music printing: as we shall see (3.4), the three Dublin tune sources printed after

²⁹⁸ Woods, "Grierson, George", DIB.

²⁹⁹ Pollard, *Dictionary of the Dublin Book Trade*, 467–9.

³⁰⁰ "Powell, Samuel", *Dublin Music Trade* (http://dublinmusictrade.ie/node/376).

Powell's death are all Bonham's work. Bonham also worked as the printer to the Royal Irish Academy from 1787 to 1802, and engraved music plates for them in the 1790s.³⁰¹

Although Bonham inherited Powell's business, and presumably at least some of his printing equipment, he does not seem to have taken possession of his predecessor's set of musical type. This was highly distinctive for its diamond-shaped noteheads, backwards-S-shaped treble clefs, and elaborate repeat signs (see Illus. 1). All of the Powell publications, beginning with Stephen Powell's earliest work with Brent, had made use of this type, incidentally giving a powerful visual coherence to the Dublin tune sources for much of the eighteenth century. Bonham's printed music, however, including his reissues of previously-released Powell works, used a much more modern type (see Illus. 2). Perhaps Bonham wished to distinguish himself graphically from the work of his predecessor; he was after all inheriting a well-known concern, and was also, with the reissue of Select Psalms, attempting to profit from the success of one of his predecessor's publications. Although the type itself does not appear damaged or worn in Powell's later printings, Bonham may have acquired new press machinery with which the old type was incompatible. But an equally likely reason for the replacement of Powell's music type is that it was by that time almost a century out of fashion. "Lozenge"-shaped noteheads with centred stems were already significantly "at variance with the taste of the day" in England by the late seventeenth century, and by the early eighteenth century the "new style" of printing rounded noteheads with stems to the left or right had spread "rapidly". 302 Developments in music type were motivated by aesthetics as well as by efficiency and improvements in technology; by the mid-eighteenth century, music printers like J. G. I.

³⁰¹ "Bonham, George", *Dublin Music Trade* (http://dublinmusictrade.ie/node/108).

³⁰² Stanley Boorman, "Printing from Type", in Stanley Boorman, Eleanor Selfridge-Field and Donald W. Krummel, "Printing and Publishing of Music", GMO (20 January 2001). Interestingly, in France the "lozenge" style was still used, with only a few exceptions, until the end of the eighteenth century.

Breitkopf felt that musical type ought to be beautiful as well as functional, reflecting the self-conscious beauty of contemporary music. In a 1755 advertisement for his own new printing system, he said that "the [printing] method used until now... possesses neither the beauty demanded nowadays nor is it adequate to meet the needs of the *art of music* which has been brought to a state of perfection". Bonham's change in style is indicative of a turn towards aesthetic concerns, and towards a view of music as an art form.

1.6 Conclusions

Dublin's eighteenth-century parish churches were complex sociopolitical and cultural spaces within which a wide range of contemporary attitudes, ideologies and even fears were manifested. As both symbols of and very real centres of secular authority, they were expressly political institutions which were open about their allegiance to the Crown and which were controlled largely by members of the emerging middle class. The attitudes of this class pervaded parish life, particularly the eighteenth-century philosophy of "improvement", which could be seen in everything from the constant rebuilding and upgrading of church buildings to the enthusiasm for the establishment of charity schools to educate the poor. Over all of these efforts hung the shadow of Catholicism, which became the city's majority religion by mid-century. Parish music-making, taking place within this highly charged space, was itself influenced by many of these extra-musical factors.

³⁰³ Quoted in Boorman et al., "Printing and Publishing of Music", GMO.

The parish music culture of eighteenth-century Dublin was highly similar to that of English parish churches, particularly those in London, and centered upon the congregational singing of metrical psalms. Where resources permitted, as was increasingly the case as the century progressed, this singing was accompanied by an organ and a choir of charity school children. The New Version of the psalms, itself influenced by ideas of improvement and concepts of modernity, dominated the parish churches even more thoroughly in Dublin than it did in Britain, and was usually sung to the tunes of the 1708 Supplement; local variation and innovation, at least as far as can be ascertained from the printed sources, was relatively rare. Church music was viewed as both an aid to worship and a means of "adorning" the church service—and, in the case of the organ, the church itself—and efforts were made throughout the century to improve what was seen as the low quality of parish church music in comparison to the cathedrals. At the same time, however, church authorities were reluctant to condone the new, "Italianate", theatrical style of music that was becoming popular in parish churches, particularly in organ music. Reactionary attitudes towards this new style owed much to long-established fears that elaborate or "frivolous" music, particularly instrumental music, was somehow "un-Protestant" and inappropriate for church use.

As well as external factors influencing the internal musical life of the church, the world of parish music-making also extended far beyond the church building itself, supporting entire industries such as organ-building and music-printing, as well as forming a core part of instruction at the city's many charity schools. This was not a niche pursuit but a cornerstone of eighteenth-century Anglican culture with which all of the city's established churchgoers would have been very familiar. It therefore can provide unique insights into both the physical and mental worlds of Dublin's eighteenth-century Protestant inhabitants.

The Dissenters as a distinct social and political force emerged in England in the mid-

seventeenth century, and came into particular prominence after the Restoration, when

disagreements over the newly reissued Book of Common Prayer led thousands of the

clergy of the Church of England to give up their positions and livings. In 1549, the passing

of an Act of Uniformity had established the forms of worship contained in the Book of

Common Prayer as the only ones permitted under the law. The BCP thus became the

central text of the English church, found in every parish alongside the Bible; to use the

BCP in church services was to conform, and to reject it was to reject the church outright.

Whenever a revision of the BCP was published, a new Act of Uniformity was passed with

it, transferring the authority of the old edition to the new. Following two early revisions

(of 1552 and 1559), the BCP underwent no substantive changes for more than a hundred

years. Its use in Ireland was authorised by act of the Irish Parliament in 1560.¹

As we have seen, the particular direction taken by the Reformation in England

and Ireland, influenced by a succession of monarchs with very different attitudes towards

the fledgling state church, led to significant diversity of religious opinion and practice

within the established church. Despite significant pressure during the Elizabethan era to

move the state church in a more Calvinistic direction, the Queen's personal insistence on

a "middle way" between Catholicism and Reformed Protestantism was to remain the

¹ The Statutes at Large, Passed in the Parliaments Held in Ireland, vol 1 (Dublin: Published by George Grierson, Printer to the King's Most Excellent Majesty, 1786), 284. Henry A. Jefferies, "The Irish Parliament of 1560: The Anglican Reforms Authorised", Irish Historical Studies 26, no. 102 (November 1988).

status quo: to this day the Church of Ireland describes itself as both "Catholic and Reformed".²

After the Civil War and Commonwealth, the established church lost its special position under the law and the BCP was replaced with the *Directory of Public Worship*, it was necessary officially to reinstate the BCP, and a new edition was duly authorised in England under the Act of Uniformity of 1662. An equivalent law was passed in the Irish Parliament in 1665.³ The 1662 BCP was more divisive than its predecessors, prompting a widespread feeling that the forms of worship it contained were too close to Catholicism or without solid scriptural justification. The most significant voices raised in dissent against the 1662 BCP were those of the Presbyterians, followers of a form of the Reformed theology of John Calvin characterised by their distinctive mode of church government (assemblies of elected elders). Presbyterians represented the majority religion in Scotland and had supported the Crown's forces in the Cromwellian Wars, and as a consequence, Presbyterian leaders had been consulted during the process of putting together the new prayer book. In 1661, Puritan and Presbyterian leaders had met with bishops of the established church to discuss revisions to the new BCP, but the bishops largely ignored the objections of the other side.⁴ When only the most minor concessions to the Nonconformist position were ratified by the Crown the following year, those clergy who supported Presbyterianism left the established church en masse. They were followed

² Church of Ireland website (<u>https://www.ireland.anglican.org/our-faith/what-we-believe</u>; accessed 25 March 2022).

³ 17 & 18 Cha. 2 c. 6. The Statutes at Large, vol. 3, 139–150.

⁴ "Savoy Conference" in *The Concise Oxford Dictionary of the Christian Church*, ed. E. A. Livingstone (Oxford University Press, 2013; online edition 2014; http://www.oxfordreference.com/view/10.1093/acref/9780199659623.001.0001/acref-9780199659623-e-5158). A useful if colourful summary of the various objections and rebukes presented at the Savoy Conference can be found in Percy Dearmer, *Everyman's History of the Prayerbook* (London: Mowbray, 1912), 114–125.

by Baptists, Quakers, Congregationalists, and others. These principled defectors from the state church quickly became known as the Dissenters.

This chapter examines the worship music of the Presbyterians and the Baptists in Dublin in the early eighteenth century. These groups are sometimes termed the "Old Dissenters" due to their seventeenth-century origins, as contrasted with the eighteenth-century Dissenting groups discussed below (chapter 3).⁵ It examines several tunebooks associated with the Presbyterian and Baptist communities in Dublin, and compares the tunes used by these communities with those in use in the established church. The connections which thus emerge between Protestant worship music and sociopolitical identity are further demonstrated by contrast with the example of the Quakers, who at this point in their history had no worship music at all.

2.1 The "Old Dissenters" in Dublin

Directly after the Restoration, when memories of the Civil War were still very fresh, harsh restrictions were imposed upon all those who disassociated themselves from the official state church, Catholics, Dissenters, and followers of other religions and none. The Corporation Act of 1661, for example, prohibited anyone who would not take Communion from holding public office in England, and the Conventicle Act forbade unauthorised meetings for worship (for example, meetings in private houses). This situation changed, however, following the Williamite Wars and the accession to the

⁵ See, for example, Ruth Watts, *Gender, Power and the Unitarians in England, 1760–1860* (New York: Longman, 1998), 15.

⁶ 13 Cha. 2 St. 2 c. 1; 16 Cha. 2 c. 4.

throne of William of Orange, who hailed from the Netherlands and privately had Calvinist leanings. In 1689 the Toleration Act was passed, officially granting Dissenters freedom of worship in England provided that they took a modified Oath of Allegiance. This included the right openly to operate their own places of worship, as long as they were registered as Dissenting meeting houses. It also allowed Dissenters to hold public office provided they swore the Oath of Abjuration, disavowing all association with the Pope. Catholics, along with Jews, atheists and nontrinitarians, were explicitly excluded from the provisions Act. In this way, Dissenters remained a step above Catholics on the legal and social hierarchy.

The history of dissent and nonconformity in Ireland has been described as "complicated and confusing", an assessment borne out by any attempt to understand the complex position the Dissenters occupied in the social fabric of eighteenth-century Dublin. Even the concrete details of their existence, such as their numbers, are difficult to pin down, as official censuses were not taken in the city before 1821. The estimate of the Earl of Orrery in 1666, however, that "Scotch presbyters and other sectaries" outnumbered members of the established church in Ireland by a ratio of two to one, is likely highly exaggerated. One of the most useful resources in tracing the extent of nonconformity in Dublin is the *Exact Survey* of the city produced by the Huguenot mapmaker John Rocque in 1756, upon which he carefully marked Dissenting meeting houses alongside the city's parish churches and Catholic chapels. Rocque's dedication to

⁷ 1 Will & Mary c. 18.

⁸ Kenneth Ferguson, "Rocque's Map and the History of Nonconformity in Dublin: A Search for Meeting Houses", *Dublin Historical Record* 58, no. 2 (2005): 132.

⁹ Patrick Fagan, "The Population of Dublin in the Eighteenth Century with Particular Reference to the Proportions of Protestants and Catholics", *Eighteenth-Century Dublin* 6 (1991): 149.

¹⁰ Clarke Huston Irwin, *A History of Presbyterianism in Dublin and the South and West of Ireland* (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1890), 10.

¹¹ John Roque, An Exact Survey of the City and Suburbs of Dublin in Which is Express'd the Ground Plot of all Publick Buildings Dwelling Houses, Ware Houses, Stables, Court Yards, &c (1756). F-Pn GE DD-2987 (2657 B).

rendering every building individually also means that those meeting houses which had by that time fallen out of use can still be located, for the majority of them remained standing, either empty or turned to other purposes. ¹² Rocque's map shows that while there were particular "centres" of nonconformity in the city—the area around St Patrick's cathedral, for example, which contained a high concentration of meeting houses—in general the Dissenters were not confined to particular areas but lived and worshipped throughout the city. In total sixteen buildings marked as meeting houses are shown on the *Exact Survey*: seven Presbyterian meeting houses (marked "PMH"), three French churches ("FC"), two Quaker meeting houses ("QMH"), one "Anabaptist" meeting house ("AB"), one "Dutch Church" ("DC") and one meeting house each for the Moravians and Methodists ("MH"). There is also one additional "MH" marking on a house in Skinners' Alley that was successively used by Baptists, Moravians and Methodists, although it was no longer in use in Rocque's time (see 2.4, 3.2 and 3.3 below). 13 Ten years later, in 1766, Rocque's enumeration of meeting houses was corroborated (or perhaps simply reiterated) by Walter Harris, who wrote that Dublin boasted "three churches for French and one for Dutch protestants, seven meeting-houses for protestant dissenters, two for quakers, one for Methodists, one for anabaptists, one for Moravians, and sixteen Roman catholick chapels" (Harris did not count the empty Skinners' Alley house). 14 Hence, the number of Dissenting meeting houses in the city was equal to that of Catholic chapels, as far as Harris was aware. This is a reflection not of the relative population size of these two groups, for in Rocque's time around fifty per cent of Dublin's inhabitants were Catholic, but of the high social visibility of Dissent and its strong presence as part of Dublin's

¹² See Ferguson, "Rocque's Map", for a thorough study of all the meeting houses marked thereon.

¹³ Ferguson, "Rocque's Map", 132.

¹⁴ The History and Antiquities of the City of Dublin, from the Earliest Accounts (Dublin: Printed for Laurence Flinn, in Castle-Street, and James Williams, in Skinner-Row, 1766), 380. Harris's reference to the "Dutch protestants" in fact refers to the Lutheran church on Poolbeg street (see 4.3 below).

cityscape in the eighteenth century.¹⁵ It is also striking that there were approximately equal numbers of parish churches, non-conforming meeting houses, and Catholic chapels in the city in the mid-eighteenth century.

Legally, Dublin's Dissenters were in a slightly less advantageous position than their English counterparts at the beginning of the eighteenth century. The Irish equivalent to the Toleration Act was not passed until 1719, a reflection of continuing wariness of non-conformity in a city where a third of the population (at that time) were Catholic. ¹⁶ The 1704 "Act to prevent the Further Growth of Popery", which required those seeking public office to pass the "sacramental test" by receiving communion in the established church, also worsened the position of Nonconformists, complicating the path to toleration. ¹⁷ It is therefore unsurprising that most of the meeting houses shown on Rocque's map were simple, unadorned buildings, and many were set discreetly back from main thoroughfares. In this they closely resemble the Catholic chapels of the same era. ¹⁸ In social terms, however, Presbyterians generally suffered little discrimination in the city, the civil authorities generally turning a blind eye to Nonconformist activities even before the 1719 Toleration Act came into force. ¹⁹ For example, despite the legal restrictions on Dissenters' holding public office, at least three Nonconformists, including the highly influential merchant and property developer Humphrey Jervis, held the office of Lord

¹⁵ Fagan, "Population of Dublin", 156.

¹⁶ Dublin's Catholic population increased dramatically as the eighteenth century progressed, but even as early as 1715 approximately one third of the inhabitants were Catholic. Fagan, "Population of Dublin", 149. ¹⁷ 2 Anne c. 6. A. W. Godfrey Brown, "Boyse, Joseph (1660–1728), Presbyterian Minister and Religious Writer", ODNB (23 September 2004). "Test Act", in Encyclopedia Britannica Online (https://www.britannica.com/topic/test-act).

¹⁸ Ferguson, "Rocque's Map", 136ff.

¹⁹ Steven C. Smyrl, *Dictionary of Dublin Dissent: Dublin's Protestant Dissenting Meeting Houses 1660–1920* (Dublin: A. & A. Farmar, 2009), 17–18.

Mayor of Dublin prior to the passing of the Act.²⁰ The Act itself, in Smyrl's words, "simply copper-fastened what had been *de facto* toleration for some years previous".²¹

2.2 Dublin Presbyterians and their Music

2.2.1 Dublin's Presbyterian community

The Presbyterians were by far the largest and most significant Dissenting Protestant group in Dublin, and indeed in Ireland as a whole, throughout the long eighteenth century. In 1825, the topographical writer George Newenham Wright described them as "the most ancient and respectable of the Dissenters in Dublin". ²² Even before Presbyterianism existed as a separate religious body from that of the established church, a Presbyterian influence could be felt in Trinity College, where the first regular Provost and the first two elected Fellows of the College were Presbyterian in sympathy. ²³ As an organised group, Presbyterians took root in Dublin around the mid-seventeenth century. The urban historian Kenneth Ferguson comments that in the early eighteenth century "Presbyterianism was the religion of a sizeable, wealthy and enlightened section of Dublin's mercantile class". ²⁴ Since 1691, the Presbyterian clergy of Ireland had also been in receipt of state financial aid known as the *regium donum*. ²⁵

²⁰ David Dickson, *Dublin: The Making of a Capital City* (London: Profile Books, 2015), 89–90.

²¹ Smyrl, *Dictionary of Dublin Dissent*, 4.

²² An Historical Guide to the City of Dublin. 2nd edn (London: Printed for Baldwin, Cradock, and Joy, 1825; reprinted by Four Courts Press, 1980), 97.

²³ Irwin, A History of Presbyterianism in Dublin, 3.

²⁴ "Rocque's Map", 136.

²⁵ Irwin, A History of Presbyterianism in Dublin, 14–15.

Irish Presbyterianism originated from two separate sources, and during the period under consideration can be divided into two "branches". The first branch had come to Ireland in the early seventeenth century, when large numbers of Scots were planted in Ulster by James I in an attempt to bolster the loyalist population of what was a historically rebellious province. 26 There were three congregations associated with Scottish Presbyterianism in Dublin during the eighteenth century. The first was in Bull Alley, and later moved to Plunket Street; a seceding group from this congregation formed a separate meeting at Mary's Abbey (Capel Street) in 1672. This congregation later itself split, forming the Ushers' Quay congregation around 1707. The Plunket Street congregation merged with that of Usher's Quay in 1773.27 These "Scottish" Presbyterians were affiliated with the Synod of Ulster, established in 1690.²⁸ The second branch, which could be termed "English Presbyterianism", developed from what had mainly been Puritan congregations settled during the Commonwealth period. This group had meeting houses at Wood Street, Cook Street, and New Row. The Wood Street congregation moved to Great Strand Street in 1764, and the Cook Street congregation amalgamated with it in 1787. The New Row congregation moved to Eustace Street in 1724. There was also a small group which seceded from the "Scottish" Capel Street meeting but was more closely aligned with the second branch; this group met at Stafford Street and at a second site at Mary's Abbey between 1738 and 1762 (and is therefore marked on Rocque's map, despite being short-lived).²⁹ Although for a period of a few decades at the beginning of the eighteenth century, the majority of the congregations in Dublin, both "Scottish" and "English", allied themselves into an association known as the "Presbytery of Dublin", the

²⁶ Smyrl, *Dictionary of Dublin Dissent*, 14–15.

²⁷ Smyrl, *Dictionary of Dublin Dissent*, 18.

²⁸ Ferguson, "Rocque's Map", 150.

²⁹ Smyrl, *Dictionary of Dublin Dissent*, 40. Note there is some disagreement with Ferguson here, who groups the seceding Mary's Abbey congregation under the Synod of Ulster. Ferguson, "Rocque's Map", 150.

"Scottish" congregations gradually ceased to attend this meeting as they became more strictly controlled by the Synod of Ulster.³⁰ Although the relative congregation sizes of these different meeting houses is not known, Ferguson notes that in the early nineteenth century the numbers in the Mary's Abbey and Strand Street congregations were approximately equal.³¹

Only one of these eighteenth-century meeting houses has survived to the present day: the Eustace Street meeting house, which is now the Ark arts centre. It was built around 1728, and preserves its eighteenth-century facade ("a handsome essay in retardataire Carolean classicism"), with its distinctive large windows. ³² This was a fashionable building, "light and airy"; a contemporary Quaker commented on the "vanity" of its design. ³³ The appearance of the city's many other meeting houses must be reconstructed from documentary evidence. The meeting house on Strand Street was described by Wright, when the building was still standing, as having a "spacious, but quite plain" interior and a simple brick exterior "without any ornament"; it was situated "in a retired street ... and receded a few yards", similar to the Eustace Street house, which is also set back slightly from the main street. ³⁴ A drawing of the church reproduced by Ferguson shows a plain building with large windows; the upper floor windows appear more elaborate, and it is possible the main hall was on this level. ³⁵ Wright's *Guide* also describes a "Poor-school" attached to the meeting house, "where 28 boys are clothed, fed

³⁰ Smyrl, *Dictionary of Dublin Dissent*, 17.

³¹ Ferguson, "Rocque's Map", 163. There were also large numbers of Seceders meeting in Dublin by 1835, but Irwin claims that in the eighteenth century their numbers were far smaller. Irwin, *History of Presbyterianism in Dublin*, 216.

³² Christine Casey, *Dublin: The City within the Grand and Royal Canals and the Circular Road with the Phoenix Park*, Buildings of Ireland series, ed. Nikolaus Pevsner and Alistair Rowan (London: Yale University Press, 2005), 430.

³³ Ferguson, "Rocque's Map", 136.

³⁴ Wright, *Historical Guide*, 28.

³⁵ Ferguson, "Rocque's Map", 152.

and educated, and afterwards apprenticed to different trades". Similar charity schools were attached to the Eustace Street, Capel Street, and Usher's Quay meeting houses by the early nineteenth century. 37

2.2.2 Presbyterian worship music

Presbyterians inherited many of their views on church music from their close cousins, the Calvinists, and Calvin himself had been very clear on what types of music he considered appropriate for worship. In the preface to the 1542 edition of the Genevan psalter, which he took a great interest in and worked on personally, Calvin wrote that music was a divine gift and so had to be handled carefully to avoid "soiling and contaminating it". Music, or more accurately singing, he wrote, had the power to "move hearts" and "bend this way and that the morals of men", and so if properly employed it was a highly beneficial force for both the praise of God and the edification of congregations. The only texts he deemed appropriate for this purpose were those that had been directly provided by God; in other words, the book of psalms, plus a few other Biblical passages which could be interpreted as having originally been sung, such as the Song of Simeon (nunc dimittis). Of these, it was the book of psalms that was to become the centre of the Reformed musical tradition, because, in Calvin's words, it contained "all the griefs, sorrows, fears, misgivings, hopes, cares, anxieties, in short, all the troublesome emotions with which the

³⁶ Wright, *Historical Guide*, 98.

³⁷ Wright, *Historical Guide*, 99.

³⁸ John Calvin, Preface to the 1542 Genevan Psalter, quoted in Jonathan Willis, *Church Music and Protestantism in Post-Reformation England: Discourses, Sites and Identities* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2010), 49.

³⁹ Quoted in Charles Garside Jr, "Calvin's Preface to the Psalter: A Reappraisal", *The Musical Quarterly* 37, no. 4 (October 1951): 570.

minds of men are wont to be agitated".⁴⁰ Calvin also described in detail how these texts ought to be sung: metrically, in unison, without accompanying instruments, and with one note for each syllable of the text—no melismata or other ornaments were to be used—to ensure that the text could be clearly understood.⁴¹

Eighteenth-century Presbyterians continued to follow these principles in their worship music, restricting themselves almost entirely to the singing of psalms. These were supplemented by occasional "paraphrases", metrical settings of other passages from scripture which were the spiritual successors of the non-psalm texts included in the Genevan Psalter. Hymns were rare in Presbyterian practice, and it was not until the second half of the nineteenth century that the Church of Scotland issued an authorised hymnal for use in public worship. Organs were not introduced into Presbyterian churches until the late eighteenth century in England, and even later in Scotland and Wales. 42

For Scottish Presbyterians, the principal source of psalm texts was the Scottish Psalter, the original version of which was first published in 1564. Like the *Whole Booke of Psalmes*, it was derived from the Anglo-Genevan psalm books. ⁴³ The 1564 Scottish psalter contained 105 tunes, of which forty-two were Genevan in origin. The extensive variety of metres in the original Scottish psalter, designed to fit the French Genevan melodies, was regarded as a drawback, however, and as early as 1601 a revision was proposed by the General Assembly. ⁴⁴ The last edition of the original Scottish Psalter with music was published in 1640. During the Commonwealth Period, the Westminster

⁴⁰ John Calvin, *A Commentary on the Psalms*, trans. Arthur Golding, quoted in J. R. Watson, *The English Hymn: A Critical and Historical Study* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1999), 44.

⁴¹ Paul Westermayer, "Theology and Music for Luther and Calvin", in *Calvin and Luther: The Continuing Relationship*, ed. R. Ward Holder (Gottingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2013), 52.

⁴² Andreas Marti and Bert Polman, "Reformed and Presbyterian Church Music", GMO (20 January 2001). ⁴³ Watson, *The English* Hymn, 43.

⁴⁴ Nicholas Temperley, Howard Slenk, Jan R. Luth, Margaret Munck, John M. Barkley and R. Tosh, "Psalms, Metrical", GMO (16 October 2013).

Assembly and subsequently the General Assembly put together a new version of the psalter, ostensibly intended as an amalgamation of the English and Scottish psalters. The resulting *Psalms of David in Meeter* was an amalgamation of texts by Francis Rous, King James I of England (and VI of Scotland), the Bay Psalm Book of the New England colony, and revisions introduced by the Westminster Assembly. This new Scottish Psalter was adopted by the Church of Scotland in 1650, and is used to the present day. In contrast to the huge variety of tunes present in the 1564 Psalter, the 1650 version contained no printed tunes at all; by the end of the seventeenth century, twelve "common tunes" were the only ones in general use in the Scottish church.⁴⁵

Several editions of the Scottish Psalter were printed in Dublin during the eighteenth century, including one by the Scottish expatriate George Grierson. And None of them contains any printed tunes. Some of the "common tunes" do appear in Dublin tunebooks during the eighteenth century (see 2.3 below), but sporadically rather than collected together as in late seventeenth-century Scottish sources. Almost all of the texts in the 1650 Scottish psalter were in common metre; some psalms were rendered in two versions, using two different metres, but even including these second versions, only thirteen psalms are in metres other than common (four long, four short, and five "irregular"). It would therefore have been quite straightforward to sing the Scottish Psalter texts to other tunes from the Dublin repertory (see Appendix 1).

⁴⁵ Temperley *et al.*, "Psalms, metrical", GMO. As we have seen, the existence of any particular tunes in print by no means necessarily guarantees that they were widely sung; the actual commonality of the Scottish tunes, however, is a question beyond the scope of this study.

⁴⁶ The psalms of David in metre, Newly Translated ... Allowed by the authority of the General Assembly of the Kirk in Scotland (Dublin: printed by and for Geo. Grierson, Printer to the King's Most Excellent Majesty, at the King's Arms and Two Bibles in Essex-Street, 1745). GB-Lbl 3061.de.42(2). C. J. Woods, "Grierson, George", DIB (October 2009). Information about other editions of the Scottish psalter obtained from ESTC.

⁴⁷ Temperley *et al.*, "Psalms, Metrical", GMO.

In terms of performance practice, Presbyterians largely continued to follow the guidelines that had been set down in the *Directory of Public Worship* during the Cromwellian era. The *Directory* abhorred set liturgy, instead recommending a general order of service in which singing was to take between the scripture reading and the prayers, and before the final benediction. In Scotland, and presumably also in the "Scottish" congregations of Dublin, services generally deviated somewhat from this pattern, instead beginning with the singing of a psalm, followed by prayers, scripture readings and a hourlong sermon, and concluding with a closing psalm and benediction. ⁴⁸ Instruments were rejected in line with Calvinistic principles. Both "Scottish" and "English" Presbyterians practised "lining out" (see 1.2.4 above); the Scottish church, having only reluctantly agreed to adopt the practice at the Westminster Assembly, then generally held on to it into the nineteenth century. In certain isolated congregations in Scotland, lining out was still practised in very recent times, along with some of the old "common tunes". ⁴⁹

2.2.3 The Dublin Presbyterian position: Joseph Boyse versus William King

For all Protestants, church music was an important and sensitive matter on which it was important to assume a clear position, but exactly what that position should be was open to debate. By examining one such conflict of opinion which took place in Ireland in the 1690s between representatives of the conforming and Dissenting communities, it is possible to gain insights into the prevailing attitudes on church music on both sides of the confessional divide. The central figure of the controversy, and in some ways its initiator, was the Presbyterian minister Joseph Boyse. Born in Leeds to a Puritan father in 1660,

⁴⁸ William B. Bynum, "The Genuine Presbyterian Whine': Presbyterian Worship in the Eighteenth Century", *American Presbyterians* 74, no. 3 (Fall 1996): 157–159.

⁴⁹ Temperley et al., "Psalms, Metrical", GMO.

Boyse became interested in church affairs early in life. During this period the Civil War and Commonwealth were still recent memories, and Nonconformists were viewed with suspicion and intolerance in England; Boyse accordingly took a position in Amsterdam, where he worked at a Brownist chapel but remained convinced of his Presbyterian principles. Boyse was eventually persuaded to come to Dublin in 1683 to serve as colleague to Dr Daniel Williams, the minister of the Wood Street congregation. When Williams resigned in 1687, Boyse took on his ministerial role, and retained it until his death in 1728 at the age of sixty-eight. Boyse appears to have been a popular and well-respected figure in Dublin society, known to his contemporaries as "the Great Mr Boyse"; in 1701, well before the passing of the Irish Toleration Act, he was chosen to compose the Latin inscription for the pedestal of the equestrian statue of William III that formerly stood in College Green, an indication of Boyse's high social standing despite his committed Nonconformist beliefs. 50

Boyse was forthright with his opinions and known for his spirited defences of Presbyterian beliefs and practices, both from the pulpit and in print. One of his regular adversaries was William King, who was the chancellor of St Patrick's Cathedral at the time of his first run-in with Boyse and subsequently became Bishop of Derry and later Archbishop of Dublin. Having already argued in 1688 on the subject of Dissenting theology and the definition of the true church, they crossed swords again in 1694 after King publicly accused Dissenters in the diocese of Derry of worshipping in a fashion that had no scriptural justification. ⁵¹ Boyse responded with an extensive treatise which, despite beginning with an assurance that he had no wish to argue with King for a second

⁵⁰ Brown, "Boyse, Joseph", ODNB.

⁵¹ William King, *A discourse concerning the inventions of men in the worship of God*, 2nd edn (Dublin: printed by Andrew Crook, their Majesties Printer, and are to be sold by Eliphal Dobson at the Stationers-Arms in Castle-Street and the rest of the Booksellers, 1694). IRL-Dtc GG.hh.21. For the former debate, see Brown, "Boyse, Joseph", ODNB.

time, is over one hundred pages in length and dissects King's arguments in excruciating detail. Second Edition of his work and a further "Admonition" to Boyse, to which Boyse again responded with a "Vindication" of his *Remarks* in 1695. The controversy even attracted a third participant, Robert Craghead, a Presbyterian minister from Derry who chimed in in support of Boyse. One of the many aspects of public worship under discussion in these treatises was church music: namely, to what extent it was scripturally justifiable, what forms (if any) it ought to take, and whether instruments should be involved. In combination, these documents provide an invaluable insight into not only Presbyterian church music in the seventeenth century, but also the established church traditions to which it was being compared and contrasted, and the attitudes of church figures on both sides of the divide to the worship traditions of their opposite numbers.

From the outset, King was clear about the kind of music that was most suitable for church use: the singing of psalms in prose, preferably antiphonally: "by way of Responses, or Answering", after the example of "the blessed Angels and glorified Saints: [...] *And one cryed unto another, Holy, Holy, Holy is the Lord of Hosts*". 55 He argued that metrical psalm settings have "no certain scriptural warrant", and that the tradition of having the priest and people "answering one another" is "one of the most Ancient we find in Scripture"; not only that, but it is a practical measure, because some of the Psalms are so long that "no one Man's Voice could hold out until the end." 56 He also supported the use

⁵² Joseph Boyse, *Remarks on a late discourse of William Lord Bishop of Derry; concerning the inventions of men in the worship of God.* (Dublin: Printed for Eliphal Dobson, Matthew Gun, and Patrick Campbel, Booksellers in Dublin, 1694). US-WS 166-806q.

⁵³ Brown, "Boyse, Joseph", ODNB.

⁵⁴ Robert Craghead, *An answer to a late book intituled, A discourse concerning the inventions of men in the worship of God* (Edinburgh: printed by the heirs of Andrew Anderson, printer to Their Most Excellent Majesties, 1694). GB-En Cwn.484.

⁵⁵ King, *Discourse*, 10; the passage cited is Isaiah 6:3.

⁵⁶ King, *Discourse*, 5, 12–13.

of instruments in church, citing, as was common in this argument, Psalm 150 (see 1.2.1 above). King stated that it was proper for everyone in the congregation to sing the psalms and hymns, if they were able, but if they were not able they should be permitted to say them instead; he exhorted those unable to sing to make greater efforts to learn to read or to memorise the psalms and hymns. He also thoroughly condemned the practice of "lining out", which in his view caused

a great interruption to the Musick, and to the understanding of the Psalm, by breaking the sense of it ... taken up to supply the negligence and lazieness of People, who will not now, as formerly, take pains to get Psalms by Heart, or so much as procure Books, or learn to read them. ⁵⁷

In his *Remarks*, Boyse took exception to almost everything proposed by King.⁵⁸ He observed that the psalms were originally written in the Hebrew style of poetry which, while it is not metrical and does not rhyme, is quite distinct from prose; therefore, rendering them in metre stays true to the spirit of the original. This was a common early modern argument in support of metrical psalms.⁵⁹ The use of metrical forms also had the practical benefit of making it far easier for a congregation to remember the texts. Like King, Boyse was opposed to practices which broke up the text and obscured the meaning; the importance of not allowing the style of the music to reduce the clarity of the text had been of a central concern of all Protestants since the Reformation. Unlike King, however, Boyse levelled this criticism not at "lining out", but at antiphonal singing. Instead, Boyse argued, the psalms should be sung straight through by the congregation, to keep the text coherent. On the subject of 'lining out', he conceded that while it did break up the text to some extent, this was a necessary accommodation to assist those of the congregation who

⁵⁷ King, *Discourse*, 22.

⁵⁸ Boyse, *Remarks*.

⁵⁹ Watson, The English Hymn, 45.

could not read or remember the tunes—those whom King had exhorted simply to make a greater effort to commit them to memory, and not to be "lazie". To Boyse, it was more important that everyone was involved in the singing than that the end result was particularly melodious. Finally, he stressed that ideally, no instruments ought to be used in churches, as he found little scriptural justification for their use; Psalm 150 and other similar examples, to him, appeared as descriptions of Hebrew practice rather than templates to be followed in the modern Christian church. He conceded, however, that "if any use of organs be allowable, 'tis that in the parish church of directing the people into the tune of the psalms they sing". ⁶⁰ In his contribution to the debate, Robert Craghead largely agreed with Boyse, but took a stronger stance against the use of instruments, in particular King's quoting of Psalm 150 as a justification for the use of organs: he commented that if that Psalm were to be taken as a template, then it would be equally scripturally valid to use harps and cymbals during services, a suggestion which he evidently found laughable. ⁶¹

On the face of it, this debate establishes two very different forms of worship music with very little common ground between them. King's idealised vision of Protestant worship music is of a choir singing the psalms antiphonally in prose, accompanied by an organ and potentially other instruments, while Boyse's (supported by Craghead) is of unaccompanied singing of metrical psalms, assisted if necessary by the parish clerk "lining out" the text. As we have seen, however, the description of established church music given here by King bears little resemblance to the contemporary practice of the parish churches, which much more closely resembled the picture of "Presbyterian" practice drawn here by Boyse.

⁶⁰ Boyse, *Remarks*, 30.

⁶¹ Craghead, An answer to the late book, 17.

Two observations can be made about this debate in the light of its disconnect from the contemporary reality of worship music practice. The first is that, assuming Boyse's description of Presbyterian worship to be accurate, the music of the Presbyterian meeting house and that of the parish church were practically identical at the close of the seventeenth century. This was particularly the case in parishes without organs, which at this point was still the situation of the majority of Dublin parish churches (see 1.3.1 above).

Secondly, however, the opinions expressed by King in this debate illustrate a critical difference between the Established and Dissenting positions on worship music, and one which was to shape the directions in which the two traditions developed as the century progressed. For Presbyterians like Boyse and Craghead, the unaccompanied singing of metrical psalms was a highly satisfactory form of worship music, in line with Calvinist principles. Even "lining out", while not ideal, was a positive practice if it encouraged the less able members of the congregation to take part in the singing. For King, on the other hand, these practices, even though they were commonplace in the established parish churches, were very far from the ideal. The Restoration-era established church, as we have seen, aspired towards an "improved" church music that approached the cathedral style: all churches should now aspire to be like cathedrals.⁶²

It should also be noted that William King was a high-ranking member of the established church hierarchy, and while his views accord with those expressed by church elites in contemporary England, the extent to which the majority of churchgoers may have shared his opinions is not clear. There may, therefore, be another disconnect articulated in this debate: between the higher ranks of the established church as personified by King, and the forms of worship preferred by the typical parish churchgoer, which more closely

⁶² Nicholas Temperley, *The Music of the English Parish Church* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1979), 101.

aligned with the Presbyterian position. The complexities of extrapolating contemporary attitudes from a debate such as this symptomise the complex relationship between Dissent and Establishment during this period, as well as the many disconnects that existed between musical theory and musical practice.

2.3 Early Eighteenth-Century Tune Sources

2.3.1 The tunebooks of Thomas Smith

In the 1690s and 1700s several tunebooks were printed in Dublin under the name of "Thomas Smith". Establishing the exact chronology of these tunebooks would be straightforward enough were it not that one of them, known only from a unique copy now in the British Library, lacks its title page. ⁶³ The title, publisher, place of publication, and, most critically, date, are therefore unknown. The British Library metadata posits a London origin for the volume; the HTI, however, where it is identified with the source code *UC 4, classes it as a Dublin publication. A Dublin origin is supported both by the volume's introduction, which is subscribed "Thomas Smith", and the evidence of the tune contents, which strongly suggest that this is the Thomas Smith known to have been involved in the publication of several other tunebooks in Dublin. It should be noted, however, that even if these two Smiths are indeed the same person, the appearance of publications by Smith in Dublin does not necessarily mean he was himself based there.

⁶³ Thomas Smith, [An Edition of the Psalms, in the Version of Sternhold and Hopkins, with Melodies. The "Instructions concerning the Gammut" Signed: Thomas Smith.] ([Dublin], [1700]). HTI: *UC 4. GB-Lbl A.1233.x.

The texts in *UC 4 provide some indications of when it may have been published.

The book contains selections from both the Sternhold and Hopkins "Old Version", which

was in widespread use in the seventeenth century, and the Tate and Brady New Version,

which was published in 1696; from this, the HTI concludes that its publication must post-

date that of the New Version.⁶⁴ The British Library metadata posits a publication date of

1700.65 As we shall see, the relationship between the tune contents of this book and two

other collections produced around the same time suggests that *UC 4 was the earliest of

the three, and therefore was published before 1699 (see 2.3.2 below). Accordingly, this

source will be identified hereinafter as "Smith1".

Smith1 contains twenty-three tunes, the majority in common metre, of which

several may have their earliest citation in this book. Three tunes appear to originate

entirely with Smith1, having no previous citations in other sources even in variant forms.

These are "Bristol" [583], "Ely" [584], and "Oxford" [585]. "Bristol" [583] (see Ex. 5)

appears in only one other source, a tunebook by Smith published in Dublin in 1699

("Smith2"—see below). "Ely" [584] has fewer individual citations (for it only appears

once in Smith1, and once in Smith2) but travelled further afield: it can be found in one

other publication, Samuel Shenton's Devout Singer's Guide, published in London in 1719,

in which it appears under the name "Handley" (see Ex. 6). 66 Shenton's book displays

some crossover with the tune contents of Smith's books and the other Dublin sources, and

so it is possible that Smith1—or possibly Smith2—made its way as far as England.

The tune named "Oxford" [585] is of particular interest, as it appears only in Irish

sources, but within that restricted set it is very common: it can be found in all four of the

6

⁶⁴ HTI entry for Source: *UC 4.

⁶⁶ HTI entry for Source: ShenSDSG 4.

⁶⁵ GB-Lbl A.1233.x.

sources printed in the period 1690–1740 (see Ex. 7). The tune itself is distinctive; the hypothesis proposed by the HTI, that it is derived from the "Lord's Prayer" tune [130a], seems highly likely given the similarities between the melodies (see Ex. 8). The Lord's Prayer tune first appeared in Sternhold's *Psalms* of 1560, and was itself derived from the German "Vater unser" tune by Martin Luther. "Lord's Prayer" [130a] and its "c" variant [130c] were common in English sources during the eighteenth century, including the various supplements to the *New Version*, but do not appear in any Irish books; the similar "Oxford" tune, with the same metre, may have served as a local alternative. ⁶⁷

In addition, there are several tune variants which have what appears to be their first citation in Smith1. The variant of "Ps. 119" which appears here is not the "a" variant [120a] but the more unusual "c" variant [120c]; either this or Smith2, discussed below, is its earliest appearance. The "j" variant of the sixteenth-century "Southwell" tune [269j] appears only in Irish sources (see Ex. 9). "Dublin" [271c] is a probable variant of the "Windsor" tune [271a] which also appears in this collection; this tune, as we shall see, appears frequently in the Dublin sources (see Ex. 10).

The earliest Dublin source of printed psalm tunes for which a reasonably definite publication date can be ascertained is a version of William Barton's *Psalms*, edited by Thomas Smith and published around 1699 by Brent and Powell.⁶⁸ *The Psalms of David in Metre* (hereinafter "Smith2") was one of the earliest music books ever printed in Ireland.⁶⁹ The exact publication date is uncertain; the Wing catalogue dates the book to 1697, but Brent and Powell were not based at the given address (Dick's Coffee House in

⁶⁷ See, for example, *A supplement to the new version of Psalms by N. Tate and N. Brady*. London: Printed by J. Heptinstall and sold by D. Brown, J. Wild and most booksellers, 1700. US-U 223.2 B471697.

⁶⁸ Thomas Smith, *The psalms of David in metre. Newly translated with amendments: by William Barton, M.A. and sett to the best Psalm-tunes in two parts, viz. treble and bass* (Dublin: Printed by J. Brent & S. Powell, at the back of Dick's Coffee House in Skinner-Row, and are to be sold by Peter Laurence at his shop in Bridge-Street, near the Old Bridge, [1699]). HTI: SmitTPD a. IRL-Dtc OLS 188.p.96.

⁶⁹ "Brent, John," *Dublin Music Trade* (http://dublinmusictrade.ie/node/33).

Skinner's Row) until 1698. Additionally, prior to 1699, Brent and Powell were in partnership with John Brocas, whose name does not appear on the title page. ⁷⁰ An advertisement for the book appeared in *The Lady's New Year's Gift* in 1699, so it was likely published some time that year, following Brocas's withdrawal from the business. ⁷¹ The book contains the complete psalter as translated by William Barton; this comprises 169 texts in total, some psalms being rendered multiple times in different metres. Accompanying these texts is a selection of nineteen tunes in various metres.

William Barton (1497/8–1678) was an English clergyman who had been driven out of his parish in Staffordshire by the cavaliers during the Civil War and who later worked in London and Leicester.⁷² His birthplace is unknown; Flood's claim that Barton was born in Dublin is unsubstantiated in other sources.⁷³ His version of the psalter was first published in 1644 and appeared in many subsequent revisions during the eighteenth century; in 1645 he petitioned the Westminster Assembly of Divines to recognise his psalms as the "official" version (in the manner the *New Version* would be recognised fifty years later), but he was unsuccessful. Nonetheless, his psalms remained popular even into the eighteenth century, especially with Nonconformist groups like the Presbyterians and Baptists.⁷⁴ He also wrote several books of hymns. Barton's psalms were popular in Ireland as well as Britain: he himself complained that 1,500 copies of his books had been "printed by stealth in England and carried over into Ireland".⁷⁵ Flood states that an edition

⁷⁰ M. Pollard, A Dictionary of the Dublin Book Trade, 1550–1800: based on the Records of the Guild of St Luke the Evangelist Dublin (London: Bibliographical Society, 2000), 469.

⁷¹ HTI entry for Source: SmitTPD a.

⁷² A. B. Grosart and D. K. Money, "Barton, William (1597/8–1678), Translator and Hymnologist", ODNB (23 September 2004).

⁷³ W. H. Grattan Flood, "Barton's Psalms (1698): The Earliest Known Dublin-Printed Music-Book", *The Journal of the Royal Society of Antiquaries of Ireland*, sixth series, 2, no. 3 (30 September 1912): 246.

⁷⁴ Flood's statement that Barton's psalms were popular among Nonconformist congregations in Dublin is discussed further in 2.4 below. Flood, "Barton's Psalms", 248–49.

⁷⁵ William Barton, *The Book of Psalms in Metre* (1691), quoted in Grosart and Money, "Barton, William", ODNB.

of some of Barton's psalms, without printed tunes, was printed in Ireland in 1697.⁷⁶ Smith's 1698 book, therefore, may have been in response to local interest in the Barton psalms, particularly if Flood's additional assertion that they were popular among the Dublin Baptists can be believed (see 2.4).

The first verse of each psalm is underlaid to a printed tune—just the melody is given, with no accompaniment parts—with the remaining verses printed beneath. The tunes are notated in minims only, with two minims to a bar; this layout corresponds poorly with the rhythm of the texts, which are mostly iambic, the stress falling on the second syllable. A set of bass parts is included at the back of the volume, which was not present in Smith1. In total there are nineteen distinct tunes to be found here; the majority are in common metre, while more unusual metres are deployed less frequently, following the metres used in the psalm texts. The "Ps. 124" tune [123a], for example, which has the metre 10.10.10.10, appears only once. The tune which appears most frequently of all is "St Mary's" [542a], an early-seventeenth-century tune that appears here twenty-six times (see Ex. 11); for comparison, the next most frequent, "London" [497b], appears only fifteen times (see Ex. 12). The tune correspondences between this book and the original edition of Barton's *Psalms* (1644) are not as close as might be expected: only three of the nineteen tunes appear in the same forms in both books ("Old Hundredth" [143a], "Ps. 113" [146a], and "Martyr's" [330a]), and a further five in variant forms (Smith gives "Ps. 51" [111c], "Ps. 119" [120c], "Southwell" [259j], "Windsor/Dublin" [271a/c], and "St David's" [379f]). 77 "Martyrs" [330a] and "London" [497b]" were both among the

⁷⁶ Flood, "Barton's Psalms", 247. I could not find any trace of this volume in the ESTC, although Joseph Ray did publish a collection of psalms by John Stearne in 1696 (ESTC: R172921).

⁷⁷ William Barton, *The Book of Psalms in metre close and proper to the Hebrew, smooth and pleasant for the metre, plain and easie for the tunes: with musical notes* (London: Printed by Matthew Simmons for the Companie of Stationers, 1644). HTI: BartWBPM a. GB-Lbl C.53.gg.33(1).

"common tunes" used in Scottish Presbyterian worship, as well as being included in the 1708 Supplement to the New Version.⁷⁸

Eighteen of the nineteen tunes from Smith2, including the rare variants, also appear in Smith1. The sole exception is the "Stanford" tune [591] which is unique to Smith2 (see Ex. 13). This close correspondence between the two volumes suggests that one volume was copied from the other (see 2.3.2 below). There are just five tunes in Smith1 which are not found in Smith2: "Shrewsbury" [166a], "Cambridge" [249a], "York" [331a], "Litchfield" [381b] and "Exeter" [397b]. The first three of these appear in Barton's *Psalms* of 1644, a possible source of tunes for Smith given that it was apparently circulating widely in Dublin in the mid- to late-eighteenth century. In total six of the tunes in Smith1 had appeared in identical forms in Barton's *Psalms*, and a further six had appeared in variant versions. Another possible source for the tunes in Smith1 is John Playford's 1671 *Psalms & Hymns ... on the common tunes*, which contains the other two tunes not found in Smith2 ("Lichfield" [381b] and "Exeter" [397b]), under the same names.⁷⁹

Three of the tune variants listed in the Hymn Tune Index for Smith2 are incorrect. The variant of the "Ps. 119" tune which appears in Smith2 is not, as recorded in the Hymn Tune Index, the original version [120a] but the distinctly different "c" variant already discussed. This makes Smith's psalters the earliest sources for this variant. Its appearance here is a useful indicator of the influence which these early tunebooks had upon later Irish sources, many of which include the same variant; by contrast, the "original" form of the tune [120a] does not appear in the Dublin sources at all (see Appendix 1). Similarly, the version of "Ps. 51" in Smith2 is also not the listed original [111a] but the "c" variant, as

⁷⁸ Temperley et al., "Psalms, Metrical", GMO.

⁷⁹ HTI entry for Source: PlayJPH.

in Smith1. "St David's" is listed in the HTI entry for Smith2 as [379c]; in fact it is the [379f] variant which appears in the book (see Ex. 14). Again, this makes Smith's psalters the earliest sources for this variant, as the earliest currently listed in the HTI is 1701, in Joseph Boyse's *Family Hymns* (see 2.3.2 below). These corrections reveal the tune contents of Smith's psalters to be closer in line with those of the other Dublin sources than previously appeared to be the case.

At the back of the Smith2 is a set of bass parts, one for each of the nineteen tunes. No composer is given for these basses, but it is possible that like the instructional introduction they are the work of Thomas Smith. Exactly what these basses were intended for is not stated; technically they are simplistic and even ungrammatical, filled with parallelisms and other egregious musical errors, and it is difficult to imagine a trained musician could have produced them (see Exx. 5–7, 9–14). Since the majority of Dissenters at this time rejected the use of instrumental music in worship and parish church organs were still rare, these basses may have been intended for domestic use.

At the front of the book is a detailed passage on how to sing in "fasola", a characteristically English solmization system also called "four-note solfa" because it omitted the Guidonian syllables *ut* and *re* as well as the more recent seventh syllable *si*. This was the most common method of music theory instruction in the eighteenth-century British Isles. It arranged the syllables *fa*, *sol*, *la* and *mi* on the "gamut" or grand staff; it was common for psalters of the early modern period to have a gamut printed at the front, and sometimes even an explanation of basic theory using the "fasola" method. The method was used in Day's edition of the *Whole Booke of Psalmes* (1570) and in Playford's *Introduction to the Skill of Music* (1655). By the eighteenth century, the fasola system

was very commonly used by teachers of psalmody, especially in the American colonies, where it developed into the shape-note system.⁸⁰

A second edition of Smith2 was published in 1706—not, however, by Brent and Powell but by John Brocas, their former partner, who left the partnership before the first edition was ever printed.⁸¹ Intriguingly, the music type used by Brocas appears identical to that used by Brent and Powell. Brocas's edition is largely identical to the first edition, despite the assertion on the title page that it has been "corrected and amended"; the music, at least, has not been changed. The musical introduction is also unchanged, save for the substitution of a different engraving of the gamut. The most substantial difference between the second and first edition is in the text portion: the main body of the volume now incorporates texts by Tate and Brady and John Patrick that were not present in the original edition. Patrick was a Church of England clergyman and staunch defender of the established church during the Jacobite period; his versions of the psalms, published at the end of the seventeenth century, were so popular that the 1708 Supplement to the New Version contained "tables of all the Psalms of the new, old, and Dr. Patrick's versions, directing what tunes are fitted for each Psalm". 82 This implies either that the book was now being targeted at a Conforming readership, or that its Nonconforming readership had no objection to the use of texts from the *New Version*; either implication supports the idea of a "common repertory" of Protestant psalmody (see 2.3.3 and 2.4 below). Few copies of the Brocas edition have survived; only eight are listed in the ESTC, and none has yet

⁸⁰ Bernarr Rainbow, "Fasola", GMO (20 January 2001).

⁸¹ Thomas Smith, *The psalms of David in metre. Newly translated with Amendments by William Barton, M.A., and set to the Best Psalm-Tunes ... The Second Edition, Corrected and Amended. With the Basses* (Dublin: Printed by J. Brocas, for Elip. Dobson, Tho. Servant, and Peter Lawrence, 1706). HTI: SmitTPD c. IRL-Dtc OLS 188.p.97.

⁸² Stuart Handley, "Patrick, John (bap. 1632, d. 1695), Church of England Clergyman and Religious Controversialist", ODNB (3 January 2008). A Supplement to the New Version of Psalms by Dr. Brady and Mr. Tate ... the sixth edition, corrected; and much enlarg'd: with the addition of ... near 30 new Tunes. London: In the Savoy: printed by John Nutt; and sold by James Holland, at the Bible and Ball, at the West-End of St. Paul's, 1708. HTI: *TS TatB 6a. GB-Lbl 3091.de.6(1).

been digitised. One of the two copies in Trinity College library carries the inscription "Mary Weld 1727 May 7th" on its title page.⁸³ The Weld family were notable figures in the Dublin Nonconformist community in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries: both Nathaniel Weld (1660–1730) and his son Isaac (d. 1778) were ministers of the New Row Presbyterian congregation. Another Isaac (d. 1824), Nathaniel's grandson, held a lucrative position as a customs official in the late eighteenth century.⁸⁴

A note in the HTI maintains that a further edition of Smith2 was printed some time between 1699 and 1706, and estimates 1702. 85 The British Library catalogue lists yet another publication by Thomas Smith, "musician, of Dublin" (the catalogue's description), entitled *An introduction to the singing of psalms ... Set to the best tunes that are now taught and used in all, or most of the churches in England or Ireland*; it also claims to be "a more plain and useful method than hath been formerly published". 86 This book was printed in Dublin by Brent and Powell in 1700 and sold by Peter Lawrence, just as Smith2 was, as well as "by the Author", implying that Thomas Smith may have worked as a bookseller. Although the physical description in the catalogue does not mention any music, it is possible this is the further edition noted in the HTI, under a slightly different title.

2.3.2 Joseph Boyse's Sacramental Hymns (1693) and Family Hymns (1701)

Around the same time that Joseph Boyse engaged in the debate with William King

⁸³ IRL-Dtc OLS 188.p.97.

⁸⁴ Bridget Hourican, "Weld, Isaac", DIB (October 2009).

⁸⁵ HTI entry for Source: SmitTPD b.

⁸⁶ Thomas Smith, An introduction to the singing of psalms: with a choice collection of the Psalms of David. Set to the best tunes that are now taught and used in all, or most of the churches in England or Ireland. In a more plain and useful method than hath been formerly published (Dublin: Printed by J. Brent and S. Powell ... and are to be sold by the Author ... and Peter Lawrence, 1700). GB-Lbl A.511.jj.

summarised above (2.2.3), he also wrote and published two of his own books of sacred music. These books serve as an invaluable embodiment of the opinions Boyse expressed in his writings, and can help to gauge the veracity of his descriptions of Presbyterian church music around the turn of the eighteenth century. They also shed further light on the tunes that were in common use among Nonconformist congregations in Dublin during this period.

The first of these two books appeared in 1693, just a year before Boyse's debate with King began. It was published in Dublin by Matthew Gunne under the title *Sacramental Hymns* (hereinafter "Boyse1") and was to be sold at Gunne's shop at Essex Gate. ⁸⁷ An edition was also published by Thomas Parkhurst in London in the same year. ⁸⁸ The book contains twenty texts written by Boyse himself, plus three by John Patrick and one by the English clergyman George Herbert that Boyse felt were "excellently done". Despite the title these are not "hymns" in the usual sense of the word (i.e., non-scriptural devotional verse), but psalm paraphrases in the Presbyterian tradition. Although there are no printed tunes in the book, Boyse indicated what tunes could be used to accompany his texts. His indications are so sparse, however, as to be almost useless; the only tune mentioned by name is the "100th psalm tune" (in other words, the "Old Hundredth" [143a]), which Boyse suggests for the eighteen hymns in long metre. For the other texts, in common metre, he simply writes "to the common tunes". At the back of the book is a glossary of terms for the "unskilful Reader"; this practical concession to his readership

-

⁸⁷ Joseph Boyse, Sacramental Hymns, Collected chiefly out of such Passages of the New Testament As contain the most sutable matter of Divine Praises in the Celebration of the Lord's Supper (Dublin: Printed for Matthew Gunn, 1693). GB-Lbl 3433.de.25.

⁸⁸ Joseph Boyse, Sacramental Hymns Collected (Chiefly) out of Such Passages of the New Testament as Contain the Most Suitable Matter of Divine Praises in the Celebration of the Lord's Supper ([London]: Printed at Dublin, and reprinted at London by Thomas Parkhurst at the Bible and Three Crowns in Cheapside, 1693). Wing / B4075.

reflects the similarly practical attitudes towards church music-making that he would later express in his debate with King.

At the front of Boyse1 is a statement endorsing its contents as "very useful and proper for the end by [the author] intended". This is followed by six names: Thomas Toy, Robert Henry, Elias Travers, Nathaniel Weld, Alexander Sinclare and Thomas Emlin. While the credentials of Toy and Henry have yet to be established, the remaining four signatories were senior Presbyterian figures with connections to Dublin: Travers was chaplain to Lord Massereene at Antrim Castle, but had been ordained in Dublin at Cook Street, while Nathanial Weld was the minister of New Row congregation on the north side of the river, which relocated to Eustace Street in 1727. Sinclare was the minister of the Plunket Street congregation. ⁸⁹ Thomas Emlin, or Emlyn, was at that time Boyse's colleague at Wood Street, though just a few years later he would be deposed by the Dublin Presbytery, prosecuted and imprisoned for holding unorthodox views on the deity of Christ. ⁹⁰ Between them, these men had connections to all three of the "English Presbyterian" congregations in the city, as well as to Plunket Street, which, although it became affiliated with the Synod of Ulster relatively early in its history, had started out as an Independent congregation closer in sympathy to the "English" branch. ⁹¹

The almost total lack of attention given to the tunes in Boyse1 suggests that, for Boyse as for many, it was the texts rather than the tunes of hymns and sacred songs that carried the most significance, and that despite the strong opinions on church music which

⁸⁹ Richard Greaves, *God's Other Children: Protestant Nonconformists and the Emergence of Denominational Churches in Ireland, 1660–1700* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1997), 161. Thomas Seccombe and Elizabeth Baigent, "Weld, Isaac (1774–1856), Topographical Writer", ODNB (23 September 2004). Smyrl, *Dictionary of Dublin Dissent,* 45. Robert Whan, *The Presbyterians of Ulster, 1680–1730* (Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 2013), 63.

⁹⁰ Alexander Gordon and H. J. McLachlan, "Emlyn, Thomas (1663–1741), Dissenting Minister", ODNB (23 September 2004).

⁹¹ Ferguson, "Rocque's Map", 150.

he expressed in his writings, he had little knowledge of the practical aspects of church music-making and was not familiar with the names of very many tunes. The only other conclusions that can be drawn from this book are that the 100th psalm tune, at least, was well known to the congregations by which Boyse intended his book to be used, and that similarly Boyse could comfortably expect a congregation—even those that were "unskilful" in reading—to be familiar with at least one tune in common metre to which his hymns could be sung, without his having to notate anything. This also confirms that in Irish Presbyterian church music practice particular tunes and texts were not generally closely linked to one another but rather, as in the parish churches, had a largely independent existence, and it was expected that a given text would be sung to different tunes in different places depending on which tunes were familiar to each particular congregation. As Boyse1 was published in both London and Dublin, he evidently was hopeful that it might acquire an international readership, in which case it would be necessary to keep the tune indications as generic as possible to facilitate widespread use.

In 1701, Boyse published a second book of psalm paraphrases, entitled *Family Hymns for Morning and Evening Worship* (hereinafter "Boyse2"). 92 The publisher's name is not given, but the place of publication is given as "the back of Dick's Coffee-House"; this is the location at which Brent and Powell were based between 1698 and 1703, so it is highly likely this book was their work. 93 It was to be sold by Matthew Gunne at the Bible and Crown in Essex Street. This was a far more musically ambitious affair than Boyse1, for all seventy-eight of Boyse's hymns are paired with tunes written out in

⁹² Joseph Boyse, Family Hymns for Morning and Evening Worship. With some for the Lord's Days; And others for several Particular Occasions. All taken out of the Psalms of David (Dublin: Printed at the back of Dick's Coffee-House; And are to be sold by Matth. Gunne, at the Bible and Crown in Essex-Street, 1701). HTI: BoysJFH. TCD OLS Xerox 6 no. 12. The TCD library catalogue lists this as a reproduction of a copy in Waterford Diocesan Library (IeDuTC); this copy is not listed in the ESTC.

⁹³ Pollard, Dictionary of the Dublin Book Trade, 469.

musical notation. Although this book was primarily intended for domestic use, the tune contents are of relevance to the present study, since Boyse claims in his introduction that "most of the tunes in this Essay are commonly used in Publick Congregations".⁹⁴

The introduction sets out Boyse's intentions for the book, as well as his motivation for writing the contents. Like many writers of psalm versions and paraphrases around this time, Boyse's principal motivation was dissatisfaction with the quality of existing material: because, he states, the book is intended principally for the use of the "common People", he has therefore avoided in his texts the "the too bold Paraphrases, and the too fanciful strains of some New Versions, as the fatness and coarseness of elder ones. For I reckon those Flights of Wit that might please a few wanton Ears, no way proper to kindle and raise Serious Devotion." This is a neat denigration of both the Whole Booke of Psalmes, which was falling out of favour in many quarters by the end of the seventeenth century (see 1.2.5 above), and the various attempts that had been made to find replacements for them. Boyse notes that he was specifically inspired by a similar book of hymns written by his friend "Mr H. Of Ch.", which, though "judicious", lacked printed tunes and contained too great a variety of metres. To improve on this, Boyse2 was an avowed attempt to produce texts that were "suited to [a] greater Variety of Tunes which may contribute to the delight of this exercise." The provision of the tunes in musical notation, Boyse's introduction states, is a practical concession to his readership, for "the Direction and Help of those that are less Skillful". Although it is unclear how this would help those without the ability to read music, this touching concern for his readership echoes the glossary provided for the "unskilful reader" in Boysel and the practical streak previously commented upon, and reinforces that Boyse intended both his books to be used

⁹⁴ Boyse, Family Hymns, introduction.

by a wide spectrum of society, rather than just those with specific training in music or singing.

As might be expected from someone with very strong opinions on church music, Boyse devoted space in his introduction to extolling the spiritual value of psalm-singing. He declared that for those engaged in it the act of singing in particular has "a genuine tendency (even above other Duties) to engage their attention, to quicken their devout affections, to raise and vent their Spiritual Joys, and to give 'em some relish of the inward pleasures of serious Religion". Boyse made the standard appeals to the historical pedigree of psalm-singing as a religious practice, as well as the evidence of the psalms themselves: "they would find the words of the Psalmist true, 147 Ps[alm] I V[erse]. 'Tis good to Sing Praises to our God ... [and] See the 148 Psalm throughout". As well as providing general spiritual edification, the singing of hymns and psalms could function as a replacement for "foolish and wanton Songs.... Giving the rising Age an early tincture of Seriousness and Piety, as the others generally do of Levity and Vice." Boyse's position echoes that of Calvin himself, and is well characterised by the Bible verses which appear on the title page of Family Hymns: 5 Ephesians 18–19: "And be not drunk with Wine wherein is excess, but be filled with the Spirit. Speaking to your selves (or, one with another) in Psalms and Hymns and Spiritual Songs, Singing and making melody in your heart to the Lord." This version of the text is taken from the King James Bible, but the parentheses has been added, presumably by Boyse; this may have been intended as an explanation of the phrase "to your selves", clarifying and emphasising the communal nature of the singing.

Accompanying each text in Boyse2 is a tune in the appropriate metre, notated in the treble clef. There are thirteen tunes in all; far fewer tunes than there are texts, as all of the tunes are repeated except three ("St David's" [379f], "Lowath" [536a] and "Ps. 113" [146a]). There is no apparent correspondence of affect between the tunes and their respective texts, or between the tunes and the occasions on which the hymns were intended to be sung; the latter are indicated by Boyse for just under half of the hymns in the book, which are grouped according to their function, e.g. "Hymns for the Lord's Day" or "Hymns for Occasions of Sickness in the Family".

All thirteen tunes in Boyse2 had also appeared in Smith2; the names of the tunes, and—most tellingly—the set of basses provided at the back of the book, are also identical to those in Smith2. This being the case, and given the lack of knowledge of even the names of tunes, let alone their melodies, which Boyse1 demonstrates, it seems certain that Boyse copied his tunes and basses directly from Smith2, even down to the separate positioning of the basses at the back of the book. The clear relationship between Boyse2 and Smith2 make it possible to posit a chain of influence between these books that also includes Smith1. A comparison of Smith2 and Boyse2 reveals that Boyse's book contains fewer tunes than Smith's, reduced from nineteen to just thirteen, while Smith1 contains more tunes than both (twenty-three). All thirteen tunes in Boyse2 are also present in Smith2, and eighteen of the nineteen tunes in Smith2 are contained in Smith1, save for one, the unique "Stanford" tune [591] discussed above (see 2.3.1). With this single exception, each source appears to represent a subset of the preceding one, which suggests that Smith1 predates Smith2, and that the tune contents of the two later volumes were arrived at by "trimming" the tune selections of their predecessors (see Table 2).

Returning to Boyse's claim that the tunes in Boyse2 represent those most commonly found in contemporary congregations, the cut tunes in each case were most likely those that were the least used. The frequency with which the recurring tunes appear

may also be evidence of changing fortunes: the tune named "Martyrs" [330a] for example, is assigned to only one of the eighty-five items in Smith1 (1.2%) but to seven of the 169 items in Smith2 (4.1%, excluding one instance in which the "St Mary's" tune [542a] is incorrectly labelled as "Martyrs"), and to four of the fifty-three items in Boyse2 (7.5%). Smith1 and Smith2 contain six tunes named for the psalms which they originally accompanied in the Genevan Psalter: Psalms 51, 100, 113, 119, 124 and 148; in Boyse2 these have been reduced to four, psalms 51 and 124 being dropped.

As with any publications of this kind, it is difficult to judge the extent to which their content truly reflected contemporary worship music practices. The claim made in the introduction to Boyse2 that the tunes were common in public congregations carries little weight on its own, particularly given that Boyse almost certainly copied them directly from Smith rather than choosing them for himself based on his knowledge of contemporary practice. Smith2, as one of the first books of printed music ever produced in Ireland, may have simply been one of the only books available to Boyse from which to copy printed tunes. According to Flood, however, Smith's *Psalms* were extremely popular with Nonconformist congregations in Dublin, including the Presbyterians. Flood's assertion is typically made without supporting citations, and is discussed further below (see 2.4), but if he is to be believed, Boyse may therefore have chosen Smith's tunes to copy because he was aware that the book was in widespread use in the city at the time—in other words, that Smith's tunes really were "commonly used in Publick Congregations". Flood also states that Boyse's book itself became quite popular after its

⁹⁵ These figures refer to the total numbers of tunes including repeats, rather than the number of *distinct* tunes given earlier in this chapter.

⁹⁶ Flood, "Barton's Psalms", 248–9.

release, both with Presbyterians and with other Dissenters; this would have circulated Smith's tunes even more widely, and so further popularised them.⁹⁷

As in Boyse1, an endorsement is attached to the end of the preface of Boyse2; the names of Weld, Travers, Sinclare and Emlyn appear for a second time, joined by Joseph Tate and Francis Iredell. Iredell was the minister of the Capel Street congregation. 98 Along with Weld, Sinclare and Emlyn, this list therefore includes ministers from four of the six Presbyterian meeting houses active in the city at the time (five, if Travers' slight connection with Cook Street is taken into consideration). Unlike the list in Boyse1, it also incorporates one of the congregations that was decidedly "Scottish" in its affiliations (Capel Street). If Boyse's books were indeed popular among Dublin's Presbyterians, then it may be inferred which congregations might have made particular use of them. Between them, Boyse's two books list the names of ten senior figures in the Presbyterian community in their statements of endorsement; the presence of four names on both of the lists suggests that these men were well known to Boyse, and that they had an ongoing interest in his attempts at hymnody. Most of the ten listed individuals were ministers of city congregations, and it seems no little stretch to imagine that, Boyse's work being known to them, they might have recommended its use to their flocks. Additionally, although he is not mentioned in the endorsement lists, Robert Craghead's son, Robert Craghead Jr, was a senior member of the congregation at Capel Street until 1722, and although it is of course by no means certain that he shared the views expressed by his father in the discourse with William King, it does show that Boyse was personally well-

⁹⁷ Flood, "Barton's Psalms", 249.

⁹⁸ A. W. Godfrey Brown, "Iredell, Francis (d. 1739), Minister of the Presbyterian General Synod of Ulster and Author", ODNB (23 September 2004).

connected to all of the city's major congregations and could have used this network to promote the use of his book.⁹⁹

2.3.3 Bradley's Psalms of David in Metre (1740)

The three tunebooks Smith1, Smith2 and Boyse2 are theologically diverse in their contents and origins. Smith1 contains texts from the *Whole Booke of Psalmes* and Tate and Brady's *New Version*, Smith2 those of William Barton, popular with Nonconformists, while Boyse2 represents the Presbyterian tradition. Despite this, all three books draw upon the same repertory of tunes. This suggests that not only was the performance practice of public worship music remarkably similar across confessional divisions in the early eighteenth century, but also that the various distinct Protestant communities in Dublin were united by a shared repertory of psalm tunes. Brocas's edition of Smith2, which incorporated texts from the *New Version* and from John Patrick's version of the psalms, even suggests that texts, as well as tunes, were shared between denominations. As we have seen (2.3.1), despite John Patrick's lifelong personal loyalty to the established church of which he was a clergyman, his psalm translations were extremely popular with Nonconformists.

An example of this "common repertory" of texts and tunes in action can be seen in a thoroughly eclectic psalm collection called *The Psalms of David in Metre*, published in 1740 for the Dublin publisher and bookseller Abraham Bradley.¹⁰⁰ Since the editor is

at the Two Bibles in Dame's-Street, over-against Sycamore-Alley, 1740). HTI: #PDMPV. TCD Starkey 101.

 ⁹⁹ James Geddes Craighead, *The Craighead Family: A Genealogical Memoir of the Descendants of Rev. Thomas and Margaret Craighead, 1658–1876* (Philadelphia PA: Printed for the Descendants, 1876), 21.
 ¹⁰⁰ The Psalms of David in Metre. Collected out of the Principal Versions now in Use. To which are Added, Hymns, Particularly Designed for the Lord's-Supper (Dublin: Printed by S. Powell, for Abraham Bradley,

unidentified, the collection will hereinafter be referred to as "Bradley". It contains texts drawn from various versions of the psalms, the majority of the psalms being given in two or more versions by different authors. There are also twenty-four hymns "to the Lord's Supper" included; thus the total number of texts in the book runs to an impressive 287. Printed at the back are twenty-six different tunes, organised according to their metres. The same psalter, with the same introduction, was published on three later occasions in Belfast, but without the printed tunes; it is possible that the tune section of the Dublin edition was not part of the editor's concept but was added by another party for publication. ¹⁰¹

The stated intention of the editor was to create a superior psalter by drawing together the best texts from the "principal versions now in use". The introduction states that the psalm texts were drawn principally from those of the *New Version*, Dr [John] Patrick, Sir John Denham, Sir Richard Blackmore and Isaac Watts, along with "a few of Mr. Barton's preserved". By far the most prominently represented author is Watts, with sixty-five texts; the next in prominence is Patrick, with forty; then John Denham with twenty-nine and Tate and Brady with twenty-eight. Richard Blackmore's texts number only eleven, while the "few" of William Barton's number only ten. The remaining seventy-nine texts have no attribution: while presumably newly composed for this collection, it could be that the author arrived at these new versions by modifying existing texts than by any recourse to any authoritative "original".

Twenty-four hymns are included after the psalms, of which four are attributed to Joseph Boyse; the others are without any attribution, but the majority (twelve) appear to be the work of the Baptist Joseph Stennett (see 2.4 below). Four are by Watts, and one is

-

 $^{^{101}}$ The ESTC numbers for the three subsequent editions are T171590 (1742), T195278 (1759) and T91814 (1776).

by Patrick. The authors of the remaining three texts could not be identified. With a typical combination of respect and disregard for these authors, the editor has prefixed the relevant initials to each psalm "that the Reader may know to whom the Translation … is principally owing", but at the same time states that "a Liberty is all along taken to alter Words, Lines, and sometimes whole Stanza's … either to bring the Sense nearer to the Original, or to render it clearer … or to render it more concise". Whether the supposed "Original" was in Hebrew, Greek, Latin or English is not stated.

The authors included in the volume represent a wide range of denominational and political affiliations. Blackmore was physician to William III and a dedicated member (like Patrick) of the established church, who tried his hand at psalms towards the end of his literary career. ¹⁰² In contrast, Denham was an ardent seventeenth-century royalist, probably born in Dublin, a "great wit" who in earlier life "despised religion" but who took to the church before his death, producing a version of the psalms around 1668, a year before his death; it was not printed until 1714. ¹⁰³ Barton, though a clergyman of the established church, was well known to Dissenting congregations. Watts was an Independent, whose father was imprisoned for nonconformity on several occasions, but like those of Patrick, his writings appealed to conforming and Nonconforming Protestants alike; his dominance over the eighteenth-century hymn repertory is discussed below (3.1). Boyse, of course, was a Presbyterian, and Stennett a Baptist. The presence of a large number of Tate and Brady texts in the book implies that it was principally intended for the use of the Church of Ireland. It is nonetheless indicative of the cordial relations between the conformed and nonconforming churches by 1740 that the work of

¹⁰² Flavio Gregori, "Blackmore, Sir Richard (1654–1729), Physician and Writer", ODNB (8 January 2009). ¹⁰³ W. H. Kelliher, "Denham, Sir John (1614/15–1669), Poet and Courtier", ODNB (11 February 2021).

Independents, Presbyterians and Baptists could appear side-by-side with "authorised" versions in a collection such as this.

The tune content of Bradley is similarly eclectic, ranging from two-hundred-year-old Genevan tunes familiar from earlier Dublin sources to tunes less than twenty years old. The majority of the texts in the book carry no tune indications, and the tunes are instead printed all together at the back, grouped together by metre. Common metre tunes are the most numerous, as might be expected, accounting for over half of the tunes (fifteen out of twenty-six—seventeen if double common is included). There are four long metre tunes, two short metre, and three in their own "particular" metres; this last category is made up of two old Anglo-Genevan psalm tunes [126a and 146a] and the "Oxford" tune [585] found only in Dublin sources and so prominently represented in Boyse2. Other sources have been cited for all the tunes except the common-metre "Dursley" tune [1545] (see Ex. 15). Five of the tunes have basslines appended: "Southwell" [269j], "St David's" [379f], "Lowath" [536a], "London" [497b], and "Shuston" [750b]. The first three of these are identical to the basses for the same tunes in Smith2 and Boyse 2, but the bass given for "London" [497b] differs substantively, while for "Shuston" [750b] the earlier Dublin sources had given no bass at all (see Ex. 16; compare with Ex. 12).

Though hardly any tune indications appear, the four that do—for "Oxford", "Ps. 113", "Ps. 148" and "Ps. 100"—hint at a concern on the part of the editor for the appropriate matching of texts with tunes of a similar affective quality. "Ps. 148" is the only tune of its particular metre in the volume (6.6.6.6.8.8), explaining that particular indication, but "Oxford" and "Ps. 113" share a metre (8.8.8.8.8.8), and so the suggestion of one tune over another for a given text—eight texts are marked "Oxford Tune" and four "113th Psalm"—could indicate a preference based on affect. One text, Patrick's Psalm 85, is

marked with the names of both tunes; in Patrick's own *Psalms of David*, it was marked "As the 113 Psalm" only, so the "Oxford" indication may well have been added by the editor of the Bradley psalter. ¹⁰⁴ Certain other tune indications in Patrick's book were not copied into Bradley. ¹⁰⁵ Similarly, Bradley is filled with long metre texts without tune indications, and there are four different long-metre tunes included to sing them to; the specific indication on three of the texts to use the tune of the "100th Psalm" therefore represents a deliberate choice by the editor. An alternative explanation is that these tune indications reflect the editor's knowledge of actual contemporary practice, and that the texts marked "Oxford" were in fact regularly sung to the "Oxford" tune.

Without doubt, the editor of Bradley had access to at least one of the Dublin sources discussed above—most likely Boyse2, considering the book contains texts by Boyse, but it is possible that the editor may have consulted more than one source (see below). Aside from the evidence of the basslines, three of which match those in Boyse2, the tunes themselves give their origins away. As we have seen, the "Oxford" tune [585] is an exclusively Irish phenomenon, as is the variant of the "Southwell" tune [269j]; the "c" variant of "Ps. 119" [120c] first appeared in the Dublin sources, although it has later citations in England, and likewise appears in all three previously discussed Dublin books. ¹⁰⁶

Since many of the tunes in this collection do not appear elsewhere in the Dublin sources, but are nonetheless not original, the editor must have drawn them from elsewhere. The original version of the "Andrew's" tune [663b] first appeared in the Tate and Brady

¹⁰⁴ John Patrick, *The Psalms of David in Meter: Fitted to the Tunes Used in Parish-Churches* (London: printed for A. and J. Churchill, at the Black Swan in Paternoster-Row; and L. Meredith, at the Star in St. Paul's Churchyard, 1694), 195. Wing / B2589.

¹⁰⁵ For example, Psalm 87 is marked "As the 100 Psalm" in Patrick's own book, but the same text is simply marked "Long Metre" in Bradley.

¹⁰⁶ The HTI incorrectly lists the variant of "Ps. 119" that appears in Smith2 as the "a" variant; it is in fact, as we have seen, the "c" variant.

Supplement of 1708, but this particular variant (see Ex. 17) only appears in two other sources: A Set of Tunes in 3 Parts (London, 1720) and William Anchors's Choice Collection of Psalm Tunes (London, 1728). 107 The former has no other tunes in common with Bradley and so can be excluded as a possible source. The latter, however, shares with Bradley the tunes "Stroudwater" [1062a] and "Wakefield" [1064], neither of which appear in any of the other Irish sources. The "Andrew's" variation [663b] is too distinctive to have been arrived at coincidentally, and so it is likely, therefore, that the editor of Bradley had access to Anchors's Choice Collection.

Another likely source of tunes for this volume is a collection of tunes from 1722, probably by William Lawrence, "suited to ... Watt's imitation of the Psalms of David, or Dr Patrick's version; fit to be bound up with either". 108 Fourteen of the twenty-six tunes in Bradley were also printed by Lawrence; eleven of these even have the same names in both volumes. This does, however, invite the question of why, if the other three tunes were also copied from Lawrence, two of their names were changed. Tune [750b], usually known as "Namure", is here titled "Shuston", a name by which it appears in no other sources whose data appears in the HTI. Tune [159a], an old Anglo-Genevan tune usually known as "Ps. 18", is named in Boyse2 as "Lincoln". The only sources in which [159a] appears under that name are the two Dublin sources Smith1 and Smith2. It therefore seems more likely that the editor drew upon one of these two books for this tune, or at least for its name.

The tune "Elgin" [400] is one of the twelve "common tunes" of eighteenth-century Scottish Presbyterian practice, and unlike the other "common tunes" which appear in the Dublin repertory (see 2.3.1 above), was not included in the 1708 Supplement (see Ex.

¹⁰⁷ HTI entry for tune [663b].

¹⁰⁸ HTI entry for Source: LawrWCT 2.

18). 109 In fact, it is found only in Scottish sources prior to its appearance here, and almost exclusively in Scottish and American sources after this point. Its first appearance had been in a 1625 book of psalms published in Aberdeen. In 1804, it was included in Cochran's Selection of Psalm and Hymn Tunes for the Third Presbyterian Congregation in Belfast, part of the Synod of Ulster (see 5.2.1 below). It seems likely, therefore, that it appears in Bradley via the city's "Scottish" Presbyterian community.

2.4 The Dublin Baptists

The Baptist community in eighteenth-century Ireland was small, but long-standing: there had been a Baptist presence in Dublin since the Commonwealth era, and many of the city's original Baptists had come to the Kingdom as part of Cromwell's army. Fleetwood, the Lord Deputy of Ireland and Cromwell's son-in-law, was himself a Baptist. 110 The first dedicated meeting house was likely the one at Swift's Alley, founded some time between 1653 and 1699. Prior to this, Baptist groups met in disused parish churches, in the northeast corner of Christ Church Cathedral, and in private houses. 111 The majority of Dublin's Baptists were Particular, or Calvinistic, Baptists, but around 1700 a group of General Baptists, so called because they believed in general salvation, began to meet at Skinners' Alley, possibly following a schism with the original group. The Skinners' Alley group was also described in contemporary sources as Arminian or Socinian. A third

¹⁰⁹ Temperley et al., "Psalms, Metrical", GMO. HTI entry for Source: *TS TatB 6a.

¹¹⁰ James Hurford Wood, A Condensed History of the General Baptists of the New Connexion (London: Simkin, Marshall & Co., 1847), 113.

¹¹¹ Smyrl, Dictionary of Dublin Dissent, 130–143. Wood, A Condensed History of the General Baptists, 113. The date of establishment of the first meeting house is very unclear; Wood gives the foundation date of Swift's Alley as 1653, but Smyrl finds this date unlikely.

congregation, "strictly Calvinistic", was formed at Boot Lane in the 1720s. 112 Both of these schismatic groups were far smaller than the main Swift's Alley congregation, and both had been reabsorbed back into that congregation by 1750. 113

Although the Baptist presence in Ireland had been quite strong in the seventeenth century, with many Baptists working as army chaplains or holding positions of social and political power, after the Restoration the community declined considerably. 114 Two letters sent by Irish Baptist ministers to America in 1725 and 1736/7 provide a useful picture of the state of the Irish Baptists in the eighteenth century. 115 Joseph Pettit, the minister of the Cork city congregation, listed five main congregations active in the Kingdom—in Dublin, Cork, Waterford, Legacorry and Ormond—whose ministers also occasionally served smaller countryside congregations. This was far fewer than there had been in the 1650s, when (Pettit claimed) there had been thirteen congregations on the island. Based on Pettit's figures, the historian Kevin Herlihy has estimated a total figure of around 1500–2000 Baptists in Ireland in 1725, of which the majority were in Dublin: Pettit stated that the Dublin congregation was much larger than all the others. His report also clarifies the position of the two schismatic congregations, which, he observed, did not associate with the generality of Baptists in the country, or with one another. A letter from Samuel Fowkes, the minister in Waterford, in 1737 regrets that "the power of godliness" was "very low" in the Waterford congregation and that they had had "of late but few additions, which indeed is too much the condition of all the churches in this kingdom."¹¹⁶ In general, the sense expressed by both letters was that the Irish Baptist community was in decline,

¹¹² Smyrl, Dictionary of Dublin Dissent, 133, 138.

¹¹³ Smyrl, *Dictionary of Dublin Dissent*, 130–31.

¹¹⁴ Hurford Wood, A Condensed History of the General Baptists, 114.

¹¹⁵ This paragraph is derived from Kevin Herlihy, "The Early Eighteenth Century Irish Baptists: Two Letters", *Irish Economic and Social History* 19 (1992), which reproduces the texts of the letters in full with commentary

¹¹⁶ Samuel Fowkes, quoted in Herlihy, "The Early Eighteenth-Century Irish Baptists", 76.

and had been much healthier in the preceding century; or at least, they believed this to be the case. The purpose of the letters was to seek financial aid from American Baptist communities, particularly for investing in property. Despite the seemingly precarious and declining fortunes of the Baptists during the eighteenth century, the Dublin congregation was in a secure enough position to have a new meeting house built in the 1730s, and the congregation thrived at Swift's Alley well into the nineteenth century; an account of 1825 mentioned that by this point it supported two charity schools, one for boys and one for girls.¹¹⁷

During the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, Baptist musical practice varied greatly between the two main denominations, General and Particular. All Baptists rejected the use of choirs and instruments, and even congregational singing was not universally accepted. Most General Baptists were opposed to congregational singing, and remained so well into the eighteenth century. There is some evidence that certain General Baptist churches in England were making use of Barton's *Psalms* in the late seventeenth century, but this practice was condemned by the General Assembly in 1689. The first General Baptist hymnal did not appear until 1772, following the influence of the Methodist movement. In contrast, Particular Baptists were generally more in favour of congregational singing; in 1691 "between 20 and 30" of the Particular Baptist congregations in London had adopted singing. Somewhat ironically, some Particular Baptists even adopted hymns enthusiastically long before they were generally approved even in the established church. The hymns of Joseph Stennett, a seventh-day Baptist, were particularly popular. The hymns of Joseph Stennett, a seventh-day Baptist, were

¹¹⁷ Smyrl, Dictionary of Dublin Dissent, 131. Wright, Historical Guide, 101.

¹¹⁸ David W. Music, "Baptist Church Music", GMO (20 January 2001).

Information about the musical practices of the Dublin Baptists is very scarce. The Baptists of the British Isles during this period had grown out of anticlerical movements during the English Civil War and Commonwealth, and as a result the congregations remained highly anticlerical, and resisted any kind of formal training for their ministers. ¹¹⁹ The quality and character of the music in any given Baptist meeting therefore depended more or less by chance on the musical abilities of the minister, who would not necessarily have received any training in music. Despite this, Pettit wrote in his 1725 letter that all of the Baptist congregations in Ireland practiced "singing of Psalms and hymns", aside from the two schismatic independent groups, who had no music. 120 As the majority of Irish Baptist congregations were Particular Baptists while the schismatic congregations were not, this was in line with the general practice of these congregations at the time. What scant mentions there are of Baptist music in the primary sources imply that the congregations did not restrict themselves to purely "Baptist" material but made use of texts and tunes also used by other denominations: the Baptists who invited the Moravian John Cennick to Dublin in the 1740s wrote specifically that they were impressed by his hymns, and asked that he bring some hymn books with him when he came (see 3.2.5 below). 121

Secondary sources can appear to shed more light on the music of the Dublin Baptists, though the facts are difficult to verify. The extrapolative Flood, for example, whose scholarship remains better known for recklessness than authoritativeness, claimed that the Dublin Baptists sang "the hymns of Joseph Stennett the elder", as well as those

¹¹⁹ Herlihy, "The Early Eighteenth Century Irish Baptists", 72.

¹²⁰ Joseph Pettit, quoted in Herlihy, "The Early Eighteenth Century Irish Baptists", 75.

¹²¹ Letter from Antisel Taylor to John Cennick, Dublin 13th August 1745. Dudley Cooney, "An Account of the Brethren's first coming to Ireland, with all Matters Relating to their losing Skinners Alley Meetinghouse". Unpublished typescript transcribed from original documents at Moravian Archive, Gracehill. Private collection of Steven C. Smyrl.

of William Barton and Joseph Boyse. 122 Typically, Flood does not cite his sources for these statements; in the absence of any evidence to the contrary, his statements can be taken at best as a working hypothesis. Stennett, a friend of Nahum Tate, tended towards the Calvinistic in his beliefs and produced several volumes of hymns. ¹²³ Flood's phrasing suggests that specific works by Stennett dating from 1697 and 1712 respectively were sung by the Dublin Baptists; published respectively in those years, the two works to which Flood was most likely referring are Hymns in Commemoration of the Sufferings of Jesus Christ and Hymns Compos'd for the Celebration of the Holy Ordinance of Baptism. 124 Neither of these books was printed in Dublin, and so would have had to have been imported, or taught to the congregations from memory by the ministers. Both books consist of paraphrases from the Bible arranged into metrical verse. The only metres which appear in the books are common, long, and short; neither book has printed tunes, but the first, Hymns... of the Sufferings, has minimal tune indications: all of the long metre texts carry the indication "As the 100 Psalm", and all of the short metre texts "As the 25 Psalm". The overall format of Hymns ... of the Sufferings is in fact very similar to Boyse1, and even has a similar glossary at the back of "the more difficult Words explained", such as "infernal", "splendor", and "vital". Boysel predates Stennett's by four years, and was published in London as well as Dublin; it is possible that Stennett's book was modelled on Boyse's, or that both men were conforming to a standard format. Several of Stennett's

¹²² Flood, "Barton's Psalms", 248-9.

¹²³ S. L. Copson, "Stennett, Joseph (1663–1713), Seventh Day Baptist Minister", ODNB (23 September 2004).

¹²⁴ Joseph Stennett, *Hymns in Commemoration of the Sufferings of our Blessed Saviour Jesus Christ, Compos'd for the Celebration of His Holy Supper* (London: printed by J. Darby, for Andr. Bell at the Cross-Keys and Bible in Cornhil, near Stocks-market, 1697). US-SM 147897. Wing / S5408. Stennett, *Hymns Compos'd for the Celebration of the Holy Ordinance of Baptism* (London: printed by J. Darby, and sold by J. Baker at Mercers-Chappel in Cheapside, and J. Clark at theBible and Crown in the Old Change, 1712). ESTC T74029. GB-Lbl 844.e.22(2).

hymns also appear in Bradley's *Psalms of David*, supporting the statement that they were popular in the city.

Flood's statement that the Baptists sang the hymns of Barton and Boyse is even more intriguing, as neither of those writers were Baptists themselves. As we have seen, Barton's hymn texts had been in circulation in Dublin since the mid-seventeenth century, though they did not appear with tunes until the publication of Smith's *Psalms of David* in 1699. Given that many of the earliest Dublin Baptists were originally from England, however, they conceivably brought copies of Barton's *Psalms* with them, particularly given Barton's own assertion that many thousands of copies of his books had been brought into Ireland without his knowledge (see 2.3.1 above).

The Baptist congregations of contemporary America may provide a useful comparison. In the early eighteenth century, the majority of American Baptist congregations probably used the Ainsworth or Sternhold and Hopkins psalters; after about 1740, many congregations began using the *New Version*. Later in the century this was replaced by the work of Isaac Watts. The majority of these books were not printed in America but instead imported from Britain. ¹²⁵ It is possible that the Irish Baptists similarly imported large amounts of material that is now difficult to trace. It is also notable that American Baptist groups had no objections to the metrical psalms "authorised" by the established church. If the Irish Baptists felt similarly, then Bradley's *Psalms of David*, which contains *New Version* texts as well as texts by Stennett, Barton and Boyse, would have been very well suited to their worship music tastes.

No Baptist hymnals printed in either Britain or America contained tunes until the appearance of the first "Baptist tune book", John Rippon's A Selection of Psalm and

¹²⁵ Music, "Baptist Church Music", GMO.

Hymn Tunes, in 1791. In America, however, a set of tunes "for Baptist use" had been published, without words, in 1768. 126 If Barton's *Psalms* were as popular among the Dublin Baptists as they were in England, it is most likely that they were sung to the tunes which appeared in Barton's original book (brought over from England) or from Smith's 1699 edition. Boyse's book, of course, contained its own tunes, as did Bradley's *Psalms of David*. In the absence of any explicitly Baptist tune books known to be circulating in Ireland during the eighteenth century, the most likely candidates for the material being sung by the Dublin Baptists are those which accompanied the Barton, Boyse and Stennett texts they supposedly preferred. If this was the case, then not only were the Baptists using texts that were also used by the Presbyterians and in the parish churches, they were also singing them to the same tunes from the common repertory. Once again, church music appears to have been a medium of commonality between theologically divided communities—a kind of cross-community tradition that, to an extent, transcended religious affiliation.

2.5 "Protestant Unity" and its limits: the case of the Quakers

As we have seen, in the early eighteenth century the public worship music of the established church and of the Dissenters was extremely similar. In both Conforming and Nonconforming services, the central element was the metrical psalm, occasionally supplemented by a hymn or psalm paraphrase; these were generally sung unaccompanied (either by practical necessity or by theological choice) and were usually "lined out" by

-

¹²⁶ Morgan Edwards, *The Customs of Primitive Churches* (Philadelphia, 1768). US-WOa DB. Music, "Baptist Church Music", GMO.

the minister or clerk. An examination of the printed sources reveals that, in addition, the same tunes, and frequently even the same texts, appear to have been used in both Conforming and Nonconforming contexts. Thus it is possible to speak of a common tradition of "Protestant" worship which united those of different denominational allegiances.

This concept of an overarching "Protestant" identity can also be found in the writings of Joseph Boyse, who despite his reputation as a polemicist and his spirited defences of the Presbyterian position, was at the same time a strong advocate of peace and unity between the different Protestant churches. Boyse "professed to see all the essentials of the true Church in the faith, morals and worship of Episcopal, Presbyterian, Independent and Anabaptist churches", and believed that Protestants should recognise those of other denominations as "true churches", recognising each other's ministries and "rejoicing in the success of one another's labours". ¹²⁷ Boyse's biographer A. W. Godfrey Brown describes this desire for Protestant unity as a fundamental part of Boyse's whole ministry. ¹²⁸

Just as strong as Boyse's calls for Protestant unity, however, was his conviction regarding just whom they were to be united against. Boyse was a lifelong opponent of Catholicism, sharing in the contemporary "general detestation of [Catholic] doctrine and practice" and often writing openly in condemnation of the Catholic Church. ¹²⁹ His colleague Richard Choppin, in his funeral sermon for Boyse, wrote that

[Boyse] was especially well vers'd ... in the popish Controversies which he studied with great application in those threatening days when Popery

¹²⁷ A. W. Godfrey Brown, *The Great Mr Boyse: A study of The Reverend Joseph Boyse Minister of Wood Street Church, Dublin, 1638–1728* (Belfast: Presbyterian Historical Society of Ireland, 1988), 16–17.

¹²⁸ Brown, *The Great Mr Boyse*, 17.

¹²⁹ Brown, The Great Mr Boyse, 17.

seem'd to be coming in upon us like a flood and was in danger of bearing down before it all opposition.¹³⁰

As Choppin's comment implies, these were not abstract theological grievances but explicitly linked to contemporary political and social issues. Writing against penal legislation in 1695, Boyse argued that the Irish Dissenters had proven their loyalty by supporting the Protestant cause during the Williamite Wars, and that by continuing legal penalties against dissent (though he notes that *de facto* toleration was already in place), the government was weakening "the whole Protestant interest". ¹³¹ In 1714, on the accession of George I, Boyse preached a sermon urging all Protestants to give thanks for the peaceful accession of a Protestant king. ¹³² A critical factor which united Protestants of different denominations, in Boyse's view, was their common opposition to the constant threat of Catholicism.

Catholics were not the only ones excluded from Boyse's calls for Protestant unity, however. His vision of unity between Protestants of all kinds had one notable exception: the Society of Friends, also known as the Quakers. Not only did Boyse exclude the Quakers from his calls for cooperation and understanding between Protestants, he specifically condemned them: an attack on Quakers is included in the second volume of his published *Works*, and Brown comments that he regarded the doctrines of the Quakers with "abhorrence". Though this may seem a surprising and specific dislike, it was typical of Boyse's day. Quakers were the pariahs of seventeenth- and eighteenth-century Protestantism. After the Restoration, when Quaker worship was outlawed, thousands of

¹³⁰ Quoted in Brown, The Great Mr Boyse, 10.

¹³¹ Brown, The Great Mr Boyse, 6.

¹³² Brown, *The Great Mr Boyse*, 9.

¹³³ Brown, The Great Mr Boyse, 12, 17.

Quakers were imprisoned—almost a tenth of the English Quaker population—and many fled the country altogether for the more hopeful prospect of the new American colonies. 134

In Dublin, where a sizeable Quaker community had existed since 1655, their refusal to pay tithes, and the social practices peculiar to their community (see below), caused "difficulties in varying degree in their relations with the civil authorities and with undisciplined sections of the general public". ¹³⁵ Much like the city's Catholics, the Quakers of Dublin rather prospered than declined under these circumstances, and some individual Quakers were very successful, among them Anthony Sharp, who became one of Dublin's most successful wool merchants in the late seventeenth century. ¹³⁶ A permanent meeting house was established in Sycamore Alley in 1662 (prior to this meetings had taken place in private houses), and a Quaker school founded at Wormwood Gate in 1680 remained in operation until the late eighteenth century, closing only between 1690 and 1693 when the fallout of the Williamite Wars drove the schoolmaster out of the country. ¹³⁷ Nevertheless, the Quakers were to remain socially set apart from the generality of Dublin Protestants during the eighteenth century, as evidenced by the discriminatory charter adopted by the newly founded Bank of Ireland in 1783 which excluded Catholics and Quakers from the Court of Directors. ¹³⁸

The dislike and distrust with which the Quakers were viewed by other Protestant groups were provoked by their radical understanding of the tenets of peace, simplicity, honesty and equality, which formed the core of their theology. Their interpretation of

-

¹³⁴ Dan Graves, "Singing Out of the Silence: A Survey of Quaker Choral Music", *The Choral Journal* 34, no. 5 (December 1993): 15.

¹³⁵ Michael Quane, "Quaker Schools in Dublin", *The Journal of the Royal Society of Antiquaries of Ireland* 94, no. 1 (1964): 47–48.

¹³⁶ Dickson, *Dublin*, 91–2.

¹³⁷ Sr Katherine Butler, "Friends in Dublin", *Dublin Historical Record* 44, no. 1 (Spring 1991): 38. Quane, "Quaker Schools in Dublin", 49–56.

¹³⁸ David Dickson & Richard English, "The La Touche Dynasty", in David Dickson, ed., *The Gorgeous Mask: Dublin 1700–1850*, Trinity History Workshop 2 (Dublin: Trinity History Workshop, 1987), 23.

these tenets led them to flout many of the social conventions and obligations of contemporary mainstream society. Quakers refused to swear oaths or to engage in violence for any reason, including in the defence of the crown or state. 139 In the eyes of the general Protestant public, this made them at best a liability, and at worst a threat; Henry Cromwell, the Lord Deputy in Ireland, expressed this view openly in 1656 when he wrote that "the most considerable enemy were the Quakers ... their principles and practices are not very consistent with civil government". 140 Individual Quakers were identifiable by their conspicuous dress and idiosyncratic behaviour, in particular their refusal to conform to conventions of etiquette and manners that were considered important markers of "civility". The Quaker belief in radical equality caused them to eschew any form of hierarchy, especially in language. Formal language was avoided, including the use of the formal pronoun "you" ("thou" was used in its place) and set phrases such as "your servant". Their dislike of artificiality also led them to prefer direct speech and avoid pleasantries. 141 Quakers refused to doff their caps to social "superiors" or use titles and ranks, preferring the use of first names only. 142 Thus the Quakers were not only socially but culturally distinct from mainstream early modern society, and very visibly and publicly so.

In their worship meetings, too, Quaker practice departed significantly from that of the established church, and indeed from any other contemporary Protestant community. The Quaker belief in direct connection between individuals and God meant that they had no clergy, creed, or well-defined rituals. Although some modern Quakers have adopted music into their meetings, the Quakers of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries had

¹³⁹ Butler, "Friends in Dublin", 34.

¹⁴⁰ Quoted in Quane, "Quaker Schools in Dublin", 47.

¹⁴¹ Keith Thomas, *In Pursuit of Civility: Manners and Civilization in Early Modern England* (London: Yale University Press, 2018), 310–315.

¹⁴² Graves, "Singing Out of the Silence", 16. Thomas, *In Pursuit of Civility*, 310–315.

no public worship music, and were highly suspicious of music in general. A central Quaker tenet was that of "honesty", and the singing of material composed by someone else without being "in the same 'condition' or frame of mind as the composer of the music" was seen as a form of lying, just as it was frowned upon to use set forms of prayer instead of speaking from the heart or as moved by the spirit. Thus while singing "with the spirit" was acceptable, any kind of formalised or congregational musical practice went against Quaker principles. A Quaker tract of 1666 specifically targeted the metrical psalms: "Hopkins & Sternhould's [sic] poetry ... hath put David's prayers & prophecies ... and mourning into Rhime & meeter, with an addition of their own innovation & Lies". Lies".

To their more mainstream contemporaries, the Quakers' supposed abhorrence of music epitomised their strangeness and difference. This can be seen in a 1667 publication by Solomon Eccles entitled *A Musick-Lector*, which provides a fascinating insight into early modern attitudes towards the Quakers from a Quaker perspective. ¹⁴⁶ The document takes the form of a discourse between "a musician...zealous for the Church of England", "a Baptist", and "a Quaker (so called)". The churchman and the Baptist are puzzled and dismayed by the Quaker's attitudes towards music; he is a former music teacher who has renounced his profession and burned his books and instruments. Eccles was himself a former musician and a prominent Quaker, known for dramatic public displays. In 1669 he was arrested during a visit to Galway for processing naked through the town carrying fire and brimstone and urging repentance. The Quaker character's burning of his instruments and renouncing of his musical career in the *Musick-Lector* appears to be

¹⁴³ Graves, "Singing Out of the Silence", 16–17.

¹⁴⁴ Graves, "Singing Out of the Silence", 16.

¹⁴⁵ Quoted in Kenneth L. Carroll, "Singing in the Spirit in Early Quakerism", *Quaker History* 73, no. 1 (Spring 1984), 3.

¹⁴⁶ Solomon Eccles, *A Musick-Lector: Or, The Art of MUSICK (that is so much vindicated in Christendome) Discoursed of, by Way of Dialogue* (London, 1667).

based on Eccles's own destruction of his musical instruments; this was done in public, as a symbol of his renunciation of his former beliefs. 147 Eccles's Quaker exemplifies the practices that mainstream Protestantism found disturbing, including using the informal personal pronoun "thou" (causing the Baptist to describe Quakers as "the unmannerliest people that ever came"), and reproaching the musician's use of the phrase "your humble servant, sir", but it is the Quaker's rejection of music that troubles them most of all. Of the three characters in the *Musick-Lector*, the Church of England musician and the Baptist are united by their views on worship music, while the Quaker stands in opposition to them both.

2.6 Conclusions

Eighteenth-century Dublin was home to a large and diverse Nonconformist community with varying worship music traditions, from the Quakers' total rejection of music to the Presbyterian music practices described by Boyse. While in theory these traditions were quite different from the ideals of church music espoused by the established church, in practice various external factors resulted in the conforming and nonconforming traditions (excluding the Quakers) having many features in common. The prohibitive cost of church organs, for example, meant that many parish churches continued to "line out" metrical psalms in the same way that the Presbyterians did well into the eighteenth century. Particular psalm and hymn texts were popular across several denominations, and, perhaps most significantly, the same basic repertory of tunes was in

¹⁴⁷ Caroline Leachman, "Eccles, Solomon (1617?–1682), Musician and Quaker Missionary", ODNB (24 May 2008). Eccles is likely the "seventeenth-century Quaker" Graves refers to as having burned his instruments. Graves, "Singing Out of the Silence", 16.

use on both sides of the conformation divide. The tunebooks of Thomas Smith and Joseph Boyse, and the composite psalter printed by Abraham Bradley, exemplify this "common repertory" in action, collecting together texts by authors of many different denominational allegiances alongside tunes of equally diverse origins that were in contemporary use in both conforming and non-conforming worship.

Boyse's writings express a strong belief in the concept of "Protestant unity", recognising almost all the Protestant churches as "true churches" and advocating a sense of fellowship between Protestant communities. This was particularly important in the face of what Boyse saw as an overwhelming Catholic threat: though divided on many fronts, Protestants could come together in solidarity against their common enemy. The musical traditions of Dublin's Nonconformists exhibit significant similarities across denominational lines and even, despite their theological differences, with the practices of the early eighteenth-century established church. Thus, from a musical perspective at least, it is possible to speak of a "Protestant culture" that transcended denominational allegiances. The only group not included in this musical unity were those that Boyse had also excluded from his calls for fellowship: the Quakers, whose radical politics and worship practices alienated them both musically and socially from Dublin's other Protestants. In this way, the musical culture of Dublin's early eighteenth-century "Old Dissenters" reflected the broader cultural allegiances and discontinuities between different denominational groups.

CHAPTER 3: HYMNODY AND EVANGELICALISM 1740–1800

For the majority of Dubliners, the mid- to late-eighteenth century was a period characterised by stability and growth that contrasted starkly with the turbulence of the preceding century. By this time, the sectarian tensions between Dublin's religious communities had considerably eased. The Protestant Hanoverian succession was now firmly established, and threats to the authority of the Hanoverian kings in the form of the Scottish Jacobite rebellions had been successfully fended off. As a result, the city's Catholic population no longer posed the political and cultural threat to the Establishment that it had in 1690, despite outnumbering the Protestant population from around 1750.¹ Accordingly, during the latter part of the eighteenth century the penal laws were successively repealed, culminating in the 1782 relief act which abolished almost all restrictions on Catholic worship.² Although Gaelic song and poetry continued to express the hope for deliverance at the hands of a Catholic monarch, the Catholic church, paradoxically considerably strengthened following the era of the penal laws, was firm in its support of the Hanoverian monarchy and its denunciations of public disorder, even if its relevant declarations were primarily tactical.³ In 1778, having finally agreed on an acceptable wording, the Catholic Archbishop of Dublin and seventy priests of the diocese presented themselves at the Four Courts and swore an oath of allegiance to George III.⁴

¹ See Patrick Fagan, "The Population of Dublin in the Eighteenth Century with Particular Reference to the Proportions of Protestants and Catholics". *Eighteenth-Century Ireland / Iris an dá chultúr* 6 (1991).

² Public ceremonial and the erecting of towers and steeples were still forbidden under the act; Ian McBride comments that while the Protestant administration could by this time accept Catholicism as an unobtrusive presence, they still "could not stomach ... popery with attitude". McBride, *Eighteenth-Century Ireland: The Isle of Slaves* (Dublin: Gill Books, 2009), 239.

³ Maureen Wall, *The Penal Laws, 1691–1760,* 2nd edn, Irish History Series vol 1 (Dundalk: Dundalgan Press, 1967), 3–4. McBride, *Eighteenth-Century Ireland,* 244–245. For the Gaelic Irish perspective as expressed in contemporary song and poetry, see Vincent Morley, *The Popular Mind in Eighteenth-Century Ireland* (Cork: Cork University Press, 2017).

⁴ David Dickson, *Dublin: The Making of a Capital City* (London: Profile Books, 2015), 196.

On the part of the Protestants, the earlier impulse to distinguish themselves from the "mere" native Irish through reasserting their "Englishness" had begun to give way to a proto-nationalist fellow sentiment, spurred by a shared feeling of separateness from, and even resentment towards, England.⁵ Despite the gathering political storm clouds, this was a city population more confessionally united than it had been for over a century.

By this time, the city itself had become a grand metropolis. Dublin was by 1750 the ninth largest city in Europe, larger than Madrid or Berlin, and unquestionably the "second city" of the young British Empire. Along with the continued expansion of the urban fabric into rural areas, ever grander public buildings rose amid the Georgian terraces. The late eighteenth century saw the construction of the Four Courts, the Custom House and the West Front of Trinity College, as well as the laying out of Sackville Mall (later O'Connell Street). The Wide Streets Commissioners, founded in 1757 and awarded extended powers in 1790, reflected a new attitude of transformation and modernisation directed towards an entire cityscape, replacing the cramped, close-quarters buildings of the medieval city with wide thoroughfares and setting strict guidelines for new housing development in order to produce "strictly unified" facades and terraces. A new concern for light and space, as well as more integrated city planning, was evident in projects such as the laying out of Parliament Street to connect the new Royal Exchange with a rebuilt Essex Bridge. Even the natural environment was not beyond human control: the 1770s saw the completion of the South Wall, the result of a decades-long project to make the

⁵ McBride, *Eighteenth-Century Ireland*, 398–405.

⁶ Dickson, Dublin, 152.

⁷ Dublin Civic Trust website (http://www.dublincivictrust.ie/dublins-buildings; accessed 30 March 2022).

⁸ Dickson, *Dublin*, 181–184.

muddy estuary of Dublin Bay more accessible to ships: a powerful symbol of "the taming of the elements".

The social and cultural life of the city kept pace with the built environment. Eighteenth-century Dublin owed its metropolitan status to the gentry class, who based themselves in the city during the winter season each year, from November to March; every second year this corresponded with the sitting of the Irish Parliament, but the yearly migration of the gentry classes to town took place regardless of whether the Parliament met or not. Dublin was the stage on which the kingdom's upper classes socialised, attended concerts, patronised the theatre (their favourite entertainment), attended clubs and negotiated marriages for their daughters, and all of this extravagant activity sustained the city's economy. The city's secular music scene reflected this atmosphere of bourgeois sociability in soirées at the Rotunda hospital or the Ranelagh Gardens (the latter opened in 1767 in imitation of the London gardens of the same name), and provided an outlet for philanthropic inclinations through charity performances of oratorios in the manner exemplified by *Messiah* in 1741. As a centre for entertainment and cultural activity, Dublin was thought to be second only to London in the English-speaking world. Dublin was thought to be second only to London in the English-speaking

The image of this period of history as a "golden age" for Dublin necessarily conceals a more complex reality: the wealth distribution in the city remained extremely unequal, and the extravagant wealth of the upper classes existed at close quarters with the

⁹ Dickson, *Dublin*, 170–171.

¹⁰ Tighernan Mooney and Fiona White, "The Gentry's Winter Season", in David Dickson, ed., *The Gorgeous Mask: Dublin 1700–1850*, Trinity History Workshop 2 (Dublin: Trinity History Workshop, 1987), 1–2.

¹¹ Dickson, *Dublin*, 153–155. For a detailed description of upper-class social life in Dublin during this period, in particular the theatre scene, see Mooney and White, "The Gentry's Winter Season".

¹² Dickson, *Dublin*, 158ff. Mooney and White, "The Gentry's Winter Season", 9.

¹³ Mooney and White, "The Gentry's Winter Season", 1.

increasing poverty of poorer parts of the city. ¹⁴ Nevertheless, Dublin's star was undoubtedly in the ascendant. An anonymous pamphlet printed in the city in 1761 encapsulated the contemporary image of Dublin as a city that had risen rapidly in its fortunes:

Dublin, whose Opulence, Grandeur, and Elegance have risen so sensibly within these thirty Years past, as to give it a rank of Eminence amongst the most considerable Cities in Europe ... such convenient and elegant Buildings have been raised, as render this, now great Metropolis, the Residence of almost all the Men of Property and Consequence of the Kingdom, and has ... given such an influx of Riches ... which must naturally be diffused amongst the Laborious and Industrious.¹⁵

Against this backdrop of growth, prosperity and fashionable modernity, the mideighteenth century brought two major changes to Protestant church music in Ireland: the gradual triumph of hymns over psalms as the medium of choice for congregational singing, and the rapid rise of evangelicalism. This chapter discusses the effect of those changes (which were themselves interrelated) and of other societal and cultural factors on the music of public worship in mid- to late-eighteenth-century Dublin. In particular, it examines the music of the Moravians and the Methodists, the two principal evangelical groups in Dublin during this period, and the extent to which their respective worship traditions resembled, and influenced, those of the Establishment mainstream. It also considers the general convergence of musical style across Protestant denominations towards the end of the century, and sheds new light on the music of the extra-parochial chapels.

-

¹⁴ Dickson, *The Gorgeous Mask*, vii-viii.

¹⁵ Reasons for a new bridge (Dublin, 1761), 5. GB-Lbl 1508/529(8).

3.1 The Rise of the Hymn: Isaac Watts

The term "hymn" generally refers to a non-scriptural text expressing religious sentiment, and usually sung congregationally as part of public worship. The heyday of the Protestant hymn in the British Isles was unquestionably the nineteenth century, but it was in the eighteenth century that the hymn first overtook the metrical psalm to become a core element of Protestant worship services. ¹⁶ The popularity of hymn-singing was in large part due to its being enthusiastically embraced by evangelical groups (especially the Methodists), but the motivations behind the work of the early eighteenth-century hymn writers reveal that they were also strongly influenced by more general contemporary attitudes towards modernity and improvement. The success of the hymn in the British Isles, as we shall see, owed much to the convergence of rationalist thought and the "zeal and enthusiasm" of the Nonconformist tradition. ¹⁷

The origins of hymn-singing in the English church can be traced to the Reformation era. From the outset, Lutherans and Calvinists had diverged in their attitudes to the singing of non-scriptural material. The Lutherans, who already had a tradition of metrical religious songs in the vernacular, embraced the introduction of similar songs into a congregational setting, and Luther himself composed words and music to many hymns. Calvin, on the other hand, believed firmly in the superiority of scriptural texts over "human" compositions, leading to the Reformed focus on metrical psalms in France, the Protestant Low Countries and Scotland (see 4.2.5 below). In England, despite the Lutheran tendencies evident in Miles Coverdale's *Goostly Psalms and Spiritual Songs* of

¹⁶ The Scottish Presbyterians are an exception to this trend, as they did not introduce a hymnal into their worship until the nineteenth century. Andreas Marti and Bert Polman, "Reformed and Presbyterian Church Music", GMO (20 January 2001).

¹⁷ J.R Watson, *The English Hymn: A Critical and Historical Study* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1999), 133–6.

c. 1535, the influence of the Marian exile communities pushed congregational music in a more Calvinist direction, and metrical psalms took a central place until the eighteenth century (see 1.2.2 above). From the beginning, however, hymns also had a place in the English tradition. The Elizabethan metrical psalter included an appendix of freely composed texts including six original hymns; to these the *Whole Booke of Psalmes* added three more hymns. Together, as Temperley states, these "may rightly be regarded as the first hymns of the English Protestant Church". The Lutheran influence can be seen in the German origins of two of the hymns, which were also provided with German tunes. 19

One of the most significant figures in the development and popularisation of hymnody in the British Isles was the Independent minister Isaac Watts (1674–1748). Watts was brought up firmly within the Nonconformist tradition; his father had been imprisoned for non-conformity several times in the late seventeenth century, and Watts himself refused a place at university on the grounds that attendance would have required conforming to the established church. ²⁰ To this Nonconformist upbringing, however, Watts added a theology influenced by contemporary rationalist philosophy. ²¹ Supposedly, Watts's initial motivation for composing his own hymns was his dissatisfaction with the quality of the hymns sung at his local meeting in Southampton, which were possibly those by William Barton which, as we have seen, were well known to Dublin congregations (see 2.3 above). On complaining about this to his father, Watts received an admonition "to mend the matter, which he did with great success". ²² His published work comprises

¹⁸ Nicholas Temperley, "The English Hymn before the Wesleyan Revival", in Warren Anderson, Thomas

J. Mathiesen, Susan Boynton, Tom R. Ward, John Caldwell, Nicholas Temperley and Harry Eskew, "Hymn", GMO (20 January 2001).

¹⁹ Anderson et al., "Hymn", GMO.

²⁰ Isabel Rivers, "Watts, Isaac (1674–1748), Independent Minister and Writer", ODNB (23 September 2004).

²¹ Watson, *The English Hymn*, 133–4.

²² Rivers, "Watts, Isaac", ODNB.

some 700 hymns and psalm paraphrases; his "vigorous, singable lyrics" appealed strongly to Protestants regardless of denomination, and quickly gained wide dissemination, especially in America. It has been shown that two out of every three of the most popular eighteenth-century US psalm tunes circulated with words by Watts. ²³ His texts are similarly predominant in the eighteenth-century Irish sources discussed in this chapter, continuing the trend already observed in the case of Bradley's psalter of 1740 (see 2.3.3 above).

Watts's hymn-writing was not influenced solely by theological factors, but also by external cultural and social forces, in particular the eighteenth-century drive to improve and modernise society. In the preface to his *Hymns and Spiritual Songs* (1706/9), Watts explained that one of the central aims of his work was to create hymns and psalm settings that were suited to "modern" Christianity by avoiding, reinterpreting or removing those parts of the scriptural texts that he deemed inappropriate or contrary to the spirit of the New Testament:

Far be it from my Thoughts to lay aside the Book of Psalms in publick Worship ... nothing can be suppos'd more proper to raise a pious Soul to Heaven, than some Parts of that Book ... But it must be acknowledged still, that there are a thousand Lines in it which were not made for a Church in our Days ... There are also many Deficiencies of Light and Glory, which our Lord Jesus and his Apostles have supplied in the Writings of the New Testament; and with this Advantage I have composed these Spiritual Songs.²⁴

Among Watts's techniques for supplying the "deficiencies" of the Psalm texts were replacing mentions of ritual sacrifices with references to the sacrifice of the Lamb of God,

²³ Esther R. Crookshank, "Watts, Isaac", GMO (31 January 2014).

²⁴ Isaac Watts, *Hymns and Spiritual Songs, in Three Books* (London: Printed for W. Strahan, 1773), vi. GB-Ob 147 g.139.

transforming vengeance on enemies into punishment of sinners, and suppressing proper names of people or places. Watts justified these significant alterations by arguing that his versions were closer in spirit to the teachings of the Gospel, and by citing Matthew chapter 11: "the least in the Kingdom of Heaven is greater than all the Jewish Prophets". Similar expressions of antisemitism run throughout Watts's preface, which repeatedly criticises the Psalms for having "something in [them] so extremely Jewish and cloudy, that darkens our Sight of God the Saviour; thus by keeping too close to David in the House of God, the Vail [sic] of Moses is thrown over our Hearts". Of his own work, he remarked that "I rejoice to see … David converted into a Christian".

Watts's desire to Christianise the Old Testament, replacing elements he saw as savage or foreign with ones he considered more civilised, is characteristic of eighteenth-century Enlightenment thought, which arose out of the scientific revolution and sought to bring order and civilisation to the world, casting aside anything thought to be backward or primitive, even within the realm of religion.²⁸ Watts also did not hesitate to recast the psalms into an overtly partisan political mode: his version of Psalm 67 proclaims that "British tongues" exalt God's praise and "British hearts" rejoice. Psalm 75 is subtitled, "Applied to the Glorious Revolution by King William", and his Psalm 24, "A Song for the Fifth of November".²⁹ Watts's hymns and psalms were not just "modern", but also very stridently "English"; as we have seen (1.4), these two qualities were often closely linked in the contemporary Protestant mind.

²⁵ Watts, Hymns and Spiritual Songs, vi.

²⁶ Watts, Hymns and Spiritual Songs, iv.

²⁷ Watts, Hymns and Spiritual Songs, x.

²⁸ Merry S. Wiesner-Hanks, Early Modern Europe, 1450–1789 (Cambridge University Press, 2013), 367.

²⁹ Watson, *The English Hymn*, 155.

3.2 The Moravians

3.2.1 Origins of Moravianism

One of Dublin's first significant evangelical congregations was established by the Moravians, who as heirs to the eastern European pre-Reformation Hussite movement were at the forefront of the eighteenth-century Evangelical Revival. After being expelled from Moravia (now part of the Czech Republic) by the Catholic rulers there in 1722, they were offered sanctuary by Count Nikolaus von Zinzendorf, a young landowner who allowed them to settle on his estate in Saxony. Tinzendorf was just twenty-two years old, and had been strongly influenced by Pietism, a movement within the Lutheran church similar to evangelicalism which promoted lay involvement in the church, the importance of studying the Bible, and strict moral discipline. On Zinzendorf's estate, and under his leadership, the pre-Reformation ideas of the Moravian brethren developed into a new Moravian religion and culture, albeit one which theoretically preserved the episcopacy of the former church. Moravian historical narratives traditionally date the foundation of the "renewed" Moravian church to a "collective religious experience" which took place on the estate, with Zinzendorf present, in 1727.

Eighteenth-century Moravianism promoted a mystical and sensual understanding of Christ, focussing in particular on the sacrifice of Christ on the cross. Moravian religious culture, particularly that of the mid-eighteenth century, was filled with imagery of the wounds and blood of Jesus, particularly the side-wound that had been caused by the Roman centurion's spear. The Moravians believed that one should embrace one's life as

³⁰ Wiesner-Hanks, Early Modern Europe, 423.

³¹ Colin Podmore, *The Moravian Church in England 1728–1760* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1998), 5. Nola Reed Knouse, ed., *The Music of the Moravian Church in America* (New York: University of Rochester Press, 2008), 12.

³² Podmore, *The Moravian Church in England*, 6.

a sinner, accept that salvation came only through the sacrifice of Christ, and celebrate "all of life" as a liturgy and act of worship. 33 In practice, Moravianism encouraged the establishment of religious communities in which work, life and worship were fully integrated. Congregations were divided into fellowship groups known as "bands" or "choirs", with single men and women separated from married couples and children; groups of "single brothers" or "single sisters" were encouraged to live together communally until they got married. Questions such as who to marry and when, like the majority of decisions taken within the community, were regularly decided "by lot". This process involved the drawing of lots to supply one of three answers to the question asked: yes, no, or blank (unclear). Putting a question to the lot was believed to place the outcome in the hands of Christ, rather than have it subject to human influence. 34

The reliance on decision-making by lot, where there was only a one in three chance of receiving an affirmative "yes", meant that the machinery of Moravian administration tended to move slowly. ³⁵ Despite this, the Moravian commitment to evangelism coupled with great popular interest in the new church allowed the Moravians to make rapid advances throughout Europe and the wider world. Within just thirty years, Moravian missionaries had been sent as far away as Suriname, South Africa, Persia, Egypt, the Gold Coast, Greenland, and Jamaica. In North America, they first settled in Georgia before moving to Pennsylvania, where they established the settlements named Bethlehem and Nazareth that remain significant Moravian centres in the present day. In Europe, where religious toleration was a thornier problem, the Moravians tended to organise as societies within the existing state churches. ³⁶ In England, the Moravians'

³³ Nola Reed Knouse, "Moravian Music: Introduction, Theme, and Variations", *Journal of Moravian History*, no. 2 (Spring 2007): 40. Podmore, *The Moravian Church in England*, 31.

³⁴ Podmore, *The Moravian Church in England*, 106.

³⁵ Podmore, *The Moravian Church in England*, 106.

³⁶ Knouse, The Music of the Moravian Church in America, 13.

episcopal structure, as well as Zinzendorf's aristocratic credentials, lent them an air of respectability among the established church authorities, and the first Moravian congregations were established there in 1742.³⁷

3.2.2 Moravianism in Dublin

Popular interest in Moravianism, and desire to join the church, often outpaced the church's central administration. Hence the establishment of Moravian societies was more often due to the enthusiasm and energy of individual evangelists on the periphery of the church. It was one of these energetic individuals, the English hymnographer John Cennick (1718–55), who first brought Moravianism to Dublin. Cennick had formerly been associated with George Whitefield's Calvinistic Methodists, and had already amassed large numbers of followers through his evangelising work in the North of England. He became fascinated by Moravianism in the 1740s, and several of the congregations he had already established in England went on to affiliate themselves with the Moravians. Rennick was a skilled and persuasive preacher; though his preaching style was not always looked upon favourably by the Moravian administration (Zinzendorf memorably described it as "theatrical and comedian-like"), it undoubtedly achieved results. In 1744, two Dublin Baptists visiting Cennick's church in London were so impressed by his preaching that they invited him to Dublin. Despite harbouring what he himself described as "a strong prejudice against the Irish nation and people", Cennick agreed, but was

³⁷ Podmore, *The Moravian Church in England*, 7, 24–25.

³⁸ Peter J. Lineham, "Cennick, John (1718–1755), Lay Preacher and Moravian Minister", ODNB (23 September 2004).

³⁹ Zinzendorf quoted in Podmore, *The Moravian Church in England*, 200.

unable to make the journey until 1746.⁴⁰ On arriving in Dublin, he instantly drew crowds at the old meeting house in Skinners' Alley, which his Baptist hosts had refurbished for his use.⁴¹ According to a relevant entry in Cennick's diary, he preached "twice daily",

& the crowds were so great that those who hear must be 2 or 3 hours before the time else they could not get in ... On Sundays all the Tops of Houses near us, all walls and windows were cover'd with people, & I must get in at a window & creep over their heads to the pulpit if I would preach . . . Some curious people at several times counted the congregation and found it generally more than a thousand & once 1,323.⁴²

Despite Cennick's popularity, however, he was not everywhere warmly welcomed. Condemnations by Presbyterians and other Dissenters began to appear in the press almost immediately upon Cennick's arrival, and a Lutheran minister who was in port on his way to America "related many things to [the Moravians'] prejudice out of Germany". As In addition, many Catholic priests also condemned Cennick and his message (one priest even described him as "a Devil in human shape and no real man"), and threatened any Catholics who attended his services with excommunication. Whether as a result of these pronouncements or not, Cennick and his congregation became frequent targets of harassment and mob violence. He wrote in his diary that his followers were threatened by "young gentlemen [who] behav'd rude and drew their swords & broke in, making towards me as if they would do hurt", and by mobs of dissatisfied Catholics who made it "dangerous for our people to go out after the meetings were ended ... not a few were hurt

⁴⁰ John Cennick, "An Account of the most remarkable Passages relating to the Awakening in Dublin and Ireland, from the beginning till the settling of the Congregation", 63. Transcribed by John and Edna Cooper. Private collection of Steven C. Smyrl.

⁴¹ This was the meeting house formerly used by one of the two schismatic Baptist groups (see 2.4). Steven C. Smyrl, *Dictionary of Dublin Dissent: Dublin's Protestant Dissenting Meeting Houses 1660–1920* (Dublin: A. & A. Farmar, 2009), 200.

⁴² Cennick, quoted in Seán Boyle, "Swaddling John and the Great Awakening", *History Ireland* 18, No. 5 (2010).

⁴³ Cennick, "An Account", 66–67, 101.

⁴⁴ Cennick, "An Account", 69.

by blows, stones, swords &c". ⁴⁵ Even an explicit order by the Catholic Archbishop, read out in Catholic chapels, failed to quell the attacks. ⁴⁶ Perhaps the violence was truly ideologically motivated; perhaps Cennick and the new Moravian society were simply unfortunate victims of the street brawls that were endemic in Dublin during this period. John Wesley, for example, who met with similar mob violence some years later, attributed it to the Liberty and Ormond mobs, and described the city as being filled with "murderers". ⁴⁷ Clearly, Dublin was a challenging environment in which to evangelise.

Despite these difficulties, by 1747 Cennick had attracted 520 committed followers, two-thirds of them women. Hese were organised into bands by Cennick's colleague and close friend, the former Dublin Baptist Benjamin Latrobe, and a number of "leaders" were appointed for each group. In his diary, Cennick listed these leaders' names along with their former religious affiliation, and this list gives an impression of the character of this very early Moravian congregation. Of the thirty-two leaders, thirteen had come from the established church, more than from any other group. Eight were former Presbyterians, and six were Baptists—an understandably high number in proportion to small size of the Baptist population, given the initial strong association between the Baptists and the Moravians. There were also a Bradilonian, a Muggletonian, a Separatist, a Quaker and a Roman Catholic. The presence of a Catholic among the band leaders demonstrates that the Moravians were not opposed to welcoming Catholics into their

⁴⁵ Quoted in Boyle, "Swaddling John".

⁴⁶ Cennick, "An Account", 98.

⁴⁷ Smyrl, *Dictionary of Dublin Dissent*, 110–111.

⁴⁸ Boyle, "Swaddling John".

⁴⁹ Cennick, "An Account", 126. In Moravian contexts, the word "congregation" is sometimes used to distinguish a Moravian group that has officially been recognised ("settled") by the international Moravian Church authorities from a "society" or group of followers that has not yet been so recognised. The Dublin Moravian group was not officially settled as a congregation until 1750 (See Samuel George Hanna, "The Origin and Nature of the Gracehill Moravian Settlement, 1764–1855, with Special Reference to the Work of John Cennick in Ireland, 1746–1755", *Transactions of the Moravian Historical Society* 21, no. 2 (1967): 13). The term is here applied to the Dublin congregation from its beginnings, to ensure consistency of use across the thesis as a whole.

congregation, and corroborates the historian J. E. Hutton's statement that Catholics did attend Cennick's sermons. ⁵⁰ Despite this openness, however, very few Catholics seem to have joined the Moravian ranks. Culturally, the Moravian congregation remained a Protestant group, whose membership, as in England, was drawn primarily from the established church. ⁵¹ Cennick operated with the Archbishop's approval and made regular appeals to the Prayer Book, following the general Moravian belief that all prayer books were of "some degree of usefulness", though subordinate to scripture. ⁵²

One of the criticisms which the Moravian church administration levelled against Cennick was that his charismatic preaching outweighed his pastoral care.⁵³ It is certainly true that Cennick was more of an evangelist than a minister, and in Dublin as in the north of England, his principal aim was to provide the initial impetus for the formation of a society rather than to remain and minister to the new society himself. Although Cennick spent considerable time in Dublin between his initial visit and his early death in 1755 at the age of thirty-seven, he was never permanently based there, instead dividing his time between England, Dublin and Ulster.⁵⁴ Ulster particularly commanded much of his attention: Cennick established hundreds of Moravian societies there.⁵⁵ The daily administration of the Dublin congregation thus fell to others such as Benjamin Latrobe, who remained prominent in the congregation for some years before moving to England to serve as the principal minister at Fulneck in Yorkshire, eventually becoming the leader

⁵⁰ J. E. Hutton, *History of the Moravian Church*, 2nd edition (1909), chapter 11.

⁵¹ Boyle, "Swaddling John".

⁵² Hanna, "The Origin and Nature of the Gracehill Moravian Settlement", 9. The legal position of the Dublin Moravians at this time is not clear. Cennick's time in Dublin is contemporaneous with an ongoing debate in Britain as to whether the Moravians should be considered "foreign Protestant strangers" due to their German connections (see chapter 4 below), or forced to register as Dissenters. There is no mention of a similar debate in the Dublin Moravian congregation's records. For details of the debate in Britain, see Podmore, *The Moravian Church in England*, 170ff.

⁵³ Podmore, *The Moravian Church in England*, 197.

⁵⁴ Lineham, "Cennick, John", ODNB.

⁵⁵ Boyle, "Swaddling John".

of the British Moravian church.⁵⁶ Subsequent ministers at the church were a mixture of Irish and English, as well as continental Europeans such as John Toeltschig, an actual native of Moravia, who arrived in Dublin with his wife around 1747.⁵⁷ Evidence from the memorial inscriptions at the Moravian graveyard in Whitechurch also suggests that at least two women, Martha Schneider and Sarah Steinhauer, served as ministers of the congregation in the late eighteenth century.⁵⁸

The eighteenth-century Dublin congregation organised itself on the standard Moravian model. The congregation was divided by gender, marital status and age into six "fellowship bands" consisting respectively of married women, married men, single women, single men, boys and girls. Women were addressed as "sisters", and men as "brothers". The congregation's copious writings record that they held services every day, with two on Sunday, while various church councils and committees met regularly to manage church affairs. Individual congregants spent much time on visiting prospective converts and on maintaining regular correspondence with other Moravian congregations, particularly the London one. ⁵⁹ Although the Moravians would never attain the same popularity as their rivals, the Methodists, the Dublin congregation numbered consistently in the hundreds until the end of the eighteenth century. ⁶⁰

⁵⁶ John C. S. Mason, "La Trobe, Benjamin (1728–1786), Moravian Leader", ODNB (23 September 2004). ⁵⁷ Sean J. Murphy, ed., *Memorial Inscriptions from the Moravian Cemetery, Whitechurch, County Dublin* (Bray: Centre for Irish Genealogical and Historical Studies, 2012), 6. Cennick, "An Account", 128. A list of ministers at the Moravian church during the eighteenth century can be found in J. J. England, *Short Accounts of the work carried on by the Ancient Protestant Episcopal Moravian Church (or "Unitas Fratrum"—"United Brethren") in Ireland, from 1746* (Leeds: Goodall and Suddick, 1889), 10.

⁵⁸ Murphy, *Memorial Inscriptions*, 7.

⁵⁹ These statements about the Dublin Moravian congregation are based on the evidence of the congregational diaries preserved at Gracehill and accessed in microfilm copy at PRONI (see bibliography for details).

⁶⁰ In 1753 a gathering of around 300 people was described as "the whole Congr[egation] and Society" (PRONI MIC1F/4/1/3, 1 December). At the end of 1774 there were 238 persons in the congregation (PRONI MIC1F/4/1/8).

Towards the middle of the century, the international Moravian church underwent a period of crisis that has since become known as the "sifting time", "a brief but disturbing period of frivolity... when Moravian devotional life reached an extreme of sentimentality and sensuality". 61 Around this time, reports began to surface of controversial practices in Moravian communities in Germany, in which the already heightened sensual spirituality of the Moravian "blood and wounds" theology was expressed even more intensely through sexual imagery, an obsession with childish language, and a fascination with the wounds of Jesus that the twentieth-century historian Jacob John Sessler described as "pathological". 62 Much of this exuberance was centred on Zinzendorf's charismatic son, Christian "Christel" Renatus, and the community of Hernnhaag, in which he was the leader of the single brothers, but the imagery and language of the "sifting time" pervaded the entire Moravian religious culture of the mid-eighteenth century. 63 It was Zinzendorf himself who popularised the theology of the wounds through his influential text, "Litany of the Wounds of Jesus", and who promoted the concept of Moravianism as a "marriage religion" in which Christ was the husband of all his followers. 64 Podmore has suggested that the childlike irrationality of the "sifting time" represented a reaction to the rational, scientific mindset of the Enlightenment, much as Evangelism in general reacted to the increasing rationalism of established church worship.⁶⁵

Although English Moravians would subsequently distance themselves from Zinzendorf and roundly reject the more controversial aspects of his theology and practice,

⁶¹ Craig D. Atwood, "Understanding Zinzendorf's Blood and Wounds Theology", *Journal of Moravian History*, no. 1 (2006): 32.

⁶² Quoted in Atwood, "Blood and Wounds Theology", 33.

⁶³ Paul Peucker, "'Inspired by Flames of Love': Homosexuality, Mysticism, and Moravian Brothers around 1750", *Journal of the History of Sexuality* 15, no. 1 (2006): 45. Atwood, "Blood and Wounds Theology", 32–33.

⁶⁴ Atwood, "Blood and Wounds Theology". Podmore, *The Moravian Church in England*, 136.

⁶⁵ Podmore, *The Moravian Church in England*, 134.

during the eighteenth century the majority of them enthusiastically embraced the language, imagery and practices of the "sifting time". 66 All indications would suggest that the Dublin Moravians also did so; Cennick himself often spoke in the language of the "blood and wounds", and is known to have prayed Zinzendorf's Litany with the Dublin congregation. 67 Hutton comments that Cennick witnessed first-hand the epicentre of the "sifting time" in Herrnhaag and did not seem shocked or perturbed by it. 68 His letters are filled with Moravian imagery and language, including references to himself as a bee flying in and out of Christ's wounds. 69 Similar imagery can be found in the Dublin congregational diaries. 70 Latrobe, during the period he was based in London, wrote several fervent letters to Christel Renatus that are saturated with blood and wounds imagery. 71 At least two Moravian families in Dublin even named their sons after Zinzendorf's son: two young boys named Christel were among the first burials in the church graveyard in 1754. 72

In England, public awareness of the "sifting time" controversies dealt a serious blow to the emerging Moravian church in the mid-1750s.⁷³ The deaths of both Zinzendorf and Christel within a short space of time, as well as a series of financial difficulties, also dampened much of the exuberant spirit of the age. As a result of this, the Moravians in England assumed a lower profile for the remainder of the eighteenth century, before

⁶⁶ Colin Podmore, "Zinzendorf and the English Moravians", *Journal of Moravian History*, no. 3 (Autumn 2007): 50. Podmore, *The Moravian Church in England*, 135–136. For an example of later English Moravian criticism of and rejection of Zinzendorf and the "sifting time", see Hutton, *History of the Moravian Church*. ⁶⁷ Cennick, "An Account", 125. PRONI MIC1F/4/1/3 also contains several references to Cennick's regular preaching of "The Litany" in mid-1754.

⁶⁸ Hutton, *History of the Moravian Church*, chapter 11.

⁶⁹ Podmore, Moravian Church in England, 135.

⁷⁰ "We also... would all agree ... that We as little Bees would feed on the Corpse of Jesus Christ, & thus labour fellowshiply together for Him". PRONI MIC1F/4/1/3. 9 December 1754.

⁷¹ Peucker, "Inspired by Flames of Love", 45.

⁷² PRONI MIC1F/4/1/3. 10 & 11 October 1754.

⁷³ Podmore, *Moravian Church in England*, 266ff.

eventually re-emerging on the strength of their nineteenth-century missionary work. ⁷⁴ In contrast, the crisis of the 1750s does not appear to have produced a dramatic change in the lives or fortunes of the Dublin Moravians. They were already a small community worshipping quite unobtrusively, and business at the church appears to have carried on more or less as usual, although the congregational diaries express great grief at the loss of Zinzendorf and his son—particularly as they believed Christel had been on the verge of making a trip to Ireland.⁷⁵ Though printed in Dublin, John Roche's virulently anti-Moravian tract of 1751, Moravian Heresy, provoked no controversy in the city, despite considerably damaging the reputation of the Moravian church in England. ⁷⁶ Although the diaries continue to record occasional incidences of violence and disorder directed at Moravian meetings or congregation members for the remainder of the century, these do not appear to have increased in frequency; the diaries also record many friendly interactions with non-Moravian Dubliners, including their former rivals the Methodists.⁷⁷ "Strangers" are often recorded as being present at services, and while the decision to admit all comers to the Christmas service in 1777 was subsequently regretted (the following year only those who "looked decent" were admitted), for the most part the diary records no trouble caused by visitors.⁷⁸

⁷⁴ Podmore, *Moravian Church in England*, 289.

⁷⁵ PRONI MIC1F/4/1/2, December 1752.

⁷⁶ Podmore, *The Moravian Church in England*, 268. There is no mention of this publication either in Cennick's diary or in the congregational records.

⁷⁷ "Afterwards an opportunity was given the Brs Lander & Clemens of becoming acquainted with some Leaders of the Methodists, who attend our preachings, and behave friendly towards us, being invited to dine with them in a village near our burying-ground. Tho' we do not expect much real benefit from our connexion with the Methodists, yet we think it not amiss to preserve, as much as in us lies, their friendship and good will towards us." PRONI MIC1F/4/1/9, December 1776.

⁷⁸ PRONI MIC1F/4/2/6.

3.2.3 The Moravian Church on Big Butter Lane

The most significant challenge faced by the Moravian community during the eighteenth century took place very early in its history. The Skinners' Alley meeting house which the Moravians initially used for their worship was owned by the schoolteacher Samuel Edwards, whose father, Oswald Edwards, had been the preacher there when it was still in use by the schismatic Baptists (see 2.4 above). In October of 1747, Edwards, who according to Charles Wesley "quite disliked his tenants", wrote to the Moravian congregation notifying them that he was increasing the rent to £16 per year—twice what the Moravians were paying.⁷⁹ This increase was almost certainly strongly influenced by John Wesley, whose relationship with the Moravian Brethren was complex and often hostile, and whose followers took possession of the house at the increased rent as soon as the Moravians left.⁸⁰ Their expulsion from the meeting house took place—violently—on Christmas Eve 1747. Although Edwards maintained that the handover was relatively peaceful, an account written by the Moravians describes several incidents of violence, including Cennick's being struck in the face and a man's being thrown down the steps of the pulpit. Cennick himself recorded in his diary that "vile men ... came and burst open the doors, threw down and abused those within, and having thrust them out, planted a guard in the house".81

Now lacking a place of worship, the Moravians met for a while in private houses before eventually acquiring suitable new premises on Big Butter Lane (sometimes also called Boater Lane or Booter Lane, and nowadays known as Bishop Street). This new

⁷⁹ Wesley quoted in Smyrl, *Dictionary of Dublin Dissent*, 108.

⁸⁰ Smyrl, *Dictionary of Dublin Dissent*, 201–205. For details of the complicated relationship between Wesley and the Moravian brethren, see Podmore, *The Moravian Church in England*, especially earlier chapters.

⁸¹ "An Account of the Brethren's first coming to Ireland, with all matters relating to their losing Skinners Alley meeting house"; MS, transcribed by Dudley Cooney and quoted in Smyrl, *Dictionary of Dublin Dissent*, 202–203. Cennick, "An Account", 127.

building was a Georgian terraced house which they repurposed for their own use, turning two of the upper floors into a large galleried hall that could seat 400 people. ⁸² The use of a meeting hall such as this was common in English Moravian settlements such as Fulneck, and from this it is possible to deduce some details about the interior at Butter Lane. Because "the Holy City had no Temple", Moravian halls were usually without an altar or pulpit, and the influence of Zinzendorf's tastes lent an "aristocratic" but orderly feel to the decoration; they were also generally "well lit by natural clear glass windows". ⁸³ The Butter Lane hall also followed standard Moravian practice of being proximate to residential areas—in this case, in the same building—to emphasise the closeness of religious worship to daily life. The minister and his wife appear to have lived in the building, possibly along with the Single Brothers. ⁸⁴

In 1754, the congregation decided to erect a church on the plot of land directly behind their Butter Lane house, paid for by subscriptions from the congregation (Cennick contributed £20). ⁸⁵ The foundation stone of the new church was laid on 9 September 1754, and by April 1755 the church was complete. The Moravians retained possession of the Butter Lane house, which was used as a residence for the Single Sisters. The new church was a simple gable-roofed building with an east-west orientation, large windows, and an internal gallery. It was built out of calp limestone, a cheap but sturdy material in very common use in Dublin at the time, and displayed little in the way of external ornament. ⁸⁶ The original church had a belfry, though this had been demolished by the late nineteenth

⁸² Edna Cooper, "Notes on the various buildings used by the Moravian Church in Dublin, 1746–1980, and sketches by J. J. England, 1889" (1999) Unpublished MS from private collection of Steven C. Smyrl.

⁸³ Podmore, Moravian Church in England, 144–6.

⁸⁴ Cooper, "Notes on the various buildings".

⁸⁵ J.H. Cooper and E. Cooper, "Extracts from the Dublin Congregational Diary 12/23.10.1751—1.7.1756 & 1777". Unpublished MS from private collection of Steven C. Smyrl.

⁸⁶ Christine Casey, *Dublin: the City within the Grand and Royal Canals and the Circular Road with the Phoenix Park* (London: Yale University Press, 2005), 633.

century; this would imply that the church also had a bell, though there is no mention of it in the congregation's records aside from a payment in 1771 for "a spring for the Bell". ⁸⁷ The church building was surrounded by a garden which also served as a burial ground until the congregation acquired a dedicated plot in Whitechurch in 1764. A drawing and plan of the church and grounds made in 1889 shows that the church could at that time be accessed via a passage from Bishop street cut through the original Moravian house. ⁸⁸ This passage, or one similar to it, existed by 1755, when the congregational diary recorded "cleaning the avenue leading to [the church] from the street". ⁸⁹ The drawing also includes some elements that were added to the church in later years, such as a schoolhouse (built in 1798) and a large pulpit inside the main church building, located at the east side. ⁹⁰

The vitality of the Dublin Moravian congregation in the latter half of the century can be seen in the decision to set up a second preaching house in 1769 in Stafford Street. As in Butter Lane, the upper part of the house was used as "dwelling rooms", in this case for the Single Brothers who moved in in 1772.⁹¹ The Dublin congregational diary records the ministers' splitting their time between Butter Lane and Stafford Street.⁹² Although attendance was initially high at the new chapel, by 1777 the congregation had dwindled somewhat and the decision was made to sell the meeting house to pay for repairs to the Butter Lane house and church.⁹³

The original church building at Butter Lane remained the locus of Moravian activity in Dublin until 1917, when a lease was taken out on a new property on the south side of the church, fronting Kevin Street. The new building incorporated a grand meeting

87 England, Short Accounts, 8. PRONI MIC1F/4/6/5, 9 March 1771.

⁸⁸ Sketches by J. J. England, included in Cooper, "Notes on the various buildings", 9.

⁸⁹ Cooper and Cooper, "Extracts from the Dublin Congregational Diary".

⁹⁰ Sketches by England, in Cooper, "Notes on the various buildings".

⁹¹ Smyrl, Dictionary of Dublin Dissent, 212.

⁹² PRONI MIC1F/4/1/8, September 1770.

⁹³ England, Short Accounts, 9.

hall on the first floor, which was formally opened with a service in 1917, but the old church and schoolroom were renovated and connected to the new building by means of a covered cloister, so presumably remained in use in some capacity. ⁹⁴ The congregation remained active at the site until 1959, when the property was put up for sale because of declining numbers. The Dublin congregation was officially closed by the Moravian Synod at the end of 1980, and the city's remaining Moravians now meet at the Lutheran church. ⁹⁵ Both the original church building and the later Kevin street property still stand; the eighteenth-century structure was in a dilapidated condition and in use as a warehouse as recently as 2005, but since then it has been renovated somewhat and incorporated into an adjoining office building complex. ⁹⁶ The interior unfortunately was not accessible at the time of writing, but a description of the inside of the building published in 2005 mentioned very little of the original fabric, save for the survival of an old staircase leading to the gallery. ⁹⁷

3.2.4 Moravian Music

Music was absolutely central to Moravian religious culture, as Zinzendorf believed that music was the best expression of religious truth as understood by the heart (rather than by the more rational head). 98 The Moravian view that all of life was a liturgy and celebration, combined with the aristocratic sensibilities derived from Zinzendorf, also led to the cultivation of a high standard of musical ability among the congregations. The

⁹⁴ Cooper, "Notes on the various buildings". The first-floor meeting hall is described by Casey as "a barrel-vaulted interior the full width of the building". Casey, *Dublin*, 634.

⁹⁵ Cooper, "Notes on the various buildings".

⁹⁶ Kenneth Ferguson, "Rocque's Map and the History of Nonconformity in Dublin: A Search for Meeting Houses", *Dublin Historical Record* 58, no. 2 (Autumn 2005): 134 & 137.

⁹⁷ Casey, *Dublin*, 633.

⁹⁸ Knouse, "Moravian Music", 40. Podmore, *The Moravian Church in England*, 149.

cornerstone of Moravian musical practice was the congregational singing of hymns, which took place at all services and served as a "unifying factor" tying disparate forms of service together.⁹⁹ Particularly important was the unique form of service known as the "Singstunde" or "Singing Hour", during which the liturgist—generally the minister—would combine stanzas from different hymns to develop a particular theme or message. The liturgist would begin the singing, and the congregation would join in once they recognised the hymn being sung. ¹⁰⁰ Zinzendorf believed that the Singing Hour was similar to, but also superior to, a sermon or homily, and was only surpassed as a form of worship by Communion, as the participation of the full congregation in the singing created a strong sense of religious community. ¹⁰¹ Hymn singing was also a central part of the Communion services and of the Lovefeasts, which were essentially Singing Hours accompanied by a fellowship meal. ¹⁰²

Moravian hymn-singing was remarkable not only for its ubiquity but also for its quality. An eighteenth-century parish church singer who visited the Moravian town of Fulneck in Yorkshire wrote that he was struck particularly by the singing, "it being very different from what he had been used to, and he confessed it made a deeper impression upon his Heart than the Preaching." Despite this, the ideal remained a "uniform and harmonious" sound in which no individual voice dominated, as was often the case in the parish churches under the "old way of singing". Christian LaTrobe, a skilled composer and the son of the Dublin Moravian Benjamin Latrobe, wrote that the Moravians, by "checking any disposition to vociferation in individuals ... acquired a degree of perfection in congregational singing, which is not attainable where there is no attention to the general

⁹⁹ Podmore, *The Moravian Church in England*, 149.

¹⁰⁰ Knouse, "Moravian Music", 42.

¹⁰¹ Podmore, *The Moravian Church in England*, 149.

¹⁰² Nola Reed Knouse, "Moravians, Music of the", GMO (20 January 2001).

¹⁰³ Quoted in Podmore, *The Moravian Church in England*, 149.

effect, but where every one is left to suit the strength of his voice, however grating, to the ardour of his feelings, or the vanity of his mind."¹⁰⁴ Thus, in the words of the Moravian hymnographer Christian Gregor, performance standards and style could be made "perfectly uniform" across all Moravian congregations, "scattered as we are in all parts of the world".¹⁰⁵ It was in search of this uniformity that LaTrobe derived most of the contents of his own Moravian hymn-book, which he published in 1790, directly from the work of Christian Gregor.¹⁰⁶

It was usual for congregants to memorise the hymns and to sing without books; in the words of the Synod of 1750, this allowed worshippers to "live in the matter". Only a "stranger" should be expected to require a hymnal, unless a new hymn was being introduced with which the congregation was unfamiliar. The Moravian musicologist Nola Reed Knouse comments that the members of Moravian congregations generally possessed an "unusual command of the hymnal". It was likely this practice of singing from memory that gave rise to the "peculiarities" in performance which LaTrobe ruefully states have been adopted by "some of our congregations in England", and may be the source of Podmore's description of English Moravian singing as "heavily ornamented" and "florid". These comments suggest that Moravian music did not always achieve the high standards of performance aspired to by LaTrobe and others in their writings on the topic.

¹⁰⁴ Christian LaTrobe, quoted in Knouse, "Moravian Music", 42. Note that Benjamin Latrobe and his son Christian LaTrobe's surnames were capitalised differently. Knouse describes LaTrobe as "the only Moravian composer to achieve renown during his lifetime". (Knouse, "Moravians, Music of the", GMO). ¹⁰⁵ Christian Gregor, quoted in Christian Ignatius LaTrobe, *Hymn-tunes, sung in the church of the United*

¹⁰⁵ Christian Gregor, quoted in Christian Ignatius LaTrobe, *Hymn-tunes, sung in the church of the United Brethren* (London: printed for the author, by J. Bland, [1790]), preface. GB-Lbl Music A.1231.kk.

¹⁰⁶ LaTrobe, *Hymn-tunes*, preface.

¹⁰⁷ Synod results of 18 November 1750, quoted in Knouse, "Moravian Music", 41–42.

¹⁰⁸ Knouse, "Moravians, Music of the", GMO.

¹⁰⁹ LaTrobe, Hymn-tunes, preface. Podmore, The Moravian Church in England, 151–2.

The Dublin congregation fully embraced the Moravian emphasis on song. 110 Dedicated "Singing Hours" took place multiple times per week, led by the church ministers, including Cennick himself when he was in the city. Special Singing Hours were held for the Girls' band on Wednesday evenings. The singing of "pretty Verses" was also a key part of the Lovefeasts that were held on Saturdays, and occasionally also on other occasions, such as the birthdays of congregants. 111 On a smaller scale, hymns were sung as part of regular prayer meetings on Sunday afternoons; the level of emotion which the singing produced in the congregation can be seen in the diary entry for Sunday 1 October 1747, which records that at the afternoon meeting that day "at the Conclusion of the Hymn there was such a particular presence of our Husband felt by all, that all the Cong[regatio]n prostrated themselves before Him of their own Accord". 112 Psalms were also sung, particularly on important church occasions such as Christmas and New Year. On at least a few occasions, the diaries and cash books record that hymns and psalms were printed, presumably for congregational use, but no examples of these printings are known to have survived.¹¹³ One of the Christmas psalms is described as having been "composed upon the occasion", though the composer's identity is not recorded. ¹¹⁴ In addition to hymns and psalms, there are several references in the diary to the singing of "doxologies" and "liturgies"; LaTrobe's hymnal includes chants for the "Litany" and the "Doxology", suggesting that it was usual for parts of the Moravian service to be chanted. 115

 $^{^{110}}$ The following general statements about singing at the Dublin Moravian church are derived from the congregational diaries (PRONI MIC1F/4/1/1–11).

¹¹¹ See PRONI MIC1F/4/1/1, 9 August 1749.

¹¹² PRONI MIC1F/4/1/1, 1 October 1747.

¹¹³ See PRONI MIC1f/4/6/5, 18 February 1771; MIC1F/4/1/9, 24 December 1776; MIC1F/4/10, 24 December 1780.

¹¹⁴ PRONI MIC1F/4/1/9, 24 December 1777.

¹¹⁵ See, for example, PRONI MIC1F/4/1/9, 24 December 1777; MIC1F/4/1/8, 11 September and 2 October 1770. LaTrobe, *Hymn-tunes*, 68–70.

For the most part, the singing appears to have been led by the minister. Occasionally, however, there are references to more complex textures: at the opening of the Stafford Street chapel in 1769, "an anthem" was "sung alternately by the choir in the gallery and the congregation below". 116 "Choir" in the Moravian context is often used as a synonym for Fellowship band, with no musical connotations— "single sisters' choir", for example—but this reference suggests the existence of a separate, singing choir that sat apart from the congregation. This may have been specially formed for the occasion, as a complex anthem would probably require rehearsal to an extent that hymns would not.

Knouse states in her survey of American Moravian music that "all students in Moravian schools received a thorough grounding in vocal music", specifically "hymn tunes and chorales", as well as being encouraged to learn instruments. ¹¹⁷ The Dublin Moravians operated schools for girls (from 1753) and boys (from 1778). ¹¹⁸ The existence of a special "Singing Hour" for the girls implies that the children of the congregation would have been familiar with the hymns used at the church. It is unclear, however, whether the schoolchildren were ever marshalled into a choir in the mode of the parish charity schools.

3.2.5 Sources of Dublin Moravian hymns

The principal source from which the Dublin Moravian congregation appear to have drawn their musical material was John Gambold's *Collection of Hymns of the Children of God*

¹¹⁶ England, Short Accounts, 9.

¹¹⁷ Knouse, Music of the Moravian Church in America, 19.

¹¹⁸ Cooper, "Notes on the various buildings".

in all Ages, a monumental hymnal in two volumes published in London in 1754. 119 Published in the wake of the "sifting time" crisis in England, it attempted to move away from the controversial imagery of the preceding decade and to emphasise the Moravian church's long history and close links with other denominations, including the established church. Accordingly, it included both newly-composed Moravian hymns and older hymns drawn from the Lutheran and established church traditions, including texts from the Old and New Versions and a large number of German-language hymns. ¹²⁰ The congregational diary for 1754 mentions Gambold's hymn book in its list of "notable events" of that year, recording that "A Complete English Authorized Brethren's Hymn Book [was] printed & designed chiefly for the use of the Congregations in union with the Brethren's-Church". 121 Since this hymnal was never published in Dublin, the Moravian congregation must have imported at least one copy, as the entry for Christmas Eve of 1754 notes that "many Verses & Hymns out of the New Hymn Book were sung". 122 In 1759, the congregation paid 5s 7d to a Thomas Gladwell for something related to "the Hymn Books", though the exact action is illegible; the following May 10s 3d were paid for "Carriage from London & other [Expenses] of the Hymn Book". 123

Although, as we have seen, the common Moravian practice was to sing the hymns from memory, there are indications in the diary that the Dublin Moravians may have sung from their own books, at least towards the end of the century. The diary entry for Christmas 1774 complained that the music was sub-par on account of the brothers' and

¹¹⁹ John Gambold, ed. A Collection of Hymns of the Children of God in all Ages, From the Beginning till now. In Two Parts. Designed chiefly for the Use of the Congregations in Union with the Brethren's Church (London: Printed; and to be had at all the Brethren's Chapels, 1754). GB-Ob 14721.e.8.

Gambold's attempts to move away from "sifting time" imagery are discussed in Podmore, *The Moravian Church in England*, 286–7.

¹²¹ PRONI MIC1F/4/1/3, 31 December 1754.

¹²² PRONI MIC1F/4/1/3, 24 December 1754.

¹²³ PRONI MIC1F/4/6/3, 9 December 1759 and 4 May 1760.

sisters' "not taking their Books with them". ¹²⁴ Whatever the situation with regard to personal copies of the hymn books, books were certainly bought and retained for the church's own use, and by its ministers. A hymn book was bound specifically "for the Church" in February 1768. ¹²⁵ In 1770, two hymn books were bound for "Br & Sr Steinhuer" [*sic*]; a similar payment was made the following year for two more books for the same people. ¹²⁶ Brother Steinhauer served as an assistant minister at Butter Lane around this time, and Sister Steinhauer appears to also have worked as a minister at some point during her life. ¹²⁷

More specific information about the individual hymns sung by the Dublin congregation can be found in the congregational diaries, which regularly make specific reference to the first lines of hymns, particularly those sung on important church occasions. The laying of the church's foundation stone in 1754 was accompanied by the singing of the hymn "We built on that foundation sure" and "O that above this chosen ground", and on the occasion of the opening of the church in 1755, the congregation sang "May Jesus' blood and righteousness, Fill and adorn this hallowed place". ¹²⁸ The Christmas Eve service in 1754 was concluded with the hymn "Welcome O welcome, noble Guest!" The diary for September 1770 records the singing of "the Hymn, O Head so full of Bruises", one of the most significant of Moravian hymns (see below). ¹³⁰ At Christmas in 1774 and 1776, the "Hymn of Praise to the Son" was sung. ¹³¹ On 28 December 1774 "the gr[eat] Girls made the Conclusion with Singing: Yea Christmas &

¹²⁴ PRONI MIC1F/4/1/8, 25 December 1774.

¹²⁵ PRONI MIC1F/4/6/5, 26 February 1768.

¹²⁶ PRONI MIC1F/4/6/5, 13 Jan 1770 and 18 February 1771.

¹²⁷ England, *Short Accounts*, 9. Murphy, *Memorial Inscriptions*, 7.

¹²⁸ Cooper and Cooper, "Extracts from the Dublin Congregational Diary". England, *Short Accounts*, 9.

¹²⁹ PRONI MIC1F/4/1/3, 24 December 1754.

¹³⁰ PRONI MIC1F/4/1/8, 14 September 1770.

¹³¹ PRONI MIC1F/4/1/8, 25 December 1774; MIC1F/4/1/9, 24 December 1776.

his Passion", and on 19 December 1777, the congregation "in their Friday's Liturgy, sang with tender & joyful hearts, 'How shall I meet my Saviour? How shall I welcome Thee? &c". ¹³² On Ash Wednesday 1778 the mood was more solemn, and the hymn "sung in the feeling of a broken spirit … Whatever others do intend to do this day". The service concluded with "part of the Hymn O Church! Attention lend it!". ¹³³

Identification of these hymns in contemporary hymnals is complicated by the Moravian practice of not always starting each hymn at the beginning, or singing it in its entirety. Knouse states that it was rare for a complete hymn of ten or twenty stanzas to be sung, and instead "half and whole stanzas were selected as desired". 134 Of the hymns listed above as sung by the Dublin congregation, only four can be found in the 1754 hymn book under those names: "How shall I meet my Saviour?", "Whatever others do intend to do", "May Jesus' blood and righteousness", and "O head so full of bruises". In other cases, the "first line" of the hymn as given in the diary is in fact the first line of a verse from a different hymn; presumably in performance only this verse, or several verses starting from this line, were sung. Thus the hymn recorded in the diary as "Welcome, O Welcome, noble guest", sung on Christmas Eve appears to be the third verse of "Today We Celebrate the Birth", a 1754 Moravian translation of the Lutheran Christmas hymn "Vom Himmel hoch". 135 "O that above this chosen ground" is the beginning of the eleventh verse of "May Jesus' blood and righteousness". 136 Similarly, psalms sung by the Moravian congregation did not always start at the first verse: the New Year's Eve service in 1776 included three sung psalms: "We await Thy Lovingkindness O God! In Thy Congregation" (Ps. 48:8), "What shall we render unto the Lord for all his Benefits towards

¹³² PRONI MIC1F/4/1/8, 28 December 1774; MIC1F/4/1/9, 19 December 1777.

¹³³ PRONI MIC1F/4/1/9, 27 February 1778.

¹³⁴ Knouse, "Moravians, Music of the", GMO.

¹³⁵ Hymnary.org text database (https://hymnary.org/hymn/HLMC1969/page/274).

¹³⁶ Gambold, A Collection of Hymns, volume 2, 135.

us?" (Ps. 116:12) and "Bless the Lord Oh My Soul!" (Ps. 103:1). ¹³⁷ In what version these psalms were sung is not clear, as the phrasing is slightly unusual (the use of "congregation" in Ps. 48, where the KJV has "in thy temple", for example). The change from "benefits towards me" (KJV) to "towards us" in Ps. 116 suggests that these psalm texts may have been specially adapted to reflect their congregational use.

Even allowing for the practice of omitting verses, however, several of the hymns mentioned in the diary could not be identified anywhere in the Gambold hymnal. It is also known that the Moravian congregation were singing hymns in the years before the hymnal was published, although those hymns are now unidentifiable. When Cennick visited Dublin in 1755, shortly before his death, he gave a special sermon for the nine-year anniversary of his first visit, and also "sung several of the hymns that were used at that time which were yet in fresh remembrance". Cennick's "singing" the hymns in the context of a service most likely implies his leading of the congregation in song, explaining the diarist's comment that the hymns were easily recalled. In the early years of the congregation it is possible that their primary source of hymns was Cennick himself, who had already published two collections of his own hymns before setting foot in Ireland. The very first invitations issued by the Baptists entreating Cennick to come to Dublin mention having shown his hymn book "to some here, who are greatly taken with them", and ask him to bring "2 dozen" copies with him. Leven if Cennick never brought the books, he would have been capable of teaching the hymns to the congregation orally. A

¹³⁷ PRONI MIC1F/4/1/8, 31 December 1776.

¹³⁸ Cooper and Cooper, "Extracts from the Dublin Congregational Diary".

¹³⁹ John Cennick, *Sacred hymns for the children of God* (London, 1742; ESTC: T53128) and *Sacred hymns for the use of religious societies* (Bristol, 1743; ESTC: T73574).

¹⁴⁰ Letter from Antisel Taylor to John Cennick, Dublin 13th August 1745. Dudley Cooney, "An Account of the Brethren's first coming to Ireland, with all Matters Relating to their losing Skinners Alley Meetinghouse". Unpublished typescript transcribed from original documents at Moravian Archive, Gracehill. Private collection of Steven C. Smyrl.

further suggestion that the congregation did not derive their musical material exclusively from Gambold's hymnal even in later years appears in the congregational diary entry for 27 February 1778, which describes "Whatever others do intend to do this day" as having been taken from "the first part of our Large Hymnbook". This must be the Gambold hymnal, as that hymn does indeed appear in the first of its two volumes. The wording implies, however, that the congregation had access to another, smaller, hymnal, for otherwise the qualifier "large" would not have been necessary.

3.2.6 Cennick's Collection of Sacred Hymns (1752)

One undoubted source of hymn texts for the Dublin Moravians is a collection of hymns written by John Cennick himself and issued in 1752 by Samuel Powell. This book, *A Collection of Sacred Hymns*, is the only surviving explicitly Moravian music published in Dublin. It contains the texts of 148 hymns in a great variety of metres, but lacks tunes or even tune indications. It is a small, densely-packed book, much smaller than Gambold's "Large Hymnal". Unfortunately, the cash books for the year in which the *Collection* was published have not been deposited in PRONI, and it could not therefore be established at the time of writing whether the congregation purchased any copies of this book when it was released, although it would seem strange if they did not, given their attachment to Cennick and his continued association with them right up until his death.

The metres used by Cennick in his collection are highly unusual, and have interesting implications for the Moravian tune repertory. The most frequently-used

¹⁴¹ PRONI MIC1F/4/1/9, 27 February 1778.

¹⁴² Gambold, A Collection of Hymns, volume 1, 294.

¹⁴³ John Cennick, *A Collection of Sacred Hymns*, 5th edition (Dublin: printed by S. Powell in Crane-Lane, 1752). GB-Ob 147.g.183.

individual metres remain common metre (twenty-one texts), double common metre (fourteen texts), and long metre (sixteen texts). Short metre is barely used, with just one text in standard short metre (6.6.8.6) and two in "double short metre" (6.6.8.6.6.8.6). The remaining texts comprise a staggering thirty-two additional metres, some of them extremely complex. The metre 10.10.11.11.4 is used six times; 8.8.6.8.8.6 ten times; 5.5.6.5 five times. Ten different texts have metres incorporating trochaic seven-syllable lines, such as 7.6.7.6 or 7.7.7.7. Five texts have the metre 8.8.8.8.10.10, while four are made up solely of long-winded hendecasyllables (11.11.11.11). The most unusual metre that appears multiple times in the Collection is 4.4.4.6.6.2.4.4.4.6, which is used five times.

Cennick's repeated use of complicated metres suggests that he was writing his hymns to fit pre-existing tunes. This probability is supported by the metre of his Hymn 29, "What Mercy hath the Saviour shew'd!": 8.8.7.8.8.7.2.2.4.4.4.8. Despite its highly irregular syllable-counts, which also give the hymn a very distinctive appearance on the page, this metre matches exactly with that of the Lutheran hymn "Wie schön leuchtet der Morgenstern"; even the rhyming scheme Cennick uses (a.a.b.c.c.b.d.d.e.e.f.f) is identical. 144 This tune was demonstrably in the Moravian repertory of the British Isles during this period, as it appears in LaTrobe's 1790 collection under the title "How bright appears the morning Star" (see Ex. 19). 145 The practice of fitting new texts to older German tunes was extremely common among Moravians, and will be further discussed below.

Perhaps the most historically significant item in Cennick's Collection is "Lo! He cometh, Countless Trumpets". This hymn was later adapted by Charles Wesley to create

¹⁴⁴ Hymnary.org: https://hymnary.org/text/wie schon leuchtet der morgenstern voll. ¹⁴⁵ LaTrobe, Hymn-tunes, 58.

the popular Advent hymn "Lo! He comes with clouds descending". According to the hymnologist John Julian, "there is evidence to show that [Cennick's text] was sung by the congregation of the Moravian Chapel, in Dublin, on April 20, 1750" (though he does not provide the evidence), but it is difficult to determine what tune it could have been sung to; its unusual metre of 8.7.8.7.4.7 does not match any tunes known to be in circulation in Dublin at this time, even if the fifth line is repeated in performance. \(^{146}\) "Lo! He Cometh" did not appear along with a printed tune until 1760, when it was included in *The Psalm Singer's Help*, a collection of tunes "now us'd in the several dissenting congregations of London". \(^{147}\) The tune that accompanies it in that volume [2256] dates from 1754, and first appeared in Thomas Butts's *Harmonia Sacra*, a Wesleyan publication, where it was set to a text by Charles Wesley. \(^{148}\) It is possible that this tune could have been circulating in English Evangelistic circles for some years prior to its being written down, and that Cennick was aware of it, although this association is very speculative. It was not until 1765 that Wesley's version of the text was first matched with the tune known as "Helmsley" [2973a] to which it is now invariably sung. \(^{149}\)

A tune titled "Lo! He cometh" and matching the metre of Cennick's text appears in LaTrobe's 1790 hymn book. ¹⁵⁰ This tune [5515] first appears here, and has only two later citations in the Hymn Tune Index; in one of these it is attributed to "C Latrobe", and in the other the tune itself is named "Latrobe". ¹⁵¹ It seems highly likely that the tune is LaTrobe's own work, therefore, as surmised in the Hymn Tune Index. Interestingly, the

¹⁴⁶ John Julian, A Dictionary of Hymnology (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1892), 681.

¹⁴⁷ HTI entry for source KnibTPSH a (1760).

¹⁴⁸ HTI entry for tune [2256].

¹⁴⁹ HTI entry for tune [2973a].

¹⁵⁰ LaTrobe, *Hymn-tunes*, 73.

¹⁵¹ HTI entry for tune [5515].

second appearance of the tune is accompanied by the words of Wesley's later, better-known derivative, rather than Cennick's original.

3.2.7 The Moravian tune repertory

In general, the primary sources tell us much more about Moravian hymns as verbal texts than about the tunes to which those hymns were sung. The references to hymns and psalms in the diary do not record any details of the tunes, but some idea of what those tunes may have been like can be gleaned from the preface to Gambold's hymnal, which offers advice on matching tunes with texts. Gambold did not include any printed tunes in his book, but instead referred to a selection of pre-existing tune sources: "a Tune-book printed by us in English some Years ago", "Ravenscroft's Collection of Psalm-tunes", and "Chatham's" collection. He also mentioned a mysterious "Tune-book" that had not yet been published but which he had "in hand", and which was to correspond to "the Index of the German Hymn-book". 152

The vast majority of Gambold's hymns are assigned tunes from either the German book or his own projected collection. A very small number of tunes which were sourced from elsewhere have their tunes mentioned by name: these are "York Tune", "Cth Psalm Tune", "cxlviiith Psalm Tune", and one unspecified "Eng. Psalm tune", sung to the short-metre text, "I lift my Heart to Thee". This is Thomas Sternhold's version of Psalm 25 from the "Old Version', so the "English psalm tune" it was to be sung to is likely that which was popularly associated with the Old Version text. "York Tune" is set in Gambold's book to a common-metre text by Isaac Watts, "Rise, rise, my

 $^{152}\,\mathrm{Gambold}, A\ Collection\ of\ Hymns,$ unpaginated tune section.

soul, and leave the ground"; there are several tunes known as "York", but this is mostly likely the sixteenth-century tune [331] which appears in Ravenscroft's *Whole Booke of Psalms in four parts*. The three psalm tunes mentioned by number are Ps. 100, Ps. 148 and Ps. 113; these names, and the metres of the texts to which they are assigned, correspond to three of the most widespread Genevan tunes in the Dublin church tune repertory [143a, 126a and 146a]. A note in the hymnal also notes that just as verses from different texts were often combined in performance, so several tunes could be used to sing different verses of the one hymn, "where the Assembly has all those Tunes at Command" and "according to the successive Variation of the Matter itself".

The strong influence of German texts and tunes on Gambold's hymnbook is characteristic of Moravian hymnody generally, which owed much to German and more specifically Lutheran influences. Gambold specifically addresses the strength of these influences in the introduction to the hymnbook, defending his choice to draw so heavily on the work of a "foreign" church. His principal argument is that German hymns are simply of a high quality: "the German Nation," he writes, "has always excell'd in the Article of Hymns", and have maintained in popular use many "ancient Hymns ... greatly helpful to maintain for ever the Christian Truths in the Minds of the common People, with ... Simplicity and Force". 153 Gambold's introduction makes it clear that the original German tunes were held in high regard by Moravians, to the point that English translations of the hymns were written to fit the original tunes, sometimes necessitating the use of unusual or awkward metres. Gambold specifically mentions the use of "double Rhymes, or a Trochaic Ending of Lines; whereas English Poetry commonly contents itself with the Iambic". He asks his readers to forgive any ensuing "Stiffness upon the

¹⁵³ Gambold, A Collection of Hymns, preface.

Performance" by considering "the Motive, it being done for the sake of the original Tunes"; and, on hearing the "solemn and expressive Harmony of those Tunes", Gambold is confident the reader will "excuse all".

With regard to the German influences upon the Moravian church music tradition, special mention must be made of the Moravian hymn "O Head So Full of Bruises", a translation into English of the Lutheran chorale, "O Haupt voll Blut und Wunden", sung to the original tune by Hans Leo Hassler. This hymn carried personal significance for Zinzendorf, as it was sung while his father was dying, and its focus on the blood streaming from Christ's head and on the wounds inflicted upon him may have even influenced Zinzendorf in the development of the "blood and wounds" theology which came to define so much of Moravian spirituality. For whatever reason, the hymn became one of the most widely-known in the whole Moravian repertory. In the Moravian settlement of Bethlehem in Pennsylvania, it was sung in its entirety every Friday evening, and was also sung by members of the congregation when on their deathbeds, as a way of focussing their minds on the suffering of Jesus in their final moments. 154 The hymn appears in John Cennick's *Collection*, and is one of those few mentioned by name in the Dublin congregational diary (see 3.2.5 above). It also appears, with its customary tune, in Christian LaTrobe's collection of Moravian hymns (see Ex. 20). 155

While Gambold admitted the strong influence of German hymnody on the tunes in his *Collection*, it is clear that he also wished to situate Moravian music not merely as a German tradition but one which shared cultural elements with many other Protestant churches, including the English churches. Both his choice of texts and the sources of his tunes emphasise the extensive crossover between the Moravian repertory and that of the

¹⁵⁴ Atwood, "Blood and Wounds Theology", 34.

¹⁵⁵ LaTrobe, Hymn-tunes, 30.

other Protestant churches in the British Isles. Thus, the tune repertory reflects the wider Moravian belief in a "universal church" which incorporated yet transcended denominational divisions.

3.2.8 Instrumental music and the organ

In contrast to many other Protestant communities, the Moravians did not simply tolerate instrumental music in their services, but strongly supported it. Moravians believed that musical ability, like all human talents, came as a gift from God, and therefore was most appropriately used in the service of God. This applied to compositional ability as well as instrumental skills, and many Moravians achieved success as composers of elaborate instrumental music, anthems and cantatas. This Still, musicians who played during meetings were expected to do so voluntarily, and so were usually amateur congregants rather than professional musicians. Moravian church authorities found themselves caught in the classic anxiety that really good music might attract worshippers to the church for the wrong reasons. Moravian church musicians were thus expected to strike a balance between, on one hand, employing their gifts and talents enthusiastically and diligently in the service of God and the church, and, on the other hand, avoiding excessive indulgence in the aesthetic quality of the music.

As in the parish churches, the organ was seen as the ideal instrument for the accompaniment of congregational singing. LaTrobe wrote that the organ was best suited to supporting the voices of the people and particularly for preventing them from "sinking"

157 Knouse, "Moravians, Music of the", GMO.

¹⁵⁶ See LaTrobe, *Hymn-Tunes*, preface.

¹⁵⁸ Knouse, "Moravian Music", 46.

¹⁵⁹ Knouse, "Moravian Music", 43-44.

(i.e. going flat). 160 While accompanying, the organ was to be loud enough "to be heard by all distinctly", yet not so loud as to overpower the voices; the organist was to be ready to follow any changes in tempo introduced by those singing, "not every verse being sung according to strict time, but according to the gravity or chearfulness of its contents". Because the organ generally followed the singing, rather than the other way around, the pitch of the hymn was usually set by the minister; LaTrobe therefore advised that a prospective organist "be acquainted with most if not all the hymns in the hymn-book, that upon their being given out, or sung without previous notice, he may assist a weak singer, by pitching immediately upon the right tune". The practice of combining together verses from various different hymns, an integral part of services such as the Singing Hour, presented even more challenges, for each hymn-verse was apparently sung to the tune of the hymn from which it was taken, and as a result it was necessary to switch between tunes from verse to verse. LaTrobe accordingly exhorted organists to learn the hymn tunes off by heart, "in most if not all the different keys extempore", for "it would be next to impossible to turn continually to the Tune-book" during this kind of performance. LaTrobe's only concession was to "difficult keys" such as C sharp and F sharp, in which it might be too difficult to follow the singer—in these situations, the advice given is for the organist to drop the pitch a semitone—"never ascend, but always descend ... viz. from C* to C – from F* to F as the congregation will more naturally fall in with him by lowering its voice." ¹⁶¹ LaTrobe's ideal Moravian organist, therefore, emerges as a player who has memorised the entire hymn book and can play any hymn tune required in a great variety of keys, without advance notice. It is difficult to reconcile the extremely high level of musical training and skill that would be required to perform this role with the

¹⁶⁰ All LaTrobe quotations in this and the following paragraph taken from LaTrobe, *Hymn-tunes*, preface. ¹⁶¹ The asterisk (*) is used by LaTrobe to indicate a sharp (#).

Moravians' custom of amateur congregational music-making, or with LaTrobe's assertions that an unskilled player motivated by spiritual devotion was of more value to the congregational music than "the most skilful professor destitute of the above principles". It is probable that in practice, these extremely high standards of accompaniment were achieved by few Moravian organists, but it is nonetheless indicative of the high regard in which church music was held in Moravian circles.

As well as accompanying congregational singing, the organist was also expected to provide solo organ music at the beginning of the service. This could either be a voluntary or the hymn tunes which were assigned for the day, but in either case the principal aim was to "prepare the minds of the assembly for the ensuing service, carefully avoiding every strain that might produce a more contrary effect". For LaTrobe, playing the hymn tunes was preferable for a number of reasons. Some were practical: it gave the congregation a chance to hear the tunes in advance of singing them, and provided a useful means of introducing new tunes to the congregation if desired, as Moravian congregations generally sang without books and did not use "lining out". Others were ideological: listening to hymn tunes was spiritually edifying even when the words were not sung, for the tunes would "recall to [the listeners'] minds an after taste of the blessings conveyed unto them by the words of the hymns to which they were adapted". Hence the tunes were still primarily valued for their association with edifying texts, rather than carrying any inherent edifying—or corrupting—power of their own. Despite this neutralisation of the moral power of wordless music, however, the playing of voluntaries was still potentially risky for LaTrobe, for it encouraged the congregation to "be led from the aim of their meeting to attend either with admiration or displeasure to the dexterity of the organist's fingers, or rather to the levity of his mind". In general, LaTrobe advised erring on the side of "simplicity" in the music wherever possible: simple hymn tunes were more suitable than elaborate voluntaries, and as in the singing, care was to be taken not to let the aesthetic and technical aspects of the music take priority over spiritual concerns.

Despite their often precarious finances, the Dublin Moravians did purchase an organ for their church in Butter Lane. The decision to do so seems to have been made with uncharacteristic rapidity and very little controversy: the diary of the Dublin Congregation records that on 13 January 1755 "some Br[ethre]n had a Conference about getting an Organ in our new Church", and just two days later the contract was signed with "Tho[ma]s Fawkner Organbuilder". 162 Unfortunately, this latter meeting is not recorded in the Elders' Consistory minutes, and no further mention of Fawkner appears in the Moravian records—or indeed anywhere else. It was not possible to establish how much the congregation paid for the organ, as the cash books for 1755 remain at Gracehill and have not been deposited in PRONI. It is certain, however, that the organ was installed: the diary records that "the Organ-Case was put up in the Church" on 6 February, and a nineteenth-century history of the church describes the Fawkner organ as being located "in the gallery of the new Chapel, opposite the large east window (where the pulpit now stands)". 163 Although references to the instrument in later records are scarce, those that can be found indicate that it was certainly present and in regular use for at least the remainder of the eighteenth century. The original instrument does not seem to have been replaced during this time, though it was repaired and maintained on a number of occasions; payments are recorded in the cash book in 1759 for "painting the Back of the Organ" (6s) and "Gilding the Organ" (1s 10d), and an account by the nineteenth-century Moravian historian Br John England states that the organ was "enlarged and improved" that year,

¹⁶² PRONI MIC1F/4/1/3, 13 and 15 January 1755.

¹⁶³ PRONI MIC1F/4/1/3, 6 Feb 1755. England, Short Accounts, 9.

likely in the same bout of repair work. ¹⁶⁴ The "Organ Builders" were also paid for unspecified work in 1758, and it is likely that a payment for "Mending the Bellows" in 1762 (1s 4d) referred to the organ bellows. ¹⁶⁵ In 1771 a payment was made for "Keys for [the] Organ". ¹⁶⁶ According to Cooper, the eighteenth-century instrument was eventually replaced by a Telford organ in 1837. ¹⁶⁷

The identity of any organist is difficult to establish, as no payment to any organist—or indeed any musicians at all—is recorded under those terms in the cash books, which are otherwise meticulous in their recording of even minor expenses. The only payment to a specific person related to the organ other than repair and building work is a payment to a Brother Griffin "for attending the Organ" in 1768; the specific record made of this suggests that this was an unusual occurrence rather than Griffin's usual role, and perhaps he was standing in for the usual organist. Given the positive Moravian attitude towards amateur music-making, and the belief that the musically gifted had a duty to employ their talents in the service of God, the lack of payments to an organist might suggest that the instrument was played on a voluntary basis. While it is tempting to assume that organists were recruited from the congregation, evidence suggests this was not always so. From the diary entry for Christmas 1774, which complains that "our Organist being indifferent to our Liturgies [...] our Liturgies have not their proper Stamp & Unction", 170 it would appear that the organist was not a congregant.

LaTrobe's description of the Moravian organist's responsibilities suggests that the organist, if not playing the hymn accompaniments by heart as suggested, usually played

¹⁶⁴ PRONI MIC1F/4/6/3, 29th July and 16 September 1759. England, *Short Accounts*, 9.

¹⁶⁵ PRONI MIC1F/4/6/4, 26 December 1762.

¹⁶⁶ PRONI MIC1F/4/6/5, 9 March 1771.

¹⁶⁷ Cooper, "Notes on the various buildings".

¹⁶⁸ PRONI MIC1F/4/6/5, 1 September 1768.

^{169 &}quot;...With us this service is voluntary". LaTrobe, Hymn-tunes, preface.

¹⁷⁰ PRONI MIC1F/4/1/8, 25 December 1774.

from the hymnal, presumably improvising harmony to fit the printed tunes. In Dublin, a special copy of the hymn book appears to have been reserved for the organist's use: in 1781 the cash book records that 10d was paid out "to binding the Organ Hymn Book". ¹⁷¹ In 1785, a "German Tune Book" was purchased for 10s 10d; this was probably Christian Gregor's chorale book of 1784, specifically produced to encourage standardisation of the tunes across the international Moravian community. ¹⁷²

Unusually among Protestant groups, the Moravians strongly approved of the use of instruments other than the organ in a public worship setting, and the use of instrumental music during services is recorded among the Dublin Moravian community from its earliest days. Cennick's diary records that on 29th August 1747, the Skinners' Alley congregation "sang the Litany of the wounds of Jesus, with music". The Skinners' Alley congregation sang the Litany of the wounds of Jesus, with music". Alley, Cennick writes that the Christmas Day meeting in 1747, which took place in a private house owing to the Moravians' recent ejection from Skinners' Alley, was kept "with singing and music". Although it is not clear if regular daily and weekly services at the Moravian church included instrumental music, instruments do certainly appear to have been used on special occasions: the psalm at the Christmas Eve service in 1776 was "performed with vocal and instrumental music in an amiable manner". This would correspond with the general Moravian tradition of specially composed music with instrumental accompaniment for festival days, begun by Christian Gregor in 1759. As with the organist, no payments to musicians appear in the cash books, and so the music was likely provided by amateur members of the congregation who brought their own instruments.

¹⁷¹ PRONI MIC1F/4/6/5, 22 April 1781.

¹⁷² PRONI MIC1F/4/6/5, 7 January 1785. Knouse, Music of the Moravian Church in America, 17.

¹⁷³ Cennick, "An Account", 125.

¹⁷⁴ Cennick, "An Account", 127.

¹⁷⁵ PRONI MIC1F/4/1/9, 24 December 1776.

¹⁷⁶ Knouse, "Moravian Music", 43.

One instrumental tradition for which the Moravians were known in America was the use of wind bands at outdoor services. ¹⁷⁷ As the Dublin Moravians did not hold outdoor services, however, it is unlikely that this tradition was followed at Butter Lane. ¹⁷⁸ The one account of an outdoor service in the congregational diary, the laying of the foundations for the construction of the new church, gives the names of the hymns sung (see above) but makes no mention of instrumental music.

3.3 The Methodists

3.3.1 Origins and practices of Methodism in Ireland

The second major eighteenth-century Evangelical movement to establish itself firmly in Dublin was Methodism, which during the period under discussion was not technically Nonconformist at all. The denomination now known as Methodism originated from the work of an Evangelical religious society known as the "Holy Club" that met for prayer and Bible study in Cambridge in the early eighteenth century, and was intended as a movement within the established church for those who felt alienated by the church's turn towards rational detachment, and who desired a more "serious" kind of religious practice. Its founder, John Wesley, remained an ordained minister and a committed member of the established church all his life. Nevertheless, as the century progressed, his followers developed a culture and ethos distinct from that of standard conforming worship, and while they did not formally separate from the established church until the nineteenth

11

¹⁷⁷ Knouse, "Moravian Music", 45–46.

¹⁷⁸ Even Cennick, who was known for his outdoor preaching in Ulster, never preached in the open air in Dublin, possibly to avoid drawing the attention of the Establishment authorities. See Hanna, "The Origin and Nature of the Gracehill Moravian Settlement", 9.

century, their worship traditions and religious culture were already distinct enough in the eighteenth century that they may legitimately be treated as a discrete cultural group.

Wesley had a long relationship with Dublin, visiting twenty-one times. ¹⁷⁹ He first arrived in the city in 1747, on the heels of one of his preachers, Thomas Williams, who had come to Dublin earlier that year to preach at Oxmantown Green and had founded a Methodist society there. On his arrival, Wesley attended service in one of the city's parish churches, possibly St Andrew's, and then preached a sermon at St Mary's in the afternoon. The discovery that an evangelical preacher had been allowed to speak from an Established pulpit enraged the Archbishop, Charles Cobbe, who barred Wesley from preaching in any of Dublin's conforming churches. Thus deprived almost immediately of a venue in which to preach, Wesley secured the use of a building on Marlborough Street that had formerly been a Lutheran church (see 4.3.1 below). ¹⁸⁰ Like Cennick, Wesley proved a sensationally popular figure; like Cennick's congregations, Wesley's were initially the victims of civil violence. Very shortly after it opened, the Marlborough Street chapel was attacked and damaged by a large mob, and this appears to have motivated the congregation to search for a new place of worship. After a brief period at a house in Dolphin's Barn which was not sufficient to hold the already sizeable Methodist congregation, Wesley obtained the use of the Skinners' Alley meeting house from the Moravians, as described above. 181

The Methodists remained based in Skinners' Alley until 1752, when Wesley took out a 99-year lease on a site in Whitefriar Street and established the first purpose-built

¹⁷⁹ Ferguson, "Rocque's Map", 146.

¹⁸⁰ Dudley Levistone Cooney, *The Methodists in Ireland: A Short History* (Dublin: Columba Press, 2001), 29–30.

¹⁸¹ Smyrl, Dictionary of Dublin Dissent, 107–8.

Methodist chapel in Ireland.¹⁸² This chapel, which remained in use until 1843 and was later used by the Carmelite order as a school, was described in 1835 as "plain and commodious, capable of holding about 1,200 people".¹⁸³ In 1770 a second chapel was opened on Blackhall Place, then known as Gravel Walk; the exterior of this building has survived, although it ceased functioning as a chapel in 1961 and the interior has been subdivided and altered. Few descriptions of the Gravel Walk chapel survive, other than a comment that it was "less spacious" than the principal Methodist chapel at Whitefriar Street. Wesley preached at the new chapel in 1771, soon after it opened, describing it in his diary as "the new preaching-house, near the barracks", and commenting that "many attended here who cannot, and many who will not, come to the other end of the town. So that I am persuaded preaching here twice or thrice a week will be much for the glory of God". ¹⁸⁴

Despite occasional incidents of violence (which, as we have seen, are likely more indicative of general culture than of ill feeling towards the Evangelicals), on the whole Wesley and his preachers were welcomed with an amicable curiosity. Wealthy landowning families in the countryside offered hospitality to the preachers and facilitated their work, believing that the principles of Methodism were good for their tenants, encouraging godly living and hard work, and would therefore benefit them by extension. Notwithstanding Archbishop Cobbe's initial reaction to Wesley, many members of the Established clergy also supported Wesley's work, being impressed by the large numbers attending his sermons and by his encouragement of frequent communion. By the end of the century, there were 14,000 Methodists in Ireland, and three meeting houses in

¹⁸² Cooney, *The Methodists in Ireland*, 29–32.

¹⁸³ Quoted in Smyrl, *Dictionary of Dublin Dissent*, 110.

¹⁸⁴ Smyrl, *Dictionary of Dublin Dissent*, 85–86.

¹⁸⁵ Cooney, The Methodists in Ireland, 39–44.

Dublin: the original Whitefriar Street chapel, Blackhall Place, and the original Marlborough Street meeting place, now in use by a new Methodist group who would later separate by schism from the main Wesleyan congregation. A school for boys had been set up at the Whitefriar Street chapel in 1784, and a girls' school was opened in 1806. Though the exact number of Methodists in Dublin during the eighteenth century is not known, the Methodist conference of 1816 recorded 1,420 Dublin members, attended by seven preachers.

Of the people who embraced his new religion, almost all were, in Wesley's words, "English transplanted to another soil" with "scarce any Irish among them": in other words, they came to Methodism from the established church. Converts from Catholicism and native Irish speakers were rare, perhaps unsurprisingly given that Wesley, viewing Methodism still as a variety of conformity, made little effort to reach out to those communities. It was not until 1805 that preachers fluent in the Irish language were specifically dispatched to preach to those in rural areas.

Because Methodism in these early stages was officially a society or sect within the established church, Methodist meetings and services were intended to complement rather than replace parish church services, and so took place in the afternoons and late evenings so as not to clash with morning or evening prayer. Wesley encouraged attendance at two Methodist meetings each Sunday, and meetings were scheduled in such a way as to make this possible. As supplemental services, they also did not need to

¹⁸⁶ Cooney, *The Methodists in Ireland*, 37. The Marlborough Street group moved to the newly built Wesley Chapel on Great Charles Street in 1800, and from there to Langrishe Place in 1825. (Smyrl, *Dictionary of Dublin Dissent*, 118–121.)

¹⁸⁷ Cooney, *The Methodists in Ireland*, 182–184.

¹⁸⁸ John Warburton, James Whitelaw and Robert Walsh, *History of the City of Dublin, from the Earliest Accounts to the Present Time* (London: Printed for T. Cadell and W. Davies, in the Strand, by W. Bulner and Co. Cleveland-Row, St James's, 1818), 822.

¹⁸⁹ Cooney, *The Methodists in Ireland*, 39–41.

¹⁹⁰ Warburton et al., History of the City of Dublin, 821.

incorporate communion, which could be received at the parish church; although Wesley himself frequently administered communion to his followers, he did so in his capacity as a minister of the established church, and he was strongly in favour of Methodists taking communion in their local parishes whenever it was available. Nor did the Methodist services have a set text that they were required to follow. It was not until Methodism split officially from the established church that a Methodist order of service was developed. As a result, it is difficult to know exactly what took place at these eighteenth-century meetings. By combining Wesley's advice to his preachers with what sketchy accounts exist, it can be gathered that a typical meeting was about an hour long, incorporating a thirty- or forty-minute sermon, various prayers and the singing of one or two hymns. Warburton *et al.* also state that the Irish Methodists held love-feasts similar to those of the Moravians, and likewise gathered into Fellowship bands for the purposes of private prayer and confession, although they did not go as far as to live together as many of the Moravians did. 193

3.3.2 Methodist music

Music was central to Methodist practice from the beginning, and revolved around hymnsinging. John Wesley exhorted his followers to sing enthusiastically, in time, and with a sense of the spiritual significance of the words; he disliked repetition, and the singing of two different lines of text at the same time, as it obscured the hymn's meaning, always his primary concern. In early Methodist worship, the hymns were lined out in the parish

¹⁹¹ In 1788, Wesley reluctantly agreed to allow Methodist services to take place at the same time as Morning Prayer, provided that the Methodists make use of a modified version of the Morning Prayer service which he produced for the purpose. The Whitefriar Street and later Abbey Street societies adopted this modified service, which their successor, the Centenary Society, still uses today. Cooney, *The Methodists in Ireland*, 169.

¹⁹² Cooney, *The Methodists in Ireland*, 165–170.

¹⁹³ History of the City of Dublin, 823.

style for practical reasons, but as literacy improved and more hymn books became available, this practice was no longer necessary. To their very good fortune, the early societies could turn to an extremely prolific writer of high-quality hymn texts in Charles Wesley, John's younger brother; Charles produced over six and a half thousand hymns, some of which are still used in Methodism and other denominations today. His creativity, however, like that of many other central figures in church music, lay squarely with language and did not extend to the realm of musical composition. As with metrical psalms, Wesley's hymn texts could be and were generally sung to whatever tune fit their metre. 194

Charles Wesley visited Dublin in 1747 and again in 1748, and it was during one of these visits that the Wesley brothers became acquainted with the printer Samuel Powell and his wife, Hannah.¹⁹⁵ The Wesleys dined at the Powells' house on several occasions; it was there that Charles Wesley met Samuel Edwards, the owner of the Skinners' Alley house, to the misfortune of the Moravians.¹⁹⁶ After one of these visits to the Powells, Wesley claimed that the Powells, formerly Anabaptists, had lately become followers of Methodism. If true, this might explain the extraordinary energy which they subsequently devoted to the publication of the Wesley brothers' writings.¹⁹⁷ The ESTC lists no fewer than fifty-five Wesleyan publications from the Powell press in the eighteenth century, including fifteen hymn collections. If the notoriously unreliable William H. Grattan Flood is to be believed, one book, *Hymns and Sacred Poems*, went through five editions in 1747

¹⁹⁴ Cooney, The Methodists in Ireland, 170–171.

¹⁹⁵ Ferguson, "Rocque's Map", 146.

¹⁹⁶ Smyrl, *Dictionary of Dublin Dissent*, 108. It is quite likely that Edwards was a relative of Hannah Powell: her maiden name was Edwards, and she formerly lived on Golden Lane, where Samuel Edwards ran a school. M. Pollard, *A Dictionary of the Dublin Book Trade*, *1550–1800: based on the Records of the Guild of St Luke the Evangelist Dublin* (London: Bibliographical Society, 2000), 467. Patrick M. Geoghegan, "Whyte, Samuel", DIB (October 2009).

¹⁹⁷ Pollard, Dictionary of the Dublin Book Trade, 467.

alone, suggesting that these new hymns had popular appeal. ¹⁹⁸ One copy of this book, held at the British Library, is inscribed with what appear to be the names of a mother and daughter: "Diana Bindon 1759" and "Elizabeth Bindon 1770". ¹⁹⁹ In an 1858 issue of the journal *Notes and Queries*, an anonymous contributor (named only as "Z.") stated Diana Bindon to have been a close friend of the Primitive Methodist leader, Lady Huntingdon. ²⁰⁰

Unfortunately for the purposes of this study, all of the purely Wesleyan hymn collections published by Powell contained only texts, without tunes or even tune indications (though several later collections that included Wesleyan texts along with those of other authors did contain tunes; see 3.4 below). Given that Methodists were expected to attend parish services alongside dedicated Methodist meetings, it is likely that these hymns were intended to be sung to tunes already in use in those parishes. The early Irish Methodists thus most likely drew their tunes from the common repertory in the same manner as the majority of the Dissenting groups considered thus far.

In England, the tunes popularised by Methodist societies had a distinct style compared to the well-known tunes of the parish church. Many were adapted from secular melodies, and even from operas, a practice on which the established church looked askance but which Methodists embraced. The Wesley brothers were themselves champions of the practice; Charles Wesley defended it explicitly in one of his hymn texts as a way of "recovering" the music from its "carnal" and inappropriate usages and retaining it "in virtue's cause". ²⁰¹ In general, the "Methodist" tunes (though they were

-

¹⁹⁸ W. H. Grattan Flood, "Music-Printing in Dublin from 1700 to 1750", *The Journal of the Royal Society of Antiquaries of Ireland*, fifth series, 38, no. 3 (September 1908): 240. It should be noted that only one edition of this book is listed in the ESTC (T31327).

¹⁹⁹John and Charles Wesley, *Hymns and sacred poems* (Dublin, 1747). GB-Lbl 03440.ee.30.

²⁰⁰ Z., "Hymnology", in *Notes and Queries*, second series, volume 138 (17 July 1858), 55.

²⁰¹ Quoted in Temperley, *Music of the English Parish Church*, 210.

quickly embraced by parish congregations as well) were modern and theatrical in style, much more similar to secular music than their predecessors were. They were regularly ornamented not only with passing notes, as older tunes had often been, but with trills and appoggiaturas—a characteristic which one Georgian critic described as "the very refuse of the theatres". Another frequently used effect, albeit one Wesley disapproved of, was the repetition of whole lines or parts of lines, which was cognate with musical repetition and sequences in the tunes. Dynamic contrasts were also used, and sometimes an antiphonal effect was created by having the men and women of the congregation sing alternate lines. All these traits can be observed in the Dublin tunebooks which contain Wesleyan texts, and are discussed in more detail below.

Like the Moravians, the Methodists did not object on any theological grounds to the use of instruments in church. Church organs, however, were far too costly to be within the budget of an average congregation, and it was not until 1869 that a Methodist congregation in Ireland first acquired an organ.²⁰⁴ The Blackhall Place chapel had no organ until 1906.²⁰⁵ Wesley's own opinion on the organ was inconsistent; he disliked organ voluntaries, though he admitted that he was occasionally moved by them, and though he approved the installation of an organ in Macclesfield in 1786, in 1790 while preaching at a parish church in Lincolnshire he ordered that the organ cease playing after the first verse of the hymn and the congregation continue singing without it.²⁰⁶ In England, Methodist societies without organs engaged in a tradition similar to that of the "west

²⁰² Ouoted in Temperley, *Music of the English Parish Church*, 212.

²⁰³ Temperley, *Music of the English Parish Church*, 212.

²⁰⁴ Cooney, *The Methodists in Ireland*, 172. The organ was installed in the Methodist Centenary church on Stephen's Green; this had been built in the 1840s as a new home for the Whitefriar Street congregation following the expiry of the original 99-year lease taken out by John Wesley (Smyrl, *Dictionary of Dublin Dissent*, 111).

²⁰⁵ Smyrl, *Dictionary of Dublin Dissent*, 84–5.

²⁰⁶ Temperley, *Music of the English Parish Church*, 214.

gallery" bands of the rural parishes, whereby parishioners who played instruments were marshalled into a small ensemble that could accompany psalm- and hymn-singing (usually from the west gallery). It is possible that this took place in Dublin also, although it should be noted that this was practically unheard of in English cities. Such ensembles were also uncommon prior to 1770, although they achieved widespread popularity in England after that date.²⁰⁷

3.4 Later Eighteenth-Century Tune Sources

3.4.1 A Collection of Hymns and Sacred Poems (1749)

Although no exclusively Wesleyan hymnals with tunes were printed in Dublin during the eighteenth century, Wesleyan hymns did begin to appear in compilation volumes from the mid-century onwards. This suggests that Wesleyan hymns were not only being sung by dedicated Methodist groups but were quickly entering the mainstream of Protestant musical practice. The first Dublin tunebook to include Wesleyan texts was published by Samuel Powell in 1749, not long after Methodism arrived in Ireland. This book, entitled *A Collection of Hymns and Sacred Poems*, is now known from a single surviving copy.²⁰⁸ This copy was noted by Grattan Flood in 1908 as being in the possession of a "Mr Warrington of Philadelphia". Despite Flood's reputation for careless scholarship, the former owner indeed proves to have been James Warrington (1841–1915), whose collection of over two thousand hymnals and psalters is now divided between the

²⁰⁸ A Collection of Hymns and Sacred Poems (Dublin: printed by S. Powell, in Crane-lane, 1749). HTI #CHSP. US-Ps Warr.1749. I am greatly indebted to Mark C. Russell at the Pittsburgh Theological Seminary's Clifford E. Barbour Library for access to scanned copies of this rare book.

²⁰⁷ Cooney, *The Methodists in Ireland*, 172. Temperley, *Music of the English Parish Church*, 196.

Pittsburgh Theological Seminary (where the Powell volume is held) and the Pitts Theology Library.²⁰⁹ The editor of the Powell volume is not named in the book itself, but Flood suggested the composer John Frederick Lampe, who previously wrote a set of tunes for the Wesleys and was living in Dublin when the *Collection* was published.²¹⁰ Though purely speculative, Flood's attribution to Lampe is repeated by the *Grove* Encyclopedia.²¹¹

From the contents page, it appears that the volume contains at least 224 separate texts. Not all of the text in the book was intended to be sung: verses which were "to be read only" were printed in italics, and frequently constitute only part of a hymn text. Presumably these verses were omitted when the hymn was sung, though the grounds for differentiating these verses from the sung ones are unclear. Of the thirty-nine hymn texts from the *Collection* that could be collated for the present study, twenty-seven are the work of Isaac Watts; five, including the "Musicians" hymn ("Thou God of harmony and love") which appears as a preface to the volume, are by Charles Wesley, and one further is a translation from German by John Wesley. The other authors that could be identified were the seventeenth-century poet Thomas Flatman, the Independent minister Simon Browne, and Lady Huntingdon, a prominent follower of Methodism who was responsible for the establishment of an extensive network of Methodist and "free-preaching" chapels across Britain and Ireland, including the Free Church on Plunket Street (see 3.5 below).²¹²

²⁰⁹ Flood, "Music-Printing in Dublin", 240. Inventory and description of the James Warrington papers at the Pitts Theology Library (https://pitts.emory.edu/archives/text/mss395.html).

²¹⁰ Flood, "Music-Printing in Dublin", 240. Flood incorrectly gives Lampe's initials as "J. J.". Lampe, originally from Saxony but since 1725 based in London, had been invited to Dublin by Thomas Sheridan to conduct theatrical performances and concerts; he left the city for Edinburgh in 1750. Suzanne Aspden, "Lampe, John Frederick (1702/3–1751), Composer and Bassoonist", ODNB (23 September 2004).

²¹¹ Peter Holman, "Lampe, John Frederick", GMO, October 2001.

²¹² Huntingdon Schlenther and Boyd Stanley, "Hastings [née Shirley], Selina, Countess of Huntingdon (1707–1791), Founder of the Countess of Huntingdon's Connexion", ODNB (23 September 2004). The authors of the hymn texts were identified by searching the texts database at Hymnary.org.

The 1749 Collection is set apart from Powell's many other books of Wesleyan texts by the inclusion, at the back of the volume, of a set of printed tunes. Given that the one extant copy is difficult to access, and awaits digitisation, it has been judged appropriate to provide a transcription of the full tune contents of the volume (see Appendix 2). There are twenty-two tunes, all set in two parts, with the melody in the treble clef and the unfigured accompaniment in the bass clef. Nine of the tunes are in common metre, six in long metre, two in short metre, and five in "particular metres"; this last category comprises the metres 6.6.6.6.8.8, 7.7.7.7, 11.11.11.11, 8.8.8.8.8.8 and 8.8.6.8.8.8. The tunes themselves are more elaborate—and more musical—than those seen in previous Dublin sources, and include frequent slurs and passing notes; the accompaniment parts, too, are more musically coherent than those found in Smith, Boyse or Bradley. There is also far more rhythmic variety here than in the earlier tune sources: thirteen of the tunes—over half of them—are in triple time, with a distinction made between 3/4 and 3/2 time; similarly, while almost all the duple-time tunes are written in the traditional cut common time, one tune [1830a] is rendered in 2/4 instead. The tune for hymn 54 [685d], though it has a cut-common time signature, is written mostly using crotchets, with quavers for melismatic sections. It is possible that this and the 3/4 and 2/4 tunes were intended to be sung at a faster tempo than those written mainly in minims. Except for the "Musician's" tune, which accompanies Charles Wesley's text of the same name, none of the tunes is given a name. 213 Instead, each tune is superscribed with the

²¹³ A nineteenth-century biography of Charles Wesley claimed that the "Musician's" hymn was composed by Wesley specifically for J. F. Lampe, and even suggests this was the hymn which caused Lampe to shed tears when it was presented to him and claim he loved Wesley "as his own brother". Although specific evidence identifying this text with that event is lacking, the existence of a further connection with Lampe, however tenuous, is suggestive given the question of the *Collection's* authorship. Thomas Jackson, *The Life of the Rev. Charles Wesley*, vol. 1 (London: John Mason, 1841), 434–5.

number of one of the hymns in the main text of the *Collection* to which it can be sung, and the first verse of that hymn is written beneath the tune.

The tunes themselves constitute an unusual selection: the oldest were almost two hundred years old at the time of publication [e.g. 143a], while the newest were brand new [e.g. 1935].²¹⁴ Many of the tunes are found in few or no other sources. Only six of the twenty-two appear in any of the previous Dublin books. These are the three Genevan tunes "Ps. 51", "Ps. 119" and "Ps. 100" [111c, 120c and 143a], "Dublin" [271c], "St Ann" [664a] and "Namure" [750b]. There is also very little crossover with the tune content of the 1708 New Version supplement, with only three of the twenty-two tunes appearing in the Collection in the same variant forms as appeared in 1708. Six of the tunes [582a; 846a; 387e; 598a; 1424; 694b] can be found in Evison's Compleat Book of Psalmody, published two years previously in London, and a likely source for the editor of the Collection; this is one of only four prior sources for "Mansfield" [1424]. Another tune, "Kent" [1830a], can definitively be attributed to J. F. Lampe, and appears in only one prior source, Lampe's Wesleyan collection Hymns on the Great Festivals (1746)—a point in favour of Lampe as editor of the 1749 Collection. Another, "St George" [995c], has Moravian connections: it is derived from a German hymn and first appeared in the British Isles in Thomas Hutton's Moravian hymn book of 1742, to accompany Isaac Watt's hymn, "Come let us join our cheerful songs". This is the same text with which it is paired in the 1749 Collection.

Five tunes appear in the *Collection* for the first time. Two of these, "St Thomas" [1934] and "Irish" [1936a] enjoyed considerable success in subsequent years, with 71 and 291 citations respectively in the HTI. The other three debut tunes, in contrast, are the

-

²¹⁴ All tune information in this and the following paragraph, unless otherwise stated, is derived from the Hymn Tune Index entries for the tunes listed in combination with the primary sources.

rarest in the volume. The tune supplied for the preface hymn by Charles Wesley, "Musician's" [1937], appears in only one other source, an American volume of 1768 in which it is attributed to Thomas Arne. If trustworthy, this attribution may be another point in favour of Lampe as the *Collection*'s editor, for Lampe was Arne's brother-in-law, and his compositional style has been described as similar to that of Arne. 215 The two remaining tunes are both unique to this collection: [1935], which appears paired with the Wesleyan text "Sons of Men, behold from far", and [685d], a unique variant of the "Salisbury" tune [685]. 216 The former [1935] has the trochaic metre 7.7.7.7, unusual in the pre-existing psalm and hymn tradition but quite characteristic of Wesley's writing.²¹⁷ Texts such as these would be difficult to sing to the existing tunes of the common repertory—the Dublin repertory up to this point contains no tunes in this metre—and so this tune may have been specifically composed to fill this gap. The latter, the "Salisbury" variant [685d], is set to the text "Hark how all the welkin rings", an early version of the now ubiquitous Christmas hymn "Hark the herald angels sing". The original text was written by Charles Wesley and first published in 1739 in the first edition of Hymns and Sacred Poems; its appearance in the Collection is notable for being its first with accompanying music, long predating its now almost universal association with the Mendelssohn tune. The original text of "Hark how all the welkin rings" had verses of four seven-syllable lines, and lacked the accompanying "Hallelujah" present in the Collection, which extends each line to eleven syllables by its repetition at the end of each phrase. The version of the text with the "Hallelujahs" is not mentioned in Julian's Dictionary of

²¹⁵ Holman, "Lampe, John Frederick", GMO.

²¹⁶ Wesley's authorship of this text was established via Hymnary.org.

²¹⁷ Temperley, Music of the English Parish Church, 212.

Hymnology or the New Oxford Book of Carols, and is only listed in six sources in the HTI database, of which this is the earliest.²¹⁸

As well as being organised by metre, several of the tunes are also marked with symbols (reproduced in Appendix 2). The same symbols appear also alongside many of the hymn texts; an instruction at the beginning of the tune section states, "The Tunes are to be adapted to Hymns of the same Measure, according as they are marked, or not marked": a long-metre tune marked with a star, for example, ought to be paired with a tune not only of the same metre, but also with the same marking. The logic behind the assigning of these markings is not clear from this volume, but can be deduced by reference to the second edition of the *Collection* (see 3.4.2 below), in which the same system is used to match tunes to texts based on their "quality"—for example, "lofty", "lively", "grave" or "mournful". 219 Applying the same interpretations to the symbols in the 1749 edition would classify the "Old 100th" [143a] and the "Dublin" tune [271c] as "grave or plaintive"; "St George" [995c], with its florid melismatic passages, as "lively"; and "St James" [582a] as "lofty".

Correspondences between the tune contents of the *Collection* and the established Dublin tune repertory suggest that the editor was familiar with that repertory, either from first-hand experience or through access to one of the Dublin sources. The presence of the "Dublin" tune [271c] is particularly telling: as we have seen (2.3), this tune originated in Dublin sources, although by 1749 it had appeared in a few English publications under the name "Coleshill". Nevertheless, tunes from the Dublin repertory make up less than one-

²¹⁸ Julian, *A Dictionary of Hymnology*, 486–7. Hugh Keyte and Andrew Parrott, eds., *The New Oxford Book of Carols* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998), 328–9. See also HTI text codes HHATWR2 and HHATWR3.

²¹⁹ A Collection of Hymns and Sacred Poems (Dublin: printed by George Bonham, No. 42, Dame-Street. And sold by S. Edwards, School-Master, in Golden-Lane, 1779), preface. GB-Lbl 3438.ff.40.

third of the total tune content. There does not appear to be any single source listed in the HTI that exhibits significant correspondences in its tune content with the *Collection*, and so it seems the editor would have needed access to several other tune sources, international in origin. As the editor's choice of tunes cannot be explained as the simple copying of content from another source wholesale, there is a tantalising possibility that this selection is based on the editor's first-hand experience of the Protestant psalm-singing tradition in practice, and may be a rare example of a primarily descriptive rather than prescriptive selection. Alternatively, the tune content may merely reflect the skilled and informed work of an editor with considerable knowledge of and interest in psalm- and hymn-tunes, both modern and of considerable vintage, deliberately drawing on a wide range of sources to create a collection of greater musical interest than the existing Dublin tune books.

3.4.2 A Collection of Hymns and Sacred Poems (1779)

Despite surviving as a single copy, the 1749 *Collection* appears to have been popular at the time of its release, for a second edition was published thirty years later by George Bonham and sold by Samuel Edwards.²²⁰ Bonham had taken over the Powell press in 1775, and had previous form with regard to reissuing Powell's old books under his name, having published a second edition of Powell's *Select Psalms* in 1777 (see 1.5.1 above).²²¹ In contrast to *Select Psalms*, however, of which the second edition was almost identical to the first, Bonham's second edition of the *Collection* was considerably expanded: the introduction (once again by an unknown editor) states that this was done to incorporate

²²⁰ A Collection of Hymns and Sacred Poems (Dublin: Bonham, 1779). This is the same Samuel Edwards who was responsible for the dispute with the Moravians discussed in 3.2.3 above.

²²¹ "Bonham, George", *Dublin Music Trade* (https://www.dublinmusictrade.ie/node/108).

more of "the different Measures used in religious Compositions; the former being for the most part of the plainer kind", as well as new hymn texts which had not been written when the original *Collection* was published. This expansion brought the total number of hymn texts up to 466—almost double the number included in the first edition. Most of the new texts have no author's attribution, but at least three are stated to be the work of John and Charles Wesley. Other authors who are specifically named are the ever-present Isaac Watts, Joseph Hart, an English evangelical with Moravian leanings whose works were popular with Calvinistic Nonconformists, and, perhaps surprisingly, "the late Revd J. Boyse, Minister of Wood-street meeting". The book is in a peculiar rectangular format, awkward for portability but amenable for positioning on a music stand. Like the previous edition, and providing continuity between the old and new volumes, the 1779 *Collection* quotes Wesley's "Musicians" hymn in its preface.

Possibly on account of its increased length, the second edition of the *Collection* included no tunes; instead, the preface states that "some select Tunes" have been published in a "separate Book". This is almost certainly the publication named *Select Tunes for Sacred Use*, printed by Bonham around the same time (see 3.4.3 below).²²³ Within the *Collection* itself, the majority of the hymn texts have no specific tune indications, but "a few Hymns with more musical Tunes have the Names of the Tunes annexed". There are ten of these: "Salisbury" (11.11.11.11), "Denmark" (LM), "Amesbury" (5.5.5.12), "Denbigh" (LM), "Woolwich" (10.10.10.10), "Greenwich" (CM), "Christ Church" (7.6.7.6), "Henbury" (7.6.7.6), "Handel's March" (DSM), and

²²² Julian, Dictionary of Hymnology, 492. A Collection of Hymns and Sacred Poems (1779), 174.

²²³ Select Tunes for Sacred Use, adapted to Psalms and Hymns in Different Measures; neither too Numerous, Long or Difficult for a Christian Congregation, or for Private Use (Dublin: printed by George Bonham, No. 42, Dame-street. Sold by S. Edwards, School-master, Golden Lane, [1780]). IRL-Dcla Gilbert Collection 15E (24).

"Litchfield" (SM). All of these, apart from "Woolwich", correspond with tunes of the same metres in *Select Tunes*.

One hymn text, number 88 "The Lamb slain and honoured", incorporates the intriguing device of words in Italics which can be included, or left out, in order to change the metre of the verse. ²²⁴ A footnote reads: "For Woolwich Tune use the *Italicks*, otherwise drop". Without the italicised words, the metre of the text is 8.8.8.8; with them, it becomes 10.10.10.10. This innovation is only used in the first verse of the hymn; all of the others are in straightforward long metre, with no italicised words. The peculiarity of the metre makes it possible to identify the "Woolwich" tune as HTI [3995a]. This tune has five citations in the HTI in printed sources between 1778 and 1820, and is always paired with the text beginning "From heav'n the loud th'angelic song began", just as it is in Bonham's *Collection*. ²²⁵ The only source in which it appears prior to Bonham's *Collection* is a volume of psalm tunes from Bath entitled *Musica Sacra*, published around 1778. ²²⁶ The appearance of "Woolwich" tune in both publications (albeit just by name in Bonham's *Collection*) suggests the possibility that Bonham's editor derived it directly from *Musica Sacra*, and was therefore up to date with recent developments in the wider world of sacred music publishing.

One aspect of both editions of the *Collection* that distinguishes them from earlier Dublin tunebooks is a high level of concern for pairing tunes with texts of a similar emotional character. This system, used without much explanation in the 1749 edition, is clarified in the 1779 edition: although the hymns were primarily assigned tunes by virtue of their metre, the book also invites readers to consider their "quality" by marking each

²²⁴ Collection of Hymns and Sacred Poems, 35.

²²⁶ HTI entry for Source: #MSH.

²²⁵ Note that *Select Tunes* is not included in the HTI, and so is excluded from these citations.

hymn and each tune with a symbol according to their particular character: "the lofty are marked thus §, the lively thus *, the soft or affecting thus ‡, the grave or plaintive thus †, and a few of a very mournful Cast thus ¶". Those which were "of a middling nature, e. i. [sic] not distinguishable for gravity, softness, sprightliness, or sublimity", were not marked with a symbol. The conscientious hymn singer could therefore easily match "lofty" texts with tunes of a similar "lofty" character, enhancing the effect of their performance. Select Tunes for Sacred Use makes use of the same symbols "that there may be the greater propriety in the accommodation of suitable tunes to the compositions"; "Christ Church", for example, the fastest of the six tunes available for analysis, is marked with the "lively" symbol. 227 Interestingly, however, the symbol to mark tunes "of a very mournful Cast" (¶) is not used in Select Tunes.

It is clear that the editor of the 1779 *Collection* expected diligent worshippers to practice their singing before attempting it in public. An idiosyncratic but fascinating section of the 1779 *Collection* is the inclusion of a set of poetic, non-sacred texts in all of the standard metres. The purpose of these is for the prospective singer to practice singing the tunes without being obliged to use sacred texts to do so; this means "that the Sacred Compositions may not be prophaned by Learners" inadvertently making mistakes.²²⁸ The texts are arranged by metre, and carry the same "tone markings" as the tunes to indicate their character; the verses in metre 7.7.7.7 carry a special footnote that anyone wishing to practice "Salisbury" should add "have a care" to the end of each line, in place of the usual "Hallelujah".

²²⁷ Select Tunes, 7.

²²⁸ Collection of Hymns and Sacred Poems (1779), included at the end of the volume (unpaginated).

3.4.3 Select Tunes for Sacred Use (1780)

Although it is nowhere named explicitly as such, there can be little doubt that the companion tunebook referred to in the 1779 Collection is Select Tunes for Sacred Use, which was published by Bonham around 1780 and sold by Samuel Edwards, the bookseller who sold the Collection.²²⁹ As well as including all of the tunes named in the 1779 Collection, the tunebook also makes use of the same system of symbols found in both editions of the Collection to indicate the character of the tunes. It also includes most of the tunes from the 1749 Collection (see below). Only one copy of this book is listed in the ESTC, held at the Dublin City library, and it has no entry in the HTI. As access to this book was only possible at a very late stage in the research process, it was not feasible to index all of the fifty-seven tunes contained in the book. It was possible, however, to obtain a general overview of the book's contents, and to look in detail at a selection of the tunes.

The contents of *Select Tunes* are divided into two distinct sections. The majority are found in the first section, which is intended for more general use, while the second section contains "more musical tunes [...] for such as are capable of a progressive improvement in sacred melody". ²³⁰ Whereas the the first section comprises straightforward psalm- and hymn-tunes with simple bass accompaniments resembling those of the 1749 *Collection* (albeit more highly ornamented and rhythmically complex), the second section comprises more elaborate material, including anthems designated for feast days such as Christmas and Easter. These "more musical tunes" also incorporate Italian terms such as "Andante" and "Vivace", variations in tempo between sections, and even an antiphonal texture achieved by apportioning sections of the tune between the men

²²⁹ IRL-Dcla Gilbert Collection 15E (24).

²³⁰ Select Tunes, 25–26.

and women of the congregation, a routine that had originated with the evangelical movement.²³¹

On the whole there is a distinctly Methodist flavour to Select Tunes. Eighteen items also appear in Sacred Melody, a tune supplement bound up with Wesley's Select Hymns of 1761.²³² These include the relatively rare tune "Builth" [2197b], which has only twenty-one citations in the Hymn Tune Index, and a tune called "Lamp's" [1813], which was written by J. F. Lampe, as well as the more elaborate "Handel's March" [1656b]. This last was derived from Handel's opera Riccardo primo of 1727, and entered the sacred sphere via Wesley's Foundery collection in 1742.²³³ The use of secular melodies for singing sacred texts was a characteristic feature of evangelical hymnody. ²³⁴ Another source for the collection appears to have been Martin Madan's Collection of Psalm and Hymn Tunes (1769), which has four tunes in common with Select Tunes: "Denbigh" [3256a], "Denmark" [3257a], "Hotham" [2786a], and "Redeeming Love" [2980a], the first three of which were written by Madan himself. The appearance in Select Tunes of the tune "Matlock" [3708] suggests a Primitive Wesleyan influence: one of its two prior sources, and the only one in which it is called "Matlock", is the tunebook Musica Sacra (see above), which was associated with chapels founded by Lady Huntingdon in Bath and Bristol. The "Henbury" tune [3070] is also found in both books. (As we have seen, Musica Sacra also includes the "Woolwich" tune [3995a], which, despite being named in the Collection, is a conspicuous absence from Select Tunes.)

Although *Select Tunes* tends towards more modern content, older, more familiar tunes are nonetheless represented. An unusually high concentration of these older tunes

²³¹ Temperley, *Music of the English Parish Church*, 212–13.

²³² HTI entry for Source: *TS Wes a.

²³³ HTI entry for Source: #CTSF. See also Temperley, *Music of the English Parish Church*, 209–10.

²³⁴ Temperley, *Music of the English Parish Church*, 209.

occurs in one particular section of the first half of the book; though this half (containing the simpler tunes) is otherwise organised by metre, one of its sections is marked "Appendix", and brings together a rather disparate selection of tunes according to no clear criteria. This selection includes several from the 1749 *Collection* (see below), as well as "St Ann's" [664], "Dublin" [271c], and "Ps. 100" [143a]. It also includes the tune "Cork" [10157], for which the earliest current citation in the HTI is in 1803, making *Select Tunes* an earlier source by twenty-three years (see Ex. 21). Given the lack of an otherwise coherent organisational principle, the presence in the "Appendix" of two tunes with Irish topographical names, and the inclusion of several tunes from the Dublin tune repertory (particularly the "Dublin" variant [271c]), it is possible that the tunes in this section represent those that were commonly in use in Dublin at the time. Additionally, at least one tune from outside of this "Appendix" section is a variant common in Dublin: the "Ten Commandments" tune [111c], which appears only in its unusual "c" variant in the Dublin sources (see 2.3 above).

Of the twenty-two tunes in the 1749 *Collection*, thirteen reappear with the same rhythm, key signature, time signature, harmony parts, and accompanying text in *Select Tunes*. A further two tunes appear in both tunebooks, but in substantially different forms, suggesting that the line of transmission in these cases was not as direct: "Invitation" [1830a] is in a different key in *Select Tunes* and is much more profusely ornamented than in the *Collection*, and although the bass line begins similarly, it ends quite differently. The version of "Salisbury" [685] which appears in *Select Tunes* is a different variant entirely from that in the *Collection*, although it is undoubtedly the same tune, and is set to a different text. Seven tunes from the *Collection* do not appear at all in *Select Tunes*: "Ps. 119" [120c], "Evening Hymn" [598a], "Bedford" [694b], "Shuston" [750b], "Mansfield" [1424], "Hymn 168" [1935], and the "Musicians" tune [1937]; this last is a

curious omission, given that the text of the "Musicians" hymn does appear in the 1779 *Collection*.

One tune from *Select Tunes*, "Mystic" [14742], is of particular interest because its appearance here predates its current earliest citation by more than thirty years (see Ex. 22). The only other publication in which this tune appears, per the HTI, is Weyman's *Melodia Sacra*, a four-volume collection of psalm and hymn tunes published in Dublin in 1816 (see 5.2.2 below). The "Mystic" tune appeared in volume 2, where it was attributed to a certain "Green". The version of the tune in *Select Tunes* is slightly different from that in *Melodia Sacra*, and includes a leap of a minor seventh in the third phrase that Weyman conceivably may have expunged.

In terms of historical performance practice, perhaps the most remarkable and novel aspect of *Select Tunes* is that each tune it contains is provided with a specific tempo marking. This takes the form of a letter T followed by an Arabic numeral. The introduction to the book explains that each such number refers to the length, in inches, of a pendulum string with a leaden ball tied to the end and allowed to swing freely:

having let the ball ... fall by its own weight from any height at pleasure, each swing will be the measure of a constituting, or prevailing note in a bar, in any tune, according to the figures affixed to the title of it; as t 15 denotes, for the note of the tune, 15 inches of the pendulum; and t 30 denotes 30 inches, &c.²³⁶

This system of tempo measurement closely resembles that explained by William Tans'ur in his 1746 music theory book, *A New Musical Grammar*, where it is estimated that a

²³⁵ Weyman, *Melodia Sacra*. HTI entry for Tune [14742].

²³⁶ Select Tunes, 7.

pendulum 30 inches long will swing at a speed of about 60 beats per minute.²³⁷ Given that the relationship between pendulum length and speed is logarithmic, and Tans'ur estimates a seven and a half inch pendulum will produce a speed of 120 beats per minute (bpm), the "pendulum mark" of T15 used frequently in *Select Tunes* is approximately 100 bpm. The fastest tempo marking in *Select Tunes* is T10 (approximately 116 bpm) while the slowest is T40 (slower than 60 bpm, perhaps closer to 50). The majority of tunes in the book are marked T25 or T30, a moderate pace of approximately 60 bpm. While estimating tempo in this way is necessarily an inexact science, it does give a rough idea of the speeds at which the editor expected these tunes to be performed.

The slowest tempo marking, T40, is given to only four tunes: "St Ann's" [664a], "Dublin" [271c], "Ps. 100" [143a] and "Matlock" [3708]. Of these, only "Matlock" appears to have entered the repertory less than fifty years previously, while the tune of "Ps. 100" (the "Old Hundredth") was by this time over two centuries old. This suggests that the older tunes were generally sung at a slower speed than the newer ones. Additionally, those tunes are notated in minims and semibreves, recalling the notations used in older tunebooks, while the newer tunes are notated in crotchets, quavers and semiquavers. This does not, however, signify that the older tunes were sung at half the speed of the newer ones: rather, the tempo indications make it clear that even the slowest tunes were sung only a little more slowly than the average (around 50 bpm rather than 60 bpm), and some of the tunes notated in crotchets and quavers (such as "Salisbury" [685], which is marked T35) are marked with slower tempi than others notated in minims (for example, the "Ten Commandments" tune [111c], which is marked T25).

-

²³⁷ William Tans'ur, *A New Musical Grammar: or, The harmonical spectator* (London: printed for the author, and sold by him, 1746). US-CHH 781 T168n.

The introduction to *Select Tunes* sheds further light on contemporary performance practice, or at least on the state of the discourse surrounding the subject. Lining out is dismissed on aesthetic grounds as well as those of clarity, the editor commenting that "it must be owned indeed to be an inelegance to give out line by line to be sung, and to obscure the sense by a confused concurrence of voices". 238 Somewhat ironically, "over complex music" is also criticised, despite the high level of complexity of the tunes in that very volume. 239 The old question of whether instruments should be considered appropriate for church use is, by this time, "too trifling a point to debate about"; as long as they are "helpful and subservient to the distinctness of vocal music and employed with the true spirit of devotion", they should be introduced wherever it is "practical" to do so. ²⁴⁰ For congregations who have mastered the basic principles of church music and wish to embrace something more challenging, the editor suggests a form of singing "by response" by dividing sections of the tune between the men and women of the congregation, as "the greatest distinction of voice is that between the sexes". ²⁴¹ The editor also states that "in regard to propriety and elegance, the finer voices of women obviously qualify them best for the treble parts of tunes", and that allowing women to sing the "treble parts of tunes... should be esteemed no criminal teaching in the church, or usurping over the men". 242 This reflects the preference expressed by John Wesley that the higher parts of the tunes should be left to the women only.²⁴³

The majority of the introduction, however, is made up not of performance suggestions or comforting words but of an accusatory tirade of criticism directed at "the

²³⁸ Select Tunes, 3.

²³⁹ Select Tunes, 3.

²⁴⁰ Select Tunes, 4.

²⁴¹ Select Tunes, 8.

²⁴² Select Tunes, 3.

²⁴³ Temperley, Music of the English Parish Church, 213.

generality of Christians", on account of the "wilful neglect" of their "duty" with regard to the proper provision of church music. 244 "There are few who decline sacred melody out of *principle*, but multitudes out of *remissness*.... How few join in it with any tolerable spirit ... or can turn the tune", the editor laments, going so far as to describe this neglect as "impropriety and criminality" and accusing those who do not engage appropriately in the music of ingratitude to God. 245 Even those who do contribute to the singing, it is implied, could be doing better; the editor exhorts all readers "to aim at a progressive improvement in sacred melody"—though not, of course, to the extent that they neglect "the improvement of their minds in useful knowledge, or social usefulness". 246

3.4.4 McVity's Select Psalm and Hymn Tunes (1787)

The *Collection* of 1779 and the accompanying *Select Tunes* may be instructively compared with a later publication by Bonham dating from 1787.²⁴⁷ *Select Psalm and Hymn Tunes* is a collection of thirty-four psalms and nine hymns set to music for between one and three voice parts, for "the use of public congregations and private families". John McVity, the compiler and likely the composer of much of the music, is styled as a "professor of sacred music" and was the clerk of the parish of Galloon, in the diocese of Clogher in Ulster. The work was published "at the particular request of the Rev. Dr Campbell, rector of the said parish"; this was Thomas Campbell, incumbent minister at Galloon since 1773, who was better known for his authorship of *A philosophical survey of the south of Ireland* (1777), a piece of travel literature intended for an English

-

²⁴⁴ Select Tunes, 5.

²⁴⁵ *Select Tunes*, 3 & 5.

²⁴⁶ Select Tunes, 7–8.

²⁴⁷ John McVity, *Select psalm and hymn tunes, adapted to the use of public congregations and private families* (Dublin: printed by George Bonham, 1787). HTI: McviJSP 2. GB-Lbl Music A.1046.

readership. Campbell was a frequent visitor to England and a friend of Dr Johnson, and a strong supporter of Irish "political and commercial union" with Britain. 248 Select Psalm and Hymn Tunes was most likely intended for use in Galloon rather than for Dublin congregations, but because it was published and sold in Dublin, it arguably represents an aspect of the Dublin tune repertory. The 1787 publication is the second edition, though no first edition is known; the third edition has also not survived, but a fourth edition was published in 1809, and a sixth in 1820 (the fifth, like the first and third, is unknown). 249 Such a proliferation of editions implies that the book was popular to an extent hardly attributable to sales in a small rural parish.

McVity's readership appears to have skewed towards the religious and the wealthy, but was not constrained either by denomination within Protestantism or by political affiliation. Attached to the book's introduction is a list of 101 subscribers, among whom are an abundance of the clergy: thirty-one "Reverend" subscribers in total, including the Dean of Leighlin, whose son was one of the original members of the Orange Order. Not all of these are established church clergy, however; among them are the Presbyterian ministers William Sinclair and William Steel Dickson, both of whom later became well known for their involvement with the United Irishmen. The list also tends towards the wealthier echelons of society, and includes the Lord Viscount Enniskillen (a member of the Ulster Volunteers), the Countess of Bective and Sir William Richardson, a baronet.

²⁴⁸ C. J. Woods, "Campbell, Thomas", DIB (October 2009; rev. September 2010).

²⁴⁹ See HTI entries for sources McviJSP 2, McviJSP 4 and McviJSP 6.

²⁵⁰ "Lieut.-Col. William Blacker", *Dublin University Magazine* 17, no. 101 (May 1841). Library Ireland (https://www.libraryireland.com/articles/BlackerDUM17-101/index.php)

²⁵¹ Rosemary Richey, "Sinclair (Sinclaire), William". DIB (October 2009). I. R. McBride, "Dickson, William Steel", DIB (October 2009).

²⁵² Miscellaneous Works of the Right Honourable Henry Grattan (London: Longman, Hurst, Rees, Orme, and Brown, and R. Milliken, Dublin, 1822), 170–1.

Since McVity was himself associated with the established church, and supposedly edited the book on the request of his minister, it is unsurprising that all except one of the psalm texts in the book are taken from Tate and Brady's *New Version*. The sole exception is an alternative version of Psalm 117 by Isaac Watts, "From all that dwell below the skies"; this text also appeared in the *Select Tunes* of 1780. The hymn texts are drawn from various authors and represent a cross-section of the wider Protestant community: three are by Isaac Watts, two by Charles Wesley, one by Samuel Wesley (father of John and Charles), one by "Mr John Bird", whose identity remains obscure, one by William Dodd, an English established church clergyman hanged for forgery, and one by Nahum Tate. This last is the still-popular Christmas hymn, "While Shepherds watched their flocks by night", albeit with a different tune than the one with which it is nowadays associated. Among the Wesleyan items is "Lo, he comes with clouds descending", now accompanied by a variation on its familiar "Helmsley" tune [2973d] (see Ex. 23).

Accompanying these psalms and hymns are thirty-nine tunes, one liturgical setting in prose (the Sanctus), and three "set pieces". 253 Many of the tunes only appear in this collection and its later editions, and are probably McVity's own compositions. Nineteen tunes are given without any accompaniment, seventeen are in two parts, and three are in three parts. The majority of the tune settings, regardless of the number of parts, are florid, containing semiquavers, trills, slurs and other melodic embellishments, but a conspicuously simpler style is used for the older tunes in the book, such as "Ps. 100" [143a], "Dublin" [271c], "St David's" [379c], and the variant on "London New" [497e]. 254 This mirrors the use of an archaic style for the older items in *Select Tunes*. The

²⁵³ See HTI entry for Source McviJSP 2.

²⁵⁴ The variant [497e] is not itself old, dating only from 1772, but the original tune upon which it is an early seventeenth-century one.

accompaniments to the tunes are relatively simple, and were probably composed by McVity.

There are some correspondences between this collection and the Dublin church tune repertory as well as the more recent Dublin sources. The "Dublin" tune that originated entirely with the Irish sources [271c] appears here, as does the ubiquitous "Old Hundredth" [143a], although it is spuriously attributed to Dowland. The tune to Psalm 95 [6851] is a variant of the "Salisbury" tune [685d] common in the later eighteenth-century sources. "Denbigh" [3256a] and "Denmark" [3257a] appear both here and in *Select Tunes*, and can therefore be considered later eighteenth-century additions to the Dublin church tune repertory.

3.5 Dissent within the Establishment: Extra-Parochial Chapels

In addition to creating new religious movements, the Evangelical Revival also made itself felt within the established church through a surge of interest in preaching and the rise of itinerant preachers in the mode of Wesley and Cennick. While these preachers are remembered today mainly for their travels in rural areas, preaching to large crowds at crossroads or under trees, in town they increasingly found venues in the "extra-parochial chapels". These were unconsecrated chapels, outside the parish system but licensed for Anglican worship by the bishop of the diocese. Being free from direct ecclesiastical control, they were often used by Evangelicals as platforms for more radical theology than would be permitted in the parish churches.²⁵⁵

 $^{^{255}}$ Temperley, $Music\ of\ the\ English\ Parish\ Church,\ 206.$

An early example of this phenomenon in Dublin was the Free Church on Plunket Street. The building no longer exists, having been torn down when the area was redeveloped in the 1880s; although the name "Plunket Street" has similarly vanished, its crooked course remains visible in the modern street plan, winding between Patrick Street and Francis Street.²⁵⁶ Roque's 1756 map shows the Free Church building standing next to a Catholic chapel, the site of which is today occupied by the church of St Nicholas of Myra. As indicated by Rocque, the building was at one time a Presbyterian meeting house (see 2.2.1 above). 257 It was then acquired by the prominent English Methodist Lady Huntingdon, who financed its repair, and it reopened in 1773 as an extra-parochial chapel.²⁵⁸ In 1782, the Revd John Hawkesworth published a book of hymns (without tunes) "for the use of the congregation in Plunket-Street Meeting House"; the highly evangelical "fire-and-brimstone" tone of the book's introduction, and the dominance of Watts, Wesley and the evangelical hymnographer Joseph Hart among the included texts, give a taste of the denominational flavour of the free church.²⁵⁹ The only suggestion of a tune indication in the book is the phrase "St Stephen's", which is appended to one of Wesley's hymns, "Head of the Church triumphant", in place of a metrical indication. The metre of the hymn is peculiar (7.7.8.7.7.8.7), and allows the tune to be confidently identified as HTI [1832], a composition by J. F. Lampe that had first appeared in the Wesleyan collection Hymns on the Great Festivals in 1746 (see Ex. 24).²⁶⁰

 ²⁵⁶ Ferguson, "Rocque's Map", 149–150.
 ²⁵⁷ Ferguson, "Rocque's Map", 149.
 ²⁵⁸ Ferguson, "Rocque's Map", 150. The purchase of the Plunket Street house occurred before Lady Huntingdon's break with the established church, and echoes her establishment of similar chapels in Bath and Brighton around the same time. Temperley, Music of the English Parish Church, 206.

²⁵⁹ John Hawkesworth, ed., A collection of hymns, for the use of the congregation in Plunket-Street Meeting-House (Dublin: printed by G. Perrin, No 3, Castle-Street, 1782). GB-Lbl 3435.a.51.

²⁶⁰ J. F. Lampe, John Wesley and Charles Wesley, Hymns on the Great Festivals, and other occasions (London: printed for M. Cooper at the Globe in Pater-Noster-Row; and sold by T. Trye near Grays-Inn Gate, Holborn; Henry Butler in Bow Church-Yard; the booksellers of Bristol, Bath, Newcastle upon Tyne, and Exeter, and at the musick-shops, 1746). HTI #HGFOO 1. GB-Lbl Music F.1120.m.

Extra-parochial chapels were also often associated with institutions such as orphanages or hospitals, and as a result could draw on the members of those institutions to provide singers for chapel music. The Magdalen Asylum chapel opened in 1768, ten years after its equivalent in London, and the published version of the sermon that accompanied that occasion also contains several hymns for use in the chapel, though there are no tunes or tune indications. ²⁶¹ One of the hymns, "Glory be to God our King", appears in a later London publication with "Hallelujah" appended to each line, strongly suggestive of the "Salisbury" tune discussed above [685]. ²⁶²

The foremost extra-parochial chapel in Dublin was the Lock penitentiary's "Bethesda" Chapel on Dorset Street—founded in 1764 by William Smyth, nephew of Archbishop Smyth—which became known as the "cathedral of Evangelism" in Dublin. Smyth paid for the building of the chapel himself, and his hope was that his uncle would license it as a chapel of ease. Unfortunately, the Archbishop died unexpectedly, and his successor, John Cradock, was unwilling to provide a license to what he termed a "Gospel chapel". 263 This lack of approval officially made Bethesda a Dissenting meeting house. Somewhat awkwardly, however, its deed of trust stipulated that it had to be administered by members of the clergy. The chapel thus existed in an ambiguous state somewhere between conformity and dissent, until it was eventually granted a license in the 1820s.

This ambiguity can be seen in the form of the service at the chapel published in 1786 by Edward Smyth, the brother of William Smyth and one of the most prominent

²⁶¹ Edward Bayly, *A Sermon preached on the opening the chapel of the Magdalen Asylum* (Dublin: Printed for Josiah Sheppard, [1768]). GB-Lbl C.109.f.16(1). Temperley, *Music of the English Parish Church*, 207. ²⁶² Thomas Costellow, *A Selection of Psalms and Hymns with favourite & approved Tunes for the Use of Bedford Chapel near Bedford Square* (London: Printed & Sold by Wm Curce, No. 40 Long Acre and may

Bedford Chapel near Bedford Square (London: Printed & Sold by Wm Curce, No. 40 Long Acre and may be had at the Chapel, 1791), 70.

²⁶³ Grayson Carter, Anglican Evangelicals: Protestant Secessions from the Via Media c. 1800–1850 (Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock, 2013), 67.

preachers at the chapel at that time. ²⁶⁴ Smyth described the liturgy of the Bethesda chapel as differing "very little from that... of the Established Church", to "the essential doctrines of which" Smyth insisted he subscribed. It is nonetheless an edited version of the liturgy, omitting several prayers in order to allow "more time than is generally spent" for singing and extempore prayer. It also omits material associated with saint's days, baptisms, marriages, and other special services, "as being unnecessary for a Chapel which is not built with any intention of infringing on the peculiar rights of the Clergy." The somewhat confused status of the Bethesda chapel did not deter visiting preachers or congregants: such famous figures as John Wesley and the Calvinist Rowland Hill preached there in the late eighteenth century, and chapel was so popular with the city's Protestant community that the Provost of Trinity College was compelled to forbid undergraduates from attending services there. ²⁶⁵

From early in its history, Bethesda chapel could draw upon two associated institutions to provide girl and woman singers for its services. A travellers' guide to Dublin written in 1831 gave the following account of the chapel:

William Smyth [...] afterwards annexed an asylum for female orphans, in which thirty-six children are regularly supported, clothed, and educated, and in 1794, the Rev John Walker carried the views of the founder still further into effect by opening a penitentiary for the reception and employment of such women dismissed from the Lock hospital, as wished to return again to the paths of industry and virtue. [...] No place of worship in Dublin is better attended, than Bethesda chapel, to which the solemnity of the service, the sweet voices of the females, and the excellent purposes

²⁶⁴ Edward Smyth, *A choice collection of occasional hymns; principally designed for the congregation attending Bethesda-Chapel; but calculated for all Denominations of Christians, who desire to worship God in Spirit and in Truth. To which is added, The form of prayer, used in the chapel.* (Dublin: printed by J. Charrurier, No. 128, Capel-Street, 1786). GB-Lbl 3436.i.45. Myrtle Hill, "Smyth, Edward (1746/7–1823), Methodist Preacher", ODNB (23 September 2004).

²⁶⁵ Grayson Carter, Anglican Evangelicals, 67–8.

for which the establishment was founded all serve as powerful attractions. 266

In addition to the women of the penitentiary, the children of the orphanage also sang once a year at the annual charity sermon.²⁶⁷ A single sheet of hymn texts survives from one of these performances on 4 February 1798, presumably printed for the occasion. ²⁶⁸ Five hymns were performed during the service: "by the children coming into the chapel", before the litany, before the sermon, "by the children during the Collection", and "while the Congregation is dismissing" at the end. There was also a doxology before Communion: "Praise God from whom all blessings flow", by Thomas Ken. Two of the hymns were by Watts, one from the New Version by Tate and Brady, and one by the English cleric and abolitionist John Newton. 269 The hymn sung during the collection, "Bring helpless infancy to me", is of uncertain authorship, but appears to have been a regular item of the Bethesda chapel charity sermon, for it appeared some thirty-five years later in a collection of "hymns used in Bethesda chapel" with the note that it was "sung by the children at the annual charity sermon". 270 In 1855, someone wrote to the editor of Notes and Queries inquiring about the authorship of "Bring helpless infancy to me", but does not appear to have received a reply.²⁷¹ Since this text does not appear in Hymnary's database, it may have been written specifically for the Bethesda chapel. The only metres used in the five hymns were the straightforward common, long and short metres, and so the tunes used to

²⁶⁶ Philip Dixon Hardy, *The New Picture of Dublin: Or, Stranger's Guide Through the Irish Metropolis* (Dublin, 1831), 165–6.

²⁶⁷ Hymns used in Bethesda Chapel (Dublin: Printed by J. S. Folds, Son, and Patton, 5 Bachelor's-Walk, 1843), preface.

²⁶⁸ Hymns, to be sung in Bethesda Chapel, on Sunday morning, the 4th of February, 1798 ([Dublin]: J. Charrurer, printer, 128, Capel-street, [1798]). GB-Cu Hib.0.798.1.

²⁶⁹ Authorship of these texts was established using the Hymnary.org database.

²⁷⁰ Hymns used in Bethesda Chapel (Dublin, 1843).

²⁷¹ C. H. H. W., "Anonymous Hymns", in *Notes and Queries: A Medium of Inter-Communication for Literary Men, Artists, Antiquaries, Genealogiests, Etc.*, vol. 12 (London: George Bell, 1855), 11.

sing them were likely similarly conservative, suitable for teaching to children. The massed women and children of the Bethesda chapel's associated institutions appear to have functioned similarly to the charity school choirs of the city parishes. Temperley has noted an "obvious similarity" between the music provided by choirs in hospital chapels and the charity school choir tradition in the English context; he also states that hospital chapels in England were generally outfitted with organs, although it is not clear whether the Bethesda chapel was similarly endowed.²⁷²

3.6 Conclusions

The nebulous state of extra-parochial chapels, midway between conformity and dissent, is an apt metaphor for the state of non-cathedral Irish church music at the end of the eighteenth century. The influence of evangelism on Protestantism in general, which made ubiquitous the practice of congregational hymn-singing, combined with the ability of popular hymn-writers such as Watts and Wesley to transcend denominational boundaries, led to a convergence in musical style and material between the "New Dissenters" and the established church, and the same hymn texts frequently appeared in hymnbooks by compilers of very diverse spiritual leanings. The persistence of tunes in the tune repertory which were also used by "Old Dissenters" such as Presbyterians and Baptists only increased this sense of cultural continuity between Protestant groups. The city's small but healthy Moravian community added to this general Protestant musical

²⁷² Temperley, *Music of the English Parish Church*, 211.

culture a strong tradition of congregational singing and instrumental music, which owed much to the community's Lutheran roots.

In addition, the tunebooks of the late eighteenth-century display a very different attitude to public worship music than that exhibited by the early eighteenth-century sources. The combination of extended efforts to "improve" church music through the provision of higher quality texts, organs, choirs and other such measures, combined with the evangelical zeal injected into everyday religion in the latter half of the century, created high standards for public worship music; the oral, populistic practices of the sixteenth century, such as lining out, were no longer considered good enough. Failure to perform to a sufficient standard was now a serious offense.

CHAPTER 4: "PROTESTANT STRANGERS"

The predominant narrative of eighteenth-century Irish history, and indeed of Irish history from the Medieval period onwards, is that of a conflict between two sides: two cultures, two religions, and two nations. 1 This dichotomous view acquired the quality of orthodoxy under the nationalistic government of the post-independence period, but its roots are far deeper; even in the early modern era, before the true beginnings of nationalism, the people of Ireland divided themselves into two groups: the Protestant, Anglophone "English", and the Catholic, Gaelic-speaking, native "Irish". Of course, it is seldom straightforward to divide society into two opposing tribes with clearly defined and opposite attributes. As has been noted in earlier chapters, such reductionist thinking effaces the cultural complexity of a society, eliding those aspects which do not conform to the narrative—the existence of a "third culture" of Scots-Irish, which existed in a complex relationship with the "English" Protestant community, being a notable example (see 2.2.1 above).³ It also depicts Dublin as a far more insular society than it really was. As the second city of the Empire, and a vibrant centre of trade and culture, Dublin was well connected to Continental Europe, as we shall see, and was home to many cultures, ethnic groups, and religions who did not fit neatly into the "Irish/English" dichotomy.

=

¹ Harry White, *The Keeper's Recital: Music and Cultural History in Ireland, 1770–1970*, Critical Conditions: Field Day Essays 6 (Cork: Cork University Press, 1998), 2–3.

² See, for example, Archbishop Edward Synge's statement that the goal of the charity schools was to make "the whole Nation ... Protestant and English". Edward Synge, *Methods of Erecting, Supporting & Governing Charity-Schools: with An Account of the Charity-Schools in Ireland; And some Observations thereon. The Second Edition, with Additions* (Dublin: Printed for J. Hyde, Bookseller in Dame-Street, 1719), 3. GB-Ob G.Pamph.1466(1). Synge was born in Cork and lived all his life in Ireland save for three years studying at Oxford. Marie-Louise Legg, "Synge, Edward", DIB (October 2009).

³ McBride problematises the settler-colonist dichotomy on many fronts, but particularly notes that the Scots-Irish represented an anomalous (in this framework) "third culture" within Irish society; see Ian McBride, *Eighteenth-Century Ireland: The Isle of Slaves* (Dublin: Gill Books, 2009), 166–9.

One of the largest and most influential of these groups was the "Protestant Strangers", immigrants who attempted to integrate into the society of their adopted city while still retaining much of their own individual culture. By far the most significant group of foreign Protestants in Dublin during this period was the community of French Calvinists known as "Huguenots", who were remarkable not only on account of sheer numbers—at one point they made up four to five per cent of the city's population—but also for their close involvement with and influence on all spheres of Dublin's city life. The Huguenots are the subject of the bulk of this chapter. The other group of "Protestant strangers" considered here are the Lutherans, whose numbers were much smaller and whose presence was far more unobtrusive, but who nonetheless maintained a consistent presence in the city for over a hundred years. This chapter examines the history and musical traditions of these communities, and what those traditions can reveal about the "Protestant stranger" experience and mindset within eighteenth-century Dublin.

4.1 "Protestant Strangers": Background and Legislation

4.1.1 The first "Protestant Strangers"

The term "Protestant Stranger" was used in seventeenth- and eighteenth-century Britain and Ireland to refer to foreign Protestants who were not subjects of the crown, and therefore were considered to exist outside of the usual rules regarding conformity among native Dissenters. The idea that one's religion and one's homeland were causally linked was not an unusual one in early modern Europe, as can be seen in the importance of the

-

⁴ Raymond Hylton, "Dublin's Huguenot Refuge: 1662–1817", *Dublin Historical Record* 40, no. 1 (December 1986): 21.

principle known as "cuius regio, eius religio", which acquired legal authority in the Holy Roman Empire in the sixteenth century following the Peace of Augsburg.⁵ Cuius regio decreed that all subjects of a given secular leader should profess the same religion as that leader, thus eliminating the risk of sectarian conflict within a ruler's territory and so strengthening the state. Subjects of foreign leaders, however, did not embody the same treasonous quality under this paradigm as native dissenters did, and so any nonconformity on their part was more easily tolerated than that of native dissenters.

From the outset, the "Protestant stranger" designation was associated with the favour of the ruling class. The first "Strangers' Churches" in London were set up by royal assent of Edward VI in 1550, granting freedom of worship to foreign Protestants from France, Wallonia and the Netherlands, as well as small Italian- and Spanish-speaking communities. The Dutch "strangers" were granted the use of a former Augustine Friary to hold their services, and a French church met in St Anthony's chapel on Threadneedle Street; the Polish Calvinist reformer John à Lasco (Laski) was invited to serve as the superintendent of the combined churches, with four pastors serving under him. A small Italian congregation joined the Strangers' Churches soon after à Lasco's arrival. Nonconformity remained a privilege of foreigners, but it depended entirely on the continued support of the Crown and government. In periods where that support was withdrawn, such as when the Catholic Queen Mary took the English throne just three years after the Strangers' Churches were established, the community correspondingly suffered; in that case, à Lasco was forced to flee to the Continent accompanied by most

-

⁵ Merry E. Wiesner-Hanks, *Early Modern Europe*, *1450–1789*, 2nd edn, Cambridge History of Europe 2 (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2013), 182.

⁶ Website of the French Protestant Church of London, "History" subsection (https://www.egliseprotestantelondres.org.uk/en/heritage/history-2/huguenot-refuge-england/; accessed 25 March 2022).

⁷ Dirk W. Rodgers, "À Lasco [Laski], John (1499–1560), Evangelical Reformer", ODNB (23 September 2004). Laski can also be spelt "Łaski".

of his associates.⁸ The special status of foreign Protestants was legally recognised in the seventeenth century, when it was enshrined in the 1662 Act of Uniformity, the Act which made use of the BCP compulsory in all public worship. This Act contained a special "proviso for Aliens of Foreign reformed Churches", stipulating that "the penalties in this Act shall not extend to the Forreiners … allowed or to be allowed by the Kings Majestie".⁹ Provided the "forreiners" were officially recognised as such, they were thereafter exempt from the usual penalties faced by Nonconformists who rejected the BCP.

4.1.2 Foreign Protestants in Ireland: The "Protestant Strangers Acts"

In Ireland, governmental support for "Protestant strangers" manifested itself in a series of Acts passed between the 1660s and the 1710s. Through these Acts, the government hoped to encourage foreign Protestants to settle in Ireland by offering them generous benefits, such as tax breaks and reduced membership fees for citizenship and guild membership. The first Act "for Incouraging Protestant-Strangers and Others, to inhabit and Plant in the Kingdom of Ireland" was passed in 1662, and declared that any Protestants immigrating to Ireland within seven years would be granted the status of "free and natural ... Subjects" of the Kingdom, with all of the same rights and freedoms of Irish-born subjects. ¹⁰ They could be admitted as freemen of any city or town in which they lived on a payment of only twenty shillings—significantly less than the £3 to £10 usually charged in Dublin—and were free to carry on business and trade on the same terms as native freemen, aside from a restriction on the number of foreign apprentices they were allowed to employ

-

⁸ Rodgers, "À Lasco, John", ODNB.

⁹ 14 Cha. 2 c. 4. John Raithby, ed., *Statutes of the Realm: Volume 5, 1628-80* (s.l: Great Britain Record Commission, 1819), 364-370. British History Online.

¹⁰ An act for incouraging Protestant-strangers and others to inhabit and plant in the kingdom of Ireland. Dublin: Printed by John Crook and are to be sold by Sam. Dancer, 1662. GB-Ob [shelfmark not available].

(likely an attempt to stave off foreign monopolies in any particular trade). ¹¹ They were also exempted from tax for seven years. The only conditions were that the "strangers" and their families must be Protestants, and were required to take the Oaths of Allegiance and Supremacy in order to enjoy the benefits the Act offered. As yet, however, there was no equivalent to the "Strangers' Church" of London where these foreign Protestants could enjoy freedom of worship.

The initial Protestant Strangers Act offered only temporary benefits, and by 1670 it had officially expired, although its effects continued to be felt in Dublin until 1672. 12 Following the conclusion of the Williamite Wars, a second Protestant Strangers Act was passed in 1692, which went "leagues further" than the original Act by allowing foreign Protestants full freedom of practice of their religion. 13 As the Irish equivalent of the Toleration Act would not be passed until 1719, the 1692 act awarded greater freedom to "Protestant strangers" than was extended to other non-conforming communities. The Act was renewed in 1703 and again in 1717. 14 The privileges offered by these Irish Acts, in particular the automatic naturalisation of any foreign Protestants upon their taking of the relevant Oaths, were far more generous than any similar legislation in England. There, Charles II had tried and failed to introduce a general Act of Naturalisation in 1681, and naturalisations were instead awarded by the more protracted processes of letters patent and Private Acts. 15

¹¹ Raymond Gillespie, "A Huguenot in Late Seventeenth-Century Dublin: the World of David Cossart and his Family", *Dublin Historical Record* 71, no. 1 (Spring/Summer 2018), 49. *An act for incouraging Protestant-strangers*, 7, 9–10.

¹² Gillespie, "David Cossart", 50.

¹³ 4 Will and Mary c. 2. Hylton, "Dublin's Huguenot Refuge", 21.

¹⁴ 2 Anne c. 14. 4 Geo. 1 c. 9. Grace Lawless Lee, *The Huguenot Settlements in Ireland* (London: Clearfield, 1936, this edn 2006), 12.

¹⁵ Lee, *Huguenot Settlements in Ireland*, 13. Hylton, "Dublin's Huguenot Refuge", 16.

The London Strangers Churches had been set up to afford sanctuary to Continental Protestants under a king whose administration was itself somewhat Calvinistic in its inclinations. Although the Irish government of a century later shared this spirit of fellowship and desire to lend aid to their distressed Protestant cousins, their primary motivations for encouraging Protestant settlers to come to Ireland had little to do with Christian fellowship. Their primary motivation was political: increasing the total Protestant population of the country, and particularly of the corporate towns, would strengthen the "Protestant front" against the ever-present and ever-threatening Catholic majority. 16 At its core, this was an old Plantation idea, which still enjoyed considerable support in the mid-seventeenth century. Just six years earlier, Cromwell had advocated for the large-scale plantation of Ireland with "all persons of what nation soever [sic] professing the Protestant religion", as it had already been planted with English and Scots.¹⁷ Despite their linguistic, cultural and even religious differences between these prospective settlers and their established church hosts, it was felt that their common Protestantism would make them dependable allies, and help to mitigate against Catholic dominance.

A further motivation behind the Protestant Strangers Acts, which would perhaps prove the most important, was economic: it was believed by many in the Ascendancy that an influx of foreign Protestants would be hugely beneficial to the Kingdom's struggling economy. There was more to this belief than a simple numerical increase of the numbers of traders and artisans and an injection of fresh ideas into an economy greatly affected by the violence and unrest of the seventeenth century. Protestant ideas about Ireland's

¹⁶ Julius Rieger, "Zur Geschichte der lutherischen Gemeinde Dublins", *Ich Glaube eine heilige Kirche*, reprinted and translated in *The Lutheran Church in Ireland 1696–199* (Belfast, 1997), 98. Gillespie, "David Cossart", 49–50.

¹⁷ Lee, Huguenot Settlements in Ireland, 9.

economic backwardness were deeply ingrained, and came hand in hand with the perceived barbarity of the native Irish people. ¹⁸ One of the reasons why Ireland had never prospered and achieved the economic success that England had, it was thought, was because the native Irish lacked both the ability and the natural disposition to engage in modern agricultural and economic practices. These ideas were still current well into the eighteenth century: Edmund Burke even argued that the Irish were genetically predisposed towards pasturage rather than agriculture, owing to their supposed descent from the ancient Scythians. ¹⁹ Added to this natural inadequacy was the corrupting influence of Catholicism, widely seen as a "barbaric" and cruel religion and so associated with lower levels of civilisation. ²⁰ Introducing foreign Protestants into Irish society would not only exert a positive influence on the native Irish in religious terms, but would also help to "civilise" them. Thus in 1697 a Dublin pamphleteer wrote that the French Protestants were "remarkable for their good breeding and civility" and that settling them "among the ruder Irish, will in time help greatly to improve them both in manners and religion". ²¹

The importance of the economic factor is clear in the text of the 1662 act, which described the "despoiled and wasted" state of Ireland on account of the latest "Troubles and cruel Wars", and lamented that the Kingdom's economy was suffering because of a lack of artisans and traders.²² This state of affairs was not helped by the inadequacies of local workmen and manufacturers, who created products that were so poorly made that

¹⁸ David Hayton, "From Barbarian to Burlesque: English Images of the Irish c. 1660–1750", *Irish Economic and Social History* 14 (1988): 9.

¹⁹ Keith Thomas, *In Pursuit of Civility: Manners and Civilization in Early Modern England* (London: Yale University Press, 2018), 213.

²⁰ Thomas, *In Pursuit of Civility*, 151–3.

²¹ "The True Way to Render Ireland Happy and Secure", quoted in Lee, *Huguenot Settlements in Ireland*, 256.

²² An act for incouraging Protestant-strangers, 1.

they were "unfit for wearing at Home or Merchandizing abroad".²³ This meant that the majority of raw materials were being sent overseas to be processed into goods. The Parliament's goal was to attract "strangers" to Ireland by means of various incentives and benefits and to allow them "free Exercize of their Trades, Mysteries, Crafts and Sciences of buying, selling, working and manufacturing the said Materials without Interruption and Disturbance".²⁴ Though the Act applied to all foreign Protestants, "Merchants, Traders ... Artizans, Artificers" and "Mariners or Seamen" were specifically mentioned as potential beneficiaries.²⁵

The main significance of the Protestant Strangers Act, beyond its creation of the favourable conditions that encouraged immigration, is that it indicates the extent to which foreign Protestants were associated with economic prosperity and societal progress. While governmental championing of the Protestant refugees had its detractors in both Ireland and England, and the privileges afforded to them could sometimes cause jealousy among the native population, in general, the Protestant communities of the British Isles warmly welcomed the arrival of "strangers" into their communities. The dominance of the cultural associations between foreign Protestant settlers and industrious progress undoubtedly contributed to the warmth of native Protestant feeling towards the settlers, and infuses the rhetoric surrounding them. In 1751, the Rector of Fintona wrote that the Huguenots were "sober, modest, industrious and honest ... they pursue [their business] with admirable address and skill, to the great advantage, not only of themselves, but of the nation in general." These associations were powerful enough to persist even in historiographical writings about Protestant immigrants until the mid-twentieth century.

²³ An act for incouraging Protestant-strangers, 2.

²⁴ An act for incouraging Protestant-strangers, 3.

²⁵ An act for incouraging Protestant-strangers, 3.

²⁶ Quoted in Lee, *Huguenot Settlements in Ireland*, 258.

Grace Lawless Lee's seminal study of the Huguenots in Ireland, for example, concludes with the assessment that the Huguenots possessed "sober industry and worth", and that their most significant characteristic was their hardworking nature. While it is certainly true that Huguenot immigrants contributed much to Irish industry and society, these characterisations owe much to the persistence of early modern attitudes towards "Protestant strangers". 28

4.2 The Huguenots

4.2.1 Huguenot immigration to Ireland, 1662–1760

The French Calvinists known as Huguenots were the most significant group of Protestant Strangers in eighteenth-century Dublin. As a religious minority in Catholic France, the Huguenots had long experienced religious persecution at the hands of the state church, and the conflict had escalated into an all-out war between the denominations in the 1560s. These hostilities, known as the "Wars of Religion", were formally ended by Henri IV in 1598 with the passing of the Edict of Nantes, which granted the Protestant minority the right to freely practice their religion. Tensions remained between Catholic and Protestant in the years following the ceasefire, however, and as time went on these tensions reescalated. By the mid-seventeenth century, the relationship between the denominations was once again extremely strained. Many Huguenots, especially wealthier ones, chose

²⁷ Lee, *Huguenot Settlements in Ireland*, 264.

²⁸ See also Charles C. Ludington, "The Huguenot Diaspora: Refugee Networks of Power", paper presented at UCC 22 May 1999; available in transcript at the RCB Library, through the Irish Huguenot Archive (IHA MS 47).

under the circumstances to leave France and find a safer and more profitable place to settle overseas.

At first glance, Ireland might not appear to be an ideal choice of refuge for these expatriate Huguenots, given the turbulent state of the Kingdom during the seventeenth century, the large Catholic population, and the tensions which existed between the state church and those of other confessions—all factors that had motivated the Huguenots' move away from France. Nevertheless, a small but significant number of families did arrive in Ireland during this period.²⁹ Although religious persecution was a major factor driving this early wave of Huguenot immigration to Ireland, it was not the only factor. Merchant families were attracted to the city for economic reasons: David Cossart, a Huguenot merchant from Rouen who moved to Dublin in 1670, was at least partly motivated in his move by his involvement in the rapidly expanding trade network between Dublin and northern France.³⁰ Others found themselves the new owners of Irish lands as a result of their involvement in Cromwell's army during the English Civil War.³¹

The establishment of this small community was greatly encouraged by James Butler, the first Duke of Ormonde, who was closely involved with the passing of the original Protestant Strangers Act after he was appointed Lord Lieutenant in 1662. Ormonde had spent twelve years exiled in France and had been impressed by what he perceived as the industry, skills and general productivity of the Huguenot minority.³² Like many in the Ascendency, the Duke was a firm believer in the economic potential which foreign Protestants could bring to Ireland, and even personally established settlements of

²⁹ Hylton, "Dublin's Huguenot Refuge", 15–16.

³⁰ Gillespie, "David Cossart", 48.

³¹ Lee, *Huguenot Settlements in Ireland*, 9.

³² Hylton, "Dublin's Huguenot Refuge", 15.

linen workers at Chapelizod and woollen manufacturers in Clonmel.³³ Ormonde's interest in attracting the Huguenots perfectly combined religious and economic concerns: in a letter to the Archbishop of Dublin in 1665 he summarised the Protestant Strangers Acts he had spearheaded as encouragements for "the propagation of the Protestant religion and the settlement of manufactures in this Kingdom".³⁴

Despite his efforts, however, fewer Huguenots initially rushed to avail of the benefits of the Protestant Strangers Act than Ormonde had hoped.³⁵ In 1679, he wrote to his secretary expressing his disappointment at the results of his efforts and doubting whether the project would ever come to fruition. Part of the reason for the lack of uptake, Ormonde believed, was due to a misunderstanding on the part of the settlers of exactly what they were being offered. On discovering that Ireland was not "as desert as the unplainted parts of America", and they would not be able to help themselves to land for free, as white settlers had begun to do in more far-flung colonies, one group of Ormonde's prospective migrants lost interest. ³⁶ Lee noted that despite the economic incentives offered by the 1662 Act, other legislation, such as restrictions on the use of foreign coinage and a ban on the importing of Irish cattle and fish into England, discouraged Huguenot merchants. ³⁷ Between 1662 and 1684, only around 500 migrants arrived in Ireland. The historian Raymond Hylton has estimated that, by 1680, there were around sixty Huguenots in Dublin, chiefly merchants and their families who hailed from the north of France, Rouen in particular. ³⁸

2

³³ Lee, *Huguenot Settlements in Ireland*, 13.

³⁴ Thomas Philip Le Fanu, "The French Church in the Lady Chapel of St Patrick's Cathedral 1666–1816", in Hugh Jackson Lawlor, *The Fasti of St Patrick's, Dublin* (Dundalk: Published by W. Tempest for the Standing Committee of the General Synod of the Church of Ireland, 1930), 278.

³⁵ Vivien Costello, "Researching Huguenot Settlers in Ireland", *The BYU Family Historian* 6, no. 1 (September 2007): 85.

³⁶ Quoted in Costello, "Researching Huguenot Settlers in Ireland", 85.

³⁷ Lee, *Huguenot Settlements in Ireland*, 13.

³⁸ "Dublin's Huguenot Refuge", 18.

Events on the Continent in the late seventeenth-century soon accelerated this population growth. By the 1680s, the relationship between Catholics and Protestants in France was rapidly deteriorating. In 1681, the French King Louis XIV instituted a policy whereby soldiers could be billeted on the households of French Protestants. The purpose of this policy, known as the *dragonnades*, was to intimidate Huguenots into conversion, and led to the expatriation of Huguenots in much greater numbers. The impact of the dragonnades, along with the generally rapidly deteriorating situation of the Calvinist community in France, was such that the Huguenot population of Dublin grew to over 400 by 1684.³⁹ The following year, Louis XIV revoked the Edict of Nantes, removing the legal right of Protestants to practice their religion. This was the decisive event in the history of the Huguenot diaspora, and caused the emigration rate to increase rapidly. In what could reasonably be described as a mass exodus, it is estimated that between 200,000 and 600,000 Huguenots left France after the Revocation, settling in cities and towns all across Europe and even across the ocean in the New World, establishing new communities, setting up churches, and adjusting to life in their new homes. 40 By the 1690s, the Huguenot population of Dublin had risen to at least 600, mostly migrants from the south-west.41

The third "wave" of Huguenot immigration to Dublin took place after the conclusion of the Williamite Wars in the 1690s. Although, during the hostilities, the number of Huguenots in Dublin dropped as families fled the increasingly dangerous conditions in Ireland, in the aftermath of the wars soldiers from the Huguenot regiments of William's army were granted land in Ireland in return for their services. There were

³⁹ Gillespie, "David Cossart", 59.

⁴⁰ Lee, *Huguenot Settlements in Ireland*, 11. Owen Stanwood, "Between Eden and Empire: Huguenot Refugees and the Promise of New Worlds", *The American Historical Review* 118, no. 5 (2013): 1319. ⁴¹ Gillespie, "David Cossart", 59.

five of these regiments, known as the "Irish Regiments": three of foot soldiers, one of cavalry and one of dragoons. Many of the pensioned soldiers were also rewarded with titles to accompany their lands; so Schomberg, who had commanded the cavalry regiment, became Duke of Leinster, De La Fausille was appointed Governor of Sligo, and the Marquis de Ruvigny was made Earl of Galway. Ruvigny's good favour with the King, in combination with his new high social position, was instrumental in securing favourable treatment for Huguenots in the British Isles after the wars were over. ⁴² Between the pensioning of Huguenot soldiers in the country and the Revocation of the Edict of Nantes, the Huguenot population of Dublin dramatically increased in the closing years of the seventeenth century. Hylton estimates that between 1679 and 1720 the Dublin Huguenot community grew in size to at least 4000. ⁴³

The final wave of Huguenot immigration to Dublin took place in the 1750s. During the first half of the eighteenth century, with the French army occupied in fighting European wars, the Huguenot community in France had been quietly re-establishing itself, but this changed when peace was restored. After the conclusion of the War of the Austrian Succession in 1748, the Intendent of Languedoc deployed the newly-available army dragoons to clamp down on Huguenot activity, causing hundreds to flee the country. 44 By this time, however, the tide of public opinion in France was turning to support the Huguenots. In 1787 an Edict of Toleration was signed by Louis XVI, and in 1789 the Declaration of Rights allowed Huguenots to be admitted to public office. Although conditions in France were now ripe for the "return" which the original settlers had dreamed of, most of the Huguenot exiles in Ireland "had become so identified with the

⁴² Hylton, "Dublin's Huguenot Refuge", 20. Schomberg was later buried in St Patrick's cathedral, and the inscription for his tomb composed by Jonathan Swift.

⁴³ "Dublin's Huguenot Refuge", 21.

⁴⁴ Lee, Huguenot Settlements in Ireland, 24.

life of their adopted country that their French origin had been almost forgotten."⁴⁵ As the eighteenth century wore on, more and more Huguenots conformed fully to the established church, intermarried with Ascendancy families, and were being educated and living together with the rest of the city's conforming community. The historian Steven Smyrl notes that even by the 1770s,

the children and grandchildren of the original refugees had assimilated with Dublin's Protestant population. They were speaking English (many had little or no French), marrying out of their own communities, and shared none of the desire of the earlier generation that a return to France might one day be possible. 46

Huguenot families remained at the centre of Dublin social, political and economic life in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, but in cultural terms they were now largely indistinguishable from the Protestant Establishment to which they had assimilated.⁴⁷

4.2.2 The Dublin Huguenot community

It is important to note that, despite their being the source of the English word "refugee" (from the French *réfugié*), the character of the Huguenot immigrants on the whole bore little resemblance to the images of extreme poverty and destitution which we associate with the word in modern times.⁴⁸ There were certainly some Huguenots who fit this description: it was for the relief of such poor immigrants that the *Société Charitable des Réfugiés* was established in 1721.⁴⁹ On the whole, however, the Huguenot community

⁴⁵ Lee, *Huguenot Settlements in Ireland*, 24–26.

⁴⁶ Dictionary of Dublin Dissent, 169.

⁴⁷ Lee, Huguenot Settlements in Ireland, 26.

⁴⁸ "The Origin of 'Refugee'", Merriam-Webster Word History blog (https://www.merriam-webster.com/words-at-play/origin-and-meaning-of-refugee; accessed 31 March 2022). See also Hylton, "Dublin's Huguenot Refuge", 22.

⁴⁹ Brigid O'Mullane, "The Huguenots in Dublin: Part I (continued)", *Dublin Historical Record* 8, no. 4 (September–November 1946): 121.

represented a broad cross-section of society and included people of varying social classes and economic backgrounds—if anything, there was an unusually high concentration of nobility among the Huguenot population.⁵⁰ Neither were the Huguenots geographically ghettoised: despite former beliefs to the contrary, there was no particular area of the city in which Huguenot dwellings were concentrated. Despite their traditional association with the linen industry, they were by no means merely a community of labourers; rather, Dublin's Huguenots made names for themselves as merchants, artisans, bankers, property developers, and scholars.⁵¹ The first librarian of Marsh's Library, Élie Bouhereau, was a Huguenot from La Rochelle; Huguenot names are also intimately connected with the founding of the Bank of Ireland (mainly the La Touche family) and the development of huge swathes of the city's now-iconic Georgian housing; names like Gervais (Jervis), Aungier and D'Olier are now familiar parts of the Dublin lexicon.

If any particular occupation could be said to have been strongly associated with the Huguenot community, in fact, it was the military. Because of the large number of Huguenot soldiers pensioned into Ireland after the Williamite Wars, a high proportion of Dublin's Huguenots had some familial association with the army. In particular, the Irish Huguenot community contained a very high number of officers, who were generally drawn from the French nobility. ⁵² Two of the most significant figures among Dublin's Huguenots, the Earl of Galway and David Digges La Touche, owed their presence in Ireland to the rewards of their service as officers. An army career was not the preserve of old military families, however; Élie Bouhereau, who was himself a scholar, had two sons

⁵⁰ Hylton estimates that 25 per cent of Dublin Huguenots, and over 30 per cent of those who worshipped at the Lady Chapel (see 4.2.3 below), were members of the nobility, as compared with one to two per cent of the total population of France. Hylton, "Dublin's Huguenot Refuge", 22.

⁵¹ Hylton, "Dublin's Huguenot Refuge", 21–22. For a detailed discussion of Huguenot involvement in various trades in Dublin, see Lee, *Huguenot Settlements in Ireland*, 236ff.

⁵² Lee, *Huguenot Settlements in Ireland*, 248, 263. Lee gives particulars of several prominent Huguenot families, every one of which was connected in some way with the military.

who fought in the Williamite Wars, one of whom was killed during the siege of Limerick. Even Huguenot places of worship professed this military character, as a great many of the ministers had either previously served as army chaplains or took up posts with the army following their service in Dublin.⁵³

4.2.3 Non-established conformity: the French conforming churches

The first Huguenot church in Dublin was established on the initiative of the Duke of Ormonde, who recognised early that the ability to worship freely in their own language would be a powerful incentive for the Huguenot immigration he so desired. Early in 1666, therefore, Ormonde wrote to the Archbishop of Dublin to discuss the matter of a place of worship for the Huguenots, inquiring whether a pre-existing consecrated space could be used to host the congregation. On the Archbishop's recommendation it was resolved that the Huguenot community could make use of the Lady Chapel of St Patrick's Cathedral, then in use as a convocation house, to hold their services. ⁵⁴ The Lady Chapel is located at the east end of the cathedral, and in the mid-seventeenth century was a simple flatroofed structure, quite different from the opulent and highly-decorated chapel which exists today as a result of later renovations. The cathedral as a whole had only just reopened after falling into desuetude during the Cromwellian era, and was in any case in a perpetual state of disrepair during this period, vulnerable to regular flooding by virtue of its position on the swampy ground near the river Poddle. It is likely, therefore, that the willingness of the dean and chapter to host the French refugees was at least partly

⁵³ Lee, *Huguenot Settlements in Ireland*, 17, 231–252.

⁵⁴ John James Digges La Touche, *Registers of the French Conformed Churches of St Patrick and St Mary, Dublin* (Dublin: Printed for the Huguenot Society of London by A. Thom, 1893), i. Hylton, "Dublin's Huguenot Refuge", 16.

motivated by financial concerns: the Huguenot congregation would be charged annual rent for the use of the chapel and would also be required to pay for its upkeep themselves.⁵⁵ The initial cost of setting the Lady Chapel up as a place of worship was met by the House of Commons; the subscription list for this was organised by Ormonde, who also contributed a significant amount of his own money to the project.⁵⁶ From 1681, the Huguenot congregation were also (on payment of a further rental fee and another agreement that they would maintain the plot themselves) allocated a portion of the cathedral-owned site north of Kevin Street known as the Cabbage Garden, in which to bury their dead.⁵⁷

The form of worship practised by the Huguenots at the Lady Chapel represented a compromise between the established church and their own Reformed practices. Under the terms of the agreement, the Huguenots at St Patrick's were permitted to retain their Calvinist polity of elders organised into a consistory, and could also worship in French, but they were required to conform to the established church by recognising the authority of the Archbishop and using the BCP (in translation) for their services. This kind of "non-established conformity" was not unique to Dublin's Huguenots but was also practiced in England, where a large Huguenot community developed in London in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. When the "conforming compromise" was first under discussion in the early 1660s, the Consistory of Geneva had been consulted, and had replied that they did not consider the BCP to go against their reformed principles. 59 Like the Lady Chapel congregation, many of these Conforming Huguenot groups made

⁵⁵ Hylton, "Dublin's Huguenot Refuge", 17. La Touche, Registers of the French Conformed Churches, i.

⁵⁶ Lee, *Huguenot Settlements in Ireland*, 220. Thomas Philip Le Fanu, "The Huguenot Churches of Dublin and their Ministers", *Proceedings of the Huguenot Society of London* 8, nos. 1–4 (1909): 91.

⁵⁷ La Touche, Registers of the French Conformed Churches, iv.

⁵⁸ Hylton, "Dublin's Huguenot Refuge", 16–17.

⁵⁹ Le Fanu, "Huguenot Churches of Dublin", 91.

use of pre-existing established church buildings; the City church of St Martin Orgars, for example, was given over to the use of the "French Protestants, who have a French minister Episcopally ordained" after it was damaged in the Great Fire. ⁶⁰ The officially "authorised" translation of the BCP used by the English Conformed churches, produced by Jean Durel (1625–1683) in 1665, was also adopted by the Lady Chapel congregation on its completion; two editions of this translation were published "for the use of the church of Ireland" in the early eighteenth century. ⁶¹

The first pastor of the new St Patrick's French Church was Ormonde's own chaplain, Dr James Hierome, who had previously served as a minister at the Savoy French church in London and who had been a pupil of Jean Durel. Ormonde's interest in setting up the church may have been partly motivated by a desire to find his chaplain a permanent position in Ireland, as his communications with the Archbishop suggest that Hierome had come over from London prior to the establishment of the church in the hope that he might be made pastor on its establishment.⁶² The first service took place on Sunday 29 April 1666. It was a grand affair, attended by many of the great and good of Irish society, and was reported on in the *London Gazette* the following month; the report noted the presence of the Duke of Ormonde, "who had by his bounty contributed very largely to its reparation", as well as "his Guard and Gentlemen", his wife and daughter-in-law, the Lord Primate, the Lord High Chancellor, the Council of State, the Lord Mayor, various sheriffs and officers of the city in ceremonial dress, and "several great Lords and ... a

-

⁶⁰ John Strype, *A Survey of the Cities of London and Westminster* (1720), book 2, 187–88. Digitised by the University of Sheffield, 2007.

⁶¹ William Muss-Arnolt, *The Book of Common Prayer among the Nations of the World* (London: SPCK, 1914). Le Fanu, "Huguenot Churches of Dublin", 97. Jean Durel, the first minister of the Savoy French Church in London, was born in Jersey and was a lifelong advocate of unity between the Anglican and Reformed churches. Vivienne Larminie, "Durel, John [Jean] (1625–1683), Church of England Clergyman and Apologist", ODNB (24 May 2008).

⁶² Le Fanu, "The French Church", 278.

great train of Ladies of Quality".⁶³ The sermon was delivered by Hierome, and concluded with a benediction in French given by the Archbishop. As this service predated the publication of the Durel translation, a partial French translation of the BCP was produced specially by Hierome for the occasion, from which "the service of the Church of Ireland in French" was read and "heard with much devotion".⁶⁴

Because the Huguenot population of Dublin remained quite small for most of the seventeenth century, the Lady Chapel was initially more than sufficient to accommodate the congregation. Towards the end of the century, however, the city's Huguenot population was growing as a result of the combined effects of the Revocation and the Williamite settlements, and before long the number of worshippers turning up for services began to put considerable strain on the Lady Chapel's space. By 1700, the congregation had grown to over 400 communicants and a third minister had been appointed. Even after erecting no fewer than five galleries within the cramped confines of the chapel, space was still felt to be lacking, and in 1700 the congregation resolved to make use of part of the derelict St Mary's Abbey off Jervis Street as a chapel of ease to the St Patrick's congregation. The first Huguenot service was held in the new church in 1701, and notwithstanding a period of schism with their parent church, the building continued to host the overflow French congregation until it closed in 1740. From 1716 on, following the reunion of the two conforming churches after the schism, both churches were governed by a united consistory, with three ministers appointed to the Lady Chapel and

⁶³ La Touche, Registers of the French Conformed Churches, ii.

⁶⁴ Le Fanu, "The French Church", 279.

⁶⁵ Smyrl, Dictionary of Dublin Dissent, 168.

⁶⁶ Hylton, "Dublin's Huguenot Refuge", 21. La Touche, *Registers of the French Conformed Churches*, ii. ⁶⁷ La Touche, *Registers of the French Conformed Churches*, ii–iii. The schism was on account of a dispute over the ministerial succession, and resulted in the St Mary's congregation forming their own consistory for a period of about twelve years. See Smyrl, *Dictionary of Dublin Dissent*, 165–168, for a full account of this dispute, including the Duke of Ormond's role in its resolution.

two to St Mary's. The church at St Mary's also adopted the same church discipline, a set of rules and regulations drawn up for the Lady Chapel in 1694 with the approval of Archbishop Marsh.⁶⁸ Before 1694, the rules of the St Patrick's French Church had been modelled on those of the Savoy Church in London, but this had since been judged unsuitable for Dublin.⁶⁹

A 1722 description of repairs carried out to the Lady Chapel provides some idea of what the space might have looked like during the period of its use by the Huguenot congregation. During these repairs, the church was plastered, the windows were glazed, and paving stones were laid. The galleries and pews were also painted and the roof and woodwork repaired. To Description of the painting work reveals that the church was decorated with a display of the Ten Commandments—the description does not record whether these were in English or French—as well as the Royal Arms, which was mandatory at all conforming churches under the law. The interior of the church therefore would have closely resembled that of the city's parish churches.

The closure of the St Mary's overflow would seem to indicate that by the 1740s the congregation of the Conformed French churches was in decline. Certainly this decline was in evidence by the 1770s, when the number of services at the Lady Chapel were reduced, the evening service being abandoned altogether.⁷² When a flood caused serious damage to the Lady Chapel in 1784, breaking some of the seats and damaging the floor so badly that it had to be replaced, the failing congregation struggled to pay the costs of

⁶⁸ Lee, *Huguenot Settlements in Ireland*, 224. "Discipline pour l'Eglise Françoise de Dublin qui s'assemble à St Patrick" (1694); photocopy held at RCB Library IHA MS 90.

⁶⁹ Lee, Huguenot Settlements in Ireland, 224.

⁷⁰ Le Fanu, "Huguenot Churches of Dublin", 123.

⁷¹ Le Fanu, "Huguenot Churches of Dublin", 123. Dell Upton, "Anglican Parish Churches in Eighteenth-Century Virginia", *Perspectives in Vernacular Architecture* 2 (1986): 93.

⁷² Smyrl, *Dictionary of Dublin Dissent*, 169.

repair.⁷³ At the beginning of the nineteenth century, the French congregation let the Lady Chapel to the Established parish congregation of St Nicholas Without, which had formerly been housed in the cathedral's north transept. The French Church held its final service at the Lady Chapel in 1817; the first Huguenot place of worship to open its doors in Dublin, it was also the last to close, three years after the non-conforming meeting house at Peter Street.⁷⁴

4.2.4 The non-conforming Huguenot congregations

Although the Act of Uniformity specifically exempted members of the foreign Reformed churches from any penalties for nonconformity, the St Patrick's (and later St Mary's) French Churches remained resolutely committed to the religious compromise of "nonestablished conformity" on which they had been founded. This kind of compromise was not acceptable to all of the French immigrants, however. Many Huguenots were dismayed by what they saw as "Popish" elements in the Anglican liturgy, and were uncomfortable with any form of celebration that reminded them too strongly of their erstwhile oppressors. The Huguenot Isaac Dumont du Bostaquet, a Williamite soldier who was pensioned in Ireland, famously wrote in 1693 that the Anglican service had "retained all the trappings of popery" and that as a result of this lack of "simplicity", he "was not edified by it". At the same time, the Presbyterian forms of worship as practised in Ireland, which were derived from the *Directory of Public Worship*, were quite different from those to which the Huguenots had been accustomed in their home country.

73 Le Fanu, "Huguenot Churches of Dublin", 132.

⁷⁶ Whelan, "Sanctified by the Word", 84–85.

⁷⁴ Smyrl, Dictionary of Dublin Dissent, 169. La Touche, Registers of the French Conformed Churches, v.

⁷⁵ Ruth Whelan, "Sanctified by the Word: The Huguenots and Anglican Liturgy", in Kevin Herlihy, ed., *Propagating the Word of Irish Dissent 1650–1800* (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 1998), 74.

The need for a strictly French Reformed place of worship in Dublin was clear. In 1692, availing of the freedom of worship newly awarded to them by the new and updated Protestant Strangers Act, a group of Huguenots wasted no time in establishing an independent, non-conforming French church near Bride Street, outside the control of the Archbishop.⁷⁷ It was this church that made use of the small cemetery which still stands on Merrion Row. The Bride Street meeting house was a very modest building of just one storey, located at the back of a house. In 1697, after just five years in Bride Street, this congregation relocated to a former Jesuit chapel on Lucy Lane on the north side of the river (later known as Mass Lane, and now Chancery Place). Though small, the Lucy Lane congregation had a long life, and remained active on this site until 1773, when the building was sold to the Presbyterians of Skinners' Alley. The building was demolished by the Wide Streets Commission around 1825.⁷⁸

The Huguenots were not immune to the Dublin Nonconformist propensity to schism. In 1701, a disagreement within the Lucy Lane congregation resulted in part of the group's relocating to Wood Street. This group remained there for ten years before high rents drove them around the corner to Peter Street in 1711.⁷⁹ The plot of land they leased there, now the site of a car park next to the National Archives building, was large enough to accommodate both a meeting house and a small graveyard. Rocque's map of 1756 shows an irregularly-shaped building a little larger than the house on Lucy Lane, with a graveyard to the rear and an empty yard to the front.⁸⁰

⁷⁷ Whelan, "Sanctified by the Word", 75.

⁷⁸ Smyrl, *Dictionary of Dublin Dissent*, 170–72.

⁷⁹ Smyrl, *Dictionary of Dublin Dissent*, 173.

⁸⁰ John Rocque, An Exact Survey of the City and Suburbs of Dublin in Which is Express'd the Ground Plot of all Publick Buildings Dwelling Houses, Ware Houses, Stables, Court Yards, &c (1756). F-Pn GE DD-2987 (2657 B).

A series of entries in the records of the Dublin Moravian church seem to indicate that by the mid-eighteenth century, the Peter Street meeting house was slightly down on its luck. When the Moravians were searching for a site on which to build their church in the late 1740s, they considered approaching the French congregation at Peter Street with a proposal to rent their meeting house, noting that the congregation there also had a second chapel on the other side of the river (presumably Lucy Lane, though not named as such). The Moravian congregation were assured by a French minister from Drogheda that the Peter Street congregation would look favourably on this proposal, and might be prevailed upon to let the building to the Moravians "or at least to let [them] preach in it at times they don't make use of it". 81 In the event, the Moravians do not seem to have followed through with the proposal, and soon afterward resolved to build their church in Big Butter Lane (see 3.2.3 above). Regardless, it appears that the Peter Street congregation followed the same pattern of gradual decline as that of the Lady Chapel in the late eighteenth century. In 1806, it was resolved to close the Peter Street meeting house during the winter months each year, "the congregation having nearly disappeared". 82 The meeting house was closed for good in 1814 on the death of the last pastor, Isaac Subremont, but the churchyard continued to be used for burials until 1879.83

Historians have been somewhat divided on the nature of the relationship between the conforming and non-conforming Huguenot communities in Dublin. It is certainly true that Anglican historians have often sought to minimise the theological differences between the two groups, claiming for example that there was something particular in the Huguenot character that made them especially amenable to eventual conformity. This

⁸¹ PRONI MIC1F/4/2/1, 15 October 1750 and 14 October 1751.

⁸² La Touche, Registers of the French Conformed Churches, v.

⁸³ Smyrl, Dictionary of Dublin Dissent, 174.

attitude differs little from that expressed by many in the established church at the time of the Huguenots' arrival, and is more hopeful than factual—the fact that many Huguenots in England specifically chose not to conform was a source of anxiety for the Establishment. Recent research has shown that attempts to enforce conformity on non-conforming Huguenots often encountered significant resistance. Although lacking the same level of governmental support and funding as the conforming congregations, it is likely that the Nonconformist community was actually the slightly larger of the two Huguenot communities in Dublin: Le Fanu estimates that in the early eighteenth century the combined congregations of St Patrick's and St Mary's was around 800, whereas those of Peter Street and Lucy Lane combined could not have been less than 900. The Nonconformist position was not that of a small discontented minority, therefore, but rather a majority position during the period under consideration, a fact that is easily overshadowed by the eventual assimilation of the community as a whole to the established church.

Despite all of this, however, it does appear that the relationship between the conforming and non-conforming Huguenots was generally very close. Although divided by their forms of worship, in the social sphere the Huguenots were united by their common culture and heritage, and not least by their language, and there is no evidence of ill will existing between Dublin's congregations. The children of the charity school, discussed below, were expected to attend both the conforming and nonconforming services in successive weeks, taking their turns at different meeting houses. Similarly, the churches cooperated in charitable matters, such as the care of poor refugees. Even at the potentially divisive liturgical level, there were surprisingly few differences between the

⁸⁴ See Whelan, "Sanctified by the Word", 90-92.

⁸⁵ Le Fanu, "Huguenot Churches of Dublin", 109.

forms of worship practiced at the conforming and non-conforming Huguenot places of worship. Reforms of service consisted largely of scripture reading and sermons, and incorporated psalm-singing and prayers; to this, the conforming services added only a reading of the Ten Commandments and a second scripture reading. The compromise worked out in the "Discipline" of 1694 which allowed the conforming Huguenots to take Communion very infrequently heightened the similarity. Such continuity of worship may help to explain the ease with which some Huguenots appear to have crossed back and forward between the conforming and non-conforming churches during their lives. Dumont de Bostaquet, who found himself so unimpressed by Anglicanism in the 1680s, chose to join the Lady Chapel congregation rather than the Bride Street one on his arrival in Dublin in 1692, and even became an elder of that congregation. His "denominational peregrinations" did not end there, however, as he later appears on the registers of the French Reformed church in Portarlington. Reformed church in Portarlington.

4.2.5 Music in Huguenot worship: The Genevan Psalter

As in the established parish churches and in line with Calvinist tradition, music in Huguenot worship was centred upon the congregational singing of psalms. Unlike the English-speaking communities of the city, however, the Huguenots drew their psalm tunes exclusively from one source: the Genevan Psalter. This monumental publication first appeared in its complete form in 1562, and consisted of all 150 psalms in French versifications by Clément Marot and Théodore de Bèze, as well as two canticles. All of these were set to music for use in public and private worship. The development of the

-

⁸⁶ Detailed comparison of the forms of service at conforming and non-conforming Huguenot places of worship can be found in Whelan, "Sanctified by the Word".

⁸⁷ Whelan, "Sanctified by the Word", 74–79.

Genevan Psalter in fact quite closely resembles that of the Sternhold and Hopkins "Old Version", upon which the Genevan Psalter exercised a significant influence (see 1.2.3 above). Like Sternhold, Clément Marot was primarily a court poet, and his courtly verses formed the core of the collection. Théodore de Bèze later added his own versions of the remainder of the psalms in order to complete and publish the full psalter.⁸⁸

Musically, the most distinctive feature of the Genevan psalter is the huge variety of tunes it contains: 125 different tunes across 152 texts. One reason for this variety is the similar variety of poetic metre displayed in the Genevan psalm texts—around 120 different metres. The origins of these tunes are various and contested, but it is generally agreed that the majority were composed, or adapted from existing melodies, by Louis Bourgeois; the remainder seem to have been the work of a "Maistre Pierre", either Pierre Dagues or Pierre Dubuisson. Many of the tunes are adaptations of pre-existing Lutheran tunes, the legacy of the Salzburg community among which the Calvinist psalm tradition first developed. Others were adapted from secular melodies, or from Gregorian chant. Whatever their origins, the Genevan tunes displayed a remarkable permanence in the Reformed musical tradition. Unlike in the established church, where the common practice was to sing psalm and hymn texts to any tunes that fit their metre, the Genevan psalm tunes became strongly associated with the psalms with which they had originally been paired in the 1562 psalter; tunes were not given names as in the Anglophone tradition, but were instead referred to by the numbers of their accompanying psalms.

-

⁸⁸ Nicholas Temperley, Howard Slenk, Jan R. Luth, Margaret Munck, John M. Barkley and R. Tosh, "Psalms, Metrical", GMO (16 October 2013).

⁸⁹ G. R. Woodward, "The Genevan Psalter of 1562; Set in Four-Part Harmony by Claude Goudimel, in 1565", *Proceedings of the Musical Association*, 44th Session (1917–1918): 171.

⁹⁰ Woodward, "The Genevan Psalter of 1562", 173–174.

⁹¹ Temperley et al., "Psalms, Metrical", GMO.

The reverence shown to the original Genevan tunes, in contrast with the relative disregard with which tunes were treated in British and Irish sources, is most clearly demonstrated by the "updated" version of the Genevan Psalter that appeared at the end of the seventeenth century. This French equivalent of the Tate and Brady *New Version* consisted of new translations of the psalm texts which attempted to update the now-outdated language of the Marot and de Bèze texts written almost two centuries earlier. Fifty-one of the new texts had been written by Valentin Conrart, one of the founding members of the *Académie francaise*; the remainder were added by the consistory of Geneva after Conrart's death in 1675. Like the *New Version*, the Conrart psalter was the product of a literary imagination, concerned with the refinement and improvement of outdated language. Unlike the *New Version*, it retained unchanged all of the tunes of its predecessor, obliging the writers to compose the new texts to match the original metres.

Although very little evidence remains of the musical traditions at the Dublin Huguenot churches, one thing that is certain is that they continued to sing the Genevan psalms as part of their services. The historian Thomas Philip Le Fanu wrotes that the congregation of the Lady Chapel "remained unchanged" from standard French practice, "the version of Marot and De Bèze, and later that of Conrart, being used". ⁹³ The very few references to music in the 1694 "Discipline" of the Lady Chapel suggest that French conforming practice resembled that of other Protestant denominations in singing psalms before and after the sermon, the minister being instructed to take to the pulpit for the sermon "at the end of the psalm". ⁹⁴ On Communion Days, psalms appropriate to the

⁹² M. Petitot, *Collection des mémoires relatifs a l'histoire de France* (Paris: Foucault, Libraire, Rue de Sorbonne no. 9, 1825). Valentin Conrart biography on the Academie française website (https://www.academie-française.fr/les-immortels/valentin-conrart; accessed 28 March 2022).

⁹³ Le Fanu, "Huguenot Churches of Dublin", 97.

⁹⁴ "Les Ministres monteront en Chaire, avant la fine du pseaume". "Discipline pour l'Église", chapter 3, article I.

occasion were sung and chapters of scripture were read alternately as the minister ascended to the pulpit. 95 The non-conforming congregations deviated little from this standard model, also singing psalms before and after the sermon during services. 96 Le Fanu mentions a "precentor" associated with the Peter Street meeting house, who had enough knowledge of the French psalms to teach them to others. 97 It is possible this "precentor" had a similar role to the parish clerk in leading the singing during services.

One performance practice which the Huguenot community shared with the established parish congregations was the use of charity school children to lead the congregational singing during services. Although the earliest Huguenot school was an informal affair, run by a pastor out of a house on Stephen's Green, a more formalised school upon the charity school model was established in 1723. It was run by the *Société Charitable des Réfugiés*, an association founded in 1719 for the relief of poor Huguenot immigrants and their children. A dedicated schoolhouse was erected on Myler's Alley, on land granted to the society free of charge by the La Touche family. Myler's Alley no longer exists, having been demolished as part of the construction of Edward Cecil Guinness's Iveagh developments in 1904, but it formerly ran approximately north-east from the north side of St Patrick's Cathedral, connecting the north cathedral close to Bride Street. This area is now the site of St Patrick's Park.

⁹⁵ "Pendant la Communion, on lira des Chapitres de l'Ecriture, et on Chantera des Pseaumes alternativement et les Ministers marqueront au Lecteur, les Chapitres et les Pseaumes convenables a la circonstance". "Discipline pour l'Église", chapter 1, article IV.

⁹⁶ Whelan, "Sanctified by the Word", 83.

⁹⁷ Le Fanu, "Huguenot Churches of Dublin", 125–6.

⁹⁸ O'Mullane, "The Huguenots in Dublin: Part I (continued)", 121. Le Fanu, "Huguenot Churches of Dublin", 124–5.

⁹⁹ Le Fanu, "Huguenot Churches of Dublin", 125.

¹⁰⁰ Christine Casey, *Dublin: The City within the Grand and Royal Canals and the Circular Road with the Phoenix Park* (London: Yale University Press, 2005), 652–3. "Myler's-Alley" in *Thom's Almanac* (1862), Library Ireland (https://www.libraryireland.com/Dublin-Street-Directory-1862/998.php; accessed 28 March 2022).

In contrast with earlier private Huguenot schools, which seem to have been more idiosyncratic institutions where pupils were instructed in subjects such as Latin, Greek, drawing and the art of fortification, the Myler's Alley school much more closely resembled a standard parish church charity school. 101 Like the parish schools, the French school taught a mixture of academic and practical subjects, and pupils were typically apprenticed out at the end of their school careers. In the 1750s, the school was given three looms, and a workshop was installed on its lower floors. 102 Initially the children comprised twenty day-schoolers, boys and girls; boarders were admitted from 1736, and the numbers gradually reduced to just eight full boarders, with boys no longer accepted. 103 This trajectory towards accepting only girls mirrors not only that of the St Michan's parish school (see 1.4.2 above), but also of the Huguenot school in Westminster, which on its opening in 1747 taught about thirty children, boys and girls, but changed to accepting only girls in 1813 owing to long-lasting financial difficulties. ¹⁰⁴ The funding of the school was also based on the charity school model, and relied upon subscriptions and collections from charity sermons. 105 Pupils at the school were dressed in brown uniforms with buckled shoes, and were specifically instructed to wear their hair long, without wigs; as wigs were not generally worn in Dublin parish charity schools, it is likely that this instruction indicates a departure from French practice, and would have thus caused the

¹⁰¹ O'Mullane, "The Huguenots in Dublin: Part I (continued)", 121. Le Fanu, "Huguenot Churches of Dublin", 115.

¹⁰² Le Fanu, "Huguenot Churches of Dublin", 125.

¹⁰³ Lawless Lee, *Huguenot Settlements in Ireland*, 228. John Warburton, James Whitelaw and Robert Walsh, *History of the City of Dublin, from the Earliest Accounts to the Present Time*, vol 1 (London: Printed for T. Cadell and W. Davies, in the Strand, by W. Bulner and Co. Cleveland-Row, St. James's, 1818), 842.

¹⁰⁴ "The Westminster French Protestant School Archives", The Huguenot Society of Great Britain and Ireland website, 20 May 2020 (https://www.huguenotsociety.org.uk/blog/the-westminster-french-protestant-school-archives; accessed 28 March 2022).

¹⁰⁵ Le Fanu, "Huguenot Churches of Dublin", 124.

Dublin Huguenot children to bear a closer resemblance to their established neighbours than to their French cousins. 106

Musical instruction at the French school also followed the charity school model. Students were taught to sing the psalms in French and were sent to assist with the congregational singing at Sunday services. In the early years of the school's history the schoolchildren not only attended at the cathedral but at the non-conforming meeting houses as well, appearing at all four of the Huguenot places of worship in turn on successive Sundays. 107 As well as testifying to the close relationship between Dublin Huguenots of different denominations, this also strongly suggests that the same psalms were sung in both conforming and non-conforming congregations, for it is unlikely the schoolchildren would prepare two different psalm repertories. From 1738, when the schoolchildren were separated into different "classes for the different churches", it ceased to be customary for all of the children to attend all of the churches. 108 Until 1770, however, they continued to learn to sing "the Huguenot Psalm tunes", which they were taught by the precentor of Peter Street meeting house. 109

By the late eighteenth century, the school had "lost its distinctive French character" owing to the death of its schoolmaster, Isaac Dufour. The Society were unable to find another teacher to replace him who was able to speak both French and English, and so the teaching of French at the school ceased; "the children, who did not now learn French either at home or in the school, could no longer attend the French services". Instead, on Sundays they attended the English-language services at St Patrick's Cathedral on Sunday

¹⁰⁶ O'Mullane, "The Huguenots in Dublin: Part I (continued)", 121.

¹⁰⁷ Lee, Huguenot Settlements in Ireland, 227–8.

¹⁰⁸ Le Fanu, "Huguenot Churches in Dublin", 125.

¹⁰⁹ Le Fanu, "Huguenot Churches in Dublin", 125–6.

¹¹⁰ Lawless Lee, *Huguenot Settlements in Ireland*, 227–8.

mornings, and at the parish church of St Nicholas Without on Sunday evenings. The school, thus effectively converted into a standard established charity school in all but name, remained open until 1822, after which the building was used as an almshouse and eventually pulled down in 1853.¹¹¹

4.2.6 Huguenot music books

Two Huguenot music books were printed in Dublin during the eighteenth century, both produced by Samuel Powell: *Les Pseaumes de David* (1731) and *Cantiques sacrez* (1748). *Les pseaumes de David* is a small but incredibly dense volume into which are packed not only the texts and tunes of all 150 psalms in the Conrart version described above (4.2.5) but also a catechism, orders of service for baptisms, communions and weddings, various prayers, and a prologue giving the history and origins of the Conrart edition. ¹¹² No author's name is given for the texts of the prayers, which are similar, but not identical, to a set of "ecclesiastic prayers" printed in London a few years earlier; a note in the ESTC states that these prayers were frequently bound together with the Marot and de Bèze psalter. ¹¹³ The contents of the Powell psalter are entirely in French, but it appears that rather than use a dedicated French typeface to render the acute, grave and circumflex accents, these were written in by hand after the printing. This would have been painstaking work, and could only have been done accurately by a French speaker. At least two different versions of the book were printed by Powell, one octavo size and the other

¹¹¹ Le Fanu, "Huguenot Churches of Dublin", 126, 132.

¹¹² Les pseaumes de David mis en vers françois, avec la liturgie, le catechism, & la confession de foi des eglises reformées (Dublin: chez S. Powell, 1731). IRL-Dtc OLS B-9-650 and OLS 192.p.83.

¹¹³ La forme des prières ecclésiastiques. Avec la manière d'administrer les sacremens, & de célébrer le mariage, & la visitation des malades ([London], c. 1728). GB-Lbl 3022.d.7(2*).

duodecimo.¹¹⁴ Although both books are dated 1731, this may be the source of Flood's claim that a second edition of the *Pseaumes* was released by Powell in 1735.¹¹⁵ If this second edition did exist, no copies of it can now be located. The title page of the *Pseaumes* lists four booksellers from whom copies could be procured, all based on Dame Street: George Risk, George Ewing, Guillaume [William] Smith and Abraham Bradley. It also incorporates a fine engraving of King David seated at his harp, signed "P. Simms". This is without a doubt the engraver Philip Simms, a prolific creator of frontispieces for several Dublin publishers in the early eighteenth century, who particularly specialised in portraits and Biblical scenes.¹¹⁶ Between the elaborate frontispiece, the quantity of printed music sheets and the time it would have taken to add all of the accents by hand, the printing of this book was likely a significant investment, on which Powell must have expected an equally significant return. The price for which the book retailed is not known.

From the copies of the *Pseaumes* still extant, some information can be gathered concerning the potential market for such a book. The copy held at the British Library is inscribed with the name "Elizabeth Letablere". The Letablere family were prominent among Dublin's Huguenot community, with Jean Letablere serving as the minister at St Patrick's French Church in the early nineteenth century. This suggests that the book had a readership among the city's Huguenot community, and possibly among the ministry. Neither of the copies at Trinity College carries an inscription, but they are notable for being in remarkably good condition, aside from a few missing pages and some signs of

1

¹¹⁴ IRL-Dtc OLS 192.p.83 is a copy of the octavo version, and IRL-Dtc OLS B-9-650 the duodecimo version.

¹¹⁵ W. H. Grattan Flood, "Music-Printing in Dublin from 1700 to 1750", *The Journal of the Royal Society of Antiquaries of Ireland*, fifth series, 38, no. 3 (30 September 1908): 238.

^{116 &}quot;Philip Simms, Engraver", in Walter G, Strickland, A Dictionary of Irish Artists (Dublin: 1913).

¹¹⁷ GB-Lbl Music A.1230.mm.

¹¹⁸ La Touche, Registers of the French Conformed Churches, 87–89.

water damage in the duodecimo copy.¹¹⁹ This suggests that the book was not regularly carried around to services but was instead treated with care by its owner. While remaining mindful of the survivorship bias (copies of the book that were badly treated or frequently used are less likely to have survived to the present day), for at least some owners, *Les pseaumes de David* seems to have functioned as a prestige or display item rather than a regular aid to music making.

Almost all of the book is taken up with the psalter proper, and each psalm is accompanied by a printed tune, aligned with the words of the first verse of the psalm as in Powell's Anglophone music books. These are the traditional Genevan psalter tunes, unchanged from their original forms and associated with the same psalms as in the 1562 original. Even the repetitions of particular tunes are identical to those in the 1562 psalter, and there is a helpful table at the beginning of the book listing which psalms share the same tune. No attempt was made to save paper by printing these "repeat" tunes only once, however. Notwithstanding the space-saving method of printing the tune only under the first verse of each psalm, the book still runs to over five hundred pages.

Musically, the most striking difference between the Genevan tunes and those found in the other Dublin tunebooks is their metrical and rhythmic variety. Whereas the tunes in the contemporary Anglophone Dublin books are written in minims throughout, sometimes with a semibreve at the start or end of a line or with the inclusion of additional passing notes, the Genevan tunes are far more rhythmically diverse. A characteristic trait is the two-semibreve pattern which regularly appears at the end of trochaic lines, and is usually set to words with weak final syllables such as "vi-e", "dé-tres-se" "es-pé-ran-

¹¹⁹ IRL-Dtc OLS B-9-650.

-

ce". 120 Another common rhythmic device is the use of three or four semibreves at the beginning of a phrase, followed by faster rhythmic movement. Semibreves may also appear in the middle of phrases, often resulting in syncopation. Melodically, the Genevan tunes also have a distinct style, one notable characteristic being the regular use of the Hypodorian mode, notated consistently in the *Pseaumes* in G minor with a single-flat signature. The combined effect of these rhythmic and melodic traits gives the Genevan tunes a distinct sound quite different from that of the Anglophone tune repertory. 121

Given that the Lady Chapel congregants are known to have used the Conrart version of the psalms in their services, it is likely that they made use of the Powell *Pseaumes de David*. While the Marot and de Bèze texts could conceivably have been performed purely by heart, the Conrart texts were relatively new, and so to perform them the congregation would either have had to read them from their own copies of the psalter or followed the minister in some form of lining out. The book's title states that it was intended for use by the "Reformed Church", but this would not have precluded its use by the conforming congregations, for the conforming Huguenots considered themselves to be still participating in a "reformed" church that did not conflict with their Genevan principles.¹²²

Printing Huguenot books was evidently a successful enough business venture for Samuel Powell, for he produced a second one seventeen years later, in 1748. This much slimmer volume is not a psalter, however, but a set of twenty-three *cantiques sacrez*, or canticles, with metrical texts, set to psalm tunes from the Genevan psalter. In the usual

¹²⁰ The prevalence of these trochaic lines was a particular feature of the Genevan psalter texts that made them difficult to adapt into English; see Woodward, "The Genevan Psalter of 1562", 183–4.

 ¹²¹ For examples of this characteristic style, see Appendix 3.
 122 Whelan, "Sanctified by the Word", 77. See also Le Fanu, "Huguenot Churches of Dublin", 91.

¹²³ Cantiques sacrez pour les principales solemnitez Chrétiennes (Dublin: chez Samuel Powell, 1748). IRL-Dtc Starkey 128.

fashion, the first verse of each *cantique* is printed beneath the notes of the tune. The copy of this book held in Trinity College Library carries the inscription "Andrew de la Maziere" on the frontispiece, and an anonymous pencilled note inside the front cover of the book notes that a merchant by that name is listed in the Dublin Directory of 1765, working in Fleet Street with his brother, Peter. 124 The registers of marriages and baptisms at St Patrick's French Church contain several mentions of a de la Maziere family, including an André and a Pierre, residing in Dublin in the first half of the eighteenth century. Based on the dates, and assuming these two were indeed brothers (Pierre served as godparent to André's daughter Magdelaine in 1739, supporting this interpretation), they are likely the sons of Samuel de la Maziere, a jeweller from Saintonge, and Jeanne Vallée of La Rochelle, who married at the Lady Chapel in 1702. 125 At some point, the family appears to have become associated with the Peter Street church, for a "Mr Maziere" was a member of the consistory of Peter Street in the nineteenth century. 126

In effect, *Cantiques sacrez* functions as a kind of Huguenot hymnal. Each *cantique* is intended for use on a specific feast day of the church year, such as Christmas, Pentecost, Easter, and Communion Days; as well as the titles of many of the *cantiques* indicating the relevant day, there is also a table at the end of the book which gives highly specific instructions as to which *cantique*—and even which verses of each *cantique*—are appropriate for use at which times. According to this table, on each day there are four occasions on which a *cantique* can be sung: before and after the sermon in the morning, and before and after the sermon in the evening. This corresponds with the normal position of the psalm in Huguenot services, both conforming and non-conforming, and suggests

¹²⁴ IRL-Dtc Starkey 128.

¹²⁵ La Touche, Registers of the French Conformed Churches, 65, 106.

¹²⁶ Le Fanu, "Huguenot Churches of Dublin", 88.

that a *cantique* could be used in place of a psalm when the occasion demanded. For most feast days, the table recommends splitting an appropriate cantique in half, and singing the first half before the sermon and the second half after. On Christmas Day, for example, *cantiques* V and I are recommended, one in the morning and one in the evening, each one serving as bookends to the sermon. This practice of splitting longer texts in half resembles that of the established church, where psalms were regularly printed divided into sections, and it was unusual for a full psalm text to be sung in its entirety.¹²⁷

The tunes chosen to accompany the *cantiques* are of interest. There are only eleven of them (Pss. 98 and 118 are listed separately, but have the same tune), and all are identified by the number of the psalm alongside which they originally appeared in the Genevan Psalter (i.e. "l'air du Ps. CXVIII"). These tunes are not included in the HTI because they are not from an English-language source, and so are transcribed here in full (see Appendix 3). It is likely that the tunes represent particular favourites, or those with which congregations would be most familiar. Six of the twelve tunes appear alongside more than one *cantique*, and one, the tune of Ps. 89, appears five times, to be sung at New Year, Easter, Pentecost, Communion day and as a general hymn of praise. The authorship of this particular tune is unknown, but it may have been written by Pierre Dagues, or Pierre Dubuisson; in any case it does not seem to have been the work of Louis Bourgeois. Today, it is described on Hymnary.org as one of the best-known in the Genevan psalter. 129

The tune of Psalm 118, a Bourgeois tune which appears in the *Cantiques* four times, is also notable, for Psalm 118 was closely associated with the Wars of Religion. ¹³⁰

¹²⁷ Temperley et al., "Psalms, Metrical".

¹²⁸ Woodward, "The Genevan Psalter of 1562", 173.

¹²⁹ Hymnary.org entry for "Genevan 89" (https://hymnary.org/tune/genevan 89).

¹³⁰ Woodward, "The Genevan Psalter of 1562", 173.

During the battle of Coutras in 1587, which ended in decisive victory for the Huguenot side, it was sung by Huguenot troops to boost morale and intimidate the Catholic forces. ¹³¹ Its cheerful major tune, evocative of its original text ("Oh happy day"), is certainly appropriate for the joyful occasions for which it is prescribed in the table. The other psalm that was very closely linked to the Wars of the Religion in the Huguenot consciousness was Psalm 68, which was later dubbed the "Huguenot Marseillaise". ¹³² This tune also appears in *Cantiques sacrez*, although it is prescribed only once, for Ascension Day.

Cantiques sacrez may be instructively compared with a similar volume which had appeared in London some decades earlier, and upon which it may have been modelled. This earlier book, published in 1707, has an almost identical title and a very similar format, providing a collection of hymn-like texts designated for use on specific occasions and set to tunes from the Genevan psalter. The texts themselves are different, and more numerous—there are thirty rather than twenty-three—and as well as being associated with specific occasions, there are also many that cover more general themes, such as the Death of Jesus, Repentance, the Song of Daniel, etc. The London Cantiques also lacks a table assigning each item to a specific day. Other than these differences, the two books are similar enough to imply that the one inspired the other. Although the London volume contains more tunes than the 1748 Dublin Cantiques, the correspondence between the tune content is very close: eight of the twelve tunes in the Dublin Cantiques also appear

-

¹³¹ Emilé Doumergue, "Music in the Work of Calvin," *The Princeton Theological Review* 8, no. 4 (October 1909): 542–543.

¹³² Woodward, "The Genevan Psalter of 1562", 182.

¹³³ Cantiques sacrez pour les principales solennitez des Chretiens (London: chez Paul Vaillant, dans le Strand vis-a-vis de Bedford-House a L'Enseigne du Navire, 1707). GB-Lbl 3438.ee.65.

in the London book.¹³⁴ The four tunes which do not are those for Psalms 45, 68, 103 and 116. The tune which appears most frequently in the London *Cantiques*, Psalm 24, also appears multiple times in the Dublin *Cantiques*.

Unlike the Dublin collection, the earlier London *Cantiques* contains a written introduction, in which the unnamed editor justifies the endeavour and explains several of the decisions taken with regard to choosing texts and tunes. ¹³⁵ From this introduction, we can get a sense of contemporary Huguenot attitudes towards worship music. Much of the introduction is taken up with pre-empting of criticism for the choice to write *cantiques* in the first place rather than simply singing psalms, the editor arguing that singing non-psalm texts is both an ancient practice and common not just among Catholics but also in many modern Protestant communities across Europe (the Lutherans, the Reformed church in Germany and England, the French church in Berlin, and the Italian Church in Geneva are mentioned specifically). ¹³⁶ That this pre-emptive defence was felt to be necessary indicates that singing material other than the psalms was still a controversial practice in the Huguenot diaspora in the early eighteenth century, possibly because—as the introduction also indicates—it was strongly associated with the Catholic Church.

Ensuring that the texts of the *cantiques* fit the existing Genevan tunes appears to have been a priority for the editor. "I have followed almost everywhere the music of our psalms," the preface states, "so that these *cantiques* could be sung more easily, and what small differences there are in two or three of these Hymns are so small they are hardly

¹³⁴ The tune for Psalm 98 and 118 appeared under both names in both books, and so has been considered as two separate tunes for the purposes of this comparison, hence the statement that the Dublin *Cantiques* contains twelve tunes (rather than eleven).

¹³⁵ Cantiques sacrez (1707), preface.

^{136 &}quot;J'y ay encore remarqué que la plus part des communions Chrétiennes ont des Cantiques, non seulement l'Eglise Romaine; mais encore les Eglises Lutheriennes, les Eglises Reformées Allemandes, & Angloises, l'Eglise Françoise de Berline, & l'Eglise Italienne qui s'assemble à Genève." The editor makes reference to a previously published dissertation on this subject, which could not be identified. All translations of this preface are my own.

noticeable". 137 The tune of Psalm 89—the most frequently appearing tune in the Dublin Cantiques—is singled out for particular comment; the editor states that this psalm is "the only heroic verse we have", and so its tune, which appears to have taken on some of its character by association, has been used to set "these kinds of verses". 138 Here, however, is an instance in which the unusual metre of the Genevan tune caused explicit problems when it came to setting it to a new text—so much so that the editor of the London Cantiques took the drastic and unusual step of altering the tune to fit the words. In the original tune, "there are six lines in every verse, of which four are feminine lines, which all follow one another", the editor explains, noting that this is nowadays considered a defect in poetry. 139 Accordingly, the new texts have been written in a more modern style, with fewer lines (and therefore fewer weaker final syllables). This necessitated shortening the 89th psalm tune so that it skipped straight from the end of the third phrase to the beginning of the sixth, leaving out two lines. This example is illustrative of the difficulty which hymnographers must regularly have experienced in trying to fit modern texts to complex tunes written to follow the speech contours of over a century earlier. At the same time, however, it is notable that the editor felt the need to justify even a slight alteration of a familiar psalm tune, and only did so reluctantly. Evidently such a practice was exceptional, and it was much more usual to compose texts to fit well-known tunes—a further example of the reverential attitude towards the original Genevan tunes which prevailed in the Huguenot diaspora.

-

¹³⁷ "J'ai suivi presque par tout la Musique de nos Psaumes, afin qu'on pût chanter plus aisément ces Cantiques, & la diversité qui est dans deux ou trois de ces Hymnes est si petite qu'à peine s'en apperçoiton."

¹³⁸ "Comme nous n'avons en vers heroïques que le seul Psaume LXXXIX. c'est aussi le seul que j'ai suivi dans ces sortes de vers."

¹³⁹ "Il y a six vers dans chaque verset, dont il y en a quatre feminins, qui sont tout de suite, ce qui est aujourd'huy un defaut dans la Poësie".

The question of whether the Dublin Huguenots ever performed their psalms with organ accompaniment, or whether they sang exclusively unaccompanied, is an intriguing one. As in the majority of contemporary tune sources, the tunes in the two Dublin books related to the Huguenots are presented without any accompaniment, and with no indication of how the psalms were generally performed. The Lady Chapel congregation, however, which could potentially have had access to an organ owing to its location within an established church building, presents an interesting possibility. In England, the use of organs to accompany psalms in French Conformed churches was not unknown. An entry in Strype's 1720 *Survey of London* gives the following description of a "French Church ... for the use chiefly of the French Refugees" that had been set up at Trinity Hospital:

The Ministers, who are French Protestants, do use the Service Book used in the Church of England, being translated into the French Language. And they have a Pair of Organs, that play when they sing their Psalms. 140

In 1726, it was proposed to purchase an organ for the French Church at a cost of £100, but the consistory, though enthusiastic about the idea in principle, could not afford the expense. It appears, however, that the money was eventually found, or in any case provided, as in 1751, while the chapel was still in regular though slightly declining use by the French congregation, a brand new organ was installed. It Fanu states that in 1816, when the French Church closed, the consistory "surrendered their lease with their organ and fixtures to the Dean and Chapter". It also Saunders's News-Letter advertised for sale "A Fine-toned Church Organ, made by Snetzler, formerly belonging

143 Le Fanu, "The French Church", 281.

¹⁴⁰ Strype Survey of London vol 1, 212.

¹⁴¹ Le Fanu, "Huguenot Churches of Dublin", 123.

¹⁴² "The Cathedral Organ", St Patrick's Cathedral website, 26 May 2016 (https://www.stpatrickscathedral.ie/the-cathedral-organ/; accessed 28 March 2022).

to the French Church, St. Patrick's". ¹⁴⁴ If this is indeed the same instrument, it appears to have stood in the Lady Chapel for around seventy years. It is almost certain, therefore, that the French Huguenot congregation made use of an organ to accompany their psalms during services from 1751 until the closure of the French Church.

Of the other three Huguenot places of worship in the city, at least one, St Mary's, is highly unlikely to have been fitted with an organ; the conformed congregation only occupied the old abbey building for less than fifty years, and spent a significant portion of that time embroiled in administrative difficulties and schisms with its mother church. It seems unlikely that, during the turmoil of its short existence, the money and time were found to install an organ in the old chapter house. It would also seem unlikely that the Nonconformist meeting houses made use of organs during their services; as independent Calvinist congregations, they would likely have followed Calvin's recommendation closely and relied only on congregational singing to provide their music. There are, however, intriguing references in the writings of Thomas Le Fanu to the sale of the "organ and plate" belonging to the Lucy Lane meeting house before it was demolished in the early nineteenth century. 145 No other references to this organ can be traced, and the records of Lucy Lane have been lost since they were consulted by Le Fanu in the early twentieth century. It is possible, though unlikely, that this organ had been added by the Presbyterian congregation that took possession of the meeting house in 1773; it also may have been left over from the period before the Huguenots began to use it, when it served as a Jesuit chapel. It was not unknown in Europe for Huguenot churches of the Reformed type to have organs: the Huguenot church at Erlangen in Germany still boasts its

-

¹⁴⁴ "Organs and Piano Forte For Sale", *Saunders's News Letter*, 22 June 1826, 3, column 1. British Newspaper Archive.

¹⁴⁵ Thomas Philip Le Fanu, *Registers of the French Non-Conformist Churches of Peter Street and Lucy Lane* (Aberdeen: University Press, 1901), xi. Le Fanu, "Huguenot Churches of Dublin", 138–9.

eighteenth-century organ, which took Johann Nikolaus Ritter nine years to build (from 1755 to 1764).¹⁴⁶

4.2.7 The Genevan Psalter and Huguenot Identity

The relationship between the Huguenot community and the established church was very cordial throughout this period. This applied particularly to the conforming Huguenots, whose community had come into existence through establishment support, and who worshipped within an established cathedral, subordinate to established authority and according to authorised forms of worship. An indication of this amicable relationship is the contribution made by the established clergy in 1722 to the repairs of the Lady Chapel, despite their being under no obligation to do so under the terms of the Huguenot's lease. 147 The secular civic authorities of the city were similarly supportive of the Huguenot community beyond their regular re-enactment of the legal protections of the "Protestant Strangers" acts and their payment of the conforming ministers' salaries. The support publicly demonstrated at the opening of the Lady Chapel church, at which large numbers of senior figures in the city government were in attendance, was no empty gesture. The city government, Lord Mayor and Aldermen also contributed to the 1722 repairs already mentioned. Added to the money contributed by established church representatives, this amounted to around £300, half of the cost of the repairs. 148 Less generosity appears to have been shown towards the nonconforming meeting houses: in 1695, for example, the

Entry for Erlangen church in Piet Bron's Orgeldatabase, accessed 25 March 2022 (http://orgbase.nl/scripts/ogb.exe?database=ob2&%250=2026226&LGE=NL&LIJST=lang).

¹⁴⁷ Le Fanu, "The French Church", 282.

¹⁴⁸ Le Fanu, "The French Church", 282.

government's charitable grant for the new meeting house at Bride Street amounted to a mere £10. 149

The cordiality was neither one-sided nor restricted to social elites. The lack of animosity between the Huguenot community and the established church can be seen in the example of David Cossart, who lived in the parish of St John's in the late seventeenth century. Although Cossart did not worship at the parish church, being a member of the Lady Chapel congregation, he still contributed money to its rebuilding and even rented a pew for his family. This pew, too small to accommodate Cossart's family and located near the front of the church, was primarily a status symbol, but nonetheless represented a financial contribution to the church as well as Cossart's desire to be seen as a member of the wider parish community. ¹⁵⁰ Even the non-conforming Huguenots, who might be expected to have a more ambivalent relationship with the Establishment elite, participated in the celebration of established church festivals such as Gunpowder Treason Day, upon which occasion in 1723 the minister Gaspard Caillard gave a memorable sermon on toleration at the Peter Street meeting house (see below). ¹⁵¹

Outside the churches and meeting houses, the Huguenots assimilated into the social world of Dublin's Protestants with astounding ease. Some even managed to climb to the upper echelons of their adopted society, and upon doing so they fully embraced the lifestyle of the Protestant Ascendancy elite. The La Touche family is perhaps the best-known example of this phenomenon: after David Digges La Touche amassed a considerable fortune through his involvement in the linen industry, property speculation

¹⁴⁹ Le Fanu, "Huguenot Churches of Dublin", 106.

¹⁵⁰ Gillespie, "David Cossart", 56.

¹⁵¹ Ruth Whelan, "Repressive Toleration: The Huguenots in Early Eighteenth-Century Dublin", in Ruth Whelan and Carol Baxter, eds, *Toleration and Religious Identity: The Edict of Nantes and its Implications in France, Britain and Ireland* (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2003), 187.

and the founding of the La Touche bank (later the Bank of Ireland), his children and grandchildren became ubiquitous figures in Dublin city life. The La Touches sat in parliament, purchased great landed estates in the countryside surrounding the city, amassed art collections, sat on city committees and heavily patronised worthy charities. One member of the family even became involved with the colonial ambitions of the nascent British Empire: James La Touche, a grandson of David Digges La Touche, settled in Jamaica as the owner of a slave plantation.

One strong cultural factor that brought the Huguenots together with the established church community was their mutual dislike of, and distrust for, the Catholic majority. Although it was previously thought that Dublin Huguenots were advocates for the toleration of Catholics in Ireland, owing to their similar experiences of persecution by the state church, in fact the Huguenots deliberately amplified their anti-Catholic rhetoric and participated in the celebration of anti-Catholic church festivals in order to signal their alliance with establishment attitudes. Caillard's sermons on Gunpowder Treason Day, mentioned above, are indeed strong defences of the principle of toleration, but their real purpose was to demonstrate that Catholics, having failed to show tolerance towards the Huguenots and other minority religious groups, were a fundamentally intolerant community and so had no place in the modern, tolerant (Protestant) society. David La Touche III, first governor of the Bank of Ireland and one of the most powerful Huguenots in the city, was a strong supporter of the bank's exclusionary charter which excluded Catholics and Quakers from the Court of Directors, and as a member of parliament was

¹⁵² David Dickson and Richard English, "The La Touche Dynasty", in Dickson, ed., *The Gorgeous Mask: Dublin 1700–1850*, Trinity History Workshop 2 (Dublin: Trinity History Workshop, 1987).

¹⁵³ Dickson and English, "The La Touche Dynasty", 20. "James Digges La Touche", Legacies of British Slavery Database (http://www.depts-live.ucl.ac.uk/lbs/person/view/2146645825; accessed 28 March 2022). ¹⁵⁴ See Whelan, "Repressive Toleration".

opposed to Catholic emancipation. ¹⁵⁵ Many of the Huguenot army pensioners were vehemently anti-Catholic, having joined William's army in the first place because they saw "in James and his army … the epitome of all from which they had suffered. 'Allons, mes amis,' Schomberg himself is reported to have cried … 'Voilá vos persécuteurs'."¹⁵⁶

The military character of Dublin's Huguenot community provided another cultural connection between them and the broader Protestant Ascendancy. In a general sense, the prevalence of soldiers and officers among Dublin's Huguenots provided a cultural common ground with the city's Protestant upper class. "The profession of soldiering" was very common among the Irish aristocracy and gentry, to the extent that by 1760 between a quarter and a third of the officers in the British army were Irish Protestants. 157 Additionally, the majority of the Huguenot soldiers in Ireland had fought in the Williamite Wars defending the English, and by extension the Irish Protestant, interest. This not only was a source of good will towards the Huguenot pensioners, it was also a source of shared experience and history which drew the two disparate Protestant communities together. This common history and allegiance could be publicly demonstrated through participation in acts of commemoration in the same way that Caillard had used the church commemoration of the Gunpowder Plot to affirm his solidarity with the established church. Thus David Digges La Touche, who had fought at the Battle of the Boyne, was known for his annual celebration of the anniversary of the battle, with dining, "making merry" and "great rejoicing", in the company of former fellow soldiers. 158

¹⁵⁵ Dickson and English, "The La Touche Dynasty", 23.

¹⁵⁶ "Onward, my friends: behold your persecutors" (translation mine). Lee, *Huguenot Settlements in Ireland*, 17.

¹⁵⁷ McBride, Eighteenth-Century Ireland, 44.

¹⁵⁸ A. M. Fraser, "David Digues La Touche, Banker, and a Few of His Descendants", *Dublin Historical Record* 5, no. 2 (December 1942–February 1943): 59.

Given the extent to which the Huguenot community assimilated to, and aligned themselves with, the established church—and Protestant society more generally—from the outset, it is remarkable that throughout the eighteenth century they did not make use of the common tunes of the Protestant psalm- and hymn- repertory, but instead continued to make exclusive use of the Genevan tunes. One reason for this lack of crossover of tunes may be the particular suitability of the Genevan tunes, as we have seen, to the prosody of the French language. A second and related factor is the wide range of different metres found in the Huguenot psalm texts, some of which were so unusual that it would have been extremely difficult if not impossible to find tunes that would fit the words, save for those which had been specifically designed to do so. The personal involvement of Calvin in the production of the Genevan psalter may also have had an effect, as the fact of his having approved a particular corpus of tunes could have been a strong motivation for using those tunes unchanged for as long as possible, giving them a kind of "authorised" status similar to that of the tunes in the supplements to the *New Version* of the psalter.

The tenacity with which the Huguenot diaspora clung to their psalm tradition is not purely attributable to musical or practical factors, however, but rather speaks to the deeper significance and function of the psalms within French Calvinist culture. The book of Psalms has long been connected with the experience of faith in exile, most famously though not exclusively in Psalm 137, written from the point of view of the Israelites in Egypt, mourning the home to which they could not return. Even before their exile from France, however, Huguenots frequently drew parallels between their own experiences and those of the Israelites, as people of God persecuted for their faith. Sermons upon the book of Psalms such as those of the preacher Jean Daillé held the ancient Israelites up as examples of courage and humility in the face of great trials, and comparing the Israelite devotion to Jerusalem to the loyalty of the Huguenots to the Reformed religion. The

Huguenots thus "annexed the spiritual heritage of Israel" through their exegesis of the book of Psalms, legitimising their religious position and situating themselves as part of a long history of persecuted believers. ¹⁵⁹ The Revocation and subsequent Huguenot diaspora, paralleling that of the Israelites exiled in foreign lands, could only have reinforced this identification and added to the symbolic character of the psalms.

As well as symbolically expressing Huguenot identity generally as a persecuted religious group, the singing of psalms to Genevan tunes also had important historical associations with the foundational events of their community. Community identity is often built around foundational myths, the idea of a shared history, and pivotal events around which historical narratives coalesce. For the Huguenots, the most significant of these pivotal events were the Wars of Religion and the Revocation of the Edict of Nantes: the former forged their community through military opposition to the Catholic majority, while the latter created the diaspora which would be such a central element of the Huguenot experience in the eighteenth century and onwards. As we have seen, psalm tunes played a central role in the Wars of Religion and hence in the Huguenot historical narrative. Stories of Huguenot battalions singing psalms during decisive battles, which associate the psalms with resistance, strength of faith and community solidarity, were part of the foundation myths of the Huguenot diaspora. The singing of metrical psalms as part of services, therefore, provided a link between the Huguenot congregations and the historical events and stories upon which their religious and community identity was built.

¹⁵⁹ Nicholas Must, *Preaching a Dual Identity: Huguenot Sermons and the Shaping of Confessional Identity, 1629–1685* (Boston: Brill, 2017), 87–90.

¹⁶⁰ Whelan, "Repressive Toleration", 179.

Genevan psalms could also provide geographical as well as historical connection, as the same texts and tunes were sung by Huguenot exiles throughout Europe. 161 Irish Huguenots were well connected to the rest of the diaspora, and there was considerable traffic of goods, ideas and people throughout the wider Huguenot world. A good example of this international character in the secular world can be found in the life and work of John Rocque, the foremost surveyor and cartographer of eighteenth-century Dublin. Rocque was born in France around 1704, and moved to England in his youth. By the time he established his business in Dublin he had already made his name as a cartographer by producing maps of many European capitals, including London. In the context of this existing *œuvre*, his subsequent maps of Dublin, as well as maps of other Irish cities including Cork and Newry, situated his adopted country within a wider European context. 162 They also enjoyed international popularity: the largest single subscriber to the Exact Survey of 1756 was the Paris map-dealer M. Julien, and the map so impressed George II that he had it hung in his apartments. ¹⁶³ Many of Rocque's maps carry subtitles in both English and French, and his Exact Survey gives the scale in French toises alongside British feet and Irish and English perches. 164 Rocque himself was not permanently based in Dublin, but spent considerable time there; when in town, he worshipped at the Lady Chapel, which is why the representation of St Patrick's Cathedral on his 1756 map is highly detailed, and even includes interior features. 165 Despite spending much of his life in the British Isles, Rocque remained "culturally a

¹⁶¹ See, for example, the French Psalter printed in the Low Countries in 1722, which contained the same Genevan tunes with the same Conrart texts as would appear in the Dublin *Pseaumes* nine years later. Valentin Conrart, *Les Pseaumes de David mis en vers François* (Amsterdam: chez P. Humbert & E. Lucas, 1722).

¹⁶² Turlough O'Riordan, "Rocque, John (Jean)", DIB (October 2009).

¹⁶³ John Montague, "John Rocque and the *Exact Survey of Dublin*", in Colm Lennon and John Montague, *John Rocque's Dublin: A Guide to the Georgian City* (Dublin: Royal Irish Academy, 2010), xiv–xvi.

¹⁶⁴ Rocque, Exact Survey. O'Riordain, "Rocque, John (Jean)", DIB.

¹⁶⁵ Lennon and Montague, John Rocque's Dublin, 59.

Frenchman"—a feat made possible by the strength of the French communities of the cities in which he lived. 166

The international character of the Huguenot community was not confined to the economic sphere, but was also evident in the religious life of both the conforming and non-conforming communities. The Lady Chapel congregation had close links with the French Church of the Savoy in London from its earliest days, owing to their first minister having previously served there. Their liturgy was also identical to that of the Savoy, and indeed of all French Conformed churches in England, owing to their use of Jean Durel's BCP translation of 1665. The ministry of the nonconforming congregations was no less international in character: Le Fanu notes that the ministers of Peter Street were "almost invariably called from abroad". 167 One of these ministers, Antoine Vinchon Des Voex, had his *Défense de la Religion Réformée* published in Amsterdam, to which the Peter Street and Lucy Lane congregations subscribed for a staggering fifty copies despite the necessity of importing them. 168 Caillard's sermons on toleration were similarly published in Amsterdam. 169 Even the translation of the Bible used at Peter Street was a Swiss one, the 1744 translation by Jean Ostervald, which had been brought to Dublin by Louis Ostervald during his tenure as minister there from 1742 to 1753. 170

Across this wider international community, the Huguenot diaspora was connected by a shared culture and a sense of shared history. The continuing use of French as a common language of the diaspora was a keystone of this shared culture, and it is significant in this context that French continued to be used exclusively at the Lady Chapel

¹⁶⁶ Kenneth Ferguson, "Rocque's Map and the History of Nonconformity in Dublin: A Search for Meeting Houses", *Dublin Historical Record* 58, no. 2 (Autumn 2005): 130.

¹⁶⁷ Le Fanu, Registers of the French Non-Conforming Churches, x.

¹⁶⁸ Le Fanu, "Huguenot Churches of Dublin", 134–5.

¹⁶⁹ Whelan, "Repressive Toleration", 182–3.

¹⁷⁰ Le Fanu, "Huguenot Churches of Dublin", 136.

long after the majority of Dublin Huguenots no longer spoke French in the home and their children no longer learned it at school. Le Fanu comments that the traditional services were continued at the Lady Chapel "as a memorial of the past", and this is a useful lens through which to regard the persistence of the Genevan tunes, which by the late eighteenth-century had come to embody historical continuity not just with the Huguenot community's origins but also the history of their life and culture in Ireland.¹⁷¹

Finally, it must be noted that the Genevan tune repertory and the common Protestant repertory of the Huguenots' Established and Dissenting neighbours were not entirely separate and isolated traditions, but in fact had much in common. The Genevan psalter, and the Calvinist psalm-singing tradition more generally, had exercised a very strong influence upon the early development of Anglophone psalmody, and so many of the oldest tunes in the common repertory had in fact originated as Genevan tunes. Several of these tunes, including the highly popular "Old Hundredth" [143a] (the 134th psalm tune in the Genevan psalter) were among the most frequently reproduced in Anglophone Dublin sources, and can therefore safely be assumed to have been popular among Dublin's Protestants (see Appendix 1). Because the Genevan psalter retained all of its original tunes, this meant that in practice the same musical material could have been heard simultaneously at the French and English services in the city. While the manner in which the tunes were performed may have been quite different, they nonetheless occupied the same role and position in the order of service. In some places of worship, as we have seen, the tunes might even have been accompanied by organ music. Much as the Dublin Huguenots themselves held on to their own distinct diaspora culture while at the same time socially and culturally aligning themselves with general Protestant society, therefore,

¹⁷¹ Le Fanu, "Huguenot Churches of Dublin", 130.

so their worship music culture was simultaneously both like and unlike that of the Protestant common tradition, both preserving and embodying elements of their particular culture and demonstrating the close links between their own practices and those of their Protestant hosts and neighbours.

4.3 The Lutherans: A Musical Enigma

The Huguenots were notable for being a distinctly "foreign" presence within Dublin's Protestant milieu, but they were not the only "Protestant strangers" that could be found in the city during the long eighteenth century. A small community of Lutherans maintained a church on Poolbeg Street throughout this period, where they worshipped in their own languages and according to their own traditions under the protection of the Toleration Act. Lutheranism was perhaps the Protestant religion most removed from that of the established church, and existed in a curious and complex relationship with it. Details of this early Lutheran community, which predates the founding of the modern Dublin Lutheran church by some two hundred and fifty years, are elusive; to reconstruct their culture of worship music has proved challenging. Nevertheless, it is possible to form a picture in broad strokes of this unobtrusive congregation, and to clarify their position within the greater Protestant community.

4.3.1 Lutherans in Dublin

Prior to the passing of the Toleration Act, there was only one Lutheran congregation active in the British Isles. They worshipped in London, on the site of the former parish

church of Holy Trinity, which had burned down in the Great Fire of 1666. The history of Lutheranism in seventeenth-century London was in fact closely connected with the Great Fire, as the demand for labourers to rebuild the city in its aftermath led to an influx of workers from the Continent, including German and Scandinavian workers. The Lutheran congregation at Holy Trinity had been granted the site as a place of worship as part of an agreement between Charles II and the city of Hamburg: the Hamburg authorities agreed to lend Charles money to rebuild the city on condition that a place of worship be provided for the use of the London Lutheran community, now much increased by recent immigration. Once again, the ability of this church to worship publicly relied on its royal charter.

After the Toleration Act was passed, five new congregations were established in London between 1692 and 1763. These new congregations were diverse and idiosyncratic; three worshipped in German, one in Danish and one in Swedish. Two were inside royal palaces, and one of these served as a kind of court chapel for the Duke of Cumberland, later the husband of Queen Anne, who was Danish and a dedicated Lutheran. Despite their rough division by language, the Lutheran congregations brought together worshippers from many different countries, although this was not always a recipe for peace and harmony. The Swedish-speaking church owed its origins to a disagreement between Swedish and Danish members of the Danish church who had at one time worshipped together: the Swedish members had left in anger after the pastor prayed for the victory of the Danish king in a battle against Sweden. 173

¹⁷² Roy Long, *Martin Luther and His Legacy: A Perspective on 500 Years of Reformation* (London: Council of Lutheran Churches, 2017), 109–110. The Holy Trinity Church was known as the "Hamburg Church" due to this association with Hamburg.

¹⁷³ Long, Martin Luther and His Legacy, 109–113.

The Dublin congregation was the only Lutheran congregation in the British Isles outside London during this period, and shared many characteristics with its London counterparts. It was first established in the 1690s, and remained active throughout the eighteenth century. The exact date of establishment, like many details of the congregation's history, is unclear; it was most likely around 1697, though it may equally have been earlier in the decade, and perhaps as early as 1690. The principal agent of its establishment was a young German named Esdras Marcus Lichtenstein, a Poet Laureate of the Holy Roman Empire and the son of a Jewish bookseller from Hamburg. ¹⁷⁴ Lichtenstein was the chaplain of the Duke of Brandenburg's regiment during the Williamite Wars and was stationed in Ireland in 1689. After a few years back in London, during which he married a London Lutheran, Lichtenstein returned to Ireland in 1697 or 1698. He remained there until 1706, when he relocated to East Frisia. The confusion over the foundation date of the congregation arises from Lichtenstein's having made two trips to Ireland during the 1690s. ¹⁷⁵

Lichtenstein was accompanied on his first sojourn in Ireland by a Norwegian, Iver Diderich Brink, a theologian and fellow military chaplain who had also been ordained at Holy Trinity Church, at the same time as Lichtenstein. If the Dublin congregation was founded at the earlier time of 1690, it is possible that Brink was involved with its foundation, as stated by the Lutheran historian Julius Rieger. This involvement could only have been very brief, however, as by 1691 Brink had been installed as the minister of the newly-built Wellclose Square Danish Lutheran church in London. 176

¹⁷⁴ John Flood, *Poets Laureate in the Holy Roman Empire: A Bio-Bibliographical Handbook* (Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 2011), 1133–1135.

¹⁷⁵ Smyrl, Dictionary of Dublin Dissent, 176 & 186–7.

¹⁷⁶ Rieger, "Zur Geschichte der lutherischen Gemeinde Dublins", 97.

For decades after its foundation, the Dublin congregation was beset by financial problems. Lacking the funds to build their own church, the Lutherans secured the use of a large building on Marlborough Street surrounded by a yard. The same building later housed a Methodist congregation, and Wesley described it as sizeable enough to accommodate about four hundred people, with space for far more standing in the yard outside (see 3.3 above). It is highly unlikely that the Lutheran congregation came close to approaching this number, however.¹⁷⁷ At the Marlborough Street house, the Lutherans held two services each Sunday, one in German in the morning and one in "a Scandinavian language" in the afternoon, reflecting the diverse origins and cultures of the worshippers. ¹⁷⁸ Financial difficulties quickly developed into personnel problems. Lichtenstein was forced to travel regularly to England and the Continent to secure funds, and on his return from one of these trips he was arrested for alleged mishandling of the subscription money. Although Lichtenstein was seemingly exonerated, and remained as minister until 1706, it is not clear what happened to the money he had collected.¹⁷⁹

The congregation's fortunes improved considerably during the tenure of the second pastor, a Dane named Andreas Kellinghusen. With the support of the Archbishop of Dublin, plus that of the Archbishops of Cashel and Tuam, three other bishops, and a large number of private donors, the Lutherans were finally able in 1725 to erect a purposebuilt church on Poolbeg Street. ¹⁸⁰ In keeping with the confusing history of the Lutheran churches in Britain and Ireland, this building became known as the "Dutch Church";

-

¹⁷⁷ Rieger states that the initial congregation numbered just twenty-five, although no source is given for this. Rieger, "Zur Geschichte der lutherischen Gemeinde Dublins", 99.

¹⁷⁸ Rieger, "Zur Geschichte der lutherischen Gemeinde Dublins", 99. Long states that the "Scandinavian language" was Danish, apparently based on the fact that Iver Brink was Danish. Long, *Martin Luther and His Legacy*, 112.

¹⁷⁹ Smyrl, *Dictionary of Dublin Dissent*, 187. Rieger, "Zur Geschichte der lutherischen Gemeinde Dublins", 99.

¹⁸⁰ Rieger, "Zur Geschichte der lutherischen Gemeinde Dublins", 107.

whether this was due to a confusion between "Dutch" and "Deutsch", an echo of the original London "Dutch Church" that provided the template for later "Strangers' Churches" such as this one, or because the congregation in Amsterdam contributed a significant donation to fund its establishment and construction, is unclear. ¹⁸¹ Kellinghusen also secured a state grant of £50 per annum to serve as his salary; Rieger suggests this grant may be attributable directly to Queen Anne, a staunch supporter of Danish Lutheranism. ¹⁸²

Contemporary maps show that the Poolbeg Street church was a simple but commodious rectangular building with an east-west orientation, surrounded by a churchyard which was in turn hemmed in by surrounding buildings. There is some evidence the churchyard was used for burials. Access to the church was via a passage; it likely was not visible from the road, in keeping with the unobtrusive nature of the congregation. Adjoining the west end of the church was a house in which it seems the pastor resided. An anonymous, undated drawing of the church shows this house clearly, in addition to large windows running down both sides of the church. Despite the looming presence of the surrounding houses, the church was likely a light, airy and capacious building more than large enough to accommodate the small congregation.

Although the Dublin Lutherans had officially submitted to the authority of the Archbishop of Dublin, and so officially constituted a "conforming" congregation similar

¹⁸¹ Ferguson, "Rocque's Map", 143. Rieger, "Zur Geschichte der lutherischen Gemeinde Dublins", 102–7. See also Rocque, *Exact Survey*, on which the Poolbeg Street building is marked "D. C."

¹⁸² Rieger, "Zur Geschichte der lutherischen Gemeinde Dublins", 101.

¹⁸³ The layout of the churchyard can be clearly seen on Charles Brooking's map of 1728, which is included in Colm Lennon, *Dublin Part II: 1610 to 1756*, Irish Historic Towns Atlas 19 (Dublin: Royal Irish Academy, 2008)

¹⁸⁴ Smyrl, Dictionary of Dublin Dissent, 181.

¹⁸⁵ Reproduced in Niall McCullough, *Dublin, An Urban History: The Plan of the City*, 2nd edn (Dublin: Anne Street Press, 2007), 203.

to the French Church at the Lady Chapel, in practice this conformity was not enforced. 186 For example, it appears that they did not make use of the BCP in their services, but instead "used either the liturgy of the consistory of Holstein, or extempore prayer". 187 The use of the BCP in eighteenth-century Lutheran churches was not unknown: the church at St James's Palace in London, which was associated with George of Denmark, operated under the supervision of the Bishop of London and its worship was conducted through a German translation of the Book of Common Prayer. 188 In addition, had the Dublin congregation wished to make use of the BCP they would not have lacked material, as a bilingual German-English edition of the BCP was published in Dublin in 1710 "for the use of the Church of Ireland". 189 This was a reprint of a book which had formerly been published in Frankfurt in 1704, and which included a prose psalter. As the Lutherans in Dublin apparently did not use this book, however, its prospective readership is unclear; it may have been intended for the use of the Palatines, German immigrants who had settled in the south-west of the country in 1709. ¹⁹⁰ There was at least a minor connection between the German BCP and the Dublin congregation, for Kellinghusen's name appears in connection with the book in an 1810 publication. It is not clear what connection Kellinghusen had with the book, however—whether he worked on it in an editorial capacity, for example, or as a translator or writer. 191

Information about the fortunes and happenings at the Dublin Lutheran church for the remainder of the eighteenth century is scarce. Kellinghusen was succeeded in 1739

¹⁸⁶ Smyrl, *Dictionary of Dublin Dissent*, 176–177.

¹⁸⁷ Warburton et al., History of the City of Dublin, 102.

¹⁸⁸ Long, Martin Luther and his Legacy, 111.

¹⁸⁹ Das allgemeine Gebet-Buch, wie auch die Handlung der H. Sacramenten und anderer Kirchen-Ceremonien, wie sie in der irrlandischen Kirchen im Gebrauch sind (Dublin: gedruckt durch Andr. Crooke, 1710). GB-Ob C.P.Germ.1710.f.1.

¹⁹⁰ Muss-Arnolt, *The Book of Common Prayer*.

¹⁹¹ Fortsetzung und Ergänzungen zu Christian Gottlieb Joechers allgemeinem Gelehrten-Lexicon, vol. 3 (Delmenhorst, 1810), 184.

by his son-in-law, Olaf Moller, who was to be the longest-serving minister, serving until his death in 1781. Moller was described by Charles Wesley, whom he met in 1747, as "a simple, loving man, but not so courageous as Martin Luther". 192 Over time, the mixed German-Scandinavian character of the early congregation was lost, and by the end of the eighteenth century the congregation was largely German-speaking. 193 It is likely the congregation also suffered a gradual decline, as by the early nineteenth century it had all but disappeared; in 1816 there were just twelve members. 194 The last pastor of the church was a German named Schulze, who was best-known for supplementing his income by performing clandestine marriages. 195 That he had the time in which to do this is a testament to the church's greatly reduced congregation at that point; according to one anonymous writer in the mid-nineteenth century, Schulze was ordinarily resident outside the city for much of his tenure, travelling to the city only when there was a ship in port that might be carrying German-speaking Lutherans. 196 That supplementing his income was necessary is also telling: Schulze himself complained that he seldom received the full £100 salary he had been promised on his appointment as minister in 1806, as part of it was meant to be paid by subscription by the congregation, and they could no longer afford it. 197 The church building was made use of by other Protestant groups in the early nineteenth century, including Welsh Calvinists and Independents. By the 1860s the building had been unused and abandoned for many years. 198

¹⁹² Smyrl, Dictionary of Dublin Dissent, 188.

¹⁹³ Rieger, "Zur Geschichte der lutherischen Gemeinde Dublins", 108.

¹⁹⁴ Smyrl, Dictionary of Dublin Dissent, 184.

¹⁹⁵ Smyrl, Dictionary of Dublin Dissent, 193.

¹⁹⁶ Rieger, "Zur Geschichte der lutherischen Gemeinde Dublins", 109–110.

¹⁹⁷ Quoted in Smyrl, *Dictionary of Dublin Dissent*, 184.

¹⁹⁸ Smyrl, Dictionary of Dublin Dissent, 184.

4.3.2 Lutherans and Music

Lutheran ideas about church music were initially very different from those of other Protestant denominations. Martin Luther was considerably less circumspect about the use of music in worship than Calvin and other reformers, viewing it as a gift from God and wholeheartedly supporting the use of elaborate choral and instrumental forces in church. In the preface to the *Wittenberg Gezangbuch* of 1524, Luther wrote:

that the singing of spiritual songs is a good thing and one pleasing to God is, I believe, not hidden from any Christian, for not only the example of the prophets and kings in the Old Testament (who praised God with singing and playing, with hymns and the sound of all manner of stringed instruments), but also the special custom of singing psalms, have been known to everyone and to universal Christianity from the beginning. ¹⁹⁹

The new forms of worship introduced by Luther preserved many of the musical traditions of the existing Catholic liturgy, including the use of instruments, trained choirs, polyphonic music and singing in Latin. Although a greater emphasis was placed on congregational singing of hymns and psalms, this practice augmented rather than replaced existing church music traditions. Organ music was to become central to Lutheran music, in particular the chorale prelude, which served as an introduction to a piece of music about to be sung by the congregation and assisted them in fixing the pitch and reminding them of the melody. By the end of the sixteenth century, it was usual for the organ to accompany congregational singing, especially in churches without choirs. Under the influence of the Pietist movement in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, which advocated the simplification of the liturgy and the avoidance of "theatrical" styles in church music, Lutheran musical practice came to more closely resemble that of the

_

¹⁹⁹ Martin Luther, quoted in Oliver Strunk, ed., *Source Readings in Music History*, rev. Leo Treitler (London: W. W. Norton, 1998), 361.

Calvinists and Presbyterians: the singing of hymns in a *galant* style with modest organ accompaniment became the standard practice in Lutheran churches, whether Pietist or Orthodox.²⁰⁰

Despite this simplification, which has been viewed as a "decline" in Lutheran music, the eighteenth-century Lutherans continued to hold their worship music in high esteem and to contrast it favourably with that of other Protestant communities.²⁰¹ A letter written by Iver Brink to a Lutheran minister in London, sent from Wexford in 1691, gives a contemporary perspective on Lutheran worship music compared to that of the "English"—in other words, the established church:

How lovely are our psalms and church music by comparison with theirs? What strength and power have our hymns and sacred songs, which are, so to speak, sugared with our sweet melodies? Thereof the English know nothing. They employ psalms of David, but randomly. For many of them [the psalms] fail to reflect in any way the need that drives us to pray to God. We, in contrast, have sanctified those from this man of God's [David's] psalter that are most relevant and use them according to a seasonal plan.²⁰²

A German Lutheran minister in Pennsylvania similarly noted that "The English [-speaking Americans] were amazed at our singing and almost went into raptures over it, for some of the people had fine voices and knew how to sing in harmony". ²⁰³ The superior quality of Lutheran music even at the local and parish level was evidently a point of pride for many Lutherans during this period.

²⁰² Quoted in Jens Henrick Koudal and Michael Talbot, "Pastor Iver Brink's Sacred and Secular Music: A Private Collection of Music from Copenhagen at the Beginning of the Eighteenth Century", *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 135, no. 1 (2010), 4–5.

²⁰⁰ Robin A. Leaver, "Lutheran Church Music", GMO (20 January 2001).

²⁰¹ Leaver, "Lutheran Church Music", GMO.

²⁰³ John Ogasapian, *Church Music in America*, 1620–2000 (Macon, GA: Mercer University Press, 2007), 72.

Unfortunately for the purposes of this study, virtually no information remains on the music of the Lutheran congregation in Dublin. In the church's early years, before it had been able to erect its own building, it is highly unlikely that the small congregation could have afforded an organ, or even books of music for the church. One possible source of music during the congregation's early history could have been Brink, who not only held strong opinions on Lutheran music but was himself a keen musician and highly musically literate. By the time of his death he had amassed an extensive library of music from all over Europe, including a large quantity of psalm books and other books of Christian and Lutheran music.²⁰⁴ He also later became known as a composer of hymns, some of which are still used in Scandinavian hymnals.²⁰⁵ If Brink was indeed involved with the Dublin congregation during its early years, he would certainly have been capable of providing them with rudimentary musical instruction, and of educating Lichtenstein in how to lead a congregation in song.

After the Lutheran congregation managed to erect their own dedicated church building, and were in receipt of far more considerable funding than previously, their ability to afford and to accommodate some form of church music would have risen considerably. Despite this, however, no records exist of music at the church for the remainder of the eighteenth century. Given the importance of music in Lutheran worship generally, it is difficult to believe that the congregation did not sing; in the absence of books or written records, it must be assumed that any singing which took place was either led by the minister and performed from memory, or that imported books were used which have not survived. Muss-Arnolt records that the eighteenth-century London Lutheran

²⁰⁴ Koudal and Talbot, "Pastor Iver Brink's Sacred and Secular Music".

²⁰⁵ Rieger, "Zur Geschichte der lutherischen Gemeinde Dublins", 97. Roy Long, *Martin Luther and his Legacy*, 111–112.

congregations used the "Halle Hymnbook" in their services in conjunction with the BCP.²⁰⁶ This is almost certainly the *Geistreiches Gesangbuch* ("Spiritual Songbook") of the Halle Pietist Johann Anastasius Freylinghausen, written in 1704 and expanded in 1714.²⁰⁷ The German Lutherans in Philadelphia, who had a rich and vibrant church music culture, were also partial to this hymnal, importing it in large numbers; it was second only in popularity in Pennsylvania to the Marburg hymnal of 1711, which was printed six times in America between 1757 and 1777. It is possible that the Dublin Lutherans could have made similar use of imported books which have since disappeared.²⁰⁸

The trans-Atlantic Lutheran communities can also provide useful examples of the musical means that were adopted by overseas Lutherans in musically impoverished situations. In the mid-eighteenth century, the Lutherans of New York possessed only one copy of the hymn book, and the visiting preacher was required to line out the hymns in the Presbyterian style—a distinctly unusual practice among Lutherans. At the Zion church in Philadelphia, which was built in 1766 but initially had no organ, two horns were used to accompany congregational singing. ²⁰⁹ Measures such as lining-out or the use of informal instrumental accompaniment could also have been adopted in Dublin even if musical resources were limited.

Any singing that did take place was likely in German, the principal language of the congregation and most of its ministers, or the unknown Scandinavian language also used during the congregation's early history, but it is also possible that parts of the services in Dublin were sung in Latin. Singing in Latin was out of favour with most

-

²⁰⁶ Muss-Arnolt, *The Book of Common Prayer*, chapter 14.

²⁰⁷ Robin A. Leaver, *Bach Studies: Liturgy, Hymnology, and Theology* (New York: Routledge, 2021), 502. Ogasapian, *Church Music in America*, 73.

²⁰⁸ Ogasapian, Church Music in America, 73.

²⁰⁹ Ogasapian, Church Music in America, 73.

Lutherans by the eighteenth century, and was abolished in most jurisdictions by 1705. In some places, however, the custom persisted for considerably longer, and in Schleswig-Holstein, the province from which the Dublin congregation's church order was derived, Latin singing was not outlawed until 1772.²¹⁰

In 1815, the Revd Schulze of the "German Church, Dublin" appeared on the subscription list to David Weyman's collection of church music, *Melodia Sacra*.²¹¹ Given that the Poolbeg Street church had no permanent congregation by this time, and the occasional services that were held there were in the German language, it is most likely that Schultze's purchase of *Melodia Sacra* was motivated by his own interest in the subject rather than the hope of making use of it in services. It nonetheless suggests that Schultze was musically literate, and would have been capable of leading his tiny congregation in song if required.

The question of whether or not there was an organ in the Poolbeg street Lutheran Church remains similarly difficult to answer. There were organs in London Lutheran churches during this period—the Danish church in Wellclose square, where Brink was appointed minister, had possessed one since the late seventeenth century—and while they were expensive to install, it is not impossible that the combination of private donations and financial support from the established church hierarchy could have covered the cost. ²¹² Further information about the church's interior is scarce. A mid-nineteenth-century visitor to the building found it sadly dilapidated, and commented that very little of note could be seen inside save a memorial plaque to a former congregant. There is no

²¹⁰ Joseph Herl, *Worship Wars in Early Lutheranism: Choir, Congregation and Three Centuries of Conflict* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2004), 254.

²¹¹ David Weyman, *Melodia Sacra*, or The Psalms of David, the Music Composed by the most celebrated Authors Ancient and Modern, 4 vols (Dublin: Printed and Published by Geo. Allen, 1816), preface.

²¹² St George-in-the-East church website: http://www.stgitehistory.org.uk/danishchurch.html; accessed 29 March 2022.

mention in this account of the remains of an organ, or even an organ case, suggesting that either there had never been an organ at all or that it had been removed by that date.²¹³ There is one extant reference to an organ connected to the Poolbeg Street church: in 1766, Faulkner's *Dublin Journal* recorded that an organ recital took place at the "Dutch Church near Lazor's Hill" (now College Street).²¹⁴ The organ in question, built by Ferdinand Weber and played upon by the organist of St Ann's, was not a permanent fixture in the building, however, but was later moved to Christ Church, Cork.²¹⁵

Dublin's eighteenth-century Lutheran community was far smaller and far less influential than that of the Huguenots, and it has left little trace on the city's history. Nevertheless, these two distinct groups of "Protestant strangers" resembled one another in certain key respects. Both professed their own culture, distinct from that of the majority of the city's Protestants and maintained through the use of their native languages. Both were international communities: throughout the history of the Lutheran congregation, much of its membership was made up of visitors, particularly sailors from the Continental ships docked in the port. Lee mentions that the Dublin Huguenot William Lunel taught himself Danish in order to establish a wholesale linen trade with "the Norwegian vessels that visited the port" in the mid-eighteenth century, implying both that Norwegian ships visited regularly and that trading links existed between the Huguenots and these Lutheran visitors. ²¹⁶ The Huguenot community was meanwhile regularly swelled by waves of new immigrants during the eighteenth century, so that in the 1750s recent arrivals from France

²¹³ "German Lutheran Church", *Notes and Queries* 17 November 1866. The congregant, a Mrs Elizabeth Jane Williams, died in 1827, and so was likely a member of one of the other Protestant congregations that used the building in the early nineteenth century, rather than the Lutheran congregation, which had dwindled almost to nothing by that time.

²¹⁴ Quoted in Smyrl, *Dictionary of Dublin Dissent*, 183.

²¹⁵ Smyrl, *Dictionary of Dublin Dissent*, 183.

²¹⁶ Lee, Huguenot Settlements in Ireland, 244.

worshipped side-by-side with third- or fourth-generation immigrants whose families had come to the city a hundred years earlier.

Additionally, both communities had a complex relationship with the established church, both administratively and culturally. The Lutherans' official submission to the authority of the Archbishop brought significant benefits, such as financial contributions from the Archbishop and other clergy towards their new church and a state-supported salary for their minister. In practice, the lack of any enforcement of conformity left the congregation able to enjoy the benefits of conforming without the need to modify their worship traditions. The generous treatment of the Lutheran community is indicative of the amicable relationship that existed between the Established and Lutheran churches more generally. Despite their retention of aspects of worship associated with "Popery", the established church viewed the Lutherans as allies, and actively encouraged the establishment of a Lutheran community in Ireland in order to strengthen the "Protestant front" against Catholicism. 217 Community relationships between the established and Lutheran churches were also positive on the local level. The parish of St Mark's, in which the Lutheran church is located, was created in 1707, but lacked a parish church until 1757. During this period, the parish vestry met regularly in the "Dutch Church", and contributed financially to the building's repairs.²¹⁸

There were also strong cultural connections between the Lutherans and the established church, and more generally with the Protestant Ascendancy. Like the Huguenots, the Lutherans were closely associated with the Williamite Wars, for the congregation owed its origins to the conflict. The founder of the church, Lichtenstein, had been a military chaplain prior to settling in Ireland, as had his possible co-founder,

²¹⁷ Rieger, "Zur Geschichte der lutherischen Gemeinde Dublins", 98.

²¹⁸ Smyrl, Dictionary of Dublin Dissent, 182

Brink.²¹⁹ Both were stationed with Williamite regiments during the war, and thus had first come to Ireland as members of an invading Protestant force. The Lutheran church was also associated with the monarchy, initially through Prince Joseph and later through King George I, who was a German-speaking Lutheran by upbringing.²²⁰

Although very little is certain about the musical culture of the Dublin Lutherans, the evidence that does exist suggests a musical culture that would have reinforced and contributed to these cultural links between the Lutheran community and the wider Protestant community. A combination of Pietist influence and financial concerns meant that in practice, the music at the Lutheran church likely closely resembled that at a parish church or meeting house: centred on the singing of hymns, likely led by the minister and possibly supported by an organ. As well as familiar elements, a parish-churchgoer visiting the Lutheran church would also have been struck by the unfamiliar, principally the use of non-English languages (possibly including Latin) or instrumental accompaniment other than that of the organ. The tunes being sung would also have been at once familiar and strange: although Lutheran hymns constituted a separate and rich tune repertory, many of the tunes in the English (and French) traditions had originated as Lutheran hymns.

4.4 Conclusions

Through their musical traditions, Dublin's "Protestant strangers" were connected both to their own cultural heritage and origins and to their contemporary co-religionists overseas.

This is particularly striking in the case of the Huguenots, who despite socially integrating

²¹⁹ Koudal and Talbot, "Pastor Iver Brink's Sacred and Secular Music", 4. Smyrl, *Dictionary of Dublin Dissent*, 186.

²²⁰ "18th-Century Britain", Encyclopedia Britannica (https://www.britannica.com/place/United-Kingdom/18th-century-Britain-1714-1815; accessed 30 March 2022).

into Dublin Protestant society still retained the tunes of the Genevan Psalter in their worship music, as well as the use of the French language. The permanence of this tradition owes much to the particular significance of the psalms within Huguenot culture.

At the same time, the worship music of the "Protestant strangers" was not wholly unlike that of the established church and other Protestant communities. Several of the best-known Genevan tunes had been adopted into the Anglophone tune repertory, and would have been familiar to established churchgoers. The Huguenots also made use of a charity school choir to sing psalms at services, and there is evidence that at least one and possibly two of the French Churches were equipped with organs that could have been used to accompany the singing. While direct evidence of the musical practices of the Lutherans is elusive, comparison with similar communities in Britain and America suggests that their worship music was likely relatively simple, following the Pietist model, and may—as it seems there was no organ in the church—have even involved "lining out". As with the Huguenots, several tunes of Lutheran origin could also be found in the Anglophone tune repertory at this time. The Moravian community, in particular, derived many of their hymn-tunes from Lutheran originals. Thus the worship music of the "Protestant strangers" served to strengthen their connections both with their own history and culture and with the wider Protestant community of eighteenth-century Dublin.

CHAPTER FIVE: THE DUBLIN CHURCH TUNE REPERTORY

The preceding chapters have demonstrated that although the different Protestant communities of eighteenth-century Dublin preserved, to an extent, their own traditions of public worship music, many aspects of those traditions were shared across denominational lines. One musical element in particular which seems to have largely transcended religious divisions was the repertory of tunes used to sing hymns and psalms in public worship contexts. By collecting together all of the tunes that have survived in Dublin tunebooks, a hypothetical "Dublin church tune repertory" can be reconstructed.

Any attempt of this kind to establish a largely oral repertory based on printed sources must be accompanied by several significant caveats, some of which have already been discussed. Firstly, it must be acknowledged that the sources that have survived to the present day do not necessarily represent the totality of tunebooks circulating in eighteenth-century Dublin. Not only could sources easily have been lost, it was also of course entirely possible to import psalm books from abroad, as amply demonstrated by William Barton's complaint that over a thousand of his books had reached Ireland illegally (see 2.3.1 above). Given the impossibility of tracing a representative enough sample of such imported material, the present study has been necessarily restricted to material with a Dublin imprint. In addition, the tunes that made their way into print were not necessarily those that were most widely used at the time—they may have been chosen for inclusion based on their musical characteristics, their metre, the preference of the editor, or any number of other reasons. Nevertheless, by consulting a broad range of

¹ A. B. Grosart and D. K. Money, "Barton, William (1587/8–1678), Translator and Hymnologist", ODNB (23 September 2004).

sources associated with a cross-section of the city's different Protestant communities and covering a time period of almost a hundred years, it is possible to obtain a general sense of which tunes were most likely to actually have been used.

Appendix 1 collects together in a table all of the tunes identified in (English-language) Dublin tune sources between c. 1696 and 1787, based on a combination of data from the Hymn Tune Index and original research. As well as giving an overview of the breadth of the repertory under discussion, this also shows which tunes appeared most frequently, and how the repertory changed between the earliest and latest sources. Comparisons with two later Irish sources, and with the "authorised" English repertory as represented by the 1708 *Supplement* to the *New Version*, also highlights idiosyncrasies of the Dublin repertory, including unique Dublin tunes and variants.

5.1 Observations on the Dublin tune repertory

Given that the sources under consideration originate from a wide range of different Protestant communities and cover a long time period, the tunes most likely to have been widely known and performed are simply those that appear most frequently in the sources. Taking into account minor variants, there are thirteen tunes which appear in four or more of the seven English-language Dublin sources (see Table 3; this analysis excludes tunes from *Select Tunes for Sacred Use* [1780], on which see 3.4.3 above). Seven of these tunes are in common metre, one in double common metre, one in short metre, one long, and three in more complex metres. Between them, then, these tunes would have been more than adequate for performing the vast majority of psalms and hymns.

One limitation of this method of identifying the most popular tunes is that the chain of influence we have previously noted between the early tune sources (see 2.3 above) makes the recurrence of tunes in several of these early tunebooks unreliable as an indicator of their popularity. Thus tunes such as "Windsor" [271a] and "Lowath" [536a] appear in all four of the early sources, but none of the later ones. Another limitation is that tunes which are relatively dominant in later sources, such as "St Ann's" [664a] (see Ex. 25), may not have been composed when the earliest tunebooks were published. Ideally, therefore, the absence of a tune from *later* sources should be taken as more significant than its absence from earlier sources. Comparison with Dublin sources that post-date the latest tunebook in this study can help to mitigate these issues (see below).

Strikingly, the old Genevan tunes seem to have had considerable sticking power throughout the period. They are among the oldest tunes in the repertory, and many are lengthy or have awkward metres, yet they remained consistently in use while many newer tunes fell out of favour. It is one of these tunes which enjoys the distinction of being the only one to appear in every single one of the Dublin tunebooks: the French Genevan tune nowadays commonly known as the "Old Hundredth" [143a] (see Ex. 26). Its Calvinistic origins mean that it also appears in the Huguenot *Pseaumes de David* of 1731 and in the *Cantiques Sacrez* of 1748.² It was also notably the only tune to be mentioned by name in Boyse's first book.³ Its dominance in the Dublin sources should come as no surprise, as it had been one of the most popular tunes in the English psalm repertory since the sixteenth century and has remained so to the present day; it has a staggering 922 entries

-

²Les pseaumes de David mis en vers francois, avec la liturgie, le catechism, & la confession de foi des eglises reformées (Dublin: chez S. Powell, 1731). IRL-Dtc OLS B-9-650 and OLS 192.p.83. Cantiques sacrez pour les principals solemnitez Chrétiennes (Dublin: chez Samuel Powell, 1748). IRL-Dtc Starkey 128.

³ Joseph Boyse, Sacramental Hymns, Collected chiefly out of such Passages of the New Testament As contain the most sutable matter of Divine Praises in the Celebration of the Lord's Supper (Dublin: Printed for Matthew Gunn, 1693). GB-BL 3433.de.25.

in the HTI, as well as an additional 193 citations in its "c" variant form with an altered last line.⁴ It is also used to furnish several examples on the HTI's home page, continuing a tradition of its use in examples that dates back at least as far as the 1708 *New Version* Supplement (which used it as an example of a "chearful" tune).⁵ The hymn tune website Hymnary.org has indexed over 1,200 hymnals in which the "Old Hundredth" appears, and at the time of writing it is the most frequently searched-for tune in their repertory.⁶ Close behind the "Old Hundredth" in eighteenth-century Dublin was "Ps. 119" [120c] (see Ex. 27) which appears in six out of the seven tunebooks including the 1749 *Collection of Hymns and Sacred Poems* (otherwise more weighted towards newer material).⁷ The popularity of this tune is especially notable given that this "c" variant is first recorded in the Dublin sources, as we have seen (2.3).

It is also possible to construct a second sub-repertory of tunes and variants which make their first appearance in, and in some cases remain exclusive to, the Dublin sources.⁸ Several of the tunes from Smith's *Psalms of David* (1698), despite their English placename nomenclature, appear nowhere else in the international hymn tune repertory apart from in the other Dublin sources derived from Smith's volume (see 2.3.1 above), and may have been Smith's own compositions.⁹ These are "Bristol" [583], "Oxford" [585] and

1

⁴HTI entries for Tunes [143a] and [143c].

⁵ HTI homepage (https://hymntune.library.uiuc.edu/default.asp). A Supplement to the New Version of Psalms by Dr. Brady and Mr. Tate ... The Sixth edition, Corrected; and Much Enlarg'd: with the Addition of ... Near 30 New Tunes (London: In the Savoy: printed by John Nutt, and sold by James Holland, at the Bible and Ball, at the West-End of St. Paul's, 1708). HTI: *TS TatB 6a. GB-Lbl 3091.de.6(1).

⁶ Hymnary.org entry for the "Old Hundredth" and list of most popular tunes. https://hymnary.org/tune/old_hundredth_bourgeois and https://hymnary.org/browse/popular/tunes/ (accessed 17 March 2022).

⁷ A Collection of Hymns and Sacred Poems (Dublin: printed by S. Powell, in Crane-lane, 1749). HTI: #CHSP. US-Ps Warr.1749.

⁸ The tune information in this and the following paragraphs has been obtained from the Hymn Tune Index in combination with the primary sources.

⁹ Thomas Smith, *The psalms of David in metre. Newly Translated with amendments: by William Barton, M. A., and sett to the best Psalm-Tunes in two parts, viz. treble and bass* (Dublin: Printed by J. Brent and S. Powell, at the back of Dick's Coffee House in Skiner-Row, and are to be sold by Peter Laurence at his shop in Bridge-Street, near the Old Bridge, 1699). HTI: SmitTPD a. IRL-Dtc OLS 188.p.96.

"Stanford" [591], the last appearing only in Smith2 (see Exx. 5, 7, 13). The "Ely" tune [584] appears in one later source only, an English collection from 1719, in which it is called "Handley" (see Ex. 6). The "Oxford" tune is of particular interest, both because it is the most frequently occurring of these Dublin exclusives, appearing in four different sources, and also because of its unusual metre (8.8.8.8.8). It is likely derived from the German "Vater Unser", composed by Martin Luther (see 2.3.1). Bradley's *Psalms of David* (1740) contains the only known appearance of the tune "Dursley" [1545] (see Ex. 15). The 1749 *Collection of Hymns and Sacred Poems* is also the earliest known source of a number of tunes, notably the tune "Irish" [1936a], which is cited prolifically in later sources and appears in both the nineteenth-century tunebooks discussed below (see 5.2). It also includes one totally unique tune, "Hymn 168" [1935]. It

In addition to these "Dublin tunes", a number of "Dublin variants" are identifiable in these sources. The version of "Southwell" [269j] which appears in Smith' psalters is found nowhere else (see Ex. 9), and the same sources contain the first instance of a frequently occurring variant of the "St David's" tune [379f] (see Ex. 14). The "c" variant of the tune "Ps. 119" [120c] also originates with the early Dublin sources (see Ex. 27). The variant which appears in the second St Michan's tunebook of the tune usually called "Hanover" [657d] is unique to this source (see Ex. 4), and incorporates an interesting descending flourish that may have been a detail of local performance practice (see 1.5.1).¹²

-

¹⁰ The Psalms of David in Metre. Collected out of the Principal Versions now in Use. To which are Added, Hymns, Particularly Designed for the Lord's-Supper (Dublin: Printed by S. Powell, for Abraham Bradley, at the Two Bibles in Dame's-Street, over-against Sycamore-Alley, 1740). HTI: #PDMPV. IRL-Dtc Starkey 101

¹¹ All of the tunes from the 1749 *Collection* are transcribed in Appendix 2.

¹² A Collection of select Psalms for the use of parish-churches in general, but particularly intended for that of New St. Michan's, Dublin (Dublin: Printed by G. Bonham, No. 42, Dame-street: for Thomas Stewart, 1777). HTI: #SPNSM b. IRL-Dn Ir.2232.p6.

The most interesting "Dublin variant" is the tune which is actually given the name "Dublin" in the Irish sources [271c]. This variant of 'Windsor' [271a] appears alongside the tune it was based on in three of the sources, and independently of it in two; in the eighteenth-century sources it appears more often than "Windsor" does (see Ex. 10). The name "Dublin" seems to have been unique to the Irish sources, for in England it was generally known as "Coleshill". Some other tune names are also unique to the Dublin sources: "Lowath" [536a] is known as "Litchfield" or "London Old" elsewhere, and the name "Uxbridge" for tune [548] is unique to Bradley's *Psalms of David*.

5.2 Comparisons with other tune sources

5.2.1 Cochran's Selection of Psalm and Hymn Tunes (1804)

Although nineteenth-century tunebooks are outside the remit of this study, two sources in particular can be usefully compared with the eighteenth-century repertory. The first of these is *A Selection of Psalm and Hymn Tunes*, printed in Edinburgh in 1804 and sold by John Cochran in Belfast. ¹³ Cochran had been appointed precentor of the Third Presbyterian Congregation in Belfast in 1801, where he was paid a £5 bonus on top of his £15 yearly salary for running a singing school during the summer months. ¹⁴ Cochran's

-

¹³ John Cochran, A Selection of Psalm and Hymn Tunes, Adapted to Various Metres for the use of Congregations and Families ([Edinburgh], 1804). HTI: CochJS 1. GB-Cu EL 832 COC. Note that the University of Cambridge gives the place of publication of this edition as London, while the HTI believes it to have been published in Edinburgh.

¹⁴ Andrew Holmes, *The Shaping of Ulster Presbyterian Belief and Practice*, *1770–1840* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2006), 118–19.

role at the Third Congregation, in conjunction with the dedication of the book to the Synod of Ulster, establishes this volume as primarily intended for Presbyterian use. 15

Although Cochran's *Selection* lies technically outside of the parameters established by this thesis in two respects—it both post-dates the Act of Union and was printed somewhere other than Dublin—a comparison of its tune contents with those of the Dublin repertory reveals some interesting commonalities. Cochran's book contains fifty-seven tunes, set in two parts. Of these, twenty-eight are also found in the Dublin repertory (six in variant forms). Particularly notable among the tune contents are the "Dublin" tune [271c], appearing here under the name by which it was generally called in Ireland, rather than as "Coleshill", and the tune known as "Irish" [1936a], which first appears in the 1749 *Collection of Hymns and Sacred Poems* (see 3.4.1 above). The "Dublin" tune in particular was a stalwart of the Dublin repertory. Another "Irish" inclusion is the "Cork" tune [10157b] (see Ex. 21), which has its earliest citation in the 1780 tunebook *Select Tunes for Sacred Use* (see 3.4.3 above). This tune has only eight citations in total in the HTI (which does not include *Select Tunes*). The tune "Elgin" [400] (see Ex. 18), which appears in Bradley's *Psalms of David* (1740), also appears here, consolidating its Presbyterian character (see 2.3.3).

The most significant implication of the Cochran *Selection* for this study is its explicit association with a Presbyterian congregation. This suggests that the commonalities between the Presybyterian and established church musical practice previously observed in the early part of the eighteenth century were cemented as the century went on, and were additionally not exclusive to Dublin but observable elsewhere in Ireland. While the Presbyterian Church in Belfast and in Dublin occupied very different positions in the

¹⁵ HTI entry for Source: CochJS 1.

social hierarchy, Presbyterianism being the dominant form of Protestantism in Belfast, it is striking that in both cities there appears to have been considerable overlap between the tune repertories of the Anglican and Presbyterian communities. A further indication of this overlap is suggested by the second edition of Cochran's *Selection*, published in 1810, in which Cochran is described as "clark [*sic*] to the parish of Ardee", in County Louth.¹⁶

5.2.2 Weyman's Melodia Sacra (1816)

The second nineteenth-century volume which can help to shed additional light on the Dublin repertory as it was at the end of the eighteenth century is David Weyman's *Melodia Sacra*, a monumental collection of church music published in four volumes between 1812 and 1815 and combined into one four-volume set in 1816.¹⁷ Weyman was a singer at both Christ Church and St Patrick's Cathedrals. The first three volumes contain the (abridged) texts of all 150 psalms, each one set to "the most approved Tune", while the final volume consists of hymns and anthems. The texts of the psalms are drawn exclusively from the *New Version*. There is also a "Short Introduction to Psalmody" provided at the beginning, which gives a basic grounding in theory, including an explanation of the "fasola" solmization method (see 2.3.1).

The collection was dedicated by the publisher, George Allen, to "Mrs Peter La Touche of Bellevue"; this was Elizabeth La Touche, *née* Vicars, formerly of Lavally, Co. Laois. Peter La Touche was the grandson of David Digues La Touche, the Huguenot refugee,

¹⁶ John Cochran, A Selection of Psalm and Hymn Tunes adapted to a Variety of Metres ... for the use of Congregations and Families ([Dublin?]: to be had of the editor, 1810). HTI: CochJS 2. IRL-Dtc 175.a.5 no 11

¹⁷ David Weyman, *Melodia Sacra or The Psalms of David, the Music Composed by the most celebrated Authors Ancient and Modern*, 4 vols (Dublin: Printed and Published by Geo. Allen, 1816). HTI: WeymDMS. US-CHH.

and had inherited his father David II's grand estate at Delgany in Co. Wicklow in 1785. When not tending to the estate, which became known for its horticultural innovation, he served as a member of Parliament, a warden of the Freemasons, a prefect of the Friendly Brothers' anti-duelling society, and the governor of various charities and societies, including the Charitable Music Society. Elizabeth was similarly noted for her charitable pursuits, establishing a school for girls at Bellevue and a girls' orphanage in Dublin. 18

The 156 tunes collected in *Melodia Sacra* represent an eclectic mixture. The introduction to the volume states that "the Melodies are carefully selected from the most celebrated Authors, Ancient and Modern", and that "New Music has also been expressly composed for many of the Psalms, &c. &c. By several eminent Professors in Ireland". ¹⁹ Twenty-three of the tunes are Weyman's own compositions. ²⁰ Although Weyman's tune selections show a preference for newer tunes above older ones, he nevertheless includes a surprising number of tunes that also appear in the earliest Dublin sources—for example, the "Old Hundredth" [143a], the "Windsor" tune [271a], and "St Mary's" [542a]—as well as tunes that appeared later but became equally established in subsequent sources, such as "St Ann's" [664a] and "Salisbury" [685; several variants]. Each tune is provided with an accompaniment part (labelled "Piano or Organ") and with two descant harmony lines above the "air"; the introduction acknowledges that "it may not always be convenient to adapt Voices to each part of the Harmony", and so "the Treble or Air may (in general) be sung *singly* with the Piano Forte accompaniment". ²¹

One aspect of *Melodia Sacra* that deserves particular mention is Weyman's transcriptions of the tunes themselves, which are heavily embellished with passing notes,

_

¹⁸ Turlough O'Riordan, "La Touche, Peter", DIB (October 2009).

¹⁹ Weyman, *Melodia Sacra*, preface.

²⁰ HTI entry for Source: WeymDMS.

²¹ Weyman, *Melodia Sacra*, preface.

ornaments and trills, especially towards the end of phrases. Along with the accompaniment and descant lines, this makes his settings far more musically interesting than the generality of hymnals and psalters, and brings even the traditional tunes closer in style to the more elaborate character of the tunes found in the later eighteenth-century sources (see 3.4 above). It is possible that the rhythmic variation and melodic embellishment are Weyman's own innovations, intended to add musical interest to well-worn tunes. It is also possible, however, that these represent an attempt to notate the style in which these tunes were sung in contemporary practice, reminiscent of similar efforts documented by Temperley to notate the passing notes and ornaments of the "Old Way of Singing" in earlier eras (see 1.2.4 above). ²² In either case, the addition of these embellishments recasts the familiar tunes in a distinctly more modern musical mode.

Another practice which distinguishes Weyman from his predecessors is the importance which he evidently placed on attributing every tune to a named composer. All but sixteen of the tunes in *Melodia Sacra* carries a composer's name and sometimes even a date of composition. These appear to be largely spurious: the "Old Hundredth" [143a], which was originally a French Genevan tune, is attributed by Weyman to Martin Luther, and "Bangor" [1390a], by William Tans'ur, is here attributed to Thomas Ravenscroft. ²³ Nevertheless, it is notable that Weyman not only sought out an attribution for every tune but advertised the credentials of the composers on the collection's title page. The concern for authorship which this displays is nowhere to be found in earlier tunebooks, and reflects changing attitudes towards music at the dawn of the Romantic era.

-

²² Nicholas Temperley, "The Old Way of Singing: Its Origins and Development". *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 34, no. 3 (Autumn 1981).

²³ HTI entries for tunes [143a] and [1390a].

Although Weyman was a cathedral singer by profession, and his accompanied threepart textures would be too complex to be performed in most churches, in his introduction to the volume he expresses his hope that his collection will be widely used outside of the cathedrals, not only in parish churches but also by Nonconformists:

This Work (it is hoped) will be found particularly useful to Organists and Clerks of Parish Churches; — Dissenting Congregations and private Individuals will likewise find it a most useful and valuable Repository of Sacred Melody.²⁴

Throughout the introduction it is clear that Weyman sees no reason why Nonconformists should not make use of the same tunes as were being sung in the established parishes, and indeed fully expects them to do so—a reflection of the cross-community nature of the common repertory. He also confirms that both groups shared the same flexible approach to the relationship between texts and tunes, commenting that it was "usual in Churches or Dissenting Congregations, to transfer the Tune of any Psalm or Hymn from the original Words, (particularly if the Tune be a favourite,) and occasionally to sing it to the Words of some other Psalm or Hymn". He has accommodated this practice in his book by making a note of the metre of the text at the top of each piece ("to save the trouble of counting each Syllable"), and by providing each tune with a name. To each of the newly composed melodies he has given an Irish place name. Although Weyman claims that these "are only made use of in order to distinguish the Melody, and to prevent it from being confounded or lost by the frequent change of Words", and so carry no particular additional significance, some of the choices of names for the newly composed tunes are nonetheless suggestive.²⁵ One is named "Bethesda" [14996], while four have names associated with the La Touche family, and particularly with Peter and Elizabeth La Touche: "Bellevue"

-

²⁴ Weyman, *Melodia Sacra*, preface.

²⁵ Weyman, *Melodia Sacra*, preface.

[14376], "Delgany" [14377], "Lavally" [14382] (birthplace of Elizabeth), and "Marlay" [14384] (home of Peter's brother David, the director of the Bank of Ireland).²⁶

Weyman's expectation that the tunes he collected could be used in parishes as well as cathedrals, and by Dissenters as well as in the established church, is borne out by the extensive list of subscribers to *Melodia Sacra*.²⁷ Alongside the organists of Christ Church, St Patrick's, the Chapel Royal, Trinity College, and St Fin Barre's of Cork are those of the parish churches of St Nicholas Without, Monkstown, St Mark's, St Catherine's, St Paul's, St Andrew's, St Werburgh's, and the churchwardens of St Audoen's, St Peter's and St John's.²⁸ A Mr John Kerr ordered four copies on behalf of the "Methodist Book-Room", a bookshop that was attached to the Methodist chapel on Whitefriar Street.²⁹ One copy also went to William Smith, "Methodist Preacher", and one to the Presbyterian minister Rev. Philip Taylor of the Eustace Street congregation.

5.2.3 Supplement to the New Version (1708)

Perhaps the most instructive comparison is that between the Dublin tune repertory and the tune contents of the 1708 *Supplement* to Tate and Brady's *New Version* of the psalms. Of the sixty-one tunes in the Dublin repertory first documented in or before 1708, all except nine can be found in the *Supplement* in either the same or variant forms (see Appendix 1). Additionally, only forty-nine tunes which post-date the *Supplement* appear in the repertory (and twenty-three of these appear only in McVity's collection). This

²⁸ Several of the organists appearing on the subscription list were women; see 1.3.2 above.

²⁶ David Dickson and Richard English, "The La Touche Dynasty", in David Dickson, ed., *The Gorgeous Mask: Dublin 1700–1850* (Dublin: Trinity History Workshop, 1987), 17–29.

²⁷ Weyman, *Melodia Sacra*, preface.

²⁹ Dudley Levistone Cooney, *The Methodists in Ireland: A Short History* (Dublin: Columba Press, 2001), 181. The bookroom operated from 1802 to until 1830.

means that out of the 110 tunes in total which appear in Dublin sources, approximately 47 per cent also appear, in some form, in the 1708 *Supplement*.

It is clear from this finding that the Dublin tune repertory was, for the most part, extremely similar to the repertory of the English tradition from which it was derived. It is also striking that, while the later sources examined in this study began to move away from the "authorized" tunes, the tunebooks associated with the school at St Michan's continued to cleave close to those of the *New Version*. In combination with the dominance of Tate and Brady texts in the surviving charity sermon hymns (see 1.4.2 above), this suggests that the charity children continued to be taught using the *New Version* even when popular tastes had started to shift towards the more elaborate, Methodist-influenced material of the kind seen in *Select Tunes* and McVity's collection (see 3.4 above).

The nine tunes from the Dublin repertory which do not appear in the *Supplement* in any form, variant or otherwise, comprise an interesting list (see Table 4). Four appear only in Bradley's *Psalms of David* (1740), and betray that volume's reliance on a wide variety of English and Scottish sources, while four more originated with the Smith-Boyse series of tunebooks, and may have been written by Smith (see 2.3 above). The "Evening Hymn" [598a], which only appears in the 1749 *Collection*, was written by Jeremiah Clarke and had first appeared in Playford's *Divine Companion* of 1701.³⁰

Comparison with the *Supplement* also confirms that the "authorised" tunes were just as prevalent in Nonconformist sources as in those associated primarily with the established church. Many of those tunes, of course, had originated with non-conforming sources—the Genevan tunes, for example, or William Barton's *Psalms of David*. Nonetheless, this shows that the Dublin church tune repertory not only connected

.

³⁰ HTI entry for Source: PlayHDC 1a.

Protestants of different denominational allegiances within Ireland, but also situated both the Conforming and Dissenting communities within the broader psalm- and hymn-tune tradition of the British Isles.

5.3 Conclusions

This brief overview of the Dublin church tune repertory, and comparison with later sources and with the 1708 *Supplement*, reveals several notable characteristics. The first is that although the tune repertory was not static, and tunes entered and left the repertory as the eighteenth century progressed, there were some tunes that persisted in popular use longer than others. Several of these were tunes of Genevan origin, and the most enduring of all was the tune known as the "Old Hundredth" [143a], which remains in use to this day. Secondly, it demonstrates that the repertory of tunes used in public worship was remarkably similar across the different Protestant denominations of eighteenth-century Dublin. The same tunes appear in books associated with the established church, with Methodists, with Presbyterians, and with Baptists and Independents, accompanying texts drawn from all of these disparate traditions. The prevalence of Genevan tunes in the repertory also provided a point of commonality with the city's Huguenots.

Finally, and perhaps surprisingly, it reveals that the Dublin tune repertory was in many ways highly derivative of English practice, a large number of its tunes having originated in English sources, particularly the "authorised" 1708 *Supplement*. Despite this, several unique tunes of Dublin origin, as well as tunes and variants which originated in Dublin, have been identified, testifying that the Dublin tradition was not devoid of a vitality and character of its own.

CONCLUSION

First and foremost, this thesis has revealed a vibrant tradition of Protestant music-making in Dublin outside of the cathedrals, an area that been little considered in the existing literature. The city parishes had a strong tradition of metrical psalm singing by charity school children, accompanied by organ, which mirrored that of London. At the beginning of the century, the principal version of the psalms in use was the Whole Booke of Psalmes of Sternhold and Hopkins, but this was quickly superseded by Nahum Tate and Nicholas Brady's New Version of the Psalms of David (1696). While at the beginning of the long eighteenth century, organs were rare in Dublin parish churches as they were in Britain, and psalms were "lined out" by the parish clerk, almost every parish in the city acquired an organ before 1800. These organs were used primarily to accompany the psalms but also to play improvised voluntaries at various points during the services. It was also standard practice in the parish churches to draw upon children from the associated charity school to form a rudimentary choir to lead the congregation in singing during the services. As the eighteenth century progressed, the standard of music in the parish churches increased considerably, partly influenced by the evangelical turn in worship music more generally; hymns began to replace psalms as the musical material of choice (though psalms did not disappear), and the style of music used in Church of Ireland worship also changed, incorporating more complex rhythms, passing notes, repeating phrases, and other elements derived from Methodist music.

Among the city's Nonconformists, worship music varied between denominations. The Presbyterian and Baptist "Old Dissenters" prioritized the singing of psalms without instrumental accompaniment, lined out by the minister or clerk. In contrast, the eighteenth-century evangelical Protestant groups, the Moravians and Methodists, made

hymn singing the core of their worship music practice; Moravian hymns were generally sung with organ accompaniment and sometimes with other instrumental accompaniment, while the Dublin Methodists, though not strictly opposed to the use of organs, did not have one during this period and so sang unaccompanied. The French Huguenots, meanwhile, preserved their own traditions of worship music in their own language, regardless of internal denominational divisions. The Dublin Lutherans have left little evidence of their worship music practice, but it is certain, at least, that they too worshipped in their own languages. Taken together, then, the picture which emerges is of a vibrant and varied culture of worship music outside of the cathedral tradition.

The second significant finding of this study is that, while the music of each distinct Protestant community displayed idiosyncratic elements particular to their own beliefs and practice, many elements of worship music were common to several if not all of the religiously diverse communities under consideration. The singing of psalms and hymns in metre formed the core of worship music practice for all of Dublin's Protestants during this period; the use of organ accompaniment for those psalms and hymns was also common to several groups, including the established church, the Moravians and the Huguenots. Choirs of charity children were in use both in the parish churches and in the Huguenot meeting houses, including non-conforming French meeting houses. Communities without organs, regardless of denomination, generally "lined out" the psalms (with the exception of the Methodists).

The commonalities between Protestant worship music traditions extended even as far as the texts and tunes that were used. While the *New Version* remained dominant in the parish churches, from early in the eighteenth century conforming and non-conforming congregations alike were making use of texts by writers like John Patrick and Isaac Watts;

the latter in particular came to dominate both the established and Dissenting musical traditions in the mid- to late-eighteenth century. The influence of Methodism from the mid-century onwards led to an even greater convergence in style between conforming and non-conforming hymnody, as epitomised by the "extra-parochial chapels", which existed in a nebulous state somewhere between conformity and dissent. Not only texts were shared between denominations in this way, but tunes as well. This study has identified a "common repertory" of tunes which crossed denominational boundaries, used by people of diverse beliefs to sing texts drawn from equally diverse sources. Many of the tunes in the Dublin church tune repertory were also shared with the Huguenots and even with the Lutherans—and hence also the Moravians, who derived much of their musical culture from the Lutheran example—due to the common European origins of these various worship music traditions. This tune repertory therefore served as a truly unifying element across denominational boundaries.

One surprising finding was the extent to which the worship music of Dublin's Protestants closely resembled that of their coreligionists in Britain. While local practices did exist, such as the use of particular tune variants, I was expecting to find greater local variation, whether in the tune repertory or in performance practice. Some of this similarity may be the result of the necessary reliance of this study on printed material and descriptions of music performances and practices which may not fully reflect the reality of what was a predominantly oral tradition, particularly in the earlier part of the eighteenth century, and so may have obscured or omitted local idiosyncrasies. Nevertheless, it is in itself a significant finding that the surviving records of Dublin's worship music portray it as very similar to that of London and of the British Isles as a whole; this reflects the sense, among Dublin Protestants, that they formed a small part of a broader international culture.

Finally, this research has demonstrated that worship music was responsive to extramusical factors, and was influenced not only by changing ideas about the role of music in worship (as observed by Nicholas Temperley and others) but also by sociopolitical and cultural forces. As a result, the study of this music can provide valuable insights into the physical and mental worlds of the eighteenth century, a particularly valuable finding with regard to the lower- and middle-class Dublin Protestants who are less represented by existing scholarship. This study has demonstrated the value of applying "urban musicology" and "cultural history" frameworks to these musical traditions as a means of better understanding the many historical and cultural contexts of worship music, and situating it within those contexts.

The main limitation of this study was the disparity between the need to look in great detail at the surviving primary sources and my desire to create a broad comprehensive overview of *all* Protestant worship music outside the cathedrals during the long eighteenth century, in order to facilitate comparison. While I have attempted to balance these microand macro-historical approaches, without doubt this has meant some elements of worship music could receive only a cursory treatment. Similarly, the self-imposed broad scope of the study meant that a detailed comparison of the Dublin worship music tradition with those of other cities, both in Ireland and Britain, was not possible within the time available. Other limitations were external and unavoidable, principal among these being the extended closure of many libraries and archives and the restrictions on travel imposed by the ongoing coronavirus pandemic.

While the research presented in this thesis may represent a significant step forward in this field of study, there is of course much still to be done, particularly in the areas in which this research was limited as noted above. All of the tunebooks and worship music traditions treated in this research merit further detailed study. The newly-discovered source *Select Tunes for Sacred Use* (1780), in particular, has the potential to add greatly to our understanding of developments in Protestant music-making in Ireland in the late eighteenth-century. An analysis of the texts accompanying the psalm- and hymn-tunes in the Dublin tunebooks would also be a valuable addition to scholarship, facilitating greater comparison with text-only sources such as the Dublin Wesleyan and Moravian hymn collections. The charity school singing tradition, and in particular the performance of hymns at annual charity sermons, might be usefully compared with the "charity music" culture that has been observed in contemporary secular music, as it similarly represents the confluence of musical entertainment and the philanthropic interest.

This research also has significant potential from a public musicology perspective: one project which I began during my research, but which remains at an early stage, is the creation of an interactive map of the eighteenth-century city, which would enable viewers to select churches and meeting houses and to hear recordings of the music that was performed there, as well as accessing information about the music and about the history of the associated Protestant community. A project of this kind would be of great value in the recontextualisation of this worship music within the vanished world of eighteenth-century Dublin. The research presented in this thesis demonstrates the value of, and the need for, further research into this somewhat neglected area, and the potential of such research to provide fascinating insights into how Protestant Dubliners living during the city's "Golden Age" thought—about themselves, their world, and their music.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Manuscript and Archive Sources

Representative Church Body Library (RCB)

P.0276: Records of St Michan's Parish Dublin

P.0276.07 Account Books

2. Churchwarden's account book 1723-61

P.0276.13 School Records

- 1. Minute book 1751-77
- 2. Minute book 1777-1825

P.0276.28 Miscellaneous Volumes

- 1. Commonplace book 1722–33
- 3. Memorial Book 1724–89

P.0117: Records of St Catherine's Parish Dublin

P.0117.05 Vestry Minute books

- 1.1657-92
- 1a. Typescript copy of the years 1679–95 of P.0117.05/1
- 2. 1693-1730

P.0155: Records of St Luke's Parish

P.0155.07 Account Books

1. Churchwarden's account book 1716–1777

Irish Huguenot archive

IHA MS 47: Transcript of a paper by Charles C. Ludington entitled "The Huguenot Diaspora: Refugee Networks of Power", presented at UCC on 22 May 1999.

IHA MS 90: "Discipline pour l'Eglise Françoise de Dublin qui s'assemble à St Patrick" (1694). Photocopy of manuscript source at Marsh's Library.

Public Records Office Northern Ireland (PRONI)¹

MIC1F/4/1: Dublin Moravian congregational diaries

1: 1749–51

2: 1752-3

3: 1753-6

8: 1770-4

9: 1775-8

10: 1778-81

MIC1F/4/2: Dublin Moravian elder's conference minutes

3: 1753-64

6: 1776–8

MIC1F/4/6: Dublin Moravian congregation cash books

3: 1756-62

4: 1762-66

5: 1752 & 1766-86

Private Collection of Steven C. Smyrl

Cennick, John. "An Account of the most remarkable Passages relating to the Awakening in Dublin and Ireland, from the beginning till the settling of the Congregation". Unpublished transcription by John and Edna Cooper.

Cooney, Dudley. "An Account of the Brethren's first coming to Ireland, with all Matters Relating to their losing Skinners Alley Meetinghouse". Unpublished typescript based on original documents at Moravian Archive, Gracehill.

¹ The PRONI eCatalogue entries for these records are numbered incorrectly. The numbering used here is thus taken from the files themselves, rather than from the catalogue.

Cooper, Edna. "Notes on the various buildings used by the Moravian Church in Dublin, 1746–1980, and sketches by J. J. England, 1889". Unpublished MS, 1999.

Cooper, J. H. and E. Cooper "Extracts from the Dublin Congregational Diary 12/23.10.1751—1.7.1756 & 1777". Unpublished MS.

Psalters, Hymnals and Tunebooks

Barton, William. *The Book of Psalms in metre close and proper to the Hebrew, smooth and pleasant for the metre, plain and easie for the tunes: with musical notes.* London: Printed by Matthew Simmons for the Companie of Stationers, 1644. ESTC: R34049. HTI: BartWBPM a. Wing / B2401. GB-Lbl C.53.gg.33(1). EEBO. https://elib.tcd.ie/login?url=https://www-proquest-com.elib.tcd.ie/books/book-psalms-metre-close-proper-hebrew-smooth/docview/2248498090/se-2?accountid=14404.

Bayly, Edward. *A Sermon preached on the opening the chapel of the Magdalen Asylum*. Dublin: Printed for Josiah Sheppard, [1768]. ESTC: T127863. GB-Lbl C.109.f.16(1). ECCO. link.gale.com/apps/doc/CB0127014160/ECCO?u=tcd&sid=bookmark-ECCO&xid=baa7190a&pg=1.

Boyse, Joseph. Sacramental Hymns, Collected chiefly out of such Passages of the New Testament As contain the most sutable matter of Divine Praises in the Celebration of the Lord's Supper. Dublin: Printed for Matthew Gunn, 1693. ESTC: R30236. GB-Lbl 3433.de.25. EEBO. https://elib.tcd.ie/books/sacramental-hymns-collected-chiefly-out-new/docview/2240937116/se-2?accountid=14404.

———. Sacramental Hymns Collected (Chiefly) out of Such Passages of the New
Testament as Contain the Most Suitable Matter of Divine Praises in the Celebration of
the Lord's Supper. [London]: Printed at Dublin, and reprinted at London by Thomas
Parkhurst at the Bible and Three Crowns in Cheapside, 1693. ESTC: R24143. Wing /
B4075. EEBO. https://elib.tcd.ie/login?url=https://www-proquest-
com.elib.tcd.ie/books/sacramental-hymms-collected-chiefly-out-
such/docview/2248535786/se-2?accountid=14404.

———. Family Hymns for Morning and Evening Worship. With some for the Lord's Days; And others for several Particular Occasions. All taken out of the Psalms of David. Dublin: Printed at the back of Dick's Coffee-House; And are to be sold by Matth. Gunne, at the Bible and Crown in Essex-Street, 1701. ESTC: N9680. HTI: BoysJFH. IRL-Dtc OLS Xerox 6 no. 12.

Cantiques sacrez pour les principales solennitez des Chretiens. London: chez Paul Vaillant, dans le Strand vis-a-vis de Bedford-House a L'Enseigne du Navire, 1707. ESTC: T31346. GB-Lbl 3438.ee.65. ECCO. link.gale.com/apps/doc/CW0122714174/ECCO?u=tcd&sid=bookmark-ECCO&xid=878dd470&pg=1.

Cantiques sacrez pour les principales solemnitez Chrétiennes. Dublin: chez Samuel Powell, 1748. ESTC: T31357. IRL-Dtc Starkey 128.

Cennick, John. *A Collection of Sacred Hymns*. 5th edition. Dublin: printed by S. Powell in Crane-Lane, 1752. ESTC: T184204. GB-Ob 147 g.183. ECCO. link.gale.com/apps/doc/CW0123244158/ECCO?u=tcd&sid=bookmark-ECCO&xid=56dcd54d&pg=1.

Cochran, John. A Selection of Psalm and Hymn Tunes, Adapted to Various Metres for the Use of Congregations and Families. [Edinburgh], 1804. HTI: CochJS 1. GB-Cu EL 832 COC.

——. A Selection of Psalm and Hymn Tunes adapted to a Variety of Metres ... for the use of Congregations and Families. [Dublin]: to be had of the editor, 1810. HTI: CochJS 2. IRL-Dtc 175.a.5 no.11.

A Collection of Hymns and Sacred Poems. Dublin: printed by S. Powell, in Crane-lane, 1749. ESTC: N53254. HTI: #CHSP. US-Ps Warr.1749.

A Collection of Hymns and Sacred Poems. Dublin: printed by George Bonham, No. 42, Dame-Street. And sold by S. Edwards, School-Master, in Golden-Lane, 1779. ESTC: T53112. GB-Lbl 3438.ff.40. ECCO.

 $\frac{link.gale.com/apps/doc/CW0122584131/ECCO?u=tcd\&sid=bookmark-ECCO\&xid=1c50180f\&pg=1}{ECCO\&xid=1c50180f\&pg=1}.$

A Collection of select Psalms for the use of parish-churches in general, but particularly intended for that of New St. Michan's, Dublin. Dublin: Printed by G. Bonham, No. 42, Dame-street: for Thomas Stewart, 1777. ESTC: T184221. HTI: #SPNSM b. IRL-Dn Ir.2232.p6.

Conrart, Valentin. *Les Pseaumes de David mis en vers Francois*. Amsterdam: chez P. Humbert & E. Lucas, 1722. Google Books. https://books.google.com/books?id=8nVWAAAAcAAJ.

Costellow, Thomas. A Selection of Psalms and Hymns with favourite & approved Tunes for the Use of Bedford Chapel near Bedford Square. London: Printed & Sold by Wm Curce, No. 40 Long Acre and may be had at the Chapel, 1791. Google Books. https://books.google.ie/books?id=l-CYoIx5EEIC.

La forme des prières ecclésiastiques. Avec la manière d'administrer les sacremens, & de célébrer le mariage, & la visitation des malades. [London], c. 1728. ESTC: T124189. GB-Lbl 3022.d.7(2*). ECCO.

link.gale.com/apps/doc/CW0122985129/ECCO?u=tcd&sid=bookmark-ECCO&xid=33603729&pg=1.

Gambold, John, ed. A Collection of Hymns of the Children of God in all Ages, From the Beginning till now. In Two Parts. Designed chiefly for the Use of the Congregations in Union with the Brethren's Church. London: Printed; and to be had at all the Brethren's Chapels, 1754. ESTC: T53156. GB-Ob 14721.e.8. Google Books. https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=r-kHAAAAQAAJ.

Hawkesworth, John, ed. *A collection of hymns, for the use of the congregation in Plunket-Street Meeting-House*. Dublin: printed by G. Perrin, No 3, Castle-Street, for the Rev. John Hawkesworth, 1782. ESTC: T124030. GB-Lbl 3435.1.51. ECCO. link.gale.com/apps/doc/CW0119241562/ECCO?u=tcd&sid=bookmark-ECCO&xid=27ecc9e4&pg=1.

An Hymn to be sung by the charity-children, of St. Andrew's parish, on Sunday the 24th of this instant, April 1726. Dublin, 1726. IRL-Dtc Press A.7.4 no. 44. ECCO.. link.gale.com/apps/doc/CB0132012867/ECCO?u=tcd&sid=bookmark-ECCO&xid=0071e9a5&pg=1.

An hymn to be sung by the charity children of St. Mary's, Dublin, on Sunday, the 19th of February, 1764. Dublin, 1764. GB-Cu Hib.0.764.1. ECCO. link.gale.com/apps/doc/CB0132016211/ECCO?u=tcd&sid=bookmark-ECCO&xid=59c19a66&pg=1.

Hymns, to be sung by the children of the Charity-School of St. Werburgh's Parish, on Sunday the 12th of December, 1756. At which time a sermon will be preached by the Reverend Sir. Philip Hoby, bart. Printed for Samuel Price, bookseller opposite Cranelane, in Dame-street, 1756. GB-Cu Hib.0.7.56.4. ECCO.

link.gale.com/apps/doc/CB0132016212/ECCO?u=tcd&sid=bookmark-ECCO&xid=fa281cb3&pg=1.

Hymns, to be sung in Bethesda Chapel, on Sunday morning, the 4th of February, 1798, ... [Dublin]: J. Charrurer, printer, 128, Capel-street, [1798]. ESTC: T194628. GB-Cu Hib.0.798.1. ECCO. link.gale.com/apps/doc/CB0132016213/ECCO?u=tcd&sid=bookmark-ECCO&xid=f299f910&pg=1.

Hymns used in Bethesda Chapel. Dublin: Printed by J. S. Folds, Son, and Patton, 5 Bachelor's-Walk, 1843. GB-Lbl. Google Books. https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=Q8BVAAAAAAJ.

Lampe, J. F., John Wesley and Charles Wesley. *Hymns on the Great Festivals, and other occasions*. London: printed for M. Cooper at the Globe in Pater-Noster-Row; and sold by T. Trye near Grays-Inn Gate, Holborn; Henry Butler in Bow Church-Yard; the booksellers of Bristol, Bath, Newcastle upon Tyne, and Exeter, and at the musick-shops, 1746. ESTC: N17476. HTI: #HGFOO 1. GB-Lbl Music F.1120.m. ECCO. link.gale.com/apps/doc/CW0106511932/ECCO?u=tcd&sid=bookmark-ECCO&xid=0204db1e&pg=1.

LaTrobe, Christian Ignatius. *Hymn-tunes, sung in the church of the United Brethren*. London: printed for the author, by J. Bland, [1790]. ESTC: T161000. GB-Lbl Music A.1231.kk. ECCO.

 $\frac{https://link.gale.com/apps/doc/CW0106516483/ECCO?u=tcd\&sid=bookmark-ECCO\&xid=3f5a6256\&pg=1.}{ECCO\&xid=3f5a6256\&pg=1}.$

McVity, John. *Select psalm and hymn tunes, adapted to the use of public congregations and private families*. Dublin: printed by George Bonham, 1787. ESTC: T155296. HTI: McviJSP 2. GB-Lbl Music A.1046. ECCO.

<u>link.gale.com/apps/doc/CW0106457103/ECCO?u=tcd&sid=bookmark-ECCO&xid=8b8fdfab&pg=1.</u>

Patrick, John. *The Psalms of David in Meter: Fitted to the Tunes Used in Parish-Churches*. London: printed for A. and J. Churchill, at the Black Swan in Paternoster-Row; and L. Meredith, at the Star in St. Paul's Churchyard, 1694. ESTC: R40779. Wing / B2589. EEBO. https://elib.tcd.ie/login?url=https://www.proquest.com/books/psalms-david-meter-fitted-tunes-used-parish/docview/2248570500/se-2?accountid=14404.

The Psalms of David in Metre. Collected out of the Principal Versions now in Use. To which are Added, Hymns, Particularly Designed for the Lord's-Supper. Dublin: Printed by S. Powell, for Abraham Bradley, at the Two Bibles in Dame's-Street, over-against Sycamore-Alley, 1740. ESTC: T91803. HTI: #PDMPV. IRL-Dtc Starkey 101.

The psalms of David in metre, Newly Translated ... Allowed by the authority of the General Assembly of the Kirk in Scotland. Dublin: printed by and for Geo. Grierson, Printer to the King's Most Excellent Majesty, at the King's Arms and Two Bibles in Essex-Street, 1745. ESTC: T90384. GB-Lbl 3061.de.42(2). ECCO. link.gale.com/apps/doc/CW0120922960/ECCO?u=tcd&sid=bookmark-ECCO&xid=46f89c61&pg=1.

Les pseaumes de David mis en vers francois, avec la liturgie, le catechism, & la confession de foi des eglises reformées (Dublin: chez S. Powell, 1731). ESTC: T154958 and T126173. IRL-Dtc OLS B-9-650 and OLS 192.p.83.

Select Psalms, for the use of the Parish-Church of New St. Michan's, in Dublin: Printed by S. Powell, in Crane-Lane, 1752. ESTC: T117668. HTI: #SPNSM a. IRL-Dtc Starkey 129.

Select Tunes for Sacred Use, adapted to Psalms and Hymns in Different Measures; neither too Numerous, Long or Difficult for a Christian Congregation, or for Private Use. Dublin: printed by George Bonham, No. 42, Dame-street. Sold by S. Edwards, School-master, Golden Lane, [1780]. ESTC: N65511. IRL-Dcla Gilbert Collection 15E (24).

Smith, Thomas. [An Edition of the Psalms, in the Version of Sternhold and Hopkins, with Melodies. The "Instructions concerning the Gammut" Signed: Thomas Smith.] ([Dublin],, [1700]). HTI: *UC 4. GB-Lbl A.1233.x.

———. An introduction to the singing of psalms: with a choice collection of the Psalms of David. Set to the best tunes that are now taught and used in all, or most of the churches in England or Ireland. In a more plain and useful method than hath been formerly published. Dublin: Printed by J. Brent and S. Powell ... and are to be sold by the Author ... and Peter Lawrence, 1700. GB-Lbl A.511.jj.

———. The psalms of David in metre. Newly translated with amendments: by William
Barton, M.A. and sett to the best Psalm-tunes in two parts, viz. treble and bass. Dublin:
Printed by J. Brent and S. Powell, at the back of Dick's Coffee House in Skiner-Row,
and are to be sold by Peter Laurence at his shop in Bridge-Street, near the Old Bridge,
[1699]. ESTC: R170579. HTI: SmitTPD a. IRL-Dtc OLS 188.p.96.

——. The psalms of David in metre. Newly translated with Amendments by William Barton, M. A., and set to the Best Psalm-Tunes ... The Second Edition, Corrected and Amended. With the Basses. Dublin: Printed by J. Brocas, for Elip. Dobson, Tho. Servant, and Peter Lawrence, 1706. ESTC: T91809. HTI: SmitTPD c. IRL-Dtc OLS 188.p.97.

Smyth, Edward. A choice collection of occasional hymns; principally designed for the congregation attending Bethesda-Chapel; but calculated for all Denominations of Christians, who desire to worship God in Spirit and in Truth. To which is added, The form of prayer, used in the chapel. By the Rev. Edward Smyth. Dublin: printed by J. Charrurier, No. 128, Capel-Street, 1786. ESTC: T135926. GB-Lbl 3436.i.45. ECCO. link.gale.com/apps/doc/CW0118704419/ECCO?u=tcd&sid=bookmark-ECCO&xid=cd421b2c&pg=1.

Stennett, Joseph. *Hymns compos'd for the celebration of the holy ordinance of baptism*. London: printed by J. Darby, and sold by J. Baker at Mercers-Chappel in Cheapside, and J. Clark at the Bible and Crown in the Old Change, 1712. ESTC: T74029. GB-Lbl 844.e.22(2). ECCO.

link.gale.com/apps/doc/CW0118594088/ECCO?u=tcd&sid=bookmark-ECCO&xid=82b84b33&pg=1.

——. Hymns in commemoration of the sufferings of Our Blessed Saviour Jesus Christ, compos'd for the celebration of His Holy Supper. London: printed by J. Darby, for Andr. Bell at the Cross-Keys and Bible in Cornhil, near Stocks-market, 1697. ESTC: R15609. US-SM 147897. Wing / S5408. EEBO.

https://elib.tcd.ie/login?url=https://www.proquest.com/books/hymns-commemoration-sufferings-our-blessed/docview/2248516725/se-2?accountid=14404.

A supplement to the new version of Psalms by N. Tate and N. Brady. London: Printed by J. Heptinstall and sold by D. Brown, J. Wild and most booksellers, 1700. ESTC: R170598. Wing / B2624. US-U 223.2 B471697. EEBO.

https://elib.tcd.ie/login?url=https://www.proquest.com/books/supplement-new-version-psalms-n-tate-brady/docview/2240943318/se-2?accountid=14404.

A Supplement to the New Version of Psalms by Dr. Brady and Mr. Tate ... the sixth edition, corrected; and much enlarg'd: with the addition of ... near 30 new Tunes. London: In the Savoy: printed by John Nutt; and sold by James Holland, at the Bible and Ball, at the West-End of St. Paul's, 1708. ESTC: T93010. HTI: *TS TatB 6a. GB-Lbl 3091.de.6(1). Google Books. https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=J-hUAAAAcAAJ.

Tate, Nahum and Nicholas Brady. *A new version of the Psalms of David, Fitted to the Tunes Used in Churches*. London: printed by J. R. for the Company of Stationers, And are to be Sold at Stationer's-Hall, near Ludgate, and by most Booksellers, 1703. ESTC: T91845. GB-Lbl 1220.g.4(1). ECCO.

link.gale.com/apps/doc/CW0123336648/ECCO?u=tcd&sid=bookmark-ECCO&xid=843436d7&pg=1.

——. *A New version of the Psalms of David, fitted to the tunes used in churches.* Dublin: Printed by A. Rhames, for E. Dobson, J. Pepyat, and E. Dobson, Jun., Booksellers, 1718. ESTC: T181872. GB-Ob Ps. Verse 1718.f.2. ECCO. link.gale.com/apps/doc/CB0127274493/ECCO?u=tcd&sid=bookmark-ECCO&xid=e878bcf4&pg=1.

Watts, Isaac. *Hymns and Spiritual Songs, In Three Books* (London: Printed for W. Strahan, 1773). ESTC: T82572. GB-Ob 147 g.139. Google Books. https://books.google.ie/books?id=3CEDAAAAQAAJ.

Wesley, John, and Charles Wesley. *Hymns and sacred poems*. Dublin, 1747. ESTC: T31327. GB-Lbl 03440.ee.30. ECCO. link.gale.com/apps/doc/CW0119758775/ECCO?u=tcd&sid=bookmark-ECCO&xid=bb138fad&pg=21.

Weyman, David. *Melodia Sacra, or The Psalms of David, the Music Composed by the most celebrated Authors Ancient and Modern,* 4 vols. Dublin: Printed and Published by Geo. Allen, 1816. HTI: WeymDMS. US-CHH. Internet Archive. https://archive.org/details/melodiasacraorps00weym.

Other Seventeenth- and Eighteenth-Century Printed Documents

An act for incouraging Protestant-strangers and others to inhabit and plant in the kingdom of Ireland. Dublin: Printed by John Crook and are to be sold by Sam. Dancer, 1662. ESTC: R26814. GB-Ob [shelfmark not available]. EEBO Text Creation Partnership. http://name.umdl.umich.edu/A45967.0001.001.

Das allgemeine Gebet-Buch, wie auch die Handlung der H. Sacramenten und anderer Kirchen-Ceremonien, wie sie in der irrlandischen Kirchen im Gebrauch sind. Dublin: gedruckt durch Andr. Crooke, 1710. ESTC: T140938. GB-Ob C.P.Germ.1710.f.1. Google Books. https://play.google.com/store/books/details?id=N8UUAAAAQAAJ.

Boyse, Joseph. *Remarks on a late discourse of William Lord Bishop of Derry; concerning the inventions of men in the worship of God*. Dublin: Printed for Eliphal Dobson, Matthew Gun, and Patrick Campbel, Booksellers in Dublin, 1694. ESTC: R230876. Wing / B4073. US-WS 166-806q. EEBO.

https://elib.tcd.ie/login?url=https://www-proquest-com.elib.tcd.ie/books/remarks-on-late-discourse-william-lord-bishop/docview/2248515382/se-2?accountid=14404.

Browne, Peter. A sermon, preach'd at the parish church of St. Andrew's Dublin, on Sunday the 15th of April, 1716. For the Benefit of The Charity-School for Boys in that Parish. By Peter Lord Bishop of Cork and Rosse. Printed by E. Waters in Essex-Street; and are to be sold by J. Hyde Book-Seller in Dame-Street. For the benefit of the Charity-School, [1716]. GB-Lbl 1508/509. ECCO.

 $\label{link.gale.com/apps/doc/CW0120270408/ECCO?u=tcd&sid=bookmark-ECCO&xid=b887846a.} \\$

Burney, Charles. *The Present State of Music in France and Italy*. London, 1773. Google Books. https://books.google.ie/books?id=x0QJAAAQAAJ.

Craghead, Robert. *An answer to a late book intituled, A discourse concerning the inventions of men in the wWorship of God*. Edinburgh: printed by the heirs of Andrew Anderson, printer to Their Most Excellent Majesties, 1694. ESTC: R7154. Wing / C6793. GB-En Cwn.484. EEBO. https://elib.tcd.ie/login?url=https://www-proquest-concerning/docview/2240863425/se-2?accountid=14404.

Croft, William. *Complete Organ Works*. Richard Platt, ed. London: Oxford University Press, 1978.

Eccles, Solomon. *A Musick-Lector: Or, The Art of MUSICK (that is so much vindicated in Christendome) Discoursed of, by Way of Dialogue*. London, 1667. Quaker Heritage Press. http://www.qhpress.org/texts/eccles.html.

Edwards, Morgan. *The Customs of Primitive Churches*. Philadelphia, 1768. ESTC: W10538. US-WOa DB.

Harris, Walter. *The History and Antiquities of the City of Dublin, from the Earliest Accounts*. Dublin: Printed for Laurence Flinn, in Castle-Street; and James Williams, in Skinner-Row, 1766. Google Books.

https://books.google.ie/books?id=g5pnAAAAMAAJ.

King, William. *A discourse concerning the inventions of men in the worship of God*. The second edition reviewed by the author. Dublin: printed by Andrew Crook, their Majesties Printer, and are to be sold by Eliphal Dobson at the Stationers-Arms in Castle-Street and the rest of the Booksellers, 1694. ESTC: R230068. Wing / K529A. IRL-Dtc GG.hh.21. EEBO.

https://elib.tcd.ie/login?url=https://www.proquest.com/books/discourse-concerning-inventions-men-worship-god/docview/2248577289/se-2?accountid=14404.

Payne, Benjamin. *The Parish-clerk's Guide: or, the singing Psalms used in the parish-churches suited to the feasts and fasts of the Church of England, and most other special occasions*. London: re-printed by John March, for the company of Parish-Clerks, 1731. ESTC: T91512. GB-Lbl 1412.c.17. ECCO.

 $\frac{link.gale.com/apps/doc/CW0122273607/ECCO?u=tcd\&sid=bookmark-ECCO\&xid=df84f97c\&pg=21.}{ECCO\&xid=df84f97c\&pg=21}.$

Reasons for a new bridge. Dublin, 1761. ESTC: T82979. GB-Lbl 1508/529(8). ECCO. link.gale.com/apps/doc/CW0104147461/ECCO?u=tcd&sid=bookmark-ECCO&xid=01c29b5a&pg=4.

"Report on the State of Popery in Ireland, 1731: Diocese of Dublin". *Archivum Hibernicum* 4 (1915). https://www.jstor.org/stable/25485488.

Rocque, John. *An Exact Survey of the City and Suburbs of Dublin in Which is Express'd the Ground Plot of all Publick Buildings Dwelling Houses, Ware Houses, Stables, Court Yards, &c* (1756). F-Pn GE DD-2987 (2657 B). BnF *Gallica*. https://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/btv1b530571173.

———. Survey of the city and suburbs of Dublin, with the division of the parishes reduc'd from the large plan in four sheets (1757). F-Pn GE C-4370. BnF Gallica. https://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/btv1b530637730.

The Statutes at Large, passed in the Parliaments Held in Ireland. 22 vols. Dublin: Boulter Grierson et al., 1786–1801. Google Books. https://books.google.ie/books?id=12RFAAAAcAAJ.

Strype, John. *A Survey of the Cities of London and Westminster*. 2 vols. 1720. Digitised by the University of Sheffield, 2007. https://www.dhi.ac.uk/strype.

Swift, Jonathan. *Poems*. Edited by Derek Mahon. London: Faber and Faber, 2001.

Synge, Edward. *Methods of Erecting, Supporting & Governing Charity-Schools: with An Account of the Charity-Schools in Ireland; And some Observations thereon. The Second Edition, with Additions.* Dublin: Printed for J. Hyde, Bookseller in Dame-Street, 1719. ESTC: T85521. GB-Ob G.Pamph.1466(1). Google Books. https://books.google.com/books?vid=V-BbAAAAQAAJ.

Tans'ur, William. *A New Musical Grammar: or, The Harmonical Spectator.* London: printed for the author, and sold by him, 1746. ESTC: T97236. US-CHH 781 T168n. Internet Archive. https://archive.org/details/newmusicalgramma00tans/.

Wetenhall, Edward. *Of gifts and offices in the publick worship of God: a treatise in three parts*. Dublin: Printed by Benjamin Took, and are to be sold by Mary Crook. ESTC: R23963. Wing / W1506. EEBO. https://elib.tcd.ie/login?url=https://www-proquest-com.elib.tcd.ie/books/gifts-offices-publick-worship-god-treatise-three/docview/2264210306/se-2?accountid=14404.

Nineteenth-Century Books

Craighead, James Geddes. *The Craighead Family: A Genealogical Memoir of the Descendants of Rev. Thomas and Margaret Craighead, 1658–1876.* Philadelphia PA: Printed for the Descendants, 1876. Google Books. https://books.google.ie/books?id=9TqRIW4V6xcC.

England, J. J. Short Accounts of the work carried on by the Ancient Protestant Episcopal Moravian Church (or "Unitas Fratrum"—"United Brethren") in Ireland, from 1746. Leeds: Goodall and Suddick, 1889.

Fortsetzung und Ergänzungen zu Christian Gottlieb Joechers allgemeinem Gelehrten-Lexicon, vol. 3. Delmenhorst, 1810. Google Books. https://www.google.com/books/edition/_/3VlnAAAAcAAJ.

Gilbert, John. T. *A History of the City of Dublin*. 3 vols. Dublin: James McGlashan, 1854. Google Books. https://books.google.com/books?id=Gg0HAAAAQAAJ.

Hardy, Philip Dixon. *The New Picture of Dublin: Or, Stranger's Guide Through the Irish Metropolis.* Dublin, 1831.

Irwin, Clarke Huston. A History of Presbyterianism in Dublin and the South and West of Ireland. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1890. Internet Archive. https://archive.org/details/historyofpresbyt00irwirich.

Jackson, Thomas. *The Life of the Rev. Charles Wesley*, vol. 1 . London: John Mason, 1841. Google Books. https://books.google.ie/books?id=m0I6AAAAcAAJ.

Julian, John. *A Dictionary of Hymnology*. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1892. Google Books. https://books.google.co.uk/books?id=aBDpAAAAIAAJ.

La Touche, John James Digges. *Registers of the French Conformed Churches of St Patrick and St Mary, Dublin*. Dublin: Printed for the Huguenot Society of London by A. Thom, 1893.

Notes and Queries: A Medium of Inter-Communication for Literary Men, Artists, Antiquaries, Genealogiests, Etc., vol. 12 .London: George Bell, 1855. Google Books. https://books.google.ie/books?id=7LIRAAAAYAAJ

Notes and Queries, 2nd series, vol. 138 (17 July 1858). Google Books. https://books.google.ie/books?id=GmvzKlg32VYC.

Miscellaneous Works of the Right Honourable Henry Grattan. London: Longman, Hurst, Rees, Orme, and Brown, and R. Milliken, Dublin, 1822. Google Books. https://books.google.ie/books?id=EggwAAAAMAAJ.

Petitot, M. *Collection des mémoires relatifs a l'histoire de France*. Paris: Foucault, Libraire, Rue de Sorbonne no. 9, 1825. Google Books. https://books.google.com/books?id=NNUFAAAAQAAJ.

Raithby, John, ed. *Statutes of the Realm: Volume 5, 1628–80.* s.l: Great Britain Record Commission, 1819. British History Online. http://www.british-history.ac.uk/statutes-realm/vol5/.

Warburton, John, James Whitelaw and Robert Walsh. *History of the City of Dublin, from the Earliest Accounts to the Present Time.* 2 vols. London: Printed for T. Cadell and W. Davies, in the Strand, by W. Bulner and Co. Cleveland-Row, St. James's, 1818. Google Books. https://books.google.com/books?id=xFkxAQAAMAAJ.

Wood, James Hurford. A Condensed History of the General Baptists of the New Connexion. London: Simkin, Marshall & Co., 1847.

Wright, George Newenham. *An Historical Guide to the City of Dublin*. 2nd edn. London: Printed for Baldwin, Cradock, and Joy, 1825. Reprinted by Four Courts Press, 1980. Google Books. https://books.google.ie/books?id=FgGFAAAAIAAJ.

Twentieth- and Twenty-First-Century Critical Literature

Alayrac-Fielding, Vanessa, and Claire Dubois, eds. *The Foreignness of Foreigners: Cultural Representations of the Other in the British Isles*. Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2015.

Anderson, Warren, Thomas J. Mathiesen, Susan Boynton, Tom R. Ward, John Caldwell, Nicholas Temperley, and Harry Eskew. "Hymn". GMO, 20 January 2001. https://doi-org.elib.tcd.ie/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.article.13648.

Aspden, Suzanne. "Lampe, John Frederick (1702/3–1751), Composer and Bassoonist". ODNB, 23 September 2004. https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/15954.

Atwood, Craig D. "Understanding Zinzendorf's Blood and Wounds Theology". *Journal of Moravian History*, no. 1 (2006): 31–47. https://www.jstor.org/stable/41179818.

Bardon, Jonathan. *Hallelujah: The Story of a Musical Genius and the City that brought his Masterpiece to Life*. Dublin: Gill & Macmillan, 2015.

Barger, Judith. *Elizabeth Stirling and the Musical Life of Female Organists in Nineteenth-Century England*. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2007.

Barnard, T. C. "The Uses of 23 October 1641 and Irish Protestant Celebrations". *The English Historical Review* 106, no. 421 (October 1991): 889–920. https://www.jstor.org/stable/574380.

Barton, E. G. "The Parish Church of St Michan Dublin: The Organ, 1724–1952". Pamphlet held at the RCB Library (274.183BOUND).

Boorman, Stanley, Eleanor Selfridge-Field and Donald W. Krummel. "Printing and Publishing of Music". GMO, 20 January 2001. https://doi-org.elib.tcd.ie/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.article.40101

Boydell, Barra, ed. *Music at Christ Church before 1800: Documents and Selected Anthems*. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 1999.

——. "St Michan's Church Dublin: The Installation of the Organ in 1725 and the Duties of the Organist". *Dublin Historical Record* 46 no. 2 (Autumn 1993): 101–120. http://www.jstor.org/stable/30101037.

Boydell, Barra and Kerry Houston, eds. *Music, Ireland and the Seventeenth Century*. Irish Musical Studies 10. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2009.

Boydell, Brian. A Dublin Musical Calendar, 1700–1760. Dublin: Irish Academic Press, 1988.

Boyle, Seán. "Swaddling John and the Great Awakening". *History Ireland* 18, no. 5 (2010). https://www.historyireland.com/swaddling-john-and-the-great-awakening.

Brown, A. W. Godfrey. "Boyse, Joseph (1660–1728), Presbyterian Minister and Religious Writer". ODNB, 23 September 2004. https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/3151.

———. The Great Mr. Boyse: A study of The Reverend Joseph Boyse Minister of Wood Street Church, Dublin, 1638–1728. The 1980 Robert Allen Memorial Lecture of the Presbyterian Historical Society of Ireland. Belfast: Presbyterian Historical Society of Ireland, 1988.

——. "Iredell, Francis (d. 1739), Minister of the Presbyterian General Synod of Ulster and Author". ODNB, 23 September 2004. https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/63662.

Burke, Peter. What Is Cultural History?, 3rd edn. Cambridge: Polity Press, 2019.

Burke, William. *The Irish Priests in Penal Times*, 1660–1760. Shannon: Irish University Press, 1914; this edn 1968.

Burton, Antoinette. "Radical Book History: E. P. Thompson and 'The Making of the English Working Class'". *Historical Reflections / Réflexions historiques* 41, no. 1 (Spring 2015): 1–6. https://www.jstor.org/stable/24720598.

Butler, Sr Katherine. "Friends in Dublin". *Dublin Historical Record* 44, no. 1 (Spring 1991): 34–46. https://www.jstor.org/stable/30100864.

Bynum, William B. "'The Genuine Presbyterian Whine': Presbyterian Worship in the Eighteenth Century". *American Presbyterians* 74, no. 3 (Fall 1996): 147–170. https://www.jstor.org/stable/23333331.

Carroll, Kenneth L. "Singing in the Spirit in Early Quakerism". *Quaker History* 73, no. 1 (Spring 1984): 1–13. https://www.jstor.org/stable/41947005.

Carter, Grayson. *Anglican Evangelicals: Protestant Secessions from the Via Media c.* 1800–1850. Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock, 2013.

Casey, Christine. *Dublin: The City within the Grand and Royal Canals and the Circular Road with the Phoenix Park*. Buildings of Ireland series ed. Nikolaus Pevsner and Alistair Rowan. London: Yale University Press, 2005.

Colley, Linda. *Britons: Forging the Nation 1707–1837*, revised edn. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2019.

Connolly, S. J. Religion, Law and Power: The Making of Protestant Ireland, 1660–1760. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1995.

Cooney, Dudley Levistone. *The Methodists in Ireland: A Short History*. Dublin: Columba Press, 2001.

Copson, S. L. "Stennett, Joseph (1663–1713), Seventh Day Baptist Minister". ODNB, 23 September 2004. https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/26360.

Corish, Patrick J. *The Catholic Community in the Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries*. Dublin: Helicon, 1981.

Costello, Vivian. "Researching Huguenot Settlers in Ireland". *The BYU Family Historian* 6, no. 1 (September 2007): 83–163. https://scholarsarchive.byu.edu/byufamilyhistorian/vol6/iss1/9.

Crawford, John. "An Archaeological Survey of St. Audoen's Church, Cornmarket". *Dublin Historical Record* 49, no. 2 (Autumn 1996): 85–93. https://www.jstor.org/stable/30101143.

Crawford, John and Raymond Gillespie, eds. *St Patrick's Cathedral Dublin: A History*. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2009.

Crookshank, Esther R. "Watts, Isaac". GMO, 31 January 2014. https://doi-org.elib.tcd.ie/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.article.A2259340.

Daly, Mary E. "Recent Writings on Modern Irish History: The Interaction between Past and Present". *The Journal of Modern History* 69, no. 3 (September 1997): 512–533. https://www.jstor.org/stable/2953595.

Darnton, Robert. *The Great Cat Massacre and Other Episodes in French Cultural History*. New York: Basic Books, 1984.

Dawe, Donovan. *Organists of the City of London, 1666–1850: A Record of One Thousand Organists with an Annotated Index.* Padstow: Published by the Author, 1983.

Dearmer, Percy. Everyman's History of the Prayerbook. London: Mowbray, 1912.

Devine, Patrick F. and Harry White, eds. *The Maynooth International Musicological Conference 1995 Selected Proceedings: Part One*. Irish Musical Studies 4. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 1996.

Dickson, David. Dublin: The Making of a Capital City. London: Profile Books, 2015.

———, ed. *The Gorgeous Mask: Dublin 1700–1850*. Trinity History Workshop 2. Dublin: Trinity History Workshop, 1987.

Doumergue, Émile. "Music in the Work of Calvin". *The Princeton Theological Review* 8, no. 4 (October 1909): 529–552.

Drage, Sally. "The Performance of English Provincial Psalmody *c*.1690–*c*.1840. PhD diss., University of Leeds, November 2009.

Earle, Peter. *The Making of the English Middle Class: Business, Society and Family Life in London, 1660–1730.* Berkeley: University of California Press, 1989. http://ark.cdlib.org/ark:/13030/ft8489p27k/.

Fagan, Patrick. "The Population of Dublin in the Eighteenth Century with Particular Reference to the Proportions of Protestants and Catholics". *Eighteenth-Century Ireland / Irish an dá chultúr* 6 (1991): 121–156. http://www.jstor.org/stable/30070912.

——. "Nary, Cornelius". DIB, October 2009. https://www.dib.ie/biography/nary-cornelius-a6138.

Ferguson, Kenneth. "Rocque's Map and the History of Nonconformity in Dublin: A Search for Meeting Houses". *Dublin Historical Record* 58, no. 2 (Autumn 2005): 129–165. https://www.jstor.org/stable/30101574.

Fitzpatrick, Elizabeth and Raymond Gillespie, eds. *The Parish in Medieval and Early Modern Ireland: Community, Territory and Building*. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2006.

Flood, John. *Poets Laureate in the Holy Roman Empire: A Bio-Bibliographical Handbook.* Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 2011.

Flood, W. H. Grattan. "Barton's Psalms (1698): The Earliest Known Dublin-Printed Music-Book". *The Journal of the Royal Society of Antiquaries of Ireland*, sixth series, 2, no. 3 (30 September 1912): 246–249. https://www.jstor.org/stable/25514244.

——. "Music-Printing in Dublin from 1700 to 1750". *The Journal of the Royal Society of Antiquaries of Ireland*, fifth series, 38, no. 3 (September 1908): 236–240. https://www.jstor.org/stable/25513925.

Fraser, A. M. "David Digues La Touche, Banker, and a Few of His Descendants". *Dublin Historical Record* 5, no. 2 (December 1942–February 1943): 55–68. https://www.jstor.org/stable/30080678.

Garside Jr, Charles. "Calvin's Preface to the Psalter: A Reappraisal". *The Musical Quarterly* 37, no. 4 (October 1951): 566–577. https://www.jstor.org/stable/739611.

Geoghegan, Patrick M. "Whyte, Samuel". DIB, October 2009. https://www.dib.ie/biography/whyte-samuel-a9027.

Gillespie, Raymond. "A Huguenot in Late Seventeenth-Century Dublin: the World of David Cossart and his Family". *Dublin Historical Record* 71, no. 1 (Spring/Summer 2018): 47–63.

Ginzburg, Carlo. *The Cheese and the Worms: The Cosmos of a Sixteenth-Century Miller*. Translated by John and Anne Tedeschi. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1980.

Goehr, Lydia. *The Imaginary Museum of Musical Works: An Essay in the Philosophy of Music*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1994.

Gómez-Arostegui, H. Tomás. "The Untold Story of the First Copyright Suit under the Statute of Anne in 1710". *Berkeley Technology Law Journal* 25, no. 3, Symposium: Copyright @ 300 (2010): 1247–1350. https://www.jstor.org/stable/24119468.

Gordon, Alexander and H. J. McLachlan. "Emlyn, Thomas (1663–1741), Dissenting Minister". ODNB, 23 September 2004. https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/8793.

Graves, Dan. "Singing Out of the Silence: A Survey of Quaker Choral Music". *The Choral Journal* 34, no. 5 (December 1993): 15–24. https://www.jstor.org/stable/23549712.

Greaves, Richard. God's Other Children: Protestant Nonconformists and the Emergence of Denominational Churches in Ireland, 1660–1700. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1997.

Gregori, Flavio. "Blackmore, Sir Richard (1654–1729), Physician and Writer." ODNB, 8 January 2009. https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/2528.

Grindle, W. H. *Irish Cathedral Music: A History of Music at the Cathedrals of the Church of Ireland*. Belfast: Queen's University Belfast, 1989.

Grosart, A. B., and D. K. Money. "Barton, William (1597/8–1678), Translator and Hymnologist". ODNB, 23 September 2004. https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/1606.

Handley, Stuart. "Patrick, John (bap. 1632, d. 1695), Church of England Clergyman and Religious Controversialist". ODNB, 3 January 2008. https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/21564.

Hanna, Samuel George. "The Origin and Nature of the Gracehill Moravian Settlement, 1764–1855, with Special Reference to the Work of John Cennick in Ireland, 1746–1755". *Transactions of the Moravian Historical Society* 21, no. 2 (1967): 1–157. http://www.jstor.org/stable/41179384.

Hayden, Mary. "Charity Children in 18th-Century Dublin". *Dublin Historical Record* 5, no. 3 (March–May 1943): 92–107. https://www.jstor.org/stable/30080114.

Hayton, David. "From Barbarian to Burlesque: English Images of the Irish c. 1660–1750". *Irish Economic and Social History* 14 (1988): 5–31. https://www.jstor.org/stable/24337345.

Herl, Joseph. Worship Wars in Early Lutheranism: Choir, Congregation and Three Centuries of Conflict. New York: Oxford University Press, 2004.

Herlihy, Kevin. "The Early Eighteenth Century Irish Baptists: Two Letters". *Irish Economic and Social History* 19 (1992): 71–76.

———, ed. *Propagating the Word of Irish Dissent 1650–1800*. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 1998. https://www.jstor.org/stable/24341848.

Hill, Myrtle. "Smyth, Edward (1746/7–1823), Methodist Preacher". ODNB, 23 September 2004. https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/67131.

Holder, R. Ward, ed. *Calvin and Luther: The Continuing Relationship*. Gottingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2013.

Holman, Peter. "Lampe, John Frederick". GMO, October 2001. https://doi-org.elib.tcd.ie/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.article.15922.

Holmes, Andrew. *The Shaping of Ulster Presbyterian Belief and Practice*, 1770–1840. New York: Oxford University Press, 2006.

Hopkins, David. "Tate, Nahum" (c. 1652–1715), Poet, Playwright and Translator". ODNB, 3 January 2008. https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/26986

Hourican, Bridget. "Weld, Isaac". DIB, October 2009. https://www.dib.ie/biography/weld-isaac-a8959.

Houston, Kerry. "The Eighteenth-Century Music Manuscripts at St Patrick's Cathedral, Dublin: Sources, Lineage, and Relationship to Other Collections". PhD diss., Trinity College Dublin, 2002.

Hutton, J. E. *History of the Moravian Church*, 2nd edition. 1909. Project Gutenberg. https://www.gutenberg.org/files/2099/2099-h/2099-h.htm#link2HCH0027.

Hylton, Raymond. "Dublin's Huguenot Refuge: 1662–1817". *Dublin Historical Record* 40, no. 1 (December 1986): 15–25. https://www.jstor.org/stable/30100772.

Jefferies, Henry A. "The Irish Parliament of 1560: The Anglican Reforms Authorised". *Irish Historical Studies* 26, no. 102 (November 1988): 128–141. https://www.jstor.org/stable/30008135.

Jenkins, Keith, ed. The Postmodern History Reader. London: Routledge, 1997.

Johnstone, H. Diack. "Greene, Maurice". GMO, 20 January 2001. https://doi-org.elib.tcd.ie/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.article.11707.

Jones, M. G. *The Charity School Movement: A Study of Eighteenth-Century Puritanism in Action*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1938.

Kelliher, W. H. "Denham, Sir John (1614/15–1669), Poet and Courtier." ODNB, 11 February 2021. https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/7481.

Keyte, Hugh, and Andrew Parrott, eds., *The New Oxford Book of Carols*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998.

Kleinman, Sylvie and Frances Clarke. "Grierson (Crawley), Constantia". DIB, October 2009. https://www.dib.ie/biography/grierson-crawley-constantia-a3637.

Knouse, Nola Reed. "Moravian Music: Introduction, Theme, and Variations". *Journal of Moravian History*, no. 2 (Spring 2007): 37–54. https://www.jstor.org/stable/41179824.

——. "Moravians, Music of the." GMO, 20 January 2001. https://doi-org.elib.tcd.ie/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.article.19095.

———, ed. *The Music of the Moravian Church in America*. New York: University of Rochester Press, 2008.

Koudal, Jens Henrik and Michael Talbot. "Pastor Iver Brink's Sacred and Secular Music: A Private Collection of Music from Copenhagen at the Beginning of the Eighteenth Century". *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 135, no. 1 (2010): 1–39. https://www.jstor.org/stable/43741606.

Krims, Adam. Music and Urban Geography. London: Routledge, 2007.

Langford, Paul. *Eighteenth-Century Britain: A Very Short Introduction*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000.

Larminie, Vivienne. "Durel, John [Jean] (1625–1683), Church of England Clergyman and Apologist". ODNB, 24 May 2008. https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/8311.

Laurie, Margaret and Curtis Price. "Tate [Teate], Nahum". GMO, 20 January 2001. https://doi-org.elib.tcd.ie/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.article.27548.

Lawlor, Hugh Jackson. *The Fasti of St Patrick's, Dublin*. Dundalk: Published by W. Tempest for the Standing Committee of the General Synod of the Church of Ireland, 1930.

Le Fanu, Thomas Philip. "The Huguenot Churches of Dublin and their Ministers". *Proceedings of the Huguenot Society of London* 8, nos. 1–4 (1909): 87–156. Internet Archive. https://archive.org/details/proceedingsofhug814hugu/.

——. Registers of the French Non-Conformist Churches of Lucy Lane and Peter Street, Dublin. Aberdeen: University Press, 1901. Internet Archive. https://archive.org/details/registersoffrenc14egli/.

Leachman, Caroline. "Eccles, Solomon (1617–1682), Musician and Quaker Missionary". ODNB, 24 May 2008. https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/8438.

Leaver, Robin A. *Bach Studies: Liturgy, Hymnology, and Theology*. New York: Routledge, 2021.

—— "Lutheran Church Music". GMO, 20 January 2001. https://doiorg.elib.tcd.ie/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.article.46760.

Lecky, William Edward Hartpole. *A History of Ireland in the Eighteenth Century*, vol 1. London: Longmans, Green & Co, 1913.

Lee, Grace Lawless. *The Huguenot Settlements in Ireland*. London: Clearfield, 1936, this edn 2006.

Legg, Marie-Louise. "Synge, Edward". DIB (October 2009). https://www.dib.ie/biography/synge-edward-a8427.

Lennon, Colm. *Dublin Part II: 1610 to 1756*. Irish Historic Towns Atlas 19. Dublin: Royal Irish Academy, 2008.

Lennon, Colm and John Montague. *John Rocque's Dublin: A Guide to the Georgian City*. Dublin: Royal Irish Academy, 2010.

Lineham, Peter J. "Cennick, John (1718–1755), Lay Preacher and Moravian Minister". ODNB, 23 September 2004. https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/4993.

Long, Roy. *Martin Luther and His Legacy: A Perspective on 500 Years of Reformation*. London: Council of Lutheran Churches, 2017.

MacCulloch, Diarmuid. *Reformation: Europe's House Divided 1490–1700*. London: Penguin Books, 2004.

Marti, Andreas and Bert Polman. "Reformed and Presbyterian Church Music". GMO, 20 January 2001. https://doi-org.elib.tcd.ie/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.article.48535.

Mason, John C. S. "La Trobe, Benjamin (1728–1786), Moravian Leader". ODNB, 23 September 2004. https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/61779.

McBride, I. R. "Dickson, William Steel". DIB, October 2009. https://www.dib.ie/biography/dickson-william-steel-a2574.

McBride, Ian. *Eighteenth-Century Ireland: The Isle of Slaves*. New Gill History of Ireland 4. Dublin: Gill Books, 2009.

McClellan, Andrew. "The Life and Death of a Royal Monument: Bouchardon's Louis XV". *Oxford Art Journal* 23, no. 2 (2000): 1–27. https://www.jstor.org/stable/3600506.

McCullough, Niall. *Dublin, An Urban History: the Plan of the City*. 2nd edn. Dublin: Anne Street Press, 2007.

Moody, T. W. and F. X. Martin, eds. *The Course of Irish History*. Revised edn. Cork: Mercier Press, 2011.

Morley, Vincent. *The Popular Mind in Eighteenth-Century Ireland*. Cork: Cork University Press, 2017.

Murphy, Sean J., ed. *Memorial Inscriptions from the Moravian Cemetery, Whitechurch, County Dublin.* Bray: Centre for Irish Genealogical and Historical Studies, 2012.

Muss-Arnolt, William. *The Book of Common Prayer among the Nations of the World*. London: SPCK, 1914. http://justus.anglican.org/resources/bcp/Muss-Arnolt/index.htm.

Music, David W. "Baptist Church Music". GMO, 20 January 2001. https://doiorg.elib.tcd.ie/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.article.46763.

Must, Nicholas. Preaching a Dual Identity: Huguenot Sermons and the Shaping of Confessional Identity, 1629–1685. Boston: Brill, 2017.

O'Gorman, Frank. *The Long Eighteenth Century: British Political and Social History 1688–1832*. 2nd edn. London: Bloomsbury, 2016.

O'Mahony, Patrick and Gerard Delanty. *Rethinking Irish History: Nationalism, Identity and Ideology*. Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2001.

O'Mullane, Brigid. "The Huguenots in Dublin: Part I (Continued)". *Dublin Historical Record* 8, no. 4 (September–November 1946): 121–134. https://www.jstor.org/stable/30080078.

O'Riordan, Turlough. "La Touche, Peter". DIB, October 2009. https://www.dib.ie/biography/la-touche-peter-a4625.

——. "Rocque, John (Jean)". DIB, October 2009. https://www.dib.ie/biography/rocque-john-jean-a7766.

Ogasapian, John. *Church Music in America*, 1620–2000. Macon, GA: Mercer University Press, 2007.

Pegg, Carole, Philip V. Bohlman, Helen Myers and Martin Stokes. "Ethnomusicology". GMO, 20 January 2001. https://doi-org.elib.tcd.ie/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.article.52178.

Peucker, Paul. "Inspired by Flames of Love': Homosexuality, Mysticism, and Moravian Brothers around 1750". *Journal of the History of Sexuality* 15, no. 1 (2006): 30–64. https://www.jstor.org/stable/4617243.

Podmore, Colin. *The Moravian Church in England 1728–1790*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1998.

——. "Zinzendorf and the English Moravians". *Journal of Moravian History*, no. 3 (Autumn 2007): 31–50. https://www.jstor.org/stable/41179832.

Pollard, M. A Dictionary of the Dublin Book Trade, 1550–1800: based on the Records of the Guild of St Luke the Evangelist Dublin. London: Bibliographical Society, 2000.

Quane, Michael. "Quaker Schools in Dublin". *The Journal of the Royal Society of Antiquaries of Ireland* 94, no. 1 (1964): 47–68. https://www.jstor.org/stable/25509549.

Quitslund, Beth. *The Reformation in Rhyme: Sternhold, Hopkins and the English Metrical Psalter*, 1547–1603. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2008.

Rainbow, Bernarr. "Fasola". GMO, 20 January 2001. https://doiorg.elib.tcd.ie/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.article.09349.

Richey, Rosemary. "Sinclair (Sinclaire), William". DIB, October 2009. https://www.dib.ie/biography/sinclair-sinclaire-william-a8092.

Rieger, Julius. "Zur Geschichte der lutherischen Gemeinde Dublins". *Ich Glaube eine heilige Kirche*. Stuttgart, 1963. Reprinted and translated in *The Lutheran Church in Ireland 1696–1997*. Belfast, 1997.

Rivers, Isabel. "Watts, Isaac (1674–1748), Independent Minister and Writer". ODNB, 23 September 2004. https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/28888.

Rodgers, Dirk W. "À Lasco [Laski], John (1499–1560), Evangelical Reformer". ODNB, 23 September 2004. https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/16081.

Said, Edward. Culture and Imperialism. London: Vintage Books, 1994.

Sambrook, James. "Brady, Nicholas (1659–1726), Poet and Church of England Clergyman". ODNB, 23 September 2004. https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/3219.

Schaff, Philip, ed. *A Select Library of the Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers of the Christian Church*, volume 1. Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1994.

Schlenther, Huntingdon and Boyd Stanley. "Hastings [née Shirley], Selina, Countess of Huntingdon (1707–1791), Founder of the Countess of Huntingdon's Connexion." ODNB, 23 September 2004. https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/12582.

Seccombe, Thomas and Elizabeth Baigent. "Weld, Isaac (1774–1856), Topographical Writer". ODNB, 23 September 2004. https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/28984.

Smyrl, Steven C. Dictionary of Dublin Dissent: Dublin's Protestant Dissenting Meeting Houses 1660–1920. Dublin: A. & A. Farmar, 2009.

Sonnelitter, Karen. *Charity Movements in Eighteenth-Century Ireland: Philanthropy and Improvement*. Woodbridge: The Boydell Press, 2016.

Stanwood, Owen. "Between Eden and Empire: Huguenot Refugees and the Promise of New Worlds". *The American Historical Review* 118, no. 5 (2013): 1319–1344. https://www.jstor.org/stable/23784579.

Strickland, Walter G. *A Dictionary of Irish Artists*. Dublin, 1913. Library Ireland. https://www.libraryireland.com/irishartists/index.php.

Strohm, Reinhard. Music in Late Medieval Bruges. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1990.

Strunk, Oliver, ed. *Source Readings in Music History*. Revised by Leo Treitler. London: W. W. Norton, 1998.

Taruskin, Richard. *Music from the Earliest Notations to the Sixteenth Century*. Oxford History of Western Music vol 1. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010.

Temperley, Nicholas. "Anglican and Episcopalian Music". GMO, 20 January 2001. https://doi-org.elib.tcd.ie/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.article.46765.

——. The Hymn Tune Index: A Census of English-Language Hymn Tunes in Printed Sources from 1535 to 1820. 4 vols. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998.

———. "John Playford and the Metrical Psalms". *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 25, no. 3 (Autumn 1972): 331–378. https://www.jstor.org/stable/830935.

——. *The Music of the English Parish Church*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1979.

——. "The Old Way of Singing: Its Origins and Development". *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 34, no. 3 (Autumn 1981): 511–544. https://www.jstor.org/stable/831191.

Temperley, Nicholas, Howard Slenk, Jan R. Luth, Margaret Munck, John M. Barkley and R. Tosh. "Psalms, Metrical". GMO, 6 October 2013. https://doi-org.elib.tcd.ie/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.article.22479.

Thomas, Keith. *In Pursuit of Civility: Manners and Civilization in Early Modern England*. London: Yale University Press, 2018.

Thompson, E. P. *The Making of the English Working Class*. New York: Vintage Books, 1963.

Truron, Walter. "The Rhythm of Metrical Psalm-Tunes". *Music & Letters* 9, no. 1 (January 1928): 29–33. https://www.jstor.org/stable/725883.

Upton, Dell. "Anglican Parish Churches in Eighteenth-Century Virginia". *Perspectives in Vernacular Architecture* 2 (1986): 90–101. https://www.jstor.org/stable/3514320.

Wall, Maureen. *The Penal Laws*, 1691–1760. 2nd edn. Irish History series 1. Dundalk: Dundalgan Press, 1967.

——. "The Rise of a Catholic Middle Class in Eighteenth-Century Ireland". *Irish Historical Studies* 11, no. 42 (September 1958): 91–115. https://www.jstor.org/stable/30006321.

Walsh, Patrick A. and John Cronin. "Wetenhall, Edward". DIB (October 2009). https://www.dib.ie/biography/wetenhall-edward-a8980.

Watson, J. R. *The English Hymn: A Critical and Historical Study*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1999.

Watts, Ruth. *Gender, Power and the Unitarians in England, 1760–1860.* New York: Longman, 1998.

Wiesner-Hanks, Merry E. *Early Modern Europe*, *1450–1789*. 2nd edn. Cambridge History of Europe 2. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2013.

Willis, Jonathan. *Church Music and Protestantism in Post-Reformation England: Discourses, Sites and Identities.* Farnham: Ashgate, 2019.

Whan, Robert. *The Presbyterians of Ulster, 1680–1730*. Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 2013.

Whelan, Ruth, and Carol Baxter, eds. *Toleration and Religious Identity: The Edict of Nantes and its Implications in France, Britain and Ireland*. Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2003.

White, Harry. *The Keeper's Recital: Music and Cultural History in Ireland, 1770–1970.* Critical Conditions: Field Day Essays 6. Cork: Cork University Press, 1998.

White, Harry and Barra Boydell, eds. *The Encyclopedia of Music in Ireland*. 2 vols. Dublin: University College Dublin Press, 2013.

White, Trevor. The Golden Age of Dublin. Dublin: The Little Museum, 2020.

Wiesner-Hanks, Merry S. *Early Modern Europe 1450–1789*, 2nd edition. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013.

Woods, C. J. "Campbell, Thomas". DIB, October 2009; rev. September 2010. https://www.dib.ie/biography/campbell-thomas-a1433.

——. "Grierson, George". DIB, October 2009. https://www.dib.ie/biography/grierson-george-a3638.

Woodward, G. R. "The Genevan Psalter of 1562; Set in Four-Part Harmony by Claude Goudimel, in 1565". *Proceedings of the Musical Association*, 44th Session (1917–1918): 167–192. https://www.jstor.org/stable/765771.

Miscellaneous Online Resources

The Hymn Tune Index: https://hymntune.library.uiuc.edu/.

Hymnary.org Database: https://hymnary.org/.

Irish Legislation Database (QUB): https://www.qub.ac.uk/ild/.

Dublin Music Trade: https://www.dublinmusictrade.ie/.